Where does subduction initiate and cease? A global scale perspective.

Martina M. Ulvrova¹, Nicolas Coltice², Simon Williams³, and Paul J. Tackley¹

Corresponding author: M. Ulvrova, Department of Earth Sciences, Institute of Geophysics, ETH Zürich, Sonneggstrasse 5, Zürich, 8092, Switzerland. (martina.ulvrova@erdw.ethz.ch)

¹Institute of Geophysics, Department of

Earth Sciences, ETH Zürich, Zürich,

Switzerland.

²Laboratoire de Géologie, École Normale

Supérieure, CNRS-UMR 8538, PSL

Research University, Paris, France

³EarthByte Group, School of Geosciences,

University of Sydney, Sydney, New South

Wales, Australia

Abstract. The thermo-mechanical evolution of the Earth's mantle is largely controlled by the dynamics of subduction zones, which connect the surface 4 tectonic plates with the interior. However, little is known about the system-5 atics of where subduction starts and stops within the framework of global 6 plate motions and evolving continental configurations. Here, we investigate 7 where new subduction zones preferentially form, and where they endure and 8 cease using statistical analysis of large-scale simulations of mantle convecq tion that feature self-consistent plate-like lithospheric behaviour and con-10 tinental drift in the spherical annulus geometry. We juxtapose the results of 11 numerical modelling with subduction histories retrieved from plate tectonic 12 reconstruction models and from seismic tomography. Numerical models show 13 that subduction initiation is largely controlled by the strength of the litho-14 sphere and by the length of continental margins (for 2D models, the num-15 ber of continental margins). Strong lithosphere favors subduction inception 16 in the vicinity of the continents while for weak lithosphere the distribution 17 of subduction initiation follows a random process distribution. Reconstruc-18 tions suggest that subduction initiation and cessation on Earth is also not 19 randomly distributed within the oceans, and more subduction zones cease 20 in the vicinity of continental margins compared to subduction initiation. Our 21 model results also suggest that intra-oceanic subduction initiation is more 22 prevalent during times of supercontinent assembly (e.g. Pangea) compared 23 to more recent continental dispersal, consistent with recent interpretations 24 of relict slabs in seismic tomography. 25

DRAFT

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm

1. Introduction

Subduction of the rigid plates is a fundamental process in Earth evolution, allowing 26 chemical cycling between the surface and the deep mantle [Kerrick, 2001]. Indeed, the 27 surface and interior of the planet are interconnected within a self-organized system in 28 which subduction arises from an instability of the top boundary layer, while it also induces 29 convective currents and pulls tectonic plates [Lowman, 2011; Coltice et al., 2017]. The 30 evolution of the lithospheric plates including continents is then characterized by repeating 31 Wilson cycles during which ocean basins periodically close and open while supercontinents 32 assemble and disperse. However, little is known about subduction inception in the set-33 ting of global tectonics with floating continental rafts. How far from the continents do 34 new subduction zones preferentially form? How do plate motions influence subduction 35 inception? At which locations with respect to the position of the continental margins do subduction zones cease? 37

Few examples of active subduction inception or cessation are available to study. Young 38 subduction systems can be found at the Mussau Trench [Hegarty et al., 1982] and Yap 39 Trench [Lee, 2004] in the western Pacific, but it is not clear if these will develop into self-40 sustained subduction. Much of our knowledge on how subduction starts and stops is based 41 on the geological record, including marine studies of forearcs [Reagan et al., 2010] and 42 on-land studies of ophiolites [Dilek and Furnes, 2009], and on numerical modelling [e.g. 43 Nikolaeva et al., 2010]. These studies indicate that subduction may initiate in a diverse 44 range of tectonic settings; at passive margins [Nikolaeva et al., 2010], fracture zones such as 45 for example Aleutian subduction zone [Maffione et al., 2017], at extinct spreading centres 46

DRAFT

ULVROVA ET AL.: SUBDUCTION INITIATION AND CESSATION

⁴⁷ such as for example Puysegur [Lebrun et al., 2003], adjacent to fossil island arcs [Leng
⁴⁸ and Gurnis, 2015], triggered by plumes [Gerya et al., 2015], or where mantle suction flow
⁴⁹ occurs [Baes et al., 2018]. Stern [2004] proposes two distinct mechanisms for subduction
⁵⁰ initiation: spontaneous nucleation by e.g. foundering at passive margins, or induced
⁵¹ initiation involving forced convergence of existing plates.

In common with subduction initiation, cessation of subduction has been attributed to a 52 variety of mechanisms, including collision with continents or oceanic plateaus, interaction 53 between the subduction zone and spreading ridges and transforms, or within the context 54 of a broader-scale reorganisation of plate motions [e.g. Michaud et al., 2006]. Some ac-55 tive subduction systems undergo a so-called polarity reversal, when the overriding plate 56 becomes the subducting plate and vice versa. In such a case, subduction initiation and 57 termination are directly related. An example of reversal of an active convergent boundary 58 is the New Hebrides with the reversal of subduction of the Pacific beneath the Australian plate at the Vitiaz trench [Auzende et al., 1988]. 60

A limiting factor in our current knowledge on subduction is the reliance on geological 61 evidence collected on land, for example where former intra-oceanic subduction products 62 have been accreted onto continents. Consequently, it is difficult to constrain where and 63 when intra-oceanic arcs resided throughout their life cycle, and tectonic reconstructions 64 are often dominated by subduction systems close to continents [e.g. Müller and Landgrebe, 65 2012]. Recently, studies mapping slab remnants imaged in seismic tomography [van der 66 Meer et al., 2012; Domeier et al., 2017] point to the existence of previously unrecognized 67 intra-oceanic subduction zones within the Pacific/Panthalassa domain that would have 68 been active while Pangea was assembled or earlier in its dispersal, and much further from 69

DRAFT

X - 4

the continents than more recent examples. This raises the question of how important the
presence of continents is to the life cycle of subduction systems, and whether this influence
varies between periods of supercontinent assembly and continental dispersal.

In this paper, we investigate the pattern of subduction initiation and cessation in time 73 and space using numerical simulations of mantle convection. Numerical models are de-74 signed in a spherical annulus geometry, and we vary the number of continents, the strength 75 of the lithosphere and its structure. We compare aspects of the modelling results to recon-76 structed subduction histories based on both plate kinematics and analysis of slab remnants 77 imaged by seismic tomography [van der Meer et al., 2010, 2012; Müller et al., 2016]. We 78 focus on global scale models to infer how the continental configuration and the plate layout 79 change the distribution of subduction initiation and cessation, and the lifespan of subduc-80 tion zones. The models indicate that subduction initiation is non-randomly distributed 81 in the ocean, and cessation happens mostly in the vicinity of continents. Our calculations 82 point to different distributions of subduction inception between phases of supercontinents 83 and phases in which continents are dispersed... 84

2. Method

In order to investigate statistically the spatial relationships between continents and the initiation, evolution and cessation of subduction zones, we numerically calculate the solution of mantle convection in a spherical annulus [Hernlund and Tackley, 2008] using the StagYY code [Tackley, 2008]. The choice of geometry is motivated by the necessity of having long temporal series of several billions of years. Employment of the spherical annulus ensures similar scaling properties compared to the full 3D spherical shell. The model features self-consistently generated plate-like surface tectonics and drifting continents.

