- 1 **Title**: Worldwide moderate-resolution mapping of lake surface chl-a reveals variable
- 2 responses to global change (1997-2020)
- 3
- 4 **Authors**: Benjamin M. Kraemer^{1*}, Karan Kakouei¹, Catalina Munteanu², Michael W.
- 5 Thayne^{1,3,4}, Rita Adrian^{1,3}
- 6 *Corresponding author: <u>ben.m.kraemer@gmail.com</u>
- 7

This is a non-peer reviewed preprint submitted to EarthArXiv

¹ IGB Leibniz Institute for Freshwater Ecology and Inland Fisheries, Berlin, Germany

² Albert-Ludwigs-University of Freiburg, Freiburg, Germany

³ Freie Universität of Berlin, Berlin, Germany

⁴ University of Geneva, Geneva, Switzerland

9 Abstract:

Anthropogenic activity is leading to widespread changes in lake water quality--a key 10 11 contributor to socio-ecological health. But, the anthropogenic forces affecting lake water 12 quality (climate change, land use change, and invasive species) are unevenly distributed across lakes, across the seasonal cycle, and across space within lakes, 13 14 potentially leading to highly variable water quality responses that are poorly documented at the global scale. Here, we used 742 million chlorophyll-a (chl-a) 15 observations merged over 6 satellite sensors (daily, 1 to 4 km resolution) to quantify 16 water quality changes from 1997 to 2020 in 345 globally-distributed large lakes. Chl-a 17 18 decreased across 56% of the cumulative total lake area, challenging the putative widespread increase in chl-a that is expected due to human activity. 18% of lakes 19 exhibited both significant positive and significant negative chl-a trends across different 20 locations or times of the year. This spatiotemporal complexity demonstrates the value of 21 22 moderate resolution mapping of lake chl-a to inform water management decisionmaking and to determine the local ecological consequences of human activity. 23

24

25 Main text:

Nutrient pollution and climate change may increase lake chl-a concentrations through various direct and indirect pathways ^{1,2}. For instance, industry, agriculture, and urbanization has caused well-documented increases in chl-a by delivering nutrients to lakes through runoff and atmospheric deposition¹. In addition, climate change can increase chl-a through the temperature dependence of primary production ³, by

expanding the stratified season ⁴, or by promoting lake conditions which favor bloomforming algae ⁵⁻⁷. Land use and climate change can interact leading to synergistic
increases in chl-a concentrations⁸ with potential negative consequences for the millions
of people who depend on lakes for their livelihoods ⁹.

However, global change is also associated with decreases in lake chl-a in some 35 contexts. Climate change has been shown to reduce chl-a by impeding the entrainment 36 of deep water nutrients into the surface waters where it is available to support algae 37 growth ^{10–12} particularly in nutrient-poor lakes^{13,14}. Increased temperatures may also 38 reduce chl-a when temperature-induced increases in the consumption and degradation 39 of algae outpace temperature-induced increases in algal production ^{15,16}. Invasive 40 species can affect chl-a indirectly through trophic cascades or directly by grazing. For 41 instance, invasive filter feeding mussels reduce chl-a by rapidly filtering lake water ^{17,18}. 42 Localized reductions in aquatic nutrient pollution can also reduce chl-a¹⁹⁻²¹. 43

These environmental changes are unevenly distributed across lakes, across the 44 seasonal cycle, and across space within lakes, potentially leading to highly 45 46 heterogeneous water quality responses ¹. But this heterogeneity is not yet well-captured at the global scale. Thus, it remains uncertain whether the environmental changes 47 operating a global scale tend to increase or decrease chl-a. An understanding of global 48 49 patterns and spatial heterogeneity in long-term changes in lake water quality at sufficient spatiotemporal resolution is necessary for improving our macroecological 50 understanding of lake ecosystems in a rapidly changing world. This improved 51 52 understanding would also allow managers to design and implement more precisely

targeted restoration strategies that are ultimately more effective at safeguarding lake
 resources ²².

55 Past global syntheses of long-term trends in chl-a at the global scale have treated lakes as discrete units with homogenous spatiotemporal changes ^{2,14}. Here, we 56 use a less discretized approach ²³ focusing on within-lake changes at the daily temporal 57 58 scale and at moderate spatial resolution (1km spatial resolution for Europe and 4 km spatial resolution for the rest of the world). We used 742 million chl-a observations 59 merged across 6 satellite sensors (SeaWiFS, MODIS AQUA, MERIS, OLCI-B, VIIRS 60 NPP, and VIIRS JPSS-1) to assess long-term trends in 345 large lakes (surface area 61 greater than 100 km²) under ice-free and cloud-free conditions from 1997 to 2020. To 62 detect chl-a, we used algorithms developed for coastal and inland waters²⁴ which we 63 adapted for specific lakes according to their mean depth, surface area, and shoreline 64 complexity using Boosted Regression Trees (BRTs). This lake-specific algorithm tuning 65 66 approach was based on cross validation comparing remote sensing and in situ chl-a data in 56 lakes where a total of 20,165 in situ chl-a observations were available. We 67 estimated the uncertainty in chl-a trends using bootstrapped error propagation 68 techniques ²⁵ incorporating the uncertainty in the chl-a algorithm and the lake-specific 69 algorithm tuning approach. 70

