

31 Speleothems have long been regarded as state-of-the-art materials for terrestrial paleoclimate 32 reconstruction owing to their potential for precisely dated chronologies and preservation of 33 detailed oxygen isotopic ( $\delta^{18}$ O) records that are routinely interpreted as a proxy for 34 bydroclimate. Yet replicated speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O records from the same cave do not always agree, 35 posing a conundrum: if these records are reliable they should exhibit a common isotopic  $36$  response to hydroclimate forcing. Using a meta-analysis of a global database of speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O 37 records, as well as published dripwater data, we show that disagreement between replicated 38 records is common and is consistent with in-cave variability in drip  $\delta^{18}$ O that is unrelated to 39 climate, cave depth or lithology. We present a case study of new coeval stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O records 40 from Golgotha Cave in southwest Australia, where the isotopic differences between four 41 stalagmites that grew during the last eight centuries are informed by long-term monitoring of 42 the cave. It is demonstrated that karst hydrology is a major driver of within cave speleothem 43 and drip  $\delta^{18}$ O variability, primarily due to the influence of fractures on flowpath variability. 44 Applying this understanding assists in moving towards quantitative reconstruction of past 45 climate variability from speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O records globally.

46

47 Oxygen isotopes are a well-studied tracer of water and thus the hydrological cycle<sup>1-3</sup>. Preservation 48 of O isotopes within paleoenvironmental archives provides an opportunity to study past 49 bydroclimatic variability<sup>4</sup> as well as climate dynamics with external forcing different to the 50 present<sup>5,6</sup>. Speleothems are excellent paleoclimate archives owing to their potential for 51 continuous, high resolution  $\delta^{18}$ O data with well-constrained chronologies occurring over most 52 climatic zones where limestone karst exists (e.g., refs<sup>7,8</sup>). These properties have motivated the 53 collation of speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O records into global databases<sup>9-11</sup> that facilitate regional synthesis of  $54$  these data to identify past climate patterns<sup>12</sup>; and promote data-model comparisons to evaluate  $55$  the performance of climate models across different past climate states<sup>13</sup>.

56 Measurement of speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O is routine, and these values reflect the isotopic composition of 57 source water (meteoric precipitation) and cave temperature<sup>14</sup>. However, speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O may 58 not always be an ideal proxy for hydroclimate owing to variable karst flowpaths between water  $59$  falling as meteoric precipitation and emerging as dripwater within a cave<sup>15</sup>. Additional processes 60 can also influence the fractionation of  $^{18}O/^{16}O$  between dripwater and calcite<sup>14</sup>. In the quest to 61 reach quantitative reconstruction of climate variability from speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O, increasing attention  $62$  has been focused on constraining the latter<sup>16-18</sup> while the impact of flowpaths is less widely 63 acknowledged. Some studies have utilised karst hydrology models to simulate the potential for 64 karst store volume, infiltration thresholds and flow type to impact dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O (refs.  $^{19,20}$ ); but 65 validation of the impact of these processes on the speleothem record is limited by a lack of studies 66 where speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O has been constrained by cave monitoring, with exceptions (refs.  $^{21\cdot26}$ ).

67 The recognised complexities of speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O means that replication of speleothem records 68 from the same cave or karst region is considered the 'gold standard' in assessing their robustness 69 as paleo-environmental archives<sup>12,27</sup>. Yet it is evident that coeval time series frequently do not 70 replicate in detail – often displaying differences in mean, variability and trends (e.g., refs.  $^{28,29}$ ). 71 Studies using coeval records commonly create 'master' or 'composite' records by splicing 72 techniques that scale records according to mean values<sup>30,31</sup> or apply a filter through merged 73 datasets<sup>32,33</sup>. The application of largely arbitrary data corrections may result in loss of information, 74 including the statistical mean  $\delta^{18}$ O value that is a critical target for model performance (e.g. ref.  $75$   $\frac{34}{2}$ , as well as the loss of opportunity for further quantification of hydroclimatic information if a  $76$  more mechanistic understanding of flowpaths was applied<sup>35</sup>.

77 Here, we quantify the within-cave range of mean  $\delta^{18}$ O values using global datasets of dripwater<sup>36</sup>  $78$  and speleothems<sup>11</sup>. For speleothems, we utilised the SISAL V2 database<sup>11</sup> to identify caves with

79 multiple speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O time series containing overlapping chronologies. We then improve our 80 understanding of the processes giving rise to different mean values for dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O between 81 flowpaths through a case study of coeval speleothem records from Golgotha Cave (southwest 82 Australia; Fig. 1). Uniquely, within the Golgotha Cave system dripwater hydrochemistry is well-83 constrained by long-term monitoring $37,38$  and flowpaths have been characterised by a spatially 84 dense network of automated drip loggers and lidar mapping<sup>39-41</sup>. This setting allows us to, for the 85 first-time, robustly assess the role that karst hydrology plays in determining the  $\delta^{18}$ O variability 86 between coeval speleothem paleoclimate records.



87

88 Fig. 1. Locations of caves used in global meta-analysis of dripwater and speleothem datasets with the range  $89$  of mean  $\delta^{18}$ O values indicated by symbol size for coeval dripwater and/or coeval speleothems from these 90 caves. Location of Golgotha Cave and other sites from the SISAL V2 database are also shown. Darker grey 91 shading indicates karst regions<sup>42</sup>.

92

93 Global speleothem and drip  $\delta^{18}$ O assessment. The within cave range of mean  $\delta^{18}$ O values were 94 assessed globally for 50 caves with 229 drip monitoring sites, and 64 caves with 192 paired coeval 95 speleothem time-series (Fig. 1; Supplementary Tables 1-2; Methods). We find that the range of 96 mean  $\delta^{18}$ O values is greater than analytical uncertainty for 52% of caves that have coeval dripwater 97 monitoring and 39% of caves that have coeval speleothem records (Fig. 2). Analytical uncertainty 98 is set at 0.3 ‰ based on inter-laboratory comparisons<sup>43,44</sup>. As each coeval dataset will likely come 99 from an individual laboratory where routine reproducibility can be several times better (e.g. 100 typically 0.06 ‰ – see Methods), our analysis is conservative. Thus our findings imply that within 101 cave variability in mean  $\delta^{18}$ O values is common worldwide and is similar in magnitude whether 102 assessed via dripwater or speleothem data; the difference between the means for the within cave 103 range for dripwater versus speleothems was insignificant (0.5 ‱VSMOW versus 0.4 ‰VPDB; p-104 value=0.35). This suggests that the majority of within cave variability between speleothem  $\delta^{18}O$ 105 records may be attributed to differences in flowpaths within the karst above the cave. We further 106 demonstrate that this occurs on a global scale, independent of hydroclimate or other potential 107 factors such as host rock geology or cave depth (see Supplementary Figs. 1 and 2). Additionally, 108 no relationship was found between the range of mean speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O values and the distance 109 from the cave entrance (Supplementary Fig. 1) further supporting that the difference in 110 speleothem mean  $\delta^{18}$ O may be inherited from the dripwater rather than the potential influence 111 of cave microclimate instability on the isotopic fractionation between dripwater and speleothem.