DRAFT

ULVROVA ET AL.: SUBDUCTION INITIATION AND CESSATION

2.1. Physical and numerical model

We determine temperature, velocity, pressure and composition within the mantle by solving the equations of conservation of mass, momentum and energy and the advection of material composition considering an incompressible mantle under the Boussinesq approximation. Below, the equations are given in their dimensionless form.

$$\boldsymbol{\nabla} \cdot \boldsymbol{v} = 0, \qquad (1)$$

$$\boldsymbol{\nabla} \cdot \left(\eta \left(\boldsymbol{\nabla} \boldsymbol{v} + (\boldsymbol{\nabla} \boldsymbol{v})^{\mathrm{T}} \right) \right) - \boldsymbol{\nabla} p = \operatorname{Ra} \left(T + B C \right) \boldsymbol{e}_{\mathbf{r}}, \qquad (2)$$

98

96 97 X - 6

$$\partial_t T + \boldsymbol{v} \cdot \boldsymbol{\nabla} T = \nabla^2 T + H \,, \tag{3}$$

108

$$\partial_t C + \boldsymbol{v} \cdot \boldsymbol{\nabla} C = 0, \qquad (4)$$

with \boldsymbol{v} the velocity, p the static pressure, η the viscosity, T the temperature, C the composition, H the internal heating rate, Ra the Rayleigh number, B the buoyancy ratio and \boldsymbol{e}_{r} the radial unit vector. ∂_{t} is the partial time derivative.

¹⁰⁶ Viscosity η follows the Arrhenius law and is strongly temperature and pressure depen-¹⁰⁷ dent

$$\eta(T,p) = \eta_A \exp\left(\frac{E_a + p V_a}{RT}\right), \qquad (5)$$

¹⁰⁹ where $E_a = 166 \text{ kJ mol}^{-1}$ is the activation energy (kept constant for all simulations), ¹¹⁰ $V_a = 6.34 \cdot 10^{-7} \text{ m}^3 \text{ mol}^{-1}$ the activation volume (constant for all simulations) and R =¹¹¹ $8.314 \text{ J mol}^{-1} \text{ K}^{-1}$ the gas constant. We give all parameters in Table 1. η_A is set such that ¹¹² η matches the reference viscosity η_0 at zero pressure and at temperature 1600 K, which ¹¹³ is the expected temperature at the base of the lithosphere. We apply a viscosity cut off ¹¹⁴ at 10^4 times η_0 . The viscosity varies over 6 orders of magnitude over the temperature ¹¹⁵ variation ΔT , the superadiabatic temperature drop over the mantle. Independently of

DRAFT July 18, 2019, 4:11pm DRAFT

temperature, viscosity increases exponentially by an order of magnitude with depth. The lowest values of the viscosity are in the asthenospheric mantle, while at the core mantle boundary viscosity is about 20 times lower than η_0 .

To localize deformation in narrow zones and obtain realistic plate boundaries at the surface, we use a pseudoplastic rheology [Moresi and Solomatov, 1998; Tackley, 2000a, b]. After reaching a certain threshold value, the yield stress $\sigma_{\rm Y}$, the rocks undergo plastic yielding. $\sigma_{\rm Y}$ is depth dependent and follows

$$\sigma_{\rm Y} = \sigma_0 + d\,\sigma_{\rm Y}'\,,\tag{6}$$

where σ_0 is the surface yield stress, d is the depth and σ'_Y is the yield stress depth derivative. If the stress reaches σ_Y , we calculate the effective viscosity η_{eff} on the grid

$$\eta_{\text{eff}} = \min\left[\eta(T, p), \eta_{\text{Y}}\right], \tag{7}$$

¹²⁷ with $\eta_{\rm Y}$ as

12

$$\eta_{\rm Y} = \frac{\sigma_Y}{2\dot{\epsilon}_{\rm II}}\,.\tag{8}$$

 $\dot{\epsilon}_{\text{II}}$ is the second invariant of the strain rate tensor. We vary the surface strength σ_0 of the lithosphere between 7 MPa and 56 MPa while keeping the gradient constant for all simulations at 810 Pa m⁻¹.

¹³² Using this kind of rheology results in the self-consistent formation of strong plate in-¹³³ teriors moving with a uniform velocity delimited by narrow plate boundaries character-¹³⁴ ized by reduced viscosity and an abrupt velocity change [Moresi and Solomatov, 1998; ¹³⁵ Tackley, 2000b]. Importantly, such rheology successfully reproduces seafloor age dis-¹³⁶ tributions [Coltice et al., 2012] and is sufficiently realistic to investigate global surface ¹³⁷ tectonics [Coltice et al., 2017; Ulvrova et al., 2019].

One of the important Earth-like features that is in general lacking in such convection 138 models is single-sided subduction, i.e., subduction is often double-sided. This can be 139 partially overcome by imposing a weak layer of oceanic oceanic crust at the surface, which 140 gets advected into the subduction channel and hence decouples to a certain degree the 141 sinking slab from the overriding plate, resulting in strong subduction asymmetry [Gerya 142 et al., 2008; Crameri and Tackley, 2014]. In some of our simulations we include this weak 143 crustal layer using tracers. The weak crustal layer is neutrally buoyant, and it follows the 144 same viscosity law as ambient mantle but is characterized by a factor of 10 reduction in η_A 145 and it is more easily deformable (surface yield stress 18 MPa, yield gradient $8.1 \,\mathrm{Pa}\,\mathrm{m}^{-1}$). 146 The initial thickness of the weak crustal layer is 20 km and it is converted to a regular 147 mantle after reaching 290 km depth. In one case, we further improve the model and 148 obtain one-sided subduction zones by imposing a free surface that can vertically deform. 149 This is done using the so-called sticky-air method [Matsumoto and Tomoda, 1983] when 150 vertical deformation of the mantle surface is allowed by prescribing an additional layer 151 of "air" atop of the mantle. This layer is permanently forced to be isothermal (300 K), 152 has close to zero density and very low viscosity, allowing it to be decoupled from the 153 lithosphere. To obtain a valid solution, the air layer must be sufficiently thick while 154 having low viscosity [Crameri et al., 2012]. We fix its initial thickness to 150 km and keep 155 its viscosity at 10^{-3} times η_0 . This results in a high viscosity contrast between the plates 156 at the surface and the air layer. The viscosity contrast is as high as 10^7 . 157

¹⁵⁸ Continental rafts are modeled using the tracer-ratio method [Tackley and King, 2003]. ¹⁵⁹ The detailed implementation is described elsewhere [Tackley and King, 2003; Rolf and ¹⁶⁰ Tackley, 2011]. We consider continents with an interior that is 300 km thick surrounded

DRAFT

by 140 km thick mobile belts in accordance with the thickness of the Archean cratons 161 and Proterozoic belts. Continents cover 30% of the model surface. In order to ensure the 162 stability of the continents, two conditions must be fulfilled: positive buoyancy and limited 163 deformation within continents [e.g. Doin et al., 1997; Lenardic and Moresi, 1999]. Based 164 on this, we choose a density contrast between continental material and ambient mantle 165 of $-100 \,\mathrm{kg}\,\mathrm{m}^{-3}$, which gives the buoyancy ratio (ratio between the density contrast and 166 the thermal density variation) of -0.4. Furthermore, continents are $100 \times$ more viscous 167 than the ambient mantle and do not undergo pseudo-plastic deformation. Due to this 168 high rigidity, continental erosion by mantle flow is negligible and the rafts are stable over 169 billions of years. 170

The system is driven by heating from radioactive elements and from heat conducted from the core. We keep the internal heating rate H constant at $5.44 \times 10^{-12} \,\mathrm{W \, kg^{-1}}$ throughout the simulations. Core heat loss contributes around 20% to the total surface heat flow, falling into the 10%–40% estimate for the Earth [Jaupart et al., 2015]. Both the top and the bottom boundaries are isothermal and free-slip, except for the case with a free deformable mantle surface, for which the top boundary of the computational domain is no-slip above the air layer.

