1	Seasonal impact-based mapping of compound hazards
2	
3	*Hillier, J.K. ¹ and Dixon, R. S. ²
4	¹ Geography, Loughborough University, LE11 3TU, UK.
5	² Dept. of Meteorology, University of Reading, RG6 6BG, UK.
6	*Corresponding Author: j.hillier@lboro.ac.uk
7	
8	This paper is a non-peer reviewed preprint submitted to <i>Env. Res. Lett.</i> June 15 th 2020
9	
10	Key words: Compound hazard, flooding, wind damage, extratropical cyclone, storm
11	
12	
13	Impact-based, seasonal mapping of compound hazards is proposed. It is pragmatic, identifies
14	phenomena to drive the research agenda, produces outputs relevant to stakeholders, and could
15	be applied to many hazards globally. Illustratively, flooding and wind damage can co-occur,
16	worsening their joint impact, yet where wet and windy seasons combine has not yet been
17	systematically mapped. Here, seasonal proxies for wintertime flooding and wind damage are
18	used to map, at 1x1° resolution, the association between these perils across Europe within 600
19	years as realized in SEAS5 hindcast data. Paired areas of enhanced-suppressed correlation are
20	identified (Scotland, Norway), and are shown to be created by orographically-enhanced rainfall
21	(or shelter) from prevailing westerly storms.
22	
23	
24	

25 1. Introduction

26

Considering hazards in isolation may both over- and under-estimate risk (1-4), and 'compound 27 28 risk' is emerging as a term to encompass research to identify and understand the impact of combined hazards (5). Over meteorological timescales (hours to weeks), even the joint 29 30 behaviours of hazards whose origin involves notably different physical processes (e.g. damaging 31 wind, extreme cold or heat, fluvial flooding, storm surge) is widely studied (6–12). Over 32 climatological timescales (seasonal to annual), often invoking a climate mode such as the North 33 Atlantic Oscillation (NAO), there are multi-hazard reviews (13), but a focus has been on individual 34 hazards (14–17) or pairwise extremes of a single variable such as temperature (hot/cold) or precipitation (wet/dry) (18,19). Links between potentially time-lagged events of different hazard 35 types via persistent underlying environmental conditions (2,20) are less studied, especially when 36 also adopting an impact-centric approach. Using flooding and wind damage in Europe as an 37 example, we illustrate that impact-based mapping can identify scientifically interesting 38 39 phenomena using measures of aggregated risk over a planning timescale of interest to 40 infrastructure operators, government agencies, and (re)insurance. 41 Flooding and wind damage are two of Europe's most impactful hazards (21). They are commonly 42 43 assessed separately (14,22,23) although, at meteorological timescales, case studies of strong

44 storms (low-pressure systems, extratropical cyclones) show both classes of damage can co-occur 45 during the same weather system (24–28). Intriguingly, when only short timescales (<72 h) are 46 used to map precipitation-wind correlation across Europe (12), the dependency is weak in Great 47 Britain (GB). In contrast, a substantive correlation for the GB is proposed to exist ($r_p \approx 0.4$ -0.7, p48 < 0.05) in longer time-windows (2,4,11,29). A way to reconcile these observations is the proposal 49 of Hillier et al. (2) that compound risk is elevated by a systematic, multi-storm relationship on timescales up to seasonal (hours to months), driven by persistent underlying environmental conditions. It has not yet been possible to fully assess this idea as the GB estimates represent a single national figure (2,11), short time-series (~15 years, Hillier *et al* (2,4)), or climatic variables that are not established to be metrics relating to impact (e.g. 29,30). Thus, to overcome these limitations, we advocate using seasonal-scale proxies for damage to map where flooding and wind impacts do or do not compound across Europe.

56

57 2. Method & Data

58

59 Investigations of compound risk (2,29,31,32) select appropriate proxies for impact (Fig. 1). Here, the hypothesis is that flooding and extreme wind are linked by persistent underlying 60 environmental conditions (2,4), so hazard proxies at a seasonal timescale are selected (dashed 61 outline). Over a season stochastic, sporadically occurring and relatively uncommon extremes 62 accumulate, permitting any coherent 'signal' of correlation to be detected most readily. Any sub-63 64 seasonal time-lags between events (11) are implicitly accounted for. Hazard proxies are based on 65 weather/climate metrics, but calibrated to loss data, avoiding the limitations of loss data (e.g. spatially sparse, short term) whilst being 'impact-based' in that they are designed to relate to loss 66 67 (e.g. 33).

68



Fig. 1 - Two-dimensional typology of proxies for the impact of natural hazards. In how directly
 they are related to impact, x-axis, proxies range from climatic variables (e.g. mm/yr), to hazard
 proxies (e.g. v³), to quantifications of particular classes of damage (e.g. insurance losses). Proxies
 may cover short or long durations, y-axis. Seasonal-scale, impact-based hazard proxies are
 advocated here (blue box with dashed outline).

75

The seasonally aggregated proxies used are $D_R = \sum R$ for flooding, and $D_W = \sum (v_{max} - c)^3$ 76 for $v_{max} > c$ for wind damage. *R* is total daily precipitation in mm, v_{max} is daily max 10-m gust 77 78 wind speed, and c is a threshold over which damage is thought to occur. Whilst a percentile might be taken for c (34), 20 ms⁻¹ is taken as damage to buildings increases markedly and non-79 linearly above this (35,36). v^3 is used as total power dissipation in wind storms, the energy 80 available to do damage, rises roughly as v^3 (15,33,37,38). Aggregated winter precipitation is 81 proposed for D_R on the two-fold basis that antecedence (e.g. via soil saturation) is important for 82 precipitation-driven hazards (11,39,40), and D_R observations in the period 2006-2019 correlate 83 with losses from delays on the rail network of Great Britain (GB, $r_p^2 = 0.63$, p = 0.0012, Fig. S1). 84 85 Sensitivity tests to the functional form of D_R and choice of c and are in Supp. Matt. sections SM1 and SM2. 86

87

 v_{max} and *R* data are from SEAS5, the ECMWF Seasonal forecast System 5, re-gridded to 1°x1° (41,42). Each member of the SEAS ensemble (versions 4 or 5) is a physically consistent realisation of a potential reality (43,44). SEAS5 hindcasts have 25 members spanning 24 years (1993-2016) considered by ECMWF to be most relevant to the current day in the context of climate change (45). Simulations run for 7 months, and September re-forecasts are chosen to capture the 'winter' half-year (Oct-Mar) when it is assumed the imprint of initialization conditions will have faded and the ensemble diverged sufficiently (44). Namely, September itself is excluded to 95 remove 'real' weather. This approach (43,44,46–49), as used here, gives 600 simulated years (24
96 years × 25 members) that might plausibly have occurred.