 $\begin{array}{c} 112 \\ 113 \end{array}$ 113 Fig. 2. Histogram of the range of mean  $\delta^{18}$ O values for each cave determined from the global meta-analysis 114 of dripwater and speleothem datasets.

115

116 A global mean of 0.4  $\%_{\text{ovPDB}}$  for the within cave range of mean speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O is large and thus 117 there is a need to further explore the underlying mechanism. The lack of caves with both coeval 118 drip monitoring and coeval speleothem data precludes using existing data to directly assess the 119 role of within cave dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O variability in explaining mean speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O variability. Just 120 four caves in this global meta-analysis have both datasets<sup>28,45-50</sup> and only one exceeds our 121 analytical threshold<sup>46,47</sup>. This highlights the need for more coeval speleothem datasets from 122 monitored caves in order to objectively quantify the hydrological control on speleothem  $\delta^{18}O$ 123 variability.

124 Golgotha Cave case study. To assess the importance of karst hydrological flowpaths driving 125 variability in mean  $\delta^{18}$ O between coeval speleothems we use a case study of four stalagmite 126 records that grew during the last eight centuries from Golgotha Cave, SW Australia (Fig. 3a). 127 Dripwater monitoring commenced after each stalagmite was removed and varies in length from 5 128 to 14 years duration. This represents a unique dataset to interrogate the influence of intra-cave 129 differences in karst flow on individual speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O records over a period when cave 130 temperature can expect to have remained relatively constant.

131 Annual dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O mean values differ by up to 1  $\%_{VSMOW}$  between monitoring sites within 132 Golgotha Cave<sup>36</sup>. Conversion of drip  $\delta^{18}$ O to calcite equivalent values, using calcites farmed during 133 our monitoring study (Supplementary Text and Supplementary Table 3), demonstrates that drip  $134$   $8^{18}$ O gives a viable extension of the individual speleothem records associated with each drip (Fig. 135 – 3b) and that the offset between speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O is primarily driven by differences in drip  $\delta^{18}$ O 136 values. The isotopic differences between the four speleothems persist throughout the 800 years 137 of coeval data (Fig. 3a), but with differences in temporal evolutions that in the absence of 138 consideration of karst processes could otherwise be misinterpreted to represent very different 139 hydroclimate histories.



142 Fig. 3a,b. Golgotha Cave speleothem records (a), comparison between speleothem, dripwater and farmed<br>143 calcite for recent decades (b). Dashed box indicates region re-plotted in (b). Dripwaters were converted to 143 calcite for recent decades (b). Dashed box indicates region re-plotted in (b). Dripwaters were converted to<br>144 calcite equivalent values using an empirical bulk fractionation factor derived from calcites farmed at the calcite equivalent values using an empirical bulk fractionation factor derived from calcites farmed at the drip 145 sites (Supplementary Text and Supplementary Table 3). Dripwater (calcite equivalent  $\delta^{18}$ O values) are used 146 to extend the speleothem time series. The agreement (allowing for the rising trend) also supports the 147 empirical fractionation factor calculated from Golgotha farmed calcites and dripwaters.

148

149 Variability in mean drip  $\delta^{18}O$  associated with recharge thresholds and karst store behaviour can 150 account for the differences observed in the  $\delta^{18}$ O values of coeval speleothems within Golgotha 151 Cave. Lidar mapping of the karst system at Golgotha Cave, coupled with a network of 34 152 automated high frequency drip loggers<sup>40</sup>, has provided a detailed understanding of water storage 153 and flowpaths that enables interpretation of the varying ways that hydroclimate signals emerge 154 in the cave system through dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O. The majority of water movement to the ceiling of 155 Golgotha Cave is via flow through the matrix of the host-rock<sup>41</sup> and is characterised by low drip 156 rates with low  $\delta^{18}$ O variability<sup>37,40</sup>. But some flowpaths exhibit a different behaviour, displaying a  $157$  threshold rise in drip rate in response to activation of flow along a fracture<sup>40</sup>, while a third flow 158 type termed 'combination' has flow through an interconnected network of fractures and 159 fissures/conduits<sup>41</sup>. Drips feeding the stalagmites in this study represent this range of flow types: 160 predominately matrix (GL-S1, GL-S2), matrix plus fracture (GL-S4) and combination (GL-S3) (Fig. 161  $\,$  4a-c). Field campaigns conducted to determine the  $\delta^{18}$ O value of drips across the automated drip l62 loggers<sup>40</sup> demonstrate a significant isotopic distinction between matrix flow (-4.0±0.1 ‰, 1σ; 163 n=58) versus fracture flow (-4.7±0.1 ‰, n=22) classified drips (Fig. 4c).

164 A fracture activation episode is evident in the monitoring time series for stalagmite GL-S4 as an 165 abrupt 115% increase in drip rate during November 2013 (Fig. 4a,b). This occurred in response to 166 a wet season with rainfall above the 90<sup>th</sup> percentile, and is consistent with rapid, deep delivery of 167 infiltrating rainwater along a fracture<sup>40,51</sup>. The increase in flow was accompanied by a 0.5 ‰ $_{\rm VSMOW}$ 168 decrease in  $\delta^{18}$ O values of the drip for GL-S4 over the subsequent year (Fig. 4c). These dripwater 169 values are isotopically consistent with larger rainfall events, which have relatively lower  $\delta^{18}O$ 170 values owing to the 'amount effect' in this region<sup>52</sup>. The drip monitoring suggests that the relative 171 volume of water contributed by large rainfall events to karst reservoirs is amplified by fractures 172 and is related to the size and/or number of contributing fractures. The drip rate response for the 173 'combination' flowpath (GL-S3) similarly rises in 2013, only here the larger network of permeable 174 features<sup>40</sup> smooths the response to infiltration. Dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O values for this site are the lowest 175 of the four monitored sites, and 1  $\%$  vs Mower than precipitation-weighted rainfall  $\delta^{18}$ O (Fig. 176 4c), consistent with the karst store for GL-S3 being sustained largely by infiltration via fractures.