We found that when chl-a trends were calculated as lake-wide averages, the median chl-a trend across all lakes was +0.04 μ g chl-a decade⁻¹ (total range = -11.98 to +9.64 μ g chl-a decade⁻¹, interquartile range = -0.03 to 0.27 μ g chl-a decade⁻¹; Fig. 1). Lake-wide average chl-a increased in 63% of lakes (225 out of 345; Fig. 2) and decreased in the remaining 37%. Trends were statistically significant in 63% of the

increasing trends and 57% of the decreasing trends at the 0.1 level ($\alpha = 0.1$). Thus, more lakes had significant trends than what would be expected based on chance alone and this was true regardless of which arbitrary threshold was used for statistical significance testing (we tested $\alpha = 0.1, 0.05, 0.01$). These general findings are comparable to previous work based on Landsat imagery which found that 68% of large lakes had increasing chl-a concentrations and 39% of lakes had statistically significant trends (alpha = 0.1) in chl-a since the 1980's ².

The lake-wide average trends agreed well with published literature on 83 phytoplankton, chl-a, and other phytoplankton proxies based on *in situ* data sources. 84 For example, in situ chl-a has decreased in Lake Nicaragua (Cocibolca) after nutrient 85 pollution peaked there in the mid 2000s ²⁶ (Fig. 1). In situ phytoplankton biomass 86 proxies also decreased in Lake Tanganyika as enhanced thermal stratification due to 87 climate change has reduced primary production ^{10,11,27} (Fig. 1). Conversely, chl-a 88 variation in Lake Kivu shown here (Fig. 1) matched a strong cycle in phytoplankton 89 biomass observed in situ due to background climate variation ²⁸. Remotely-sensed chl-90 a also increased in Lake Erie which has experienced a well-documented nutrient 91 92 pollution trend for decades due to agricultural expansion and intensification²⁹ (Fig. 1).



95 Fig. 1 | Chl-a percent change (1997-2020) based on lake-wide averages. Map

96 showing lake-wide trends for 345 globally distributed lakes where the sizes of the dots 97 are proportional to the size of the lake and the transparency of the dot is proportional to 98 the size in the transparency of the dot is proportional to

the significance of the trend (a). Time series show the chl-a anomalies for the 6 lakes

with the largest negative trends (b:g) in lake-wide chl-a and the 6 lakes with the largest
positive trends (h:m) in lake-wide chl-a when trends were weighted by each lake's
volume. The black lines (b:m) are the ordinary least squares regression line and the
size of the dots represents the number of remote sensing observations in each year
(b:m). An inset map of Europe can be found in Supplemental Fig. S1.

104

While 63% of lakes had positive chl-a trends at the lake-wide average scale, only 105 44% of the total lake area experienced increases in chl-a at the pixel scale. This 106 difference arose because chl-a tended to decrease in the largest lakes (Fig 1). The 107 global median chl-a trend was -0.01 µg chl-a decade⁻¹ when pixel-level trends were 108 weighted by pixel area (pixel area varies across latitude when a consistent equal angle 109 grid is applied). In total, we investigated chl-a trends at the pixel scale for 1,383,893 km² 110 of cumulative lake area. Chl-a increased for 612,014 km² of the cumulative lake area 111 and 17% (104,871 km²) was significant at the 0.1 level. Chl-a decreased across 112 113 771,879 km² of the cumulative lake area and 19% (148,175 km²) of the lake area with decreasing trends was significant at the 0.1 level. Thus, more lake area had significant 114 trends at the pixel scale than what would be expected based on chance alone 115 regardless of which arbitrary threshold was used for statistical significance (we tested a 116 = 0.1, 0.05, and 0.01). This finding challenges the broadly held assumption that global 117 change causes widespread increases in lake chl-a¹. 118

Decreases in chl-a observed here have been attributed to water management efforts in some lakes (e.g. Ladoga ³⁰), and to invasive filter feeding mussels in others (e.g. Ontario, Huron, Michigan ²⁰), but these drivers alone cannot explain decreases across all lakes. Decreases in chl-a as a result of climate change through changes to terrestrial inputs ³¹, higher heterotrophic consumption of algae ^{32,33}, or climate change

mediated reductions in deep water nutrient entrainment to the well-lit surface waters ^{4,34–}
³⁶ may be an underrecognized response to global change. While this result is most
relevant for Earth's large lakes, widespread bluing trends have been observed in small
lakes as well ^{31,37,38}. We recommend future emphasis on how global-change may reduce
chl-a, especially because chl-a reductions can heavily affect lake ecosystems and the
benefits that humans derive from them ^{19–21}.