The convective vigour of the system is measured by the Rayleigh number Ra

$$Ra = \frac{\rho_0 g \alpha \Delta T D^3}{\kappa \eta_0} , \qquad (9)$$

where ρ_0 is the reference density, g the gravitational acceleration, α the thermal expansivity, ΔT is the superadiabatic temperature drop across the mantle with the thickness D, κ is the thermal diffusivity and η_0 is the reference viscosity. For all experiments, we keep Ra = 10⁶ (calculated with $\eta_0 = 6 \times 10^{22} \text{ Pa s}$). This is $10 - 100 \times$ lower than the

Earth's Rayleigh number, but lies at the edge of the computational feasibility for the
 given rheology and the presence of sticky air.

We use a resolution of 128×1024 cells in the radial and horizontal directions, respec-184 tively, except for the case with the free surface when we use a grid with 256×2048 cells. 185 Vertical grid refinement close to the top and bottom limits is employed resulting in 10 km 186 and 15 km (5 km and 8 km for the case with the sticky air) thick cells at the surface and 187 at the core-mantle boundary (cf. more details in the supplementary material). To track 188 composition, we use 4×10^7 tracers. This means that on average there are around 300 189 tracers per cell except in simulations with a free surface, which have higher resolution. In 190 this case, the number of tracers per cell is around 75. 191

First, we run a model until it reaches a statistically steady state, at which the heat 192 budget is balanced and characteristic properties of the system such as mean temperature, 193 mean velocity and average surface heat flux fluctuate around some constant values. In this 194 initial stage, we do not advect tracers and hence the composition field remains the same 195 throughout the initialization period, which means that continents do not move from their 196 initial positions. Once statistically steady state is achieved, we use a random snapshot 197 from the equilibrated evolution to start the calculation with continents that move freely. 198 The choice of the particular snapshot from the statistically steady state does not have any 199 influence on the statistics performed on the system. The model is run until a sufficient 200 number of subduction initiations N is collected. The shortest analyzed period is 1 Gy with 201 27 subduction initiation events. The longest analyzed period is 7 Gy with 288 detected 202 subduction initiations. The length of the simulation does not have any influence on the 203 results as soon as N is large enough and statistically representative of the system. The 204

DRAFT

²⁰⁵ parameters of the calculations are listed in Table 1. We vary the strength of the oceanic
²⁰⁶ lithosphere and number of continents, and we test how the presence of the weak crustal
²⁰⁷ layer and presence of a free surface alter the results. In total, we run 13 models having
²⁰⁸ different parameterizations.

2.2. Model analysis

To detect subduction inception and follow its evolution, we analyze the divergence of 209 the surface velocity. As soon as a negative peak of the surface velocity divergence appears 210 (the threshold of detection being minus one tenth of the surface rms velocity), a new 211 subduction zone is formed. The motion of this peak is then tracked through time and we 212 record the distance to the closest continental margin until the peak disappears. For each 213 case we specifically register this distance at subduction inception and at cessation. These 214 values are further analyzed by calculating a cumulative distribution of the distance to 215 the closest continental margin specifically when subduction starts and ends. To construct 216 these distributions we bin the range of all possible distances into 500 km wide intervals. 217 We then count the cumulative number of detected distances falling into a specific bin. 218 All subduction zones that initiate at a continental margin fall into the first bin. The 219 long duration of each model allows us to collect up to several hundreds of subduction 220 initiations, typically several tens of them. 221

To investigate systematic patterns within the distributions retrieved from the models, we use a Monte Carlo method and calculate the synthetic distribution for subduction zones initiating at random positions within oceans. At each model time we generate a set of randomly located points within the oceans, which together we take to have a spatial distribution equivalent to scenarios where subduction initiation or cessation locations

DRAFT

X - 12 ULVROVA ET AL.: SUBDUCTION INITIATION AND CESSATION

is also randomly distributed. For models with one continent, the cumulative frequency 227 of random point locations as a function of distance to the continent is a straight line 228 since the distance between the two continental margins is constant through time and the 229 probability that a subduction zone initiates at a certain location is uniform. For more 230 than one continent, the distribution is typically curved. This allows us to show how the 231 modelled subduction distributions deviate from the random one. However, it is necessary 232 that a sufficiently large number of random subduction initiations is generated at each 233 time level, in total at least several thousand. To estimate the variance of the random 234 distribution, we calculate distributions of N subduction initiation events that happen 235 at random times and random positions. N is the number of initiations detected in the 236 particular model. 237

3. Results

The organization of the system dictates its dynamic evolution: sinking slabs drive 238 plate motion while inducing the mantle flow that in turn is at the origin of the plate 239 motion (Figure 1). Plate-like behaviour is developed self-consistently using the yielding 240 rheology (cf. Section 2.2) with a surface velocity that is constant in plate interiors while 241 changing abruptly over plate boundaries. Since the system is heated mainly by internal 242 heat sources (and we keep the internal heating rate constant for all simulations), sinking 243 slabs and surface plates that compose the upper boundary layer dominate over plumes 244 created at the core-mantle boundary. In particular, around 20% of the total surface heat 245 flux is due to heating the mantle from the core. . The core derived fraction of the 246 total surface heat flux is very similar for all models, with differences smaller than 1%. 247 When looking at the temperature structure of the system (Figure 1b,e,h), one can note 248

DRAFT

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm

that there is a strong subadiabatic gradient (Figure 1c,f,i). This is partly because the system is internally heated but more importantly negative gradients arise due to pressure dependent viscosity [Christensen, 1985].

Subduction zones (and in this study we refer to subduction zones as convective down-252 welling currents in the numerical simulations) next to continental margins are one-sided 253 while a distinctive asymmetry is observed for intra-oceanic subduction zones (cf. Figure 1) 254 and animation S1 in the supporting material). The degree of asymmetry in the latter case 255 changes through time and differs among models. The dip angle with which plates sink into 256 the mantle is generally large (close to vertical, Figure 1a) but more realistic behaviour is 257 observed (i.e. shallower dip angles) in models with the weak crustal layer that allows par-258 tial decoupling between the sinking and overriding plates (Figure 1d), or in models with 259 a free surface (Figure 1g). However, these models are still far from producing Earth-like 260 subduction zones in their entirety, with modeled sinking plates commonly experiencing 261 phases of symmetrical subduction during their lifespans, for example at their inception 262 or during polarity flips (Figure 2). Crameri and Tackley [2014] have observed polarity 263 reversals for intra-oceanic subduction in models with a similar parameterization but in 264 3D. Our models also show polarity reversals at the continent-ocean boundary (Figure 2). 265

3.1. Influence of lithospheric strength

To investigate the impact of the lithospheric strength on subduction initiation we run several models with different yield stress σ_0 , which we vary between 7 and 56 MPa. The plate size hence number of subduction zones is strongly influenced by how difficult it is for the lithosphere to localize deformation, which is directly related to the value of σ_0 . Decreasing the surface yield stress results in weaker oceanic lithosphere and smaller

DRAFT

plates [Moresi and Solomatov, 1998; Tackley, 2000b; Coltice et al., 2017; Langemeyer 271 et al., 2018]. For low yield stress ($\sigma_0 = 7 \text{ MPa}$), a large population of subduction zones 272 exists at a given instant, fluctuating around 7 and 8 (cf. histogram on Figure 3a). The 273 distribution of subduction initiation within the oceans can be characterized as a random 274 process distribution as it follows the distribution of subduction zones that are randomly 275 initiated in within oceans (Figure 3a). There are small deviations of the distribution 276 from the mean synthetic random distribution, which fall into the variance of the random 277 distribution. This is due to finite number of subduction zones collected for this model 278 (N = 89). The fact that these deviations are small indicates that the number of subduc-279 tion zones collected is sufficient. The number of subduction zones that are formed in the 280 vicinity of a continental margin (closer than 500 km) is small, around 5% (Figure 3a). A 281 stiffer lithosphere ($\sigma_0 = 35$ MPa, Figure 3b) promotes subduction initiation proximal to 282 continents, with around 30% of subduction zones being formed close to continental mar-283 gins. Within this case, the influence of the continents on subduction initiation is strongest 284 close to the continents, which is in accordance with previous studies that showed stress 285 focusing at the continental margins [Rolf and Tackley, 2011]. Beyond a certain threshold 286 distance from the continents the probability of subduction initiation is essentially random. 287 For intermediate yield stress ($\sigma_0 = 35 \text{ MPa}$) this distance is around 3000 km (Figure 3b). 288 For very stiff lithosphere ($\sigma_0 = 56 \text{ MPa}$), the distance within which continents influence 289 the stress distribution becomes greater still, with no clear threshold between random and 290 controlled behaviour (Figure 3c). The frequency of subduction initiation in the immediate 291 proximity of continental margins is further increased and is close to 40% for strong oceans 292 with few (around two) subduction zones on average (Figure 3c and Figure 4a). 293