179 Fig. 4a-c. Golgotha Cave monitoring data. Smoothed monthly precipitation (P) anomalies (a), monitored drip 180 rate (b) precipitation–weighted monthly rainfall  $\delta^{18}$ O and smoothed dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O (c) for drip sites where 181 speleothems were collected. Shown also on panel (c) are the mean  $\delta^{18}$ O values of matrix and fracture flow 182 sites from drips in the automated logger network obtained during five separate sampling campaigns each<br>183 conducted over 2-5 day durations between 2012 and 2014. Monthly precipitation anomalies were 183 conducted over 2-5 day durations between 2012 and 2014. Monthly precipitation anomalies were<br>184 calculated using the monthly climatological means from 1950 to 2020. An exponentially-weighted moving 184 calculated using the monthly climatological means from 1950 to 2020. An exponentially-weighted moving<br>185 average (EWMA) was applied to monthly P anomalies with a half-life parameter of 36.6 months; similarly an average (EWMA) was applied to monthly P anomalies with a half-life parameter of 36.6 months; similarly an 186 EWMA was applied to monthly rainfall  $\delta^{18}$ O using a 25 month half-life, as well as a lag of 19 months 187 supported by our field studies in ref.<sup>40,53</sup>. Dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O were smoothed with a loess 2<sup>nd</sup> order filter (span 188 0.3). Drip rates exhibit a threshold response to higher infiltration indicating the fracture component of each<br>189 flowpath<sup>40</sup>. For example, the drip for GL-S4 rapidly increases in response to higher precipitation ano 189 flowpath<sup>40</sup>. For example, the drip for GL-S4 rapidly increases in response to higher precipitation anomalies<br>190 during 2013 compared to the much smaller rise in the drip rate for GL-S1, indicating that a larger fract 190 during 2013 compared to the much smaller rise in the drip rate for GL-S1, indicating that a larger fracture<br>191 component is feeding GL-S4. Over the same period, mean drip rate of the logger network increased from 191 component is feeding GL-S4. Over the same period, mean drip rate of the logger network increased from<br>192 0.16±0.02 to 0.20±0.40 for matrix flow sites and from 2.21±0.40 to 8.32±3.43 for fracture flow sites. The 192 0.16±0.02 to 0.20±0.40 for matrix flow sites and from 2.21±0.40 to 8.32±3.43 for fracture flow sites. The 193<br>193 relative contribution of fracture flow to each drip site is inversely related to drip  $\delta^{18}$ O values 193 relative contribution of fracture flow to each drip site is inversely related to drip  $\delta^{18}$ O values with activation 194 of fractures occurring during periods of higher infiltration associated with lower rainfall  $\delta^{18}$ O values.

The extensive monitoring and characterisation of the Golgotha Cave system (see also Supplementary Text) allows us to interpret the differences between the mean values of Golgotha 197 Cave  $\delta^{18}$ O speleothem records as well as the drivers of the variability through time. Records GL-S1 and GL-S4 have similar isotopic trends on multi-decadal to multi-centennial scales throughout the 199 last eight centuries; however, GL-S4 is isotopically offset by approximately -0.5 ‱<sub>VPDB</sub> (Fig. 3a). This is consistent with our identification of GL-S4 receiving a larger component of fracture flow whilst GL-S1 as supplied predominately by matrix flow. Oxygen isotopic values for stalagmite GL-S1 do

202 not fall below -4.5  $\%_{\text{ovPDB}}$ , whereas they are typically below this value for GL-S4 (Fig. 3b). This 203 indicates that selective recharge due to fracture activation during periods of higher rainfall was a 204 persistent process impacting the flow pathway, hence the  $\delta^{18}$ O record, of GL-S4. Further support 205 for this process-based understanding is the typical widening of the isotopic offset between the 206 two records that is observed during periods of relatively lower  $\delta^{18}$ O values (Fig. 3a), indicative of 207 enhanced fracture activation feeding GL-S4 in response to more intense rainfall. Additionally, from 208 1990 CE onwards, all records and their extended dripwater time series display rising  $\delta^{18}$ O trends. 209 This implies a reduction in fracture flow, i.e., conditions were insufficient to overcome recharge 210 threshold(s) for regular fracture activation<sup>51</sup> and is consistent with the sustained rainfall decrease 211 in this region that began around 1970  $CE^{54}$ .

212 Stalagmite GL-S2  $\delta^{18}O$  values are initially similar to GL-S4 from 1330 to 1440 CE, intermittent 213 between GL-S1 and GL-S4 until 1560 CE, then at or above GL-S1 for the remainder of the 214 speleothem and dripwater record (Fig. 3a,b). Temporal flow-switching was documented 215 previously for GL-S2's drip site<sup>57</sup> and is consistent with its location in the cave characterised as 216 having high-spatial heterogeneity in flow regime<sup>40</sup>. In contrast, stalagmites GL-S1 and GL-S4 come 217 from a section of the cave with low spatial variability in flow-paths attributed to their 218 connectedness to the common hydrological domain of the matrix $39,40$ .

219 Speleothems from drips that are dominated by 'combination' or complex fracture flowpaths show 220 greater isotopic variability and less reliable growth consistent with their drip supplied by flow<br>221 along fractures rather than the matrix. Speleothem GL-S3 experienced discontinuous growth over along fractures rather than the matrix. Speleothem GL-S3 experienced discontinuous growth over 222 the last 800 years (Fig. 3a), with rejuvenation of growth commencing with low  $\delta^{18}$ O values (e.g. 223 1200-1300 and 1950s CE; Fig. 3a). This is consistent with flow to this speleothem dominated by 224 fracture flowpaths<sup>40</sup> that require relatively high infiltration from larger rainfall events to activate<sup>51</sup>. 225 A relatively wet interval during the  $13<sup>th</sup>$  century is supported by falling d18O values supplied by  $226$  the matrix to GL-S1 plus fracture activation initiating growth to stalagmites GL-S2 and GL-S4. An 226 the matrix to GL-S1 plus fracture activation initiating growth to stalagmites GL-S2 and GL-S4. An 227 enhanced non-linear response to recharge is also evident in GL-S3:  $\delta^{18}$ O values are up to 1  $\%_{\text{ovPDB}}$ 228 lower than the other records at 1200-1300 CE but display a rising trend that is initially similar in 229 value to GL-S4 until approximately 1300 CE when GL-S3  $\delta^{18}$ O values steeply rise a further 1.5  $\%$ <sub>OVPDB</sub> 230 in less than three decades, exceeding the matrix-flow record (GL-S1; Fig. 3a). The continuity of all 231 the other records at the time when GL-S3 ceases growing (approx. 1360 CE) indicates that 232 infiltration to the cave system is still occurring, although not to the karst store(s) supplying GL-S3. 233 The isotopic maximum prior to termination of this growth phase: -2.5 ‱ $_{PDB}$  ( $\delta^{18}$ O; Fig. 3a) is similar 234 to observed dripwater maxima (Fig. 3b), thus could be inherited from the dripwater, or additional 235 processes may be dominating speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O as the store volume in this 'stranded' reservoir 236 depletes, including enhanced isotopic disequilibrium effects as the drip interval lengthens<sup>55,56</sup>.

237 Implications for quantified hydroclimate reconstructions. The Golgotha Cave case study 238 demonstrates that the differences between coeval speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O records from the same cave 239 can be controlled by flowpaths. The global meta-analysis reveals that such within cave variability 240 is common worldwide. The global mean of  $\delta^{18}$ O offsets between drip sites in caves (0.6 ‰) is 241 similar in magnitude to that observed in Golgotha Cave. The global mean of within cave isotopic 242 range for coeval speleothems is 0.4 ‰. While we have not considered isotopic fractionation that 243 can further impact speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O values during calcite precipitation in the SISAL data, the 244 evidence presented here suggests that the karst hydrological control is an important factor in 245 explaining within-cave speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O differences.