Fig. 2 | Distribution of global chl-a percent change (1997-2020). Percent change at the lake-wide average scale (a, b), and at the lake area scale (c, d). Blue indicates decreasing trends and green indicates increasing trends. The solid colors represent trends significant at the α = 0.1 level.

Long-term trends based on lake-wide averages hid the complexity of long-term 136 137 change in chl-a across lake surfaces. Some lakes which had weak or no significant 138 overall chl-a trend at the lake-wide scale, had strong simultaneous increases and decreases in chl-a at different locations within the lake (Fig. 3). For example, the 139 140 Caspian Sea had a weak overall trend at the lake-wide scale but chl-a increased significantly in the northern shallows (Fig. 3). Increasing trends in the Caspian Sea 141 primarily occurred near the inflowing Ural, Volga, and Terek rivers which deliver large 142 nutrient loads from the surrounding landscape ³⁹ (Supplemental Fig. S2). At the lake-143 144 wide scale, this increase in chl-a in the northern shallows was offset by the statistically weaker but widespread decrease in chl-a in the deeper offshore areas (Fig. 3). 145

In addition to the Caspian Sea, many other lakes experienced local increases in 146 chl-a in the shallower areas closer to the shore near inflowing rivers that diverged from 147 lake-wide average trends (Fig. 3). For example, Lake Huron experienced very localized 148 increases in chl-a in the shallow Saginaw Bay where the Saginaw River enters the lake 149 bringing with it a variety of agricultural and industrial pollutants ⁴⁰ (Supplemental Fig. 150 S2). At the same time, chl-a decreased in the offshore deeper areas of Lake Huron 151 where the combined effect of nutrient mitigation and invasive species expansion has 152 caused reductions in chl-a²⁰. Lake Titicaca experienced very localized increases in chl-153 a in the smaller south east basin where inflowing rivers drain an increasingly urbanized 154 catchment near El Alto/La Paz, Bolivia ⁴¹ (Supplemental Fig. S2). A strong reduction in 155 156 chl-a concentrations in Lake Ladoga (Fig. 3) suggests that continued efforts at reducing nutrient pollution have improved water quality there. However, patchy greening areas in 157

158 the shallower parts of Lake Ladoga may indicate the potential for internal re-suspension of past phosphorus loads resting in the sediment ⁴². Lake Nasser/Nubia, one of the 159 largest manmade lakes in the world, has a pronounced greening trend near the 160 inflowing Nile River which transitions into a bluing trend near the outflow of the 161 reservoir. This pattern of chl-a increases transitioning to chl-a decreases was common 162 in large reservoirs presumably because nutrient loads from incoming rivers get diluted 163 as they pass into larger volumes of water with greater thermal stratification. Thus, 164 simultaneous increases and decreases in chl-a for specific locations within lakes can 165 166 reflect differences in the location and strength of various anthropogenic stressors affecting chl-a. Chl-a changes at the local scale within lakes may diverge widely from 167 168 the lake-wide average.



Fig. 3 | Spatial variation within and across lakes in chl-a trends (1997-2020). The relative positions of the lakes shown here do not reflect geo-spatial location but lake

sizes share a common scale except where indicated otherwise in the boxed insets.

Lakes shown are those with the largest number of chl-a observations. The p-values

- associated with each grid cell can be found in Supplemental Fig. S3.
- 175

```
Long-term trends based on lake-wide averages also failed to capture the
```

- 177 complexity of long-term change in lake surface chl-a across days of the year for
- individual lakes. For example, in Lakes Michigan, Huron, and Ontario, introduced
- mussels have reduced chl-a primarily in the less stratified times of the year when the

impact of filter feeding on phytoplankton is strongest ¹⁸ (Fig. 4). Chl-a decreases in Lake 180 Tanganyika were most pronounced during the dry season when climate change 181 mediated changes to stratification patterns have dampened seasonal mixing ^{10,11}. 182 Several lakes had serial increases and decreases in chl-a across the seasonal 183 spectrum (Fig. 4). For instance, earlier seasonal stratification in Lake Superior due to 184 185 climate change may have increased chl-a in early spring when phytoplankton benefit from being retained in the well-lit stratified surface layer where they can better 186 photosynthesize. But the increased chl-a in early spring is combined with a summer 187 decrease in chl-a as prolonged summer stratification reduces the amount of nutrients 188 available for primary producers⁴³. 189