97

98 Compounding is mapped (Fig. 2d) by an uplift (U) in mean wind damage (D_W) in the wettest one third as opposed to the driest one third of years; namely, a fraction (f = 0.333) of years are taken 99 100 as wet. The statistical significance of U is determined by a t-test. Correlations, Pearson's (r_p) and 101 Spearman's rank (r_s), between D_W and D_R are examined to support this at selected sites (Figs. 2ac, S2). To understand impact, exceedance probability (EP) curves are plotted (Figs. 2g-i), with 102 103 statistical significance determined by a stochastic simulation (10,000 iterations) to detect 104 differences from an uncorrelated state (2,50–52). The procedure to calculate aggregate EP (AEP) curves is standard (21). Whilst noting advances in statistical modelling multivariate extremes 105 106 (6,52–56), to make the approach as accessible as possible we select the simplest sufficient methods. 107 108 109 3. Impact-based map of compounding hazards 110 To build upon the studies of Great Britain (GB), and mapping in short time windows (24-72h), 111 impact-based proxies for flooding (D_R) and wind damage (D_W) are used to map how these perils 112

113 compound across Europe on a seasonal timescale (Fig. 2d). In the Atlantic to the north and west

of GB, there is an uplift of roughly +100% wind damage potential in wet years (pink). This

background level of correlation (Central site C, Fig. 2c) is modified across the north of GB,

enhanced to the west (Western site W, Fig. 2a) and suppressed to the east (Eastern site E, Fig.

117 2b). Similar patterns of enhanced-suppressed correlation occur across Scandinavia

118 (Norway/Sweden) and the Iberian Peninsula. Elsewhere, the background level of correlation is

119 maintained across northwest central countries (France, Germany), whilst low and statistically

insignificant effects (white/blue colours, circles) are present over southern areas (e.g. Italy). This

spatial pattern (relative magnitudes) is broadly insensitive to the measure of correlation used (*U*, r_p, r_s), threshold *c*, fraction *f* of years defined as 'wet' or 'dry', or indeed a shorter Nov-Feb winter (Fig. S2). In terms of wider implications, the map demonstrates that using impact-based seasonal proxies is a pragmatic means of mapping compounding hazards. In detail, we acknowledge that local (sub-grid) associations and variations are not captured, perhaps exposed hilltops outside mountainous areas (e.g. SW England) or between neighbouring valleys (57), and that some mechanisms for flooding such as snow melt (e.g. 40) may not be fully accounted for.



Fig 2 - Impact-based estimate of compounding between flooding and extreme wind (a) - (c) Scatter plots of the seasonal hazard proxies D_R and D_W , with OLS best-fit lines and 3σ confidence intervals, at sites W/E/C located in panel d. (d) Map of uplift $U = 100 * (D_{w_wet}/D_{w_dry} - 1)$ in wet over dry years with *f*=0.33. Circles indicate a lack of statistical significance. (e) Orientation of winds on windy (>99th percentile) days for sites W and E. (f) as panel e but for wet days. (g) - (i) AEP curves for D_W , for wet (blue) and dry (red) seasons at the three sites. Differences given at 10 and 40 year return periods. Where statistically significant, p values are in []; * <0.1, ** <0.05,

138 *** <0.01. Site locations: W (-006°,56°), E (-002°,56°), C (-002°,52°), N(001°,61°).

139

140 4. Enhanced compounding and correlation shadows

141

Fig. 2d presents a view of the potential for flooding and wind damage to combine at seasonal 142 timescales. The areas of strongest co-occurrence when only short (\leq 72h) timeframes are 143 144 considered (12), in North and Baltic Seas, are muted leaving paired areas of enhanced-supressed 145 risk (Norway, Iberia, GB, South Sweden, South Italy) more distinct. Statistical simulation modelling (Supp. Matt. section SM5) provides an explanation for the increased clarity, with the 146 147 majority of the compounding effect (~70-90%) at sites W/C/N attributable to a relationship at timescales over 72h. A striking difference between Fig. 2d and mapping of short-term correlation 148 (12) is GB. We therefore choose to investigate the patterns and mechanisms here in more depth 149 150 and detail than done previously.

151

152 Flooding and wind damage proxies in Great Britain compound most strongly in the north, to the

153 west of the hills that run northwards from the Pennines into the Scottish Highlands (Fig. 2d).

154 Storms and strong winds predominantly hit GB from the south-west (Fig. 2d)(14,24,58). In these

low-pressure frontal systems, the heaviest topographically enhanced rainfall occurs in the warm 155 sector of the depressions in association with strong winds (59–61). This orographic enhancement 156 157 over this moderate amplitude topography is widely thought to be caused by the seeder-feeder mechanism (61–63), and the rainfall is the main driver of flooding in affected areas (e.g. 64–66). 158 In SEAS5, these behaviours are evident in the agreement of wind directions for the windiest and 159 160 wettest days at Site W (Fig 2e-f, blue), and the correlation between daily wind and rain (v_{max} and 161 *R*) at site W is high ($r_s = 0.607$, p < 0.01) matching that of the seasonal proxies (Fig. 2a). However, 162 this is not a complete explanation as the very windiest days are wet but not the wettest ones 163 (Fig. S3). We suggest that this is because storms with the most damaging winds are likely to still 164 be actively interacting with the jet stream and therefore intensifying and travelling rapidly (67,68), allowing them less time than slower-moving systems to rain at any given site on the 165 166 ground; their translational speed likely adds only a minor amount to v_{max} (21,69). Therefore, 167 persistence appears to also play a role in creating the enhanced correlations in Fig. 2, either from clusters of storms within relatively short time windows (\lesssim 14 days) to create widespread flooding 168 169 (11,23,70) and/or on climatological timescales (weeks/months) to create notably wet and stormy 170 winters (4,29,32,71–73).