246 A previous global meta-analysis on monitored cave datasets<sup>36</sup> showed that dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O values 247 are close to that of rainfall at cooler locations, while reflecting recharge rather than rainfall  $\delta^{18}O$ 248 at warmer locations. Building on this, our expanded global meta-analysis, demonstrates that the 249 additional impacts of karst hydrological heterogeneity is important over all climate types and karst 250 characteristics. Golgotha Cave hydrology experiences matrix flow through the highly porous 251 Pleistocene aeolinite host rock<sup>37</sup>. Globally, most karst is older and retains little or no primary 252 porosity, hence water movement is likely to be more impacted by heterogeneities in flowpaths 253 through fractures. In mature limestones, a high density of fissures, sediment-filled structures and 254 paleokarst could similarly act as porous media; and drips with matrix flow properties have been 255 identified in many monitored caves from mature limestones (e.g. refs.  $26,58,59$ )

256 Speleothems associated with complex fractures are likely to show highly non-linear responses to hydroclimate forcing and more caution should be taken with interpreting paleoclimate information from them whereas speleothems dominated by matrix flowpaths and simple fracture 259 structures are likely to be more suitable. Where coeval records exist, the difference in mean  $\delta^{18}O$ value could be viewed from a process-based understanding that may enable quantitative hydroclimate reconstructions. For example, temporal changes in this mean value records such as GL-S1 and GL-S4, could be exploited to identify past changes in rainfall characteristics, with larger offsets representing periods of enhanced recharge from larger rainfall events. Furthermore, 264 interpretation alongside a karst model that is able to reconcile the  $\delta^{18}$ O offset between coeval speleothems arising from recharge thresholds and differences in flowpaths would allow for the 266 possibility of reconstructing mean precipitation  $\delta^{18}$ O, which is directly comparable to output from general circulation models.

268

#### 269 Methods

270 Global meta-analysis. The dripwater dataset of ref.<sup>36</sup> was extended to include studies with: 1. at 271 least quarterly sampling over 12 months; and 2. sites that had not previously meet the criteria of 272 having nearby rainfall  $\delta^{18}$ O data. Mean  $\delta^{18}$ O for each drip site over a 12 month period was 273 calculated and the range of these mean values for each cave was determined (Supplementary 274 Table 1). We utilised the SISAL V2 database<sup>11</sup> to identify caves with speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O records 275 satisfying the following criteria: 'mineralogy' = calcite AND coeval interval exceeds 10% of the 276 minimum age of overlap AND overlap interval exceeds 2x'lin interp age uncert pos' of the 277 maximum age AND 2x'lin\_interp\_age\_uncert\_neg' of the minimum age AND each section contain 278 >10  $\delta^{18}$ O measurements (Supplementary Table 2). Hiatuses were accounted for and if present, the 279 record split into growth intervals and each growth interval treated as a potential record. The mean  $280 - \delta^{18}$ O value for each speleothem pair was calculated for the period of overlap (Supplementary Table 281 2) and the within cave range calculated. A conservative threshold value of 0.3‰ was chosen for 282 analytical uncertainty based on inter-laboratory studies<sup>43</sup> and consistent with the value previously  $283$  adopted<sup>36</sup>.

 $284$  Golgotha Cave dripwater data. Drip data presented here are an extension of published data<sup>37</sup> and 285 new dripwater data collected at the speleothem GL-S4 (2012-19). Methods for dripwater data 286 appear in ref.<sup>37</sup> with the exception of  $\delta^{18}$ O measurements being made using Picarro L2120-I Water 287 Analyser at ANSTO (see ref.<sup>60</sup> for method) from 2012 onwards. Supplementary Table 4 contains 288 identification codes for dripwater and speleothem pairing and summarises site data.

289 Carbonate stable isotopes. Each speleothem was milled along the growth axis using a Taig 290 micromill to produce homogenised powders representing increments of 0.1 to 0.2 mm, depending 291 on the speleothem growth rate. Powders were weighed to 180–220  $\mu$ g and analysed for  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $292$   $8^{13}$ C using a Finnigan MAT-251 isotope ratio mass spectrometer coupled to a Kiel I carbonate 293 device, or a Thermo MAT-253 isotope ratio mass spectrometer coupled to a Kiel IV carbonate 294 device (using 110–130 μg samples), at the Research School of Earth Sciences, ANU. Analyses were 295 calibrated using NBS-19 standard ( $\delta^{18}O_{v-PDB}$  = -2.20 ‰ and  $\delta^{13}C_{v-PDB}$  = 1.95 ‰). A further linear 296 correction for  $\delta^{18}$ O measurements was carried out using the NBS-18 standard ( $\delta^{18}$ O<sub>v-PDB</sub> = -23.0 297 ‰). The original delta values for NBS-19 and NBS-18 are used to maintain consistency of results

through time in the RSES Stable Isotope Facility. Long-term precision of both the MAT-251 and 299 MAT-253 instruments is ±0.06 % for  $\delta^{18}$ O and ±0.04 % for  $\delta^{13}$ C (±1 $\sigma$  standard deviation).

Speleothem chronologies. Speleothem chronologies were determined using U-series disequilibrium dating at the University of Melbourne, and are supported by 'bomb pulse' 302 radiocarbon dating previously published in ref. and/or laminae counting of annual Sr concentrations mapped by X-ray fluorescence microscopy (XFM) at the XFM beamline at the Australian Synchrotron. Full details of chronologies and U-series disequilibrium data are given in the Supplementary Information.

### Online supporting material

- Supporting figures, tables, text and associated references, are contained in the Supplementary Information.
- Data availability

### Acknowledgements

This research is supported by funding from the Australian Research Council (DP140102059 to PCT and NJA) and a Land & Water Australia grant (ANU52). The micro-XRF analysis research was undertaken on the X-ray fluorescence microscopy (XFM) beamline at the Australian Synchrotron, part of ANSTO under proposals PA13457 and PA14312. We used the SISAL database, made possible through the Speleothem Isotope Synthesis and Analysis (SISAL) working group of the Past Global Changes (PAGES) project, supported by the Swiss Academy of Sciences and the Chinese Academy of Sciences. We gratefully acknowledge the assistance from the staff at Calgardup Caves (Department of Biodiversity, Conservations and Attractions) to conduct the cave monitoring, as well as Fabio Oriani for assistance with image processing of synchrotron maps and technical support from Barbora Gallagher, Jennifer van Holst, Joe Cali, Joan Cowley, Heather Scott-Gagan, Jennifer Wurtzel and Lewis Adler.

### Author contributing statement

This manuscript was devised and written by PCT and ABaker. All co-authors contributed to the writing of the paper. Golgotha Cave speleothem and monitoring data were created by PCT with input from JCH, PB, NJA, ABorsato, MM, DJP, MKG and ABaker. JC, ABaker, PCT, SP and SH conducted the analysis for Figure 1.





17 Hansen, M., Scholz, D., Schöne, B. R. & Spötl, C. Simulating speleothem growth in the laboratory: Determination of the stable isotope fractionation (δ13C and δ18O) between 376 H2O, DIC and CaCO3. Chem Geol 509, 20-44, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemgeo.2018.12.012 (2019).