190 This within lake complexity (Fig. 3, Supplemental Fig. S4) and seasonal complexity (Fig. 4) of chl-a trends discounts the tendency to emphasize the 191 dichotomous view that lakes are either undergoing increases or decreases in chl-a. 18% 192 193 of lakes exhibited significant positive and negative trends in chl-a at different locations or at different times of the year (more than 10% of positive trends and more than 10% of 194 the negative trends had p-values less than 0.1). This combination of positive and 195 196 negative trends for individual lakes highlights the heterogeneity of lake responses to global change. Therefore, lake ecology and ecosystem management should recognize 197 198 the potential for local changes at specific times of the year to vary widely from lake-wide averages. Whole-lake chl-a trends can mask spatiotemporal trend variability leading to 199 lakes with weak trends at the lake-wide scale but strongly contrasting increases and 200 decreases in chl-a at finer seasonal and spatial resolution (e.g. Caspian Sea in Fig. 3 201 and Fig. 4). 202



Fig. 4 | Seasonal variation in lake chl-a trends (1997-2020). Panels (a:j) show seasonal trends in chl-a for the 10 largest lakes with broad seasonal data coverage. Lines represent the LOESS-smoothed daily trend in chl-a weighted by the number of observations included in the chl-a trend calculation for each day of the year. The blue to green color reinforces values on the y-axes and is consistent across panels. The shaded area represents the 95% confidence interval for the smoothed line.

Overall, we provide a global view of trends in near surface chl-a over the past 23 211 212 years for large lakes. Our analysis of chl-a in lakes demonstrates the promise of spatially-explicit long-term satellite observations for tracking chl-a conditions and 213 disentangling the multiple overlapping drivers of change. The approach used here 214 215 augments the geographically and temporally limited in situ chl-a monitoring efforts 216 where data is often not shared readily nor in near real time. This analysis applies a novel statistical approach to merge chl-a data from multiple sensors to produce a 217 218 validated data set that documents global surface lake chl-a dynamics with new levels of 219 spatial detail and accuracy. Global datasets documenting the aquatic concentration of chlorophyll-a (chl-a) with remote sensing can serve as a key indicator of lake responses 220 221 to human activity but so far have been underused. The accuracy of remote sensing

based chl-a estimates has been questioned at the local scale due to the presence of 222 223 surface algae scums, submerged vegetation, sediment, and high concentrations of organic matter ^{44–46}. However, the cross validation and the performance of the lake-224 specific chl-a algorithm developed here (Supplemental Fig. S5) suggests that our main 225 conclusions are robust to such effects. Nonetheless, we caution against the 226 227 overinterpretation of specific trend estimates reported here and suggest corroborating observed trends in chl-a with in situ measurements wherever possible. In the frequent 228 229 absence of such *in situ* measurements, remote sensing data of this type may provide 230 the best approximation of global scale trends yet available.

231 Our primary result that chl-a concentrations decreased for 56% of lake area challenges the putative widespread increase in chl-a intensity that is expected due to 232 human activity. Furthermore, we highlight that lake chl-a trends vary substantially 233 across the surface of lakes, and across seasons making lake-wide average trends or 234 235 patterns extrapolated from small central extraction points potentially misleading. The findings reported here reinforce the need for water-resource management strategies 236 that integrate the potential for both increases and decreases in chl-a due to global 237 238 change. Spatially-explicit water quality monitoring is essential for evaluating the success of investments in water management and for detecting new management challenges. 239 240 Management approaches that currently treat lake-wide surface chl-a trends in a simplistic fashion should immediately benefit from the detailed maps of chl-a trends 241 242 provided here. Resolving key challenges in water management requires spatially- and temporally-explicit approaches that engage policymakers and water managers at scales 243 relevant to their decisions, including subnational administrative units, bays, and 244

delimited stretches of lake shoreline. The data used herein hold promise for identifying
the timing and magnitude of lake phytoplankton variations at daily scales allowing lake
scientists and managers to concurrently capture human influences on surface water
quality in near real time. The need to mobilize financial resources to support integrated
approaches using these data is imperative, before additional drift from past ecological
conditions becomes the new accepted norm for lakes.

251

252 Methods:

253 Overview

254 We calculated long-term (1997-2020) chl-a trends using 23 years of remote sensing data for 345 lakes (listed in Table S1). Trends were calculated from chl-a 255 anomalies where the effects of the day of the year, latitude, longitude, and remote 256 257 sensing platform as well as the interactions between these variables had been accounted for and removed from the data. We calculated a single lake-wide trend where 258 chl-a anomalies were pooled across pixels and seasons for each lake. We also 259 260 calculated separate trends for each pixel (where chl-a anomalies were pooled across all