DRAFT

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm

X - 15

Subduction zones that are formed next to a continental margin stay glued to the con-294 tinent their whole existence (Figure 5). In contrast, subduction zones that initiate as 295 intra-oceanic reside in the oceans where they either merge with another subduction zone 296 or migrate in the oceans before reaching a continental margin where they endure for some 297 time before ceasing (Figure 5). In some cases, a subduction zone retreats toward the con-298 tinent and once it hits the margin, subduction continues with a reversed polarity (Figure 299 2). Rarely, a subduction zone is formed and ceases as intra-oceanic without colliding with 300 another convergence zone (Figure 5). In the weak lithosphere case, termination is random 301 just like initiation (Figure 3a). Where the continents have an influence, subduction zones 302 are more likely to terminate adjacent to continents than to initiate there, which is pre-303 sumably a consequence of intra-oceanic subduction zones being able to migrate freely, but 304 once they migrate to a continental margin subduction zones stay there until they cease 305 (Figure 3b and c).

3.2. Influence of number of continental margins

Repeated continental assembly and dispersal are observed on Earth in the cycles that 307 last for several 100 Myr [e.g. Rogers and Santosh, 2004]. The length of the continen-308 tal margins thus varies according to the continental configuration, being minimal when 309 continents are aggregated and maximal when dispersed. To investigate the influence of 310 the number of continental margins on the position of subduction initiation within our 311 annulus models, we perform a set of calculations with one, two and three continental rafts 312 (where each raft has two margins), while keeping the total cover of continents constant at 313 30% of the annulus. The number of continental margins in 2D models corresponds to the 314 length of the continental margins in 3D. In these models, we keep the yield stress fixed 315

DRAFT

X - 16 ULVROVA ET AL.: SUBDUCTION INITIATION AND CESSATION

 $(\sigma_0 = 35 \text{ MPa})$ and include a weak crustal layer at the surface. The number of subduction 316 zones fluctuates around four or five (cf. histograms on Figure 6). With increasing num-317 ber of continental margins, the number of intra-oceanic subduction initiations decreases, 318 regardless of whether a weak crustal layer is present (cf. Figure 4b). In particular, subduc-319 tion initiation at continental margins increases from 30% for the case with one continent 320 to 67% for three continents (cf. Figure 4b and 6). Two fundamental results are consistent 321 across all model cases: firstly, all cases significantly differ from initiation at random po-322 sition for the chosen lithospheric strength; secondly, we systematically observe that more 323 subduction zones cease at a continental margin compared to the initiation position (cf. 324 Figure 6). Both these relationships are weakest for the case with a single continent (cf. 325 Figure 6a). The threshold distance below which the effect of continents is negligible and 326 the distribution follows a random distribution of subduction initiation increases with in-327 creasing number of continental margins and is around 4000 km, 6000 km and 7000 km for 328 cases with two, four and six continental margins (Figure 6). 329

3.3. Asymmetric subduction zones

At the surface of the Earth, during a collision of two oceanic plates, one of them subducts 330 into the mantle while the overriding plate stays at the surface. Although numerical mod-331 els still have limited ability to produce such behavior, strong asymmetry of sinking slabs 332 is observed in our models as is described in the beginning of this section. The simplest 333 model, with a free-slip surface and no weak crustal layer features the least realistic sub-334 duction dipping angles and longer periods of vertical descent. In this case, about 45% of 335 subduction inceptions are adjacent to the continental margins (Figure 7a). For more com-336 plex models with more realistic slab dip angles due to lubrication and partial decoupling 337

DRAFT

at the interface between the two colliding plates (models with the weak crustal layer), it is 338 more likely that subduction initiates at the continental margin; close to 60% of detected 339 subduction zones start in the vicinity of the continent (Figure 7b). This is because the 340 lateral density gradient between continental and oceanic lithosphere produces additional 341 compressive stresses that would drive continents to spread below the free-slip boundary, 342 if the viscosity was low enough. Hence compressive stresses focus at the continent ocean 343 boundary [Nikolaeva et al., 2010; Rolf and Tackley, 2011] and favour subduction initiation. 344 In combination with a weak crustal layer having lower yield stress and hence localizing 345 deformation more easily, more subduction zones initiate at the continental margins. For 346 the models with a free, deformable surface that features more realistic slab dips and stress 347 states, the number of initiation events at the continental margins drops to around 30%348 (Figure 7c). In this case, the free surface allows the continent to hamper continent spread-349 ing by generating a topography that can accommodate a fraction of the stresses at the 350 continent ocean boundary and the lateral density difference between the continents and 351 the mantle through isostasy. 352

3.4. Reconstructions of subduction, initiation, and cessation

The timing and location of past subduction can be reconstructed from geological and geophysical constraints, though such reconstructions are subject to large uncertainties over the timescales of supercontinent cycles (several hundred Myr). In particular, the lengths and locations of plate boundaries within the oceanic realm far from continents are poorly known, increasingly so further back in time, since the crust that comprised these regions is scarcely preserved at the present day. We compare two reconstructions of subduction history (Figure 8) that are derived by different methods, and use these as

DRAFT

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm

X - 17

X - 18 ULVROVA ET AL.: SUBDUCTION INITIATION AND CESSATION

points of comparison with numerical model behaviour. The first reconstruction maps the 360 extent of subduction zones within a globally self-consistent framework of plate boundary 361 configurations and plate kinematics [Müller et al., 2016]; the second reconstruction uses 362 subducted slab signatures mapped within seismic tomography models as the primary line 363 of evidence [van der Meer et al., 2010, 2012]. Both reconstructions attempt to reconcile 364 geologic observations from arc remnants to some extent, but nonetheless differ in many 365 aspects - notably, slab remnants interpreted from seismic tomography suggest a much 366 larger population of intra-oceanic subduction zones. Qualitatively, subduction zones in 367 the Müller et al. [2016] reconstruction are typically closer to the continents compared to 368 those in the interpretation of van der Meer et al. [2010, 2012] (Figure 8). Below we describe 369 a first-order quantification of the proximity to continents of subducting segments and their 370 initiation and cessation both reconstructions, which offers some degree of comparison 371 with the results of the numerical simulations described in Section 2.2. The supporting 372 material contains the computer code and data files used to perform this analysis and a 373 detailed explanation of the steps we followed. 374

In computing distributions functions for reconstructions, uncertainty arises when we 375 attempt to measure the distance from individual segments along a subduction zone to the 376 nearest continent - such measurements require a clear definition of what does and does 377 not constitute a continent within the reconstructions. The distinction is not clear-cut for 378 the Earth, which contains a spectrum of stretched, submerged continental fragments that 379 have not conventionally been considered continents [e.g. Mortimer et al., 2017], and where 380 the nature of the crust in the overriding plate can change significantly along strike for 381 individual arcs (for example the present-day Aleutian arc). Using a set of reconstructable 382

DRAFT

polygons defining major continental blocks (Figure 8, see also supporting information) we first derived the curves in Figure 9 by generating sets of randomly distributed points within the oceans at different reconstruction times. We then compute the distance of each point to the nearest continent boundary, and plot the cumulative distribution functions of these distances subdivided into 25 Myr time windows. These results provide a visual baseline to show how the distances to the continents of subduction segments compare to the pattern expected from a random process, similar to that used in Figures 3, 6 and 7

³⁹⁰ but on a spherical Earth rather than an annulus.