18 Guo, W. & Zhou, C. Patterns and controls of disequilibrium isotope effects in speleothems: Insights from an isotope-enabled diffusion-reaction model and implications for





- 54 Hope, P., Timbal, B. & Fawcett, R. Associations between rainfall variability in the southwest 481 and southeast of Australia and their evolution through time. Int. J. Climatol. 30, 1360-1371 (2010).
- 55 Mühlinghaus, C., Scholz, D. & Mangini, A. Modelling fractionation of stable isotopes in 484 stalagmites. Geochim Cosmochim Ac 73, 7275-7289, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2009.09.010 (2009).
- 56 Deininger, M. & Scholz, D. ISOLUTION 1.0: an ISOtope evoLUTION model describing the 487 stable oxygen (δ18O) and carbon (δ13C) isotope values of speleothems. Int J Speleol 48, 488 3, doi:https://doi.org/10.5038/1827-806X.48.1.2219 (2019).
- 489 57 Fitzsimmons, K. E. et al. Late Quaternary palaeoenvironmental change in the Australian drylands. Quaternary Sci Rev 74, 78-96, doi:Doi 10.1016/J.Quascirev.2012.09.007 (2013).
- 58 Ayalon, A., Bar-Mathews, M. & Sass, E. Rainfall-recharge relationships within a karstic terrain within the Eastern Mediterranean semi-arid region, Israel: d18O and dD charateristics. Journal of Hydrology 207, 18-30 (1998).
- 494 59 Nava-Fernandez, C. et al. Pacific climate reflected in Waipuna Cave drip water 495 hydrochemistry. Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. 24, 3361-3380, doi:10.5194/hess-24-3361-2020 (2020).
- 60 Crawford, J., Hollins, S. E., Meredith, K. T. & Hughes, C. E. Precipitation stable isotope 498 variability and subcloud evaporation processes in a semi-arid region. Hydrological Processes 31, 20-34, doi:10.1002/hyp.10885 (2017).
- 500 61 Markowska, M. et al. Modelling the 14C bomb-pulse in young speleothems using a soil carbon continuum model. Geochim Cosmochim Ac 261, 342-367, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2019.04.029 (2019).
- 
- 
- 
- 
- 

# 508 Supplementary Information

# 509 Quantification of the hydrological control on speleothem oxygen

510 isotopic variability

# 511 Treble P.C. et al.

- 512
- 513 The Supplementary Information comprises:

# 514 Supplementary Text

- 515 Farmed calcites and conversion of dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O to calcite equivalent values
- 516 Assessment of evaporation on dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O
- 517 Assessment of disequilibrium and/or kinetics on speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O
- 518 Golgotha Cave speleothem chronologies

# 519 Supplementary Tables

- 520 Supplementary Table 1: Global dripwater data and meta-data
- 521 Supplementary Table 2: Meta-data and mean  $\delta^{18}$ O values of paired coeval
- 522 speleothem data from SISAL database V2
- 523 Supplementary Table 3: Farmed calcite and dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O values
- 524 Supplementary Table 4: Description of paired drip sites and stalagmites
- 525 Supplementary Table 5: Summary of techniques used to construct chronologies

# 526 Supplementary Figures

- 527 Supplementary Figure 1: Cross-plots of range of mean  $\delta^{18}$ O and meta-data for caves
- 528 from global dripwater and speleothem datasets
- 529 Supplementary Figure 2: Mann-Whitney U test for range of mean  $\delta^{18}$ O and geology 530 type for caves from global dripwater and speleothem datasets
- 531 Supplementary Figure 3a-c: Scatterplots of speleothem  $\delta^{13}$ C versus  $\delta^{18}$ O for Golgotha 532 speleothems
- 533 Supplementary Figure 4: Age-depth models for Golgotha Cave stalagmites
- 534 Supplementary Figure 5: Stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O values and age-depth models

535

# 536 Supplementary references

#### Supplementary Text

#### 539 Farmed calcites and conversion of dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O to calcite equivalent values.

Two substrate types were used to collect modern calcite ('farmed calcites') that formed contemporaneously with the dripwater monitoring. Prior to 2013 these were discs machined from Delrin® plastic rod with approximate dimensions of 25 mm diameter and 4 mm thickness and sand-blasted to increase surface roughness and promote calcite precipitation. Following the introduction of acoustic drip loggers into each funnel, the substrate was switched to inverted watch glasses with roughened convex surface that could be placed on top of the logger and still permit acoustic transmission. Approximately 25-50 µg of carbonate was scraped from the substrates directly into the reaction thimbles. This was repeated to reproduce duplicate or triplicate measurements where possible and an average calculated (Supplementary Table 4). Samples were measured on the MAT-253 isotope ratio mass spectrometer with Kiel carbonate device at the Mark Wainwright Analytical Centre at UNSW Sydney according to the method in ref<sup>1</sup>. Data are normalised to the Vienna Pee Dee Belemnite (VPDB) scale using NBS19 (δ<sup>18</sup>O=−2.20‰ 552 and  $\delta^{13}$ C=+1.95‰) and NBS-18 ( $\delta^{18}$ O=−23.0‰ and  $\delta^{13}$ C=−5.0‰). An isotopic fractionation factor

553  $(\alpha_{\text{calcite-water}})$  was calculated using the equation:

$$
\alpha_{calcite-water} = \frac{1 + \frac{\delta_{calcite}}{1000}}{1 + \frac{\delta_{water}}{1000}}
$$

555 where  $\delta_{\text{calcite}}$  is the farmed calcite  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\delta_{\text{water}}$  is the corresponding mean drip water  $\delta^{18}$ O value

556 over the corresponding period each substrate was in the cave. δ<sub>water</sub> is converted to the equivalent 557 value on the VPDB scale using the equation  $\delta^{18}O_{VPDB} = 0.97001^* \delta^{18}O_{VSMOW}$  -29.99.

558 Dripwater δ<sup>18</sup>O measurements were converted from the VSMOW scale to a calcite equivalent on the VPDB scale using the average calculated isotopic fractionation factor (1.0318 ± 0.0004) and mean monthly cave temperature measured at Golgotha Cave (14.6±0.1°C; May 2017-July 2020).

#### 561 Assessment of evaporation on dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O

562 The range of mean dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O values accounts for the range in mean speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O values indicating that the differences between Golgotha Cave speleothems is primarily driven 564 by dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O. Our long-term monitoring demonstrates that the isotopic differences between flowpaths is attributable to the balance between matrix and fracture flow for each flowpath. Treble et al. (2013) ruled out the impact of evaporation within the karst as a driver 567 of dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O as the dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O values are the same or lower than incoming rainfall. Here, we further address the alternative hypothesis that evaporation of water on stalactites 569 could account for higher dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O at our slower dripping sites by examining relative 570 humidity and pan evaporation data from Golgotha Cave. Average monthly relative humidity<br>571 values were calculated from data originally acquired at 15 min intervals using a Datataker values were calculated from data originally acquired at 15 min intervals using a Datataker DT80 logger between May 2017 and July 2020 using a Vaisala HMP155 with Humicap 180RC and sensor warming enabled to negate saturation of the sensor at high humidity 574 (accuracy  $\pm$ 1.8%). High relative humidity is maintained throughout the year with an average<br>575 of 98.9% (range 95.7 to 100%). Evaporation pans consisting of 95 mm diameter petri dishes of 98.9% (range 95.7 to 100%). Evaporation pans consisting of 95 mm diameter petri dishes glasses in triplicate were placed near our dripwater monitoring site in chamber 1 over two years (May 2012 – March 2014). Pans were filled with 70 mls of tapwater using a measuring cylinder. The volume of water lost was measured every six weeks when the pans were emptied and refilled. The average evaporation rate was 0.009 mm day<sup>-1</sup> (range 0.002 to 0.019 mm day-1; n=13).