171

East of the hills, correlation is suppressed, to which we give the label 'correlation shadow' (Fig. 172 2b). This decorrelation arises because winds bearing the most intense rain to site E (northerly) 173 come from a different direction to the strongest winds, which are from the south-west and not 174 the north (Fig. 2 e-f)(58). Daily v_{max} values show that the strength of the severest gusts at the 175 sites is strongly related ($r_s = 0.773$, p < 0.01), indicating that both typically arise from the same 176 weather patterns, but extreme rain does not commonly follow at site E. This can be partially 177 understood by the concept of a rain-shadow (12,74,75). This is not as unambiguously invoked in 178 GB as it is for larger mountains (76), but the strongest rain-shadow effect occurs for precipitation 179 180 in the warm sector of frontal systems (77,78) like those driving the compounding effect at site W.

What rain persists eastwards, might still produce risk correlated with wind, but is does not as its 181 182 direction is not consistent with the wettest days at site E (Fig. 2f). Thus, the key to understanding 183 Fig. 2d is the difference in site-specific response to a similar set (Fig. S4) of impacting weather patterns or air masses. At a seasonal level, wind directions (weather types) capable of causing 184 flooding and wind damage in GB are known to trade-off with each other (79–81). In particular, 185 186 when westerly winds are common those from the north and east occur less frequently (Fig. S5), 187 but this effect does not appear strong enough to induce inverse relationships (Fig. 2d,h) as none are statistically significant. 188

189

This example highlights that using seasonal hazard-based proxies can identify phenomena to investigate further (e.g. with daily data), and poses questions to drive future research. How does the mechanism driving GB's correlation shadow compare to that of Scandinavia or the western USA? How prevalent is each type of extra-tropical correlation shadow globally? How strong is compounding in the most extreme seasons/events? How will these change in future?

195

196 **5. Impact of compounding effects**

197

Many stakeholders, such as the (re)insurance sector or rail network, need to understand rare and 198 199 extreme years for the purposes of planning. Will the compound aggregate loss in a season likely 200 exceed their limits permitted by regulation, capacity or reserves? A correlation driven by small 201 but frequent losses is not a concern, whereas one that exhibits itself as both very severe flooding and wind damage in the same year would be. Therefore, with wet years linked to increased 202 flooding impacts (Fig. S1), an important result (Figs 2g,2i) is that the flood-wind correlation 203 204 identified from relatively short time series (2,4,11,12,29) is securely established present at higher 205 return periods up to ~50 years from 600 years of data. Thus, the use of seasonal, impact-based

206 hazard metrics has allowed us to build additional understanding of real-world relevance over and above that possible from the relatively short instrumental record. 207 208 209 6. Conclusions 210 211 By applying seasonal, impact-based hazard proxies to map how flooding and extreme wind 212 compound across Europe, using SEAS5 data, our view is that such mapping is useful for three main reasons: 213 214 215 1. It is a pragmatic, self-consistent (i.e. using similar data) means to map compounding hazards across large regions using publicly available data (e.g. SEAS5). This said, where 216 possible we advocate site-specific studies using alternative data (e.g. river flows, weather 217 station data) and higher resolutions (spatial and temporal) to validate the observations 218 and gain deeper process-based understanding (e.g. 82). 219 220 2. The mapping identifies phenomena (e.g. correlation shadows) to drive the research 221 agenda, posing questions and generating hypotheses about atmospheric behaviour for future investigation and testing. 222 3. The outputs (e.g. % increase in losses, AEP curves) are seasonal, at a time-scale relevant 223 to many stakeholder's resource planning horizons, and thus of direct real-world 224 225 relevance. 226 This approach could readily be applied to different regions, or to diverse and potentially time-227 228 lagged hazard combinations (e.g. landslide, snow, heat, wind). 229 Acknowledgements 230 231

232	We thank Rob Wilby and Alex Alabaster for their comments, which improved this work. Hillier is
233	funded by the UKRI, NERC KE Fellowship NE/R003297/1.
234	
235	Author Contributions Dixon conceived the work. Hillier and Dixon together devised and
236	conducted the analyses, reviewed existing literature, discussed the results and wrote the paper.
237	
238	
239	Supplementary Material
240	
241	SM1. WRIID flooding data
242	
243	Support for D_R as a measure of impact comes from the Weather Related Incident Impact Data
244	(WRIID). WRIID is Schedule 8 delay data compiled by Network Rail (NR), who are the owner and
245	infrastructure provider of most of the rail network in Great Britain. WRIID contains 182,000
246	incidents (2006-2019) that have each been assigned to one of nine hazards, including flooding,
247	and given an impact location (the originating site of delays). These data have been used
248	previously for work on heat (83,84), linked NAO (32), and recently for multi-hazard risk (4).
249	Precipitation data are aggregated winter England and Wales precipitation (85).
250	



Fig. S1 - Correlation between seasonal winter flooding impacts in WRIID and monthly mean
 precipitation aggregated across England and Wales (85).

254

276

Pearson's correlation between seasonal winter flooding impacts in WRIID and mean monthly 255 precipitation is $r_p^2 = 0.63$, with p = 0.0012, so a null hypothesis that the gradient of the line is 256 equal to zero (2-tailed test) can be rejected. In a leave one out assessment of covariance (LOOCV) 257 46.4% of the variance in loss is explained by precipitation, which indicates that the relationship is 258 not over-fitted and there is predictive capability despite the short duration of the WRIID 259 timeseries (2006-2019). WRIID is intrinsically weighted to geographic areas with more 260 261 infrastructure, but this is actually desirable in a proxy for risk. 262 A linear model was selected for simplicity, and to avoid overinterpreting the WRIID data. If a non-263 264 linear model is used, where the losses are related to a positive power of precipitation > 1, explanatory power is increased up to powers of 5 where $r^2 = 0.78$. Here, LOOCV estimates that 265 70.0% of the variance in losses are explained, and AIC is minimized. The model used is y =266 $c_1x^n + c_2$, where c_1 and c_2 are constants, and *n* is a positive integer. Thus, our main results are 267 268 robust to this choice, and non-parametric methods (e.g. Spearman's r) are used to verify this (e.g. Fig. S2). In future analyses, better diagnostics of impact may arise from extreme rainfall 269 percentiles (e.g. 57) or including non-linearity before aggregation (i.e. as for D_w). 270 271 SM2. Sensitivity tests 272 273 In this approach to mapping the spatial pattern of co-occurrence of flooding and extreme wind, a 274 number of choices were made. Fig. S2a-d demonstrates that the relative magnitudes of 275

correlation at sites W (blue), E (red) and C (green) are robust to these choices; equivalent lines