383

384

385

386

387

388

389

For the Müller et al. [2016] reconstruction, we extract subduction zone geometries at 1 391 Myr intervals and resample each line geometry to uniformly spaced half-degree segments. 392 We compute the distance of segment mid-points to the nearest continent boundary, such 393 that the distances that contribute to the cumulative distributions may vary significantly 394 along each distinct line feature. These distances are illustrated for each reconstruction 395 time in animation S2, and form the basis of the cumulative distribution functions in 396 Figure 9b where the results are subdivided into 25 Myr time bins. Subduction initiation 397 and termination is not explicitly encoded into the kinematic reconstruction, and so we 398 used simple criteria to detect initiating and ceasing segments. The main criterion is that 399 initiating or ceasing segments will not lie within a threshold distance of any segment from 400 the network of subduction zones from 1 Myr earlier or later. The threshold is required 401 because trenches where subduction is ongoing will migrate by a finite amount over 1 Myr 402 (animation S2), and we use a threshold distance of 200 km to allow for the magnitude 403 of trench migration expected within 1 Myr [Williams et al., 2015]. An exception to this 404 criterion is segments that lie within this threshold distance, but where the pair of plates 405

DRAFT

X - 20 ULVROVA ET AL.: SUBDUCTION INITIATION AND CESSATION

that bound the adjacent segments differs between successive plate boundary snapshots 1
Myr apart (occurring for example in cases of reconstructed subduction polarity reversal,
which we consider as termination of existing subduction and initiation of a new segment).
Locations of subduction initiation and cessation defined in this way are highlighted in
animation S2, and the distances to the nearest continents at these points form the basis
of the cumulative distribution functions in Figure 9c.

For subduction history interpreted from seismic tomography, we compute the distance 412 to the nearest continent of the line geometries defined by these previous studies at discrete 413 reconstruction times being 7 to 17 Myr apart. We make an important distinction between 414 slabs tabulated in van der Meer et al. [2010] (Figure 9e) and the longer list of slabs 415 considered in van der Meer et al. [2012] (Figure 9d). For the former, the top and bottom 416 slab ages are available and we take them as the timings of subduction termination and 417 initiation respectively. The histories of additional slabs mapped in van der Meer et al. 418 [2012] are not defined with the same level of detail. Consequently we do not include 419 pre-Cenozoic subduction interpreted from slab remnants beneath the Pacific in two of our 420 distribution plots (Figure 9e,f). 421

With these limitations in mind, we ask the question as to whether the patterns of subduction initiation and cessation contained within current reconstructions follow a similar distribution to that observed in our numerical models. The distribution of subduction in relation to continents from the alternative subduction histories is illustrated using cumulative distribution functions (Figure 9), providing some analogy to the annulus model results. For both subduction histories, the overall distribution of ongoing subduction is typically closer to the continents than expected for randomly distributed points within

DRAFT

the oceans (Figure 9b,d,e). This pattern is particularly pronounced for the Müller et al. 429 [2016] kinematic reconstruction (Figure 9b), which lacks many intra-oceanic systems in-430 terpreted by van der Meer et al. [2010, 2012] from seismic tomography. When we isolate 431 subduction initiation and cessation (Figure 9c,f), a further trend emerges that is apparent 432 in both kinematic and tomography-based subduction histories - subduction cessation is 433 typically closer to the continents than subduction initiation. This trend is only absent in 434 the poorly resolved pre-100 Ma section of the Müller et al. [2016] reconstruction and the 435 results do not show an obvious distinction between the periods before and after 100 Ma, 436 broadly corresponding to the periods of initial and later stages of dispersal of Pangea. 437 However, since the distributions for tomography-based initiation and termination do not 438 include additional slabs interpreted to have existed within the middle of the Panthalassic 439 ocean (Figure 8), the proportion of cases far from continents while Pangea was assembled 440 are likely to be underestimated in our plots. 441

4. Discussion

Previous studies into the effect of continents on mantle dynamics have shown that con-442 tinents increase the wavelength of the convective flow [e.g. Guillou and Jaupart, 1995] and 443 influence heat loss out of the system as they act as thermal insulators [e.g. Lenardic and 444 Moresi, 1999; Rolf et al., 2012]. Importantly, numerical simulations and laboratory exper-445 iments suggest that continents change the lithospheric stress distribution and facilitate 446 subduction initiation [e.g. Nikolaeva et al., 2010; Rolf and Tackley, 2011]. However, sys-447 tematic study of the locations of subduction initiation and their ensuing evolution taking 448 into account global tectonic settings has received very little attention. 449

DRAFT

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm

X - 22 ULVROVA ET AL.: SUBDUCTION INITIATION AND CESSATION

Comparison between the distribution of subduction in numerical simulations and those 450 inferred from reconstructions offers insight into the most plausible model parameters. 451 Models in which the lithospheric strength is low, such that subduction is effectively ran-452 domly distributed within the oceans, are inconsistent with the inferred patterns of sub-453 duction on Earth during the last >200 Myr (Figure 9). Instead, the distributions from 454 reconstructions are more compatible with scenarios in which the lithospheric strength is 455 relatively high, such that the continents generate a strain shadow promoting subduction 456 initiation closer to the continents. This region adjacent to margins is loaded by the den-457 sity and topography contrast between continent and ocean lithosphere. Therefore, the 458 lithosphere more readily yields upon experiencing additional stresses produced by convec-459 tion, whereas the same convective stresses alone are less likely to reach the yield criterion 460 further from continents. 461

In models where sites of initiation of subduction are biased towards regions close to 462 continents, the distribution of subduction throughout its duration and cessation is also 463 naturally biased towards these regions. Subduction that initiates at a continental margin 464 remains there until it ceases. Subduction systems initiating in the oceans may migrate 465 towards or away from the nearby continental margins; those that reach the continent mar-466 gin become continental arcs, and remain so until subduction ceases. Hence, the control 467 of continents on patterns of subduction initiation influences the distribution of subduc-468 tion cessation, such that subduction termination along continental margins occurs more 469 frequently than subduction initiation, even in the absence of continent-continent collision. 470 Comparison between models with different numbers of continents (and therefore mar-471 gins) offers an insight into the different distributions of subduction that we may expect 472

during different phases of the supercontinent cycle. Cases with two or three distinct con-473 tinents (analogous to periods of continental dispersal such as the last ~ 100 Myr on Earth) 474 are more favorable to subduction initiation close to continental margins - in contrast, when 475 the annulus includes only one continent (analogous to a supercontinent such as Pangea), 476 the area influenced by the continental strain shadow effect is reduced and the proportion 477 of subduction initiations (and terminations) occurring within the oceans increases. This 478 result contrasts with the results for the Müller et al. [2016] kinematic reconstruction, 479 where very little subduction initiates, evolves, or ceases far from continents prior to 100 480 Ma (Figure 9b,c). However, distributions from kinematic reconstructions also contrast 481 with those for alternative subduction histories interpreted from seismic tomography - in 482 particular when these take into account Triassic-Jurassic, intra-Panthalassa subduction 483 systems of van der Meer et al. [2012], illustrated in Figure 8 and included in the distri-484 bution of Figure 9d but not included in Figure 9f. The ages and locations of subduction 485 initiation for these systems is unknown, but it is reasonable to infer that some or all of 486 these systems initiated far from Pangea. 487