581 We modelled the isotopic impact of evaporation on a thin film assuming a worse-case scenario

582 whereby water flows exclusively on the outer surface of a stalactite and an evaporation rate

583 of 0.1 mm day<sup>-1</sup>. Assuming a drip volume,  $V_d = 0.2$  mL, the water flux is

$$
Q = \frac{V_d}{\tau}
$$

585 where  $\tau$  is the interval between drips. The evaporation rate inside the cave,  $E = 0.1$ mm/day, 586 so the evaporation flux from water film over the stalagmite is so the evaporation flux from water film over the stalagmite is

$$
Q_E = EA_f
$$

588 where  $A_f$  is the surface area of the film. Assuming that  $Q_E \ll Q$ , so that  $Q + Q_E \approx Q$ , the fraction of water which remains in the liquid phase is fraction of water which remains in the liquid phase is

$$
f_l = 1 - \frac{Q_E}{Q}.
$$

591 Modelling the stalactite as a cylinder with length 6 cm and diameter 1 cm, based on 592 measurements of stalactites at this site<sup>2</sup>, and assuming  $\tau = 300$  s we obtain

$$
f_l = 99.67\%.
$$

594 To calculate isotopic fractionation, we assume that kinetic fractionation can be neglected<br>595 because of the high humidity of the cave. With this condition, the result from Rayleigh because of the high humidity of the cave. With this condition, the result from Rayleigh 596 Fractionation applies<sup>3</sup> which, for this system where vapour is removed, is written

$$
R = R_0 f_l^{1/\alpha - 1}
$$

598 where  $\alpha$  is the equilibrium fraction factor,  $\alpha = 1.0101$  at 16°C<sup>4</sup>, R is the ratio of heavy-to-light isotopes, and  $R_0$  is the initial R of the infiltrating water. Setting  $R_0$  to equal standard VSMOW, 599 isotopes, and  $R_0$  is the initial  $R$  of the infiltrating water. Setting  $R_0$  to equal standard VSMOW, 600 using  $f_1 = 99.67$  calculated above, and converting to  $\delta$  notation, using  $f_l$  = 99.67 calculated above, and converting to  $\delta$  notation,

$$
\delta_l = 0.03\%.
$$

602 Thus, assuming a worse-case scenario of evaporation that is 5x higher than our observed 603 value results in an estimated increase in dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O of 0.03‰, that is too weak by a factor

604 of >10 to explain drip  $\delta^{18}$ O variability.

605

#### 606 Assessment of disequilibrium and/or kinetics on speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O

Speleothem fabrics determined from thin section analysis shows that all stalagmites are columnar and open-columnar fabrics (see for fabric descriptions ref<sup>5</sup>) with no fabrics associated with "disequilibrium deposition" such as dendritic, micrite, microsparitic fabrics, detected.

611 Disequilibrium and/or kinetic isotopic effects result in a  $\alpha_{\text{calcite-water}}$  value that departs from a 612 value determined under conditions of thermodynamic equilibrium. Supplementary Table 4 613 shows that the  $\alpha_{\text{calcite-water}}$  values calculated from our farmed calcites are consistent across the 614 monitored Golgotha Cave drip sites (1.0318±0.0004) and the range in measured 1000lnαcalcite-615 water values between sites is <0.2‰. This demonstrates that disequilibrium and/or kinetic 616 isotopic effects are not responsible for the difference in farmed calcites values over the 617 monitored interval and we infer not responsible for the differences in mean speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O. 618 Rather, the difference in mean speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O values for Golgotha Cave are dominated by 619 the difference in dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O values and this is driven by the ratio of matrix to fracture 620 flow along a flowpath. Possible exceptions to this, as raised in the main text, are the interval

621 1300-1360 CE in GL-S3. We investigate this further below by investigating the relationship

622 between speleothem  $\delta^{13}$ C versus  $\delta^{18}$ O which has been used as a possible diagnostic of  $623$  disequilibrium and/or kinetic isotopic effects<sup>6</sup>.

624 Scatterplots for Golgotha speleothems are shown in Supplementary Figure 3. Speleothem 625 growth with lowest slope values and least co-variation between  $\delta^{13}C$  and  $\delta^{18}O$  occurs when 626  $\delta^{18}$ O values are lowest, i.e., during times of persistent fracture flow in these speleothem 627 records (e.g., 1200-1300 CE for GL-S3 and 1580-1790 CE GL-S4; see main text). Highest slope 628 and co-variation are observed for speleothem GL-S3 during 1300-1360 CE when GL-S3  $\delta^{18}$ O values rapidly rise and exceed neighbouring matrix flow speleothems by at least 1 ‰. As values rapidly rise and exceed neighbouring matrix flow speleothems by at least 1 ‰. As 630 outlined in the main text, this isotopic maximum precedes a growth hiatus and is interpreted<br>631 to represent processes that could occur once a karst store is disconnected from infiltration to represent processes that could occur once a karst store is disconnected from infiltration 632 and subsequently drains. This could include enhanced disequilibrium and/or kinetic isotopic 633 fractionation between speleothem calcite and its source water as the drip interval lengthens. 634 From 1180 to 1260 CE, GL-S1 and GL-S4 have high, declining  $\delta^{18}$ O values (Fig. 3a; main text) 635 as well as high slope and  $r^2$  values (Supplementary Figure 3). Prior to this, GL-S1 sustained 636 mean  $\delta^{18}$ O value of -2.6±0.3‰ for a multi-centennial period. Regardless of the driver of these 637 GL-S1  $\delta^{18}$ O values during this period, the high value as well as lack of growth in the other three 638 stalagmites supports an extended dry period. This indicates that the downward trending 639 values for GL-S1 and GL-S4 prior to 1200 CE are likely associated with establishment of new 640 or reliable water percolation along a flow path. Thus the high values prior to 1200 CE and the  $641$  high slope and  $r^2$  values could indicate enhanced disequilibrium and or kinetic isotope 642 fractionation due to very low drip rates or the incorporation of older water with high  $\delta^{18}$ O 643 values as a result of having been disconnected from infiltration during a dry period. 644 Speleothems that are dominated by matrix flow either because they lack a significant fracture 645 flow path (GL-S1) or during periods when the ratio of fracture to matrix flow is reduced (e.g.  $646$  1260-1580 GL-S4) have intermediate slope and  $r^2$  values (Supplementary Figure 3). 647 Speleothems have different mean  $\delta^{13}$ C values (Fig. 3a,c) supporting mean speleothem  $\delta^{13}$ C is 648 related to speleothems being fed by different flowpaths as outlied in the main text. 649 Speleothem  $\delta^{13}C$  is also smoothly varying through time (Fig. 3c) supporting an environmental 650 not kinetic control. Combining observations that variability in speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O values are 651 driven by fracture activation and that the strength of the relationship between speleothem 652  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\delta^{13}$ C also varies according to flow type, raises the possibility that dripwater  $\delta^{13}$ C may 653 also be influenced by conditions within a flow path, except when dripwater becomes disconnected from infiltration.