277 never cross where they are reliably constrained (site C in Fig. S2b discussed below), and whilst 278 the use of mean uplift in $U D_W$ as opposed to r_p or r_s raises intermediate levels of correlation (site 279 C) to a par with higher ones (site W), but both remain distinctly above those of site E in the 280 correlation shadow. Thus, the spatial pattern (Fig. 2d) is mainly broadly insensitive to measure of 281 correlation used (U, r_p , r_s), threshold c selected for D_W , fraction f of years defined as 'wet' or 'dry' 282 in order to compute U, or indeed the exact months defined as winter.

283

There is very little difference between Pearson's correlation coefficient (r_p) and Spearman's rank 284 285 correlation (r_s) , which isolates the dependency structure from the marginal distributions (Fig. 286 S2a). This justifies the functional forms chosen such as $log(D_W)$ for in Figs. 2a-c. A lower threshold 287 might be argued for on the basis that SEAS5 wind speeds are averaged over a relatively large (1° x 1°) area, which would increase correlation strengths (r_p, r_s) bolstering the points in the main 288 text. Taking a high (98th) percentile of daily max 10-m gust wind speed, which has been related to 289 damage in UK and Germany using weather station data (34,58,86), would argue for a higher c 290 291 that varies by site, but the relative magnitudes not altered by this. Fig. S2b contains the only example of relative magnitudes at sites changing, when values at site C go below those of site W 292 293 or $c > 24 \text{ms}^{-1}$, however this is because wind speeds are lowest at site C (Figs. 2c, S2a) and data become sparse. So, we regard this feature as unreliable. Lines are horizontal on Fig. S2c as f is not 294 295 included in the computation of r_p or r_s , but it is included for completeness. Fig. S2d illustrates that, similar to Fig. S2b, mean uplift in U increases as the subset of data used is limited to include 296 only increasingly extreme values (higher *c*, lower *f*). 297





300 Fig. S2 - Sensitivity tests for the mapping of correlation at site W (blue), site E (red) and site C (green). (a) and (b) are Spearman's rank correlation r_s , and uplift $U = 100 * (D_{w wet}/D_{w drv} - D_{w drv})$ 301 302 1) in wet over dry years, respectively, both with the fraction (f) of years defined as 'wet' or 'dry' held at 0.35 whilst the threshold c over which v^3 is summed for D_W is varied in increments of 1 303 ms⁻¹. (c) and (d) are similar, except that c is held constant at $20ms^{-1}$ and f is varied in increments 304 of 0.05. For these main tests only (dark solid lines) statistical significance (p < 0.05) is indicated by 305 small circles, with their lack indicating insignificance. Pale solid line are for r_p instead of r_s . Dashed 306 lines are for a shorter Nov-Feb winter. Vertical grey bars indicated the values used in Fig. 2. 307 308 Percentiles of v_{max} are shown in (a) to allow comparison with percentile-based methods.

309

310 SM3. Correlations in daily data at sites W and E

311

To augment the main analysis using seasonal impact-based hazard proxies, daily data were 312 examined. Figs S3 plots a selected comparison. As in the main analysis R is total daily 313 314 precipitation in mm, v_{max} is daily max 10-m gust wind speed. Orientation is calculated from 315 velocities to the east and north averaged over 24h, also from SEAS5. The correlation between extremes of wind and rain at site W (r_s = 0.607, Fig. S3a) is greater than that at site E (r_s = 0.069). 316 317 For extremes however, within the upper-right quadrant as delimited by the dashed lines (98th 318 percentiles), there is a notable absence of points for site W as compared to site N (Fig. S3). A simple cumulative Binomial distribution can be used to determine that there are more 319 occurrences at site W than expected by chance (n = 109200, $p = 0.02^2$, E[n] = 43.7), in line with 320 Martius et al. (12), but typically either wind is very extreme *or* rain is, not both (Fig. S3a,b). This 321 supports the argument that underlying processes enduring across longer durations (>72h) are 322 323 needed to generate the correlations observed (Fig. 2d). 324 Fig. S4 counters the idea that in the GB correlation shadows can arise from the east and west of 325

the country experiencing different air masses (76). Orientations at the sites are similar, but with 326 327 slightly more frequent winds from the south-west for site E. So, it is not possible for a difference 328 in wind directions experienced by E can possibly explain the decorrelation between wind and rain extremes there without another factor; with all else equal, the effect of south-westerly 329 winds driving the correlation in site W should be even more pronounced at site E. Prevailing 330 winds from the south-west occur in historically observed 3-sec 10m gusts at a 43-station network 331 over the period 1980–2005, with this prevalence even more pronounced for damaging winds 332 exceeding the 98th percentile (58). So, this is not an artefact of SEAS5 at sites W and E. 333



Fig. S3 - Correlation between daily *R* and v_{max} values at sites W and N. (a) All 109200 data displayed individually (grey dots) and 98th percentiles (dashed lines). (b) Structure of the point cloud for the data in panel (a), displayed as point density using a smoothing kernel of width 5 units, with dark blue shades indicating high density. Numbers in quadrants delimited by the lines are number of points in the quadrants. (c) and (d) are as for (a) and (b), but for site N.



334

342 Fig. S4 - Wind direction within SEAS5. All days are used for site W (blue) and site E (red).

343

344 SM4. Trade-offs in wind direction

345

It is known that there is a trade-off between weather types in Great Britain (79,80). An analysis of Lamb's (1972) principal weather types (Fig. S5) confirms that previous work on these Lamb Weather Types (LWTs) applies to the trade-off most relevant to this study. The most relevant directional types here (Fig. 2e,f)(81) are northerly (N), easterly (E) and westerly (W). In Fig. S5 black dots are for the years that WRIID losses, as used in Section SM1, are available (r_p = -0.824, p = 0.0005). The red dots are for a longer period, from 1948 to 2018, and show a similar pattern (r_p = -0.725, p = \ll 0.01).