In addition to the global studies of van der Meer et al. [2010] and van der Meer et al. 488 [2012], regional studies have also interpreted tomography to reveal previously unrecog-489 nised intra-oceanic subduction zones existing within Panthalassa during the Cretaceous 490 and earlier [Domeier et al., 2017; Sigloch and Mihalynuk, 2013]. Furthermore, numerical 491 models of past mantle flow constrained by subduction histories similar to that of Müller 492 et al. [2016] produce present-day temperature fields that show good agreement with deep 493 mantle seismic velocity variations imaged by tomography to first-order [Flament et al., 494 2017] but yield regional mismatches around parts of the Pacific which may be resolved 495

DRAFT

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm

X - 24 ULVROVA ET AL.: SUBDUCTION INITIATION AND CESSATION

when additional intra-oceanic subduction zones are incorporated [e.g. Braz et al., 2018]. 496 The emerging view from observations is that intra-oceanic subduction was more preva-497 lent during Pangea's existence and early breakup than previously recognised. Our model 498 results in which intra-oceanic subduction initiation and evolution is favoured during su-499 percontinental assembly are consistent with this view, even though our models lack many 500 features of real-world plate tectonics. Even during supercontinent assembly we would still 501 expect a greater likelihood of intra-oceanic subduction initiation proximal to continental 502 margins in the geological record [e.g. Maffione et al., 2017]. 503

One must keep in mind that numerical simulations have certain limitations. Primarily, 504 the study relies on 2D calculations, in which only poloidal flow can exist. We do not 505 consider any 3D characteristics of mantle flow such as toroidal motion around lateral slab 506 edges that can slow down descending slabs [Li and Ribe, 2012]. The models operate at 507 a Rayleigh number that is lower than the Earth's and hence result in thicker boundary 508 layers, less vigorous convection and surface heat flow and plate velocities lower than what 509 is expected for our planet. Although basal heating in the models (representing around 510 20% of the total surface heat flux) falls into the estimated range of the Earth's basal 511 heat flux portion [Jaupart et al., 2015], we fix the internal heating rate and we possibly 512 underestimate the influence of plumes. Subduction can be initiated when plumes provide 513 sufficient additional stresses causing local weakening of the lithosphere after hitting the 514 subsurface [Gerya et al., 2008]. However, this is not our case since the plumes in the 515 models are relatively weak and hence only rarely trigger the formation of new convergent 516 boundaries. Importantly, the employed rheology neglects any past deformation of the 517 lithosphere and reflects only the instantaneous stress distribution. However, on Earth 518

DRAFT

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm

⁵¹⁹ plates have memory of previous yielding and can be damaged or undergo healing [e.g ⁵²⁰ Bercovici and Ricard, 2016].

5. Conclusions

We present an assessment of where subduction initiates and ceases in global convec-521 tion models with a plate-like surface and continental drift. We compare the results of 522 numerical simulations with distributions of subduction initiation and cessation retrieved 523 from plate tectonics reconstructions and seismic tomography models. We show that the 524 location of subduction initiation and cessation is not randomly distributed within the 525 oceans on Earth. Subduction zones that are formed at continental margins tend to stay 526 there, while subduction zones formed within the oceans migrate and merge with other 527 intra-oceanic subduction zones, or reach continental margins where subduction usually 528 continues, changing polarity before eventually ceasing. Hence, we systematically find 529 that more subduction zones cease in the vicinity of continental margins compared to sub-530 duction initiation. Numerical models indicate that the critical parameters that influence 531 the position of subduction initiation are the lithospheric strength and the number of con-532 tinental margins. Stronger lithosphere (which implies larger plates and fewer subduction 533 zones [Tackley, 2000b]) increases the probability of subduction initiation in the vicinity of 534 continental margins. With our numerical simulations we also predict that intra-oceanic 535 subduction initiation is more likely during the times of supercontinent assembly, while 536 continental dispersal favors incipient subduction close to continents. These results favour 537 interpretations of intra-oceanic subduction systems within the Panthalassa Ocean during 538 the time of Pangea based on seismic tomography van der Meer et al., 2012; Van Der Meer 539 et al., 2014, which are missing from earlier plate tectonic reconstructions. 540

DRAFT

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm

ULVROVA ET AL.: SUBDUCTION INITIATION AND CESSATION

Acknowledgments. The support for this research has been provided by the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation program under the ERC grant agreement n°617588 and the Marie Skłodowska Curie grant agreement n°753755. Simulations were performed on the AUGURY super-computer at P2CHPD Lyon. The StagPy library was used in this study to process StagYY output data (https://github.com/StagPython/StagPy). The pygplates library was used to analyse plate tectonic reconstructions (https://www.gplates.org/docs/pygplates/).

References

X - 26

- ⁵⁴⁸ Auzende, J.M., Lafoy, Y., Marsset, B., 1988. Recent geodynamic evolution of the north
 ⁵⁴⁹ Fiji basin (southwest Pacific). Geology 16, 925–929.
- ⁵⁵⁰ Baes, M., Sobolev, S.V., Quinteros, J., 2018. Subduction initiation in mid-ocean induced
 ⁵⁵¹ by mantle suction flow. Geophys. J. Int. 215, 1515–1522.
- Bercovici, D., Ricard, Y., 2016. Grain-damage hysteresis and plate tectonic states. Phys.
 Earth Planet. Inter. 253, 31 47.
- ⁵⁵⁴ Braz, C., Seton, M., Flament, N., Müller, R.D., 2018. Geodynamic reconstruction of an
 ⁵⁵⁵ accreted cretaceous back-arc basin in the northern andes. Journal of Geodynamics 121,
 ⁵⁵⁶ 115–132.
- ⁵⁵⁷ Christensen, U.R., 1985. Heat transport by variable viscosity convection ii: pressure ⁵⁵⁸ influence, non-newtonian rheology and decaying heat sources. Physics of the Earth and
- ⁵⁵⁹ Planetary Interiors 37, 183 205.
- ⁵⁶⁰ Coltice, N., Gérault, M., Ulvrová, M., 2017. A mantle convection perspective on global
 ⁵⁶¹ tectonics. Earth-Sci. Rev. 165, 120 150.

DRAFT

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm

- ⁵⁶² Coltice, N., Rolf, T., Tackley, P.J., Labrosse, S., 2012. Dynamic causes of the relation ⁵⁶³ between area and age of the ocean floor. Science 336, 335–338.
- ⁵⁶⁴ Crameri, F., Schmeling, H., Golabek, G.J., Duretz, T., Orendt, R., Buiter, S.J.H., May,
 ⁵⁶⁵ D.A., Kaus, B.J.P., Gerya, T.V., Tackley, P.J., 2012. A comparison of numerical sur⁵⁶⁶ face topography calculations in geodynamic modelling: an evaluation of the sticky air
 ⁵⁶⁷ method. Geophys. J. Int. 189, 38–54.
- ⁵⁶⁸ Crameri, F., Tackley, P.J., 2014. Spontaneous development of arcuate single-sided sub-
- duction in global 3-D mantle convection models with a free surface. J. Geophys. Res.: Solid Earth 119, 5921–5942.
- ⁵⁷¹ Dilek, Y., Furnes, H., 2009. Structure and geochemistry of tethyan ophiolites and their ⁵⁷² petrogenesis in subduction rollback systems. Lithos 113, 1–20.
- ⁵⁷³ Doin, M.P., Fleitout, L., Christensen, U., 1997. Mantle convection and stability of depleted
- and undepleted continental lithosphere. J. Geophys. Res.: Solid Earth 102, 2771–2787.
- 575 Domeier, M., Shephard, G.E., Jakob, J., Gaina, C., Doubrovine, P.V., Torsvik, T.H.,
- ⁵⁷⁶ 2017. Intraoceanic subduction spanned the Pacific in the Late Cretaceous–Paleocene.
 ⁵⁷⁷ Science Advances 3, eaao2303.
- ⁵⁷⁸ Flament, N., Williams, S., Müller, R., Gurnis, M., Bower, D.J., 2017. Origin and evolution
- of the deep thermochemical structure beneath eurasia. Nature communications 8, 14164.
- Gerya, T., Stern, R., Baes, M., Sobolev, S., Whattam, S., 2015. Plate tectonics on the earth triggered by plume-induced subduction initiation. Nature 527, 221–225.
- Gerya, T.V., Connolly, J.A., Yuen, D.A., 2008. Why is terrestrial subduction one-sided? Geology 36, 43–46.