655

# 656 Golgotha Cave speleothem chronologies

X-ray fluorescence microscopy (XFM) maps were acquired on the speleothem polished slabs 658 at 2 μm resolution (pixel size) at the XFM beamline at the Australian Synchrotron<sup>7,8</sup> using a monochromatic incident energy of 18.5 keV focussed to spot size of 1.5 μm, and dwell per pixel from 1 to 4 ms. The XFM elemental maps were created and analysed using GeoPIXE software, quantified by using single element Mn, Fe and Pt foils (Micromatter, Canada) and corrected by using a Ca matrix factor. Laminae counting and error estimate was made by determining the position of the Sr peaks on two parallel areas of the Sr maps at three confidence levels (> 95%, 50-95% and <50% confidence) using ImageJ software package according to the method outlined in ref.<sup>9</sup>.

666 U-Th age measurements followed the method of ref<sup>10</sup>. Briefly, calcite wafers weighing 100-667 200 mg were dissolved and equilibrated with a mixed  $^{229}Th-^{233}U-^{236}U$  tracer before U and Th 668 are extracted in a single solution using Eichrom TRU resin before measurement on a Nu 669 Plasma multi-collector ICPMS where isotope ratios of both elements are measured 670 simultaneously. A ratio of initial  $[230Th/232Th] = 0.33\pm0.25$  was applied and is defined by 671 modelling the ratio required to bring ages into age-depth order for each stalagmite. This ratio

- 672 is further supported by comparing the U/Th ADM to the laminae chronology for stalagmite 673 GL-S4.  $GL-S4.$
- 674 Age depth models were constructed by combining information from the date of collection, bomb pulse chronology<sup>11</sup>, laminae counting of Sr maps and U/Th ages. The specific approach
- 675 bomb pulse chronology<sup>11</sup>, laminae counting of Sr maps and U/Th ages. The specific approach for each stalagmite is summarised in Supplementary Table 7.
- for each stalagmite is summarised in Supplementary Table 7.

678 Supplementary Table 1: Global dripwater data and meta-data. Range of mean dripwater  $\delta^{18}O$ 

 $679$  and climate meta-data were published in ref.<sup>12</sup> and references therein, unless otherwise

680 indicated. Geology codes: L=limestone, D=dolomite, M=marble, MX=mixed and U=unknown. AI is



681 aridity index.



684 Supplementary Table 2: Meta-data and mean  $\delta^{18}$ O values of paired coeval speleothem data

 $685$  from SISAL database V2<sup>30</sup>. 'Age min' and 'Age max' represent the minimum and maximum age of

686 the interval of overlap of each coeval dataset. See Methods for criteria used to calculated coeval

687 data. Range in mean  $\delta^{18}$ O values for each cave is shown in Figures 1 and 2 (main text).















689 Supplementary Table 3: Farmed calcite and dripwater  $\delta^{18}$ O values collected at each site between

690 2008-2017. The calculated fractionation factor between calcite and water is shown for each 691 interval and an overall mean value calculated (termed "Empirical bulk fractionation factor").

interval and an overall mean value calculated (termed "Empirical bulk fractionation factor").



692  $a \pm 1$  standard deviation

693 bValue in brackets indicates number of observations

695 Supplementary Table 4: Description of paired drip sites and stalagmites. Further detail on  $696$  flow types and drip rate data are given in ref.<sup>2,31</sup>.



697

699 Supplementary Table 5: Summary of techniques used to construct chronologies for<br>700 Golgotha Cave speleothems. Data from bomb pulse model previously published in

700 Golgotha Cave speleothems. Data from bomb pulse model previously published in ref.<sup>11</sup>. ADM is age-depth model.

ref.<sup>11</sup>. ADM is age-depth model.



702 \*Median ages: see Supplementary Figure 4 for ADM uncertainties.

703



705 Supplementary Figure 1: Cross-plots of within cave range in mean dripwater or coeval  $707$  speleothem $\delta^{18}$ O data with latitude, elevation, annual precipitation, mean annual 708 temperature, aridity index (AI; precipitation divided by actual evapotranspiration) mean 709 depth, and minimum distance from cave entrance. Also shown are Kendall's tau values for 710 each variable ranked against within cave range  $\delta^{18}$ O; and output from multiple linear 711 regression models (MLR) for dripwater and speleothem datasets for climate variables or 712 variables sensitive to climate (latitude and elevation). The MLR is represented as  $v = (a_1 \pm \sigma_1)x_1$ variables sensitive to climate (latitude and elevation). The MLR is represented as  $y=(a_1\pm\sigma_1)x_1$ 713 +  $(a_2 \pm \sigma_2)x_2 + ... + (a_n \pm \sigma_n)x_n + (b \pm \sigma)$  for variables 1 to n. The engineering notation used in the 714 MLR output is base 10 e.g. -8.50E-03 is equivalent to -8.5x10<sup>-3</sup>. Overall, the models explain 7% 715 and 15% of the variation in the within cave range  $\delta^{18}$ O, for dripwater and speleothem 716 datasets. There are weak to no relationships between the within cave range of mean The the proport and coeval speleothem  $\delta^{18}$ O values and these variables (Kendall's tau; 0.05) and  $718$  the P-values indicate that none of the relationships in the multiple linear regression model the P-values indicate that none of the relationships in the multiple linear regression model The are significant. There is also no relationship between the intra-cave range  $\delta^{18}$ O and the 720 minimum distance from the cave entrance to either coeval stalagmite pair in the SISAL data minimum distance from the cave entrance to either coeval stalagmite pair in the SISAL data 721 suggesting that the discrepancy between coeval speleothem mean values is not related to the 722 stability of the climate inside the cave. This analysis suggests that karst hydrological 723 heterogeneity is important over all climate types, cave depths and host rock types. Mean depth 724 is the estimated mean thickness of host rock above site of dripwater monitoring or collected<br>725 speleothem. Cave meta-data were extracted from SISAL V2 $^{34}$  and climate variables from speleothem. Cave meta-data were extracted from SISAL V2 $34$  and climate variables from

- 726 WorldClim V1<sup>35</sup>. Cave depth and distance to entrance data were not available for all sites. In
- 727 cases where elevation data were not provided, these were taken from ref $36$ .



728

729 **Supplementary Figure 2:** Mann-Whitney U test for within-cave range in mean  $\delta^{18}$ O and geology type. Geology codes: D is dolomite, L is limestone, M is marble, MX is mixed, O is 'other' 730 geology type. Geology codes: D is dolomite, L is limestone, M is marble, MX is mixed, O is 'other' 731 and U is unknown. There were no significant differences in median values for different host<br>732 rock types using a p-value = 0.05 for either the dripwater or speleothem datasets. For 732 rock types using a p-value =  $0.05$  for either the dripwater or speleothem datasets. For dripwaters, the differences significant at p-value =  $0.1$  between dolomite and 'other' although 733 dripwaters, the differences significant at p-value = 0.1 between dolomite and 'other' although<br>734 for the base of values; and between limestone and 'unknown' although there is 734 'other' had a small number of values; and between limestone and 'unknown' although there is an overlap of the distributions.