353



356 show the same pattern. Data: https://crudata.uea.ac.uk/cru/data/lwt/. Trendline is for 2006-

2018 data, and grey shading indicates estimated 2σ bounds for this.

358



An analysis is conducted to derive a first-order indication of the relative dominances (i.e. minor, 361 comparable, major) of short term (12) and up to seasonal (2) contributions to the compounding 362 effect between extreme wind and a precipitation-based proxy for flooding. An approach is used 363 in which linkages between extremes in data (e.g. SEAS5) are selectively broken to quantify the 364 effect they had by measuring the difference their absence makes (4). For simplicity, and to 365 366 isolate the correlation-related effects, flooding and wind are assumed to have the same loss distribution; this is a substantial assumption, so the detail of the results (Fig. S6) should not be 367 over-interpreted. 368



370

Fig. S6 - Breakdown of timescales contributing to compounding at Sites. All panels are
Aggregate Exceedance Probability (AEP) plots, with a damage metric *AL* estimated for flooding
and extreme wind combined displayed as a difference from a simulated condition of
independence between the hazards (pink line, condition C). Data directly from SEAS5 (dark red,
condition A) plot above a condition in which associations between extremes within a 72h
window are retained but any longer-term relationships (e.g. monthly) are removed (red,

condition B). Differences between conditions A and B, due to longer term (up to seasonal)
effects, are shown at 10 and 40 year return periods (vertical grey lines). Where statistically
significant, p values are in []; * <0.1, ** <0.05, *** <0.01. Total (and average) loss is identical in all
3 conditions, merely re-distributed.

381

382

Using a metric estimating flooding and extreme wind damage combined (D_W) , statistical 383 384 simulation modelling (Fig. S6) is conducted to provide an explanation for the increased clarity of 385 the paired areas of enhanced-suppressed correlation in Fig. 2d. The majority (74-89%) of the 386 compounding effect, as estimated at the 40 year return period level at key sites (W,C,N) is attributable to relationships caused by weather patterns or other climatological drivers that 387 388 endure for timescales of greater than 72h. This estimate is made by taking data directly from SEAS5 (condition A), which contains all the hazard inter-dependencies within that dynamical 389 390 modelling, and using simulation to break any relationship between extremes outside a ± 1 day window (condition B) (12), and finally breaking relationships at all timescales (i.e. independence, 391 392 condition C). Thus, A-C is the entire impact of hazard interdependency upon risk, B-C is the part 393 attributable to short-term linkages $(\pm 1 \text{ day})$ (12), and A-B is the remainder due to longer term (up to seasonal) effects. The method is detailed below, sequentially for the 3 conditions. 394

395

396 <u>Condition A</u>

1. Extract v_{max} and R (1°x1°) from SEAS5 for a site, and convert the daily v_{max} winds to estimates of damage $L_{wi} = \{1, 2, ..., n\}$ where n is the count of daily data during 600 years of October-March winters (i.e. 109200). The subscript w denotes wind. $L = (v_{max} - c)^3$ for $v_{max} > c$, taking c as 20 ms⁻¹, as in the main text.

401 2. Rank *L*_{wi} by magnitude.

402 3. Convert daily precipitation totals to estimates of damage $L_{Ri} = \{1, 2, ..., n\}$ by ranking them 403 according magnitude, then assigning L_{Ri} to be the L_{wi} of the same rank (i.e. extremeness 404 according to percentile). This gives both hazards an identical, empirical marginal 405 distribution specific to each site analysed.

406 4. Compute total seasonal (i.e. aggregate) losses for wind in years j = {1,2,.... n}, where n is

407 the number of years (i.e. 600), as $AL_{jw} = \sum_{i} L_{iw}$ for days i within each year j. Do similar

408 for precipitation, then add to wind losses to give combined annual losses AL_i .

409 5. With annual losses AL_j , calculate an AEP curve using standard methods (21) to give losses

410 at return periods R for condition A of AL_{AR} . These form the pink line on Fig. S6.

411 <u>Condition B</u>

412 Start from Step 6. Numbering is continuous to prevent ambiguity. Note that the total value of the413 damage proxies in the time series remains identical

414 6. Perform Steps 1-5 as for Condition A, inserting the following two manipulations between

415 steps 3 and 4. First, Identify high values of L_{wi} within a ±24h window (i.e. > at i+1 or i-1)

416 and, for these values of i, identify the highest L_{Ri} within the $\pm 24h$ window and if necessary

417 swop it with the value at i such that the highest *L*_{wi} and *L*_{Ri} values are now coupled. Sum

418 them (i.e. $L_i = L_{wi} + L_{Ri}$). Second, randomize i, such that losses are re-assigned to different

419 years. Note that as damage estimates for w and R are already combined, it is not

420 necessary to repeat this in Step 4. This creates a set of return period losses AL_{BR} .

421 7. Repeat Step 6 100 times to determine estimates of the mean (μ) and standard deviation

422 (σ) of AL_{2R} for each return period R, defining Normal distributions i.e. $AL_{BR} \sim N(\mu, \sigma)$

423 assuming the Central Limit Theorem applies.