- X 28 ULVROVA ET AL.: SUBDUCTION INITIATION AND CESSATION
- Guillou, L., Jaupart, C., 1995. On the effect of continents on mantle convection. J.
 Geophys. Res.: Solid Earth 100, 24217–24238.
- Hegarty, K.A., Weissel, J.K., Hayes, D.E., 1982. Convergence at the Caroline-Pacific Plate
 Boundary: Collision and Subduction. American Geophysical Union. pp. 326–348.
- Hernlund, J.W., Tackley, P.J., 2008. Modeling mantle convection in the spherical annulus.
 Phys. Earth Planet. Inter. 171, 48–54.
- Jaupart, C., Labrosse, S., Lucazeau, F., Mareschal, J., 2015. 7.06 temperatures, heat
- and energy in the mantle of the earth, in: Schubert, G. (Ed.), Treatise on Geophysics
- ⁵⁹² (Second Edition). Elsevier, Oxford. volume 7, Second edition edition. pp. 223–270.
- Kerrick, D.M., 2001. Present and past nonanthropogenic co2 degassing from the solid
 earth. Reviews of Geophysics 39, 565–585.
- Langemeyer, S.M., Lowman, J.P., Tackley, P.J., 2018. The sensitivity of core heat flux to
- the modeling of plate-like surface motion. Geochem., Geophys., Geosyst. 19, 1282–1308.
- 597 Lebrun, J.F., Lamarche, G., Collot, J.Y., 2003. Subduction initiation at a strike-slip
- ⁵⁹⁸ plate boundary: The cenozoic pacific-australian plate boundary, south of new zealand.
- ⁵⁹⁹ Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth 108.
- Lee, S.M., 2004. Deformation from the convergence of oceanic lithosphere into Yap trench and its implications for early-stage subduction. J. Geodynamics 37, 83 – 102.
- Lenardic, A., Moresi, L.N., 1999. Some thoughts on the stability of cratonic lithosphere:
- ⁶⁰³ Effects of buoyancy and viscosity. J. Geophys. Res.: Solid Earth 104, 12.
- Leng, W., Gurnis, M., 2015. Subduction initiation at relic arcs. Geophys. Res. Lett. 42, 7014–7021.

- ⁶⁰⁶ Li, Z.H., Ribe, N.M., 2012. Dynamics of free subduction from 3-d boundary element ⁶⁰⁷ modeling. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth 117.
- Lowman, J.P., 2011. Mantle convection models featuring plate tectonic behavior: An overview of methods and progress. Tectonophys. 510, 1–16.
- Maffione, M., van Hinsbergen, D.J., de Gelder, G.I., van der Goes, F.C., Morris, A.,
 2017. Kinematics of Late Cretaceous subduction initiation in the neo-tethys ocean
 reconstructed from ophiolites of Turkey, Cyprus, and Syria. J. Geophys. Res.: Solid
 Earth 122, 3953–3976.
- ⁶¹⁴ Matsumoto, T., Tomoda, Y., 1983. Numerical simulation of the initiation of subduction ⁶¹⁵ at the fracture zone. Journal of Physics of the Earth 31, 183–194.
- van der Meer, D.G., Spakman, W., Van Hinsbergen, D.J., Amaru, M.L., Torsvik, T.H.,
 2010. Towards absolute plate motions constrained by lower-mantle slab remnants. Nat.
 Geosci. 3, 36–40.
- van der Meer, D.G., Torsvik, T.H., Spakman, W., Van Hinsbergen, D.J.J., Amaru, M.L.,
- ⁶²⁰ 2012. Intra-panthalassa ocean subduction zones revealed by fossil arcs and mantle ⁶²¹ structure. Nat. Geosci. 5, 215–219.
- Michaud, F., Royer, J.Y., Bourgois, J., Dyment, J., Calmus, T., Bandy, W., Sosson, M.,
- Mortera-Gutiérrez, C., Sichler, B., Rebolledo-Viera, M., et al., 2006. Oceanic-ridge subduction vs. slab break off: Plate tectonic evolution along the baja california sur continental margin since 15 ma. Geology 34, 13–16.
- ⁶²⁶ Moresi, L., Solomatov, V., 1998. Mantle convection with a brittle lithosphere: thoughts
- on the global tectonic styles of the earth and venus. Geophys. J. Int. 133, 669–682.

- X 30 ULVROVA ET AL.: SUBDUCTION INITIATION AND CESSATION
- Mortimer, N., Campbell, H.J., Tulloch, A.J., King, P.R., Stagpoole, V.M., Wood, R.A.,
- Rattenbury, M.S., Sutherland, R., Adams, C.J., Collot, J., et al., 2017. Zealandia:
- Earths hidden continent. GSA Today 27, 27–35.
- Müller, R., Landgrebe, T., 2012. The link between great earthquakes and the subduction
 of oceanic fracture zones. Solid Earth 3, 447–465.
- Müller, R.D., Seton, M., Zahirovic, S., Williams, S.E., Matthews, K.J., Wright, N.M.,
- ⁶³⁴ Shephard, G.E., Maloney, K.T., Barnett-Moore, N., Hosseinpour, M., Bower, D.J.,
- ⁶³⁵ Cannon, J., 2016. Ocean Basin Evolution and Global-Scale Plate Reorganization Events
- ⁶³⁶ Since Pangea Breakup. Ann. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci. 44, 107–138.
- ⁶³⁷ Nikolaeva, K., Gerya, T.V., Marques, F.O., 2010. Subduction initiation at passive mar ⁶³⁸ gins: Numerical modeling. J. Geophys. Res.: Solid Earth 115, B03406.
- 639 Reagan, M.K., Ishizuka, O., Stern, R.J., Kelley, K.A., Ohara, Y., Blichert-Toft, J.,
- ⁶⁴⁰ Bloomer, S.H., Cash, J., Fryer, P., Hanan, B.B., et al., 2010. Fore-arc basalts and
 ⁶⁴¹ subduction initiation in the izu-bonin-mariana system. Geochem., Geophys., Geosyst.
 ⁶⁴² 11.
- Rogers, J., Santosh, M., 2004. Continents and Supercontinents. Oxford University Press.
 Rolf, T., Coltice, N., Tackley, P., 2012. Linking continental drift, plate tectonics and the
 thermal state of the Earth's mantle. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 351, 134–146.
- Rolf, T., Tackley, P., 2011. Focussing of stress by continents in 3D spherical mantle
 convection with self-consistent plate tectonics. Geophys. Res. Lett. 38.
- Sigloch, K., Mihalynuk, M.G., 2013. Intra-oceanic subduction shaped the assembly of
 cordilleran north america. Nature 496, 50.