741 Supplementary Figure 3a-c. Scatterplots of speleothem  $\delta^{13}$ C versus  $\delta^{18}$ O for Golgotha 742 speleothems (a); Pearson's  $r^2$  value versus slope for intervals chosen from panel a with 743 different slope and  $r^2$  values (b); and  $\delta^{13}$ C time series (c). Farmed calcites (square symbols) 744 also appear on (a) for comparison. Colour-coding on legend on (b) applies to both plots. 745 Intervals with lowest  $\delta^{18}$ O values (highest fracture flow influence) have weakest relationships 746 between speleothem  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O values.



Supplementary Figure 4a-d. Age-depth models for each stalagmite based on U/Th age measurements and bomb pulse models for stalagmites GL-S1 (a), GL-S2 (b), GL-S3 (c) and GL-S4 (d). Also shown are age-depth models derived from Sr concentration laminae and bomb pulse ADM. Uncertainty on bomb pulse ADM is +/-0.05 mm and +/-0.004 ka.



755 **Supplementary Figure 5:** Stalagmite  $\delta^{18}$ O data shown with GL-S1 plotted using the 17<sup>th</sup> 756 and 50<sup>th</sup> percentile U/Th age-depth models. GL-S1  $\delta^{18}$ O plotted on the 17<sup>th</sup> percentile ADM 757 closely follows GL-S4  $\delta^{18}$ O. GL-S4 chronology is based on laminae counting. A summary of the construction of each chronology is in Table S5.

- 
- 
- 

### 762 Supplementary References

- 763
- 764 1 Markowska, M. et al. Modern speleothem oxygen isotope hydroclimate records in 765 water-limited SE Australia. Geochim Cosmochim Ac 270, 431-448, 766 doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2019.12.007 (2020).
- 767 2 Mahmud, K., Mariethoz, G., Treble, P. C. & Baker, A. Terrestrial LiDAR survey and 768 morphological analysis to identify infiltration properties in the Tamala Limestone,<br>769 Western Australia. IEEE Journal of Selected Topics in Applied Earth Observations and Western Australia. IEEE Journal of Selected Topics in Applied Earth Observations and 770 Remote Sensing 8, 4871-4881, doi:10.1109/JSTARS.2015.2451088 (2015).
- 771 3 Gat, J. R. Oxygen and Hydrogen Isotopes in the Hydrologic Cycle. Annual Review of 772 Earth and Planetary Sciences 24, 225-262, doi:10.1146/annurev.earth.24.1.225  $(1996)$ .
- 774 4 Horita, J. & Wesolowski, D. J. Liquid-vapor fractionation of oxygen and hydrogen 775 isotopes of water from the freezing to the critical temperature. Geochim Cosmochim Ac 776 58, 3425-3437 (1994).
- 777 5 Frisia, S. & Borsato, A. in Developments in Sedimentology Vol. 61 (eds A. M. Alonso-778 Zarza & L. H. Tanner) 269-318 (Elsevier, 2010).
- 779 6 Mickler, P. J., Stern, L. A. & Banner, J. L. Large kinetic isotope effects in modern 780 speleothems. Geological Society Of America Bulletin 118, 65-81 (2006).
- 781 7 Paterson, D. et al. in The 10th International Conference On X-Ray Microscopy 219-222<br>782 (AIP Publishing, 2011). (AIP Publishing, 2011).
- 783 8 Wang, J. K. et al. Hydroclimatic variability in Southeast Asia over the past two 784 millennia. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 525, 115737, 785 doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2019.115737 (2019).
- 786 9 Faraji, M. et al. Accurate dating of stalagmites from low seasonal contrast tropical 787 Pacific climate using Sr 2D maps, fabrics and annual hydrological cycles. Sci Rep-Uk 788 11, 2178, doi:10.1038/s41598-021-81941-x (2021).<br>789 10 Hellstrom, J. Rapid and accurate U/Th dating usin
- 10 Hellstrom, J. Rapid and accurate U/Th dating using parallel ion-counting multi-790 collector ICP-MS. Journal of Analytical Atomic Spectrometry 18, 1346-1351, 791 doi:10.1039/b308781f (2003).<br>792 11 Markowska, M. *et al.* Modelling t
- 792 11 Markowska, M. et al. Modelling the 14C bomb-pulse in young speleothems using a soil 793 carbon continuum model. Geochim Cosmochim Ac 261, 342-367, 794 doi: <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2019.04.029</u> (2019).<br>795 12 Baker, A. *et al.* Global analysis reveals climatic cont
- 12 Baker, A. et al. Global analysis reveals climatic controls on the oxygen isotope 796 composition of cave drip water. Nat Commun 10, 2984, doi:10.1038/s41467-019-<br>797 11027-w (2019). 11027-w (2019).
- 798 13 Yin, J.-J. et al. Individual event, seasonal and interannual variations in δ18O values of 799 drip water in Maomaotou Big Cave, Guilin, South China, and their implications for palaeoclimatic reconstructions.  $n/a$ , doi:10.1111/bor.12454 (2020).
- 800 palaeoclimatic reconstructions. **n/a**, doi:10.1111/bor.12454 (2020).<br>801 14 Czuppon, G., Bočić, N., Buzjak, N., Óvári, M. & Molnár, M. Monitoring in 801 14 Czuppon, G., Bočić, N., Buzjak, N., Óvári, M. & Molnár, M. Monitoring in the Barać and<br>802 Lower Cerovačka caves (Croatia) as a basis for the characterization of the Lower Cerovačka caves (Croatia) as a basis for the characterization of the 803 climatological and hydrological processes that control speleothem formation. 804 Ouaternary Meternational **494**, 52-65, 805 doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.quaint.2018.02.003 (2018).
- 806 15 Drăguşin, V. et al. Transfer of environmental signals from the surface to the 807 underground at Ascunsă Cave, Romania. Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. 21, 5357-5373, 808 doi:10.5194/hess-21-5357-2017 (2017).
- 809 16 Boch, R. Stalagmites from Katerloch Cave, Austria: Growth dynamics and high-810 resolution records of climate change PhD thesis, Leopold-Franzens-Universitat 811 Innsbruck, (2008).



- 865 34 Comas-Bru, L. *et al.* SISALv2: A comprehensive speleothem isotope database with<br>866 multiple age-depth models. *Earth Syst. Sci. Data* **12**, 2579-2606, doi:10.5194/essd-12-866 multiple age-depth models. *Earth Syst. Sci. Data* **12**, 2579-2606, doi:10.5194/essd-12-<br>867 2579-2020 (2020). 867 2579-2020 (2020).<br>868 35 Hijmans, R. J., Camer
- 868 35 Hijmans, R. J., Cameron, S. E., Parra, J. L., Jones, P. G. & Jarvis, A. (2004).<br>869 36 Spotl, C., Moseley, G., Johnson, K., Mattey, D. & P., T. Cave monitorin
- 869 36 Spotl, C., Moseley, G., Johnson, K., Mattey, D. & P., T. Cave monitoring database,<br>870 <www.cave-monitoring.org> (2020). 870 <www.cave-monitoring.org> (2020).
- 871
- 872
- 873
- 874
- 875