424 8. For each return period R, calculate a two-tailed p-value using a cumulative Normal
425 distribution that the value from Condition A (i.e. AL_{AR}) could arise from Condition B by

- 426 chance (i.e. is the difference caused by eliminating all associations outside a \pm 24h window
- 427 statistically significant).
- 428 <u>Condition C</u>
- 429 Start from Step 9. Numbering is continuous to prevent ambiguity. Note that the total value of the
- 430 damage proxies in the time series remains identical.
- 431 9. Perform Steps 1-5 as for Condition A, inserting the following manipulations between
- 432 steps 3 and 4. For each hazard separately, randomize i such that losses are re-assigned to
- 433 different years. This creates a set of return period losses AL_{CR} .
- 434 10. Repeat Step 6 100 times to determine estimates of the mean (μ) and standard deviation
- 435 (σ) of AL_{CR} for each return period R, defining Normal distributions i.e. $AL_{CR} \sim N(\mu, \sigma)$
- 436 assuming the Central Limit Theorem applies.
- 437 11. For each return period R, calculate a two-tailed p-value using a cumulative Normal
- 438 distribution that the value from Condition A (i.e. AL_{1R}) could arise from Condition C by
- 439 chance (i.e. is the difference caused by eliminating all associations statistically significant).
- 440
- 441
- 442
- 443

444 Bibliography

- Kappes MS, Keiler M, von Elverfeldt K, Glade T. Challenges of analyzing mulit-hazard risk: a review. Nat Hazards. 2012;64:1925–1958.
- 448 2. Hillier JK, Macdonald N, Leckebusch GC, Stavrinides A. Interactions between apparently primary
 449 weather-driven hazards and their cost. Env Res Lett. 2015;10:104003.
- 450 3. de Ruiter M, Couasnon A, van den Homberg MJC, Daniell JE, Gill J, Ward PJ. Why We Can No Longer
 451 Ignore Consecutive Disasters. Earth's Future. 2019;8:e2019EF001425.
- 4. Hillier JK, Matthews T, Wilby RL, Murphy C. Multi-hazard dependencies can increase and decrease risk.
 Nature Climate Change. 2020;
- 454 5. Zscheischler J, Westra S, van der Hurk BJJM, Seneviratne SI, Ward PJ, Pitman A, et al. Future climate
 455 risk from compound events. Nature Climate Change. 2018;
- 456 6. Bevacqua E, Maraun D, Haff HI, Widmann M, Vrac M. Multivariate statistical modelling of compound
 457 events via pair-copula constructions: analysis of floods in Ravenna (Italy). Hydrol Earth Syst Sci.
 458 2017;21:2701–23.
- 459 7. Moftakhari H, Schubert JE, AghaKouchak A, Matthew RA, Sanders, B. F. Linking statistical and
 460 hydrodynamic modeling for compound flood hazard assessment in tidal channels and estuaries.
 461 Advances in Water Resources. 2019;128:28–38.
- 462 8. Khouakhi A, Villarini G. Contribution of tropical cyclones to rainfall at global scale. Journal of Climate.
 463 2017;30:359–372.
- 464 9. Matthews T, Wilby RL, Murphy C. An emerging tropical cyclone–deadly heat compound hazard. Nature
 465 Climate Change. 2019;9:602–6.
- 466 10. Ward PJ, Couasnon A, Eilander D, Haigh ID, Hendry A, Muis S, et al. Dependence between high sea467 level and high river discharge increases flood hazard in global deltas and estuaries. Env Res Lett.
 468 2018;13(8):084012.
- 469 11. De Luca P, Hillier JK, Wilby RL, Quinn NW, Harrigan S. Extreme multi-basin flooding linked with extra 470 tropical cyclones. Env Res Lett. 2017;12(11):114009.
- 471 12. Martius O, Pfahl S, Chevalier C. A global quantification of compound precipitation and wind extremes:
 472 Compound precipitation and wind extremes. Geophys Res Lett. 2016;43:7709–14.
- 473 13. Steptoe H, Jones SEO, Fox H. Correlations between extreme atmospheric hazards and global
 474 teleconnections: Implications for multi-hazard resilience. Reviews of Geophysics. 2017;55(1):50–78.
- 475 14. Walz MA, Donat MG, Leckebusch GC. Large-Scale Drivers and Seasonal Predictability of Extreme Wind
 476 Speeds Over the North Atlantic and Europe. Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres.
 477 2018;123(20):11518–35.
- 478 15. Chan JCL. Interannual variations of intense typhoon activity. Tellus, Series A: Dynamic Meteorology
 479 and Oceanography. 2007;59(A(4)):455–460.
- 480 16. Camargo SJ, Sobel AH. Western North Pacific Tropical Cyclone Intensity and ENSO. Journal of Climate.
 481 2010;23:5810–5825.

- 482 17. Mariani M, Fletcher MS, Holz A, Nyman P. ENSO controls interannual fire activity in southeast
 483 Australia. Geophys Res Lett. 2016;43:10891–900.
- 484 18. Bieli M, Pfahl S, Wernli H. A Lagrangian investigation of hot and cold temperature extremes in Europe.
 485 Quaterly Journal of the Royal Meteorological Society. 2015;141:98–108.
- 486 19. West H, Quinn N, Horswell M. Regional Rainfall Response to the North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO)
 487 across Great Britain. Hydrology Research. 2019;50(6):1549–63.
- 20. Zscheischler J, Seneviratne SI. Dependence of drivers affects risks associated with compound events.
 Science Advances. 2017;3:e1700263.
- 490 21. Mitchell-Wallace K, Jones M, Hillier JK, Foote M. Natural Catastrophe Risk Management and
 491 Modelling: A Practitioner's Guide. Oxford, UK: Wiley; 2017. 506 p.
- 22. Donat MG, Leckebusch GC, Wild S, Ulbrich U. Future changes in European winter storm losses and
 extreme wind speeds inferred from GCM and RCM multi-model simulations. Nat Hazards Earth Syst
 Sci. 2011;11:1351–1370.
- 495 23. Lavers DA, Allan RP, Villarini G, Lloyd-Hughes B, Brayshaw DJ, Wade AJ. Future changes in
 496 atmospheric rivers and their implications for winter flooding in Britain. Environmental Research
 497 Letters. 2013;8(3):034010.
- 498 24. Matthews T, Murphy C, McCarthy G, Broderik C, Wilby RL. Super Storm Desmond: a process-based
 499 assessment. Env Res Lett. 2018;13(1):014024.
- Solution F, van der Wiel K, van Oldenborgh GJ. Climate change increases the probability of heavy rains in
 Northern England/Southern Scotland like those of storm Desmond-a real-time event attribution
 revisited. Environmental Research Letters. 2018;13(2):024006.
- 503 26. Fink AH, Brucher T, Ermert V, Kruger A, Pinto JG. The European storm Kyrill in January 2007: Synoptic
 504 evolution, meteorological impacts and some considerations with respect to climate change. Nat
 505 Hazards Earth Syst Sci. 2009;9:405–23.
- 27. Raveh-Rubin. Large-scale wind and precipitation extremes in the Mediterranean: A climatological
 analysis for 1979–2012. Q J R Meteorol Soc. 2015;141:2404–17.
- Liberato MLR. The 19 January 2013 windstorm over the North Atlantic: Large-scale dynamics and
 impacts on Iberia. Weather Clim Extremes. 2014;5–6:16–28.
- S10 29. Matthews T, Murphy C, Wilby RL, Harrigan S. Stormiest winter on record for Ireland and UK. Nature
 S11 Climate Change. 2014;4:738–740.
- 30. De Luca P, Messori G, Pons FME, Faranda D. Dynamical systems theory sheds new light on compound
 climate extremes in Europe and Eastern North America. Quart J Royal Meteorol Soc. 2020;
- 514 31. Zscheischler J, Mahecha MD, von Buttlar J, Harmeling S, Jung M, Rammig A, et al. A few extreme
 515 events dominate global interannual variability in gross primary production. Env Res Lett.
 516 2014;9:035001.
- 517 32. Palin EJ, Scaife AA, Wallace E, Pope E, Arribas A, Brookshaw A. Skillful Seasonal Forecasts of Winter
 518 Disruption to the U.K. Transport System. Journal of Applied Meteorology and Climatology.
 519 2016;55:325–44.
- 520 33. Emanuel K. Increasing destructiveness of tropical cyclones overthe past 30 years. Nature.
 521 2005;436:686–8.