- Stern, R.J., 2004. Subduction initiation: spontaneous and induced. Earth Planet. Sci.
 Lett. 226, 275–292.
- Tackley, P.J., 2000a. The Quest for Self-Consistent Generation of Plate Tectonics in
 Mantle Convection Models. American Geophysical Union, Washington, D.C.. volume
 121 of *Geophys. Monograph.* pp. 47–72.
- Tackley, P.J., 2000b. Self-consistent generation of tectonic plates in time-dependent,
 three-dimensional mantle convection simulations 1. pseudoplastic yielding. Geochem.,
 Geophys., Geosyst. 1.
- ⁶⁵⁸ Tackley, P.J., 2008. Modelling compressible mantle convection with large viscosity con-
- trasts in a three-dimensional spherical shell using the yin-yang grid. Phys. Earth Planet.
 Inter. 171, 7–18.
- Tackley, P.J., King, S.D., 2003. Testing the tracer ratio method for modeling active
 compositional fields in mantle convection simulations. Geochem., Geophys., Geosyst.
 4, 8302.
- ⁶⁶⁴ Ulvrova, M.M., Brune, S., Williams, S., 2019. Breakup without borders: How continents
- speed up and slow down during rifting. Geophysical Research Letters 46, 1338–1347.
- Van Der Meer, D.G., Zeebe, R.E., van Hinsbergen, D.J., Sluijs, A., Spakman, W., Torsvik,
- T.H., 2014. Plate tectonic controls on atmospheric co2 levels since the triassic. Proc.
 Nat. Acad. Sci. 111, 4380–4385.
- Williams, S., Flament, N., Müller, R.D., Butterworth, N., 2015. Absolute plate motions
 since 130 ma constrained by subduction zone kinematics. Earth and Planetary Science
 Letters 418, 66–77.

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm

		Nondimensional	Dimensional
Variable	Symbol	Value	Value
Gravitational acceleration	g	-	$9.81{ m ms^{-2}}$
Mantle thickness	D	1	$2890\mathrm{km}$
Thermal expansivity	$lpha_0$	-	$3 \times 10^{-5} {\rm K}^{-1}$
Thermal diffusivity	κ	-	$10^{-6} \mathrm{m^2 s^{-1}}$
Thermal conductivity	k	-	$4{\rm Wm^{-1}K^{-1}}$
Gas constant	R	-	$8.314\mathrm{Jmol^{-1}K^{-1}}$
Reference density	$ ho_0$	1	$3300 \rm kg m^{-3}$
Internal heating rate	H	20	$5.44 \times 10^{-12} \mathrm{W kg^{-1}}$
Reference viscosity	η_0	1	$6 \times 10^{22} \mathrm{Pas}$
Activation energy	E_a	8	$170\mathrm{kJmol^{-1}}$
Activation volume	V_a	3	$6.34 \cdot 10^{-7} \mathrm{m^3 mol^{-1}}$
Surface temperature	$T_{\rm s}$	0.12	300 K
Superadiabatic temperature drop	ΔT	1	$2500\mathrm{K}$
Rayleigh number	Ra	10^{6}	-
Surface yield stress in oceans	σ_0	10^3 to 8×10^3	$7~\mathrm{MPa}$ to $56~\mathrm{MPa}$
Yield stress depth derivative in oceans	$\sigma'_{ m Y}$	3.3×10^5	$810 Pa m^{-1}$

 Table 1. Dimensional and non-dimensional parameters of the convection model.

DRAFT



Figure 1. A snapshot of the viscosity (left column) and temperature (middle column) fields at one particular time. (Right column) Azimuthally and temporally averaged temperature profiles of minimum (blue), mean (black) and maximum (red) temperature. Model without a)-c) and with d)-f) weak crustal layer. g)-i) Model with free surface. Air layer atop of the mantle is shown in light blue. Continents are emphasized in all panels in blue.



Figure 2. a)-c) Subduction zone retreating toward the continent (emphasized in blue) and reaching the continental margin. d)-f) Subduction zone changes its polarity and continues descending into the mantle next to the margin. The model has a weak crustal layer and intermediate yield stress $\sigma_0 = 35$ MPa.

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm



Figure 3. Cumulative distribution of subduction initiation (blue) and cessation (black) as a function of distance from the nearest continent for three different yield stresses σ_0 (increasing from left to right). Dark grey line represents the distribution of subduction initiation at random position for a large population of cases. Gray area designates random distributions generated for N subduction initiations with N being the number of initiations detected for a particular model. Number of subduction zones detected is (from left to right) 89, 93 and 78. Histograms in the bottom right corners show the distribution of the number of subduction zones in the respective models. The models have a free slip top boundary but no weak crustal layer.



Figure 4. a) Proportion of all subduction zones that initiate (blue) and cease (black) in the vicinity of the continent as a function of the lithospheric strength. One continental raft is present (i.e., two margins) throughout the simulations. b) Proportion of all subduction zones that initiate (blue) and cease (black) in the vicinity of the continent as a function of the number of the continental margins. Solid line is for models with compositionally uniform oceanic lithosphere while dashed line is for runs with weak crustal layer. The yield stress is fixed at $\sigma_0 = 35$ MPa.



Figure 5. Position of the continents (blue) and subduction zones (coloured lines; one colour corresponds to individual subduction zone) through time together with the surface heat flux (gray scale). The model has a weak crustal layer and intermediate yield stress $\sigma_0 = 35$ MPa.



Figure 6. The influence of the number of continental margins (increasing from left to right). a) Two continental margins (N = 43), b) four continental margins (N = 79), c) six continental margins (N = 288). N is the number of initiations detected for a particular model. Dark grey line represents the distribution of subduction initiation at random position for a large population of cases. Gray area designates random distributions generated for N subduction initiations. Histograms in the bottom right corners show the distribution of the number of subduction zones in the respective models. The yield stress is $\sigma_0 = 35$ MPa and the models feature a weak crustal layer.

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm



Figure 7. Cumulative distribution of subduction initiation (blue) and cessation (black) for model with a) no weak crustal layer (N = 132), b) weak crustal layer (N = 79), and c) free surface (N = 27). N is the number of subduction initiations detected for a particular model. Dark grey line represents the distribution of subduction initiation at random position for a large population of cases. Gray area designates random distributions generated for N subduction initiations. Histograms in the bottom right corners show the distribution of the number of subduction zones in the respective models. The yield stress is fixed at $\sigma_0 = 35$ MPa. There are two continents throughout the simulations.

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm



Figure 8. Position of the continents and subduction zones since the Triassic according to two alternative reconstructions (see text), subdivided into 4 distinct time windows from Pangea times to recent. The detailed time-evolution of these reconstructions is illustrated in animations S2-S3. a) Subduction zones and continent positions for the M2016 model between 0 and 50 Ma, plotted at 10 Myr increments; locations of subduction zones are shown in colours corresponding to the color legend, while the continents are shown in gray with darker gray standing for younger positions within the 0-50 Myr period.b) same as a for 50-100 Ma; c) same as a for 100-150 Ma; d) same as a for 150-230 Ma; e) V2012 model for times between 0-50 Ma f) same as e for 50-100 Ma; g) same as e for 100-150 Ma h) same as e for 150-235 Ma.

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm



Figure 9. Caption on the next page

Figure 9. Cumulative distribution functions for distance between continents and points along subduction zones at different stages of their development for reconstructions from the Triassic to present (see supporting text and animations S2-S3). Each coloured line represents the distribution for a specific time in panels a, b, d and e. In panels c and f, the relatively small number of initiating and ceasing subduction segments are subdivided into broad time ranges encompassing the earlier and later stages of Pangea breakup. See text for further explanation. (a) CDF for random points falling within reconstructed extent of ocean basins; the grey background shows the envelope of these distributions based on random points, and is reproduced on the other panels for visual reference; (b) distance to continent for segments of active subduction zones for the kinematic reconstruction of Müller et al. [2016]; (c) distances to continent for initiating and ceasing subduction segments derived from Müller et al. [2016]; (d) distance to continent for remnants of past subduction mapped from seismic tomography [van der Meer et al., 2010, 2012; (e) As (d), but only including 'primary' subduction according to the definition of van der Meer et al. [2010]; (f) distance to continents for subduction zones in (e) at the beginning and end of their lifespans (assumed to approximate initiation and cessation) for the slab remnant reconstruction.

DRAFT

July 18, 2019, 4:11pm