- 522 34. Klawa M, Ulbrich U. A model for the estimation of storm losses and the identification of severe winter
 523 storms in Germany. Nat Hazards Earth Syst Sci. 2003;3(6):725–32.
- 524 35. Geiger T, Frieler K, Bresch D. A global historical data set of tropical cyclone exposure (TCE-DAT). Earth
 525 System Science Data. 2013;10:185–194.
- 526 36. Hawker M. Climate Change and the Global Insurance Industry. The Geneva Papers. 2007;32:22–8.
- 527 37. Nordhaus W. The economics of hurricanes and implications of global warming. Climate Change
 528 Economics. 2010;1(1–20).
- 529 38. Southern RL. The global socio-economic impact of tropical cyclones. Aust MeteorolMag.
 530 1979;27:175–95.
- 39. Postance B, Hillier JK, Dijkstra T, Dixon N. Comparing threshold definition techniques for rainfall induced landslides: A national assessment using radar rainfall. Earth Surface Processes and
 Landforms. 2017;43(2):553–60.
- 40. Berghuijs WR, Harrigan S, Molnar P, Slater L, Kirchner JW. The relative importance of different floodgenerating mechanisms across Europe. Water Resour Res. 2019;55(6):4582–93.
- 41. Johnson SJ, Stockdale T, Ferranti L, Balmaseda M, Molteni F, Magnusson L, et al. SEAS5: the new
 ECMWF seasonal forecast system. Geosci Model Dev. 2019;12:1087–117.
- 538 42. CDS. CDS Home Page. 2020 [cited 2020 Apr 30]. Available from:
 539 https://cds.climate.copernicus.eu/#!/home
- 43. Osinski R, Lorenz P, Kruschke T, Voigt M, Ulbrich U, Leckebusch GC, et al. An approach to build an
 event set of European wind storms based on ECMWF EPS. Nat Hazards Earth Syst Sci Discuss.
 2016;16(1):255–68.
- 44. Walz MA, Leckebusch GC. Loss potentials based on an ensemble forecast: How likely are winter
 windstorm losses similar to 1990? Atmospheric Science Letters. 2019;

545 45. Stockdale T, Johnson S, Ferranti L, Balmaseda M, Briceag S. ECMWF's new long-range forecasting
546 system SEAS5. ECMWF Newsletter [Internet]. 2018 [cited 2020 Feb 12];154. Available from:
547 https://www.ecmwf.int/en/newsletter/154/meteorology/ecmwfs-new-long-range-forecasting548 system-seas5

- 46. van den Brink HW, Können GP, Opsteegh JD, van Oldenborgh GJ, Burgers G. Improving 10⁴-year
 surge level estimates using data of the ECMWF seasonal prediction system. Geophys Res Lett.
 2004;31:L17210.
- 47. Breivik Ø, Aarnes OJ, Abadalla S, Bidlot J-R, Janssen P. Wind and Wave Extremes over the World
 Oceans From Very Large Ensembles. Geophys Res Lett. 2014;41:5122–5131.
- 48. Thompson V, Dunstone NJ, Scaife AA, Smith DM, Slingo JM, Brown S, et al. High risk of unprecedented
 UK rainfall in the current climate. Nature communications. 2017;8(1):107.
- 49. Kelder T, Muller M, Slater L, Marjoribanks T, Wilby RL, Prudhomme C, et al. UNSEEN trends: Detecting
 decadal changes in 100-year precipitation extremes. In Prep.; Available from:
 https://eartharxiv.org/hyxeq/
- 50. Muir-Wood R, Drayton M, Berger A, Burgess P, Wright T. Catastrophe loss modelling of storm-surge
 flood risk in eastern England. Phil Trans Royal Soc London A. 2005;1407–22.

- 51. Lamb R, Keef C, Tawn J, Laeger S, Meadowcroft I, Surendran S, et al. A new method to assess the risk
 of local and widespread £ooding on rivers and coasts. Journal of Flood Risk Management.
 2010;3:323–36.
- 564 52. Wyncoll D, Gouldby B. Integrating a multivariate extreme value method within a system flood risk 565 analysis. Journal of Flood Risk Management. 2013;8(2):145–160.
- 566 53. Serinaldi F, Papalexiou SM. Random fields simplified: Preserving marginal distributions, correlations,
 567 and intermittency, with applications from rainfall to humidity. Water Resour Res.
 568 2020;56(2):e2019WR026331.
- 569 54. Wadsworth JL, Tawn JA, Davidson AC, Elton DM. Modelling across extremal dependence classes.
 570 Journal Of The Royal Statistical Society Series B. 2017;79(1):149–75.
- 571 55. Hao Z, Hao F, Singh VP, Xia Y, Shi C, Zhang X. A multivariate approach for statistical assessments of 572 compound extremes. Journal of Hydrology. 2018;565:87–94.
- 56. Hao Z, Singh VP, Hao F. Compound Extremes in Hydroclimatology: A Review. Water. 2018;10(6):art.
 no. 718.
- 575 57. Malby AR, Whyatt JD, Timmis RJ, Wilby RL, Orr HG. Long-term variations in orographic rainfall:
 analysis and implications for upland catchments. Hydrological Sciences. 2007;52(2):276–91.
- 577 58. Hewston R, Dorling SR. An analysis of observed daily maximum wind gusts in the UK. Journal of Wind
 578 Engineering and Industrial Aerodynamics. 2011;99:845–56.
- 59. Douglas CKM, Glasspoole J. Meteorological conditions in heavy orographic rainfall. Quart J Royal
 Meteorol Soc. 1947;73:11–38.
- 60. Hill FF, Browning KA, Bader MJ. Radar and rain gauge observations of orographic rain over south
 Wales. 1981;107:643–70.
- 583 61. Smith SA, Vosper SB, Field PR. Sensitivity of orographic precipitation enhancement to horizontal
 584 resolution in the operational Met Office Weather forecasts. Meteorological Applications.
 585 2012;22:14–24.
- 586 62. Bergeron T. On the low-level redistribution of atmospheric water caused by orography. In:
 587 Supplementary Proceedings of the International Conference on Cloud Physics. Tokyo, Japan.:
 588 IAMAP/WMO; 1965. p. 96–100.
- 589 63. Dore AJ, Choularton TW, Brown R, Blackall RM. Orographic rainfall enhancement in the mountains of
 590 the Lake District and Snowdonia. Atmospheric Environment. 1992;26A(3):357–71.
- 591 64. Sibley A, Cox D, Titley H. Coastal flooding in England and Wales from Atlantic and North Sea storms
 592 during the 2013/2014 winter. Weather. 2015;70(2):62–70.
- 593 65. Eden P, Burt S. Extreme rainfall in Cumbria, 18–20 November 2009. Weather. 2010;65(1):14.
- 66. Roberts NM, Cole SJ, Forbes RM, Moore RJ, Boswell D. Use of high-resolution NWP rainfall and river
 flow forecasts for advance warning of the Carlisle flood, north-west England. Meteorological
 Applications. 2009;16:23–34.
- 67. Geng Q, Sugi M. Variability of the North Atlantic Cyclone Activity in Winter Analyzed from NCEP–
 NCAR Reanalysis Data. Journal of Climate. 2001;14:3863–73.
- 68. Ulbrich U, Leckebusch GC, Pinto JG. Extra-tropical cyclones in the present and future climate: a
 review. Theor Appl Climatol. 2009;96:117–31.

- 601 69. Loridan T, Scherer E, Dixon M, Bellone E, Khare S. Cyclone Wind Field Asymmetries during
 602 Extratropical Transition in the Western North Pacific. Journal of Applied Meteorology and
 603 Climatology. 2014;53:421–8.
- 70. Vitolo R, Stephenson DS, Cook I, Mitchell-Wallace K. Serial clustering of intense European storms.
 Meteorologische Zeitschrift. 2009;18(4):411–424.
- 606 71. Kendon M, McCarthy M. The UK's wet and stormy winter of 2013/2014. Weather. 2015;7(2):40–47.
- Final Straight St
- 609 73. Wild S, Befort DJ, Leckebusch GC. Was the extreme storm season 2013-14 over the North Atlantic and
 610 the UK triggered by changes in the West-Pacific Warm Pool? Bulletin of the American
 611 Meteorological Society. 2015;
- 612 74. Smith RB. The influence of mountains on the atmosphere. Advances in Geophysics. 1979;21:87–230.
- 613 75. Sinclair MR. A diagnostic model for estimating orographic precipitation. Journal of Applied
 614 Meteorology. 1994;33:1163–75.
- 56. Stockham AJ, Schultz DM, Fairman JG, Draude AP. Quantifying the rain-shadow effect: Results from
 516 the Peak District, British Isles. Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society. 2018;778–90.
- 517 57. Silner N, Roe G, Durran D. On the dynamical causes of variability in the rain-shadow effect: A case
 518 study of the Washington Cascades. Journal of Hydrometeorology. 2013;14:122–39.
- 78. Mass C, Johnson N, Warner N, Vargas R. Synoptic control of cross-barrier precipitation ratios for the
 Cascade Mountains. Journal of Hydrometeorology. 2015;16:1014–28.
- Fiffa KR, Jones PD, Kelly PM. Principal component analysis of the Lamb catalogue of daily weather
 types: Part 2, Seasonal frequencies and update to 1987. International Journal of Climatology.
 1990;10(6):549–63.
- 80. Jones PD, Osborn TJ, Harpham C, Briffa KR. The Development of Lamb Weather types: from subjective
 analysis of weather charts to objective approaches using Reanalyses. Weather. 2014;69(5):128–32.
- 81. Wilby RL, Quinn NW. Reconstructing multi-decadal variations in fluvial flood risk using atmospheric
 circulation patterns. Journal of Hydrology. 2013;487:109–121.
- 82. Halliday O, Shafferty L, Tsaknias D, Siddaway A, Cloke H. Understanding the Risk from Correlated
 Windstorms and Floods in the UK. In Prep.; Available from:
 https://presentations.copernicus.org/EGU2020/EGU2020-20230_presentation.pdf
- 631 83. Ferranti EJS, Chapman L, Lowe C, McCulloch S, Jaroszweski D, Quinn AD. Heat-related failures on
 632 South-East England's railway network: insights and implications for heat-risk management. Weather
 633 Climate and Society. 2016;8:177–91.
- 634 84. Ferranti EJS, Jaroszweski D, Lee S, Chapman L, Lowe C, Quinn AD. The hottest day on the railway
 635 network; insights and thoughts for the future. Meteorological Applications. 2018;5:195–208.
- 636 85. HadUKP. 2019. Available from: https://www.metoffice.gov.uk/hadobs/hadukp/data/download.html
- 637 86. Hewston R. Quantifying the Impact of Historical and Future Climate Change on Windstorm Insured
 638 Loss in Great Britain [PhD]. [Norwich]: School of Environmental Sciences, University of East Anglia;
 639 2008.

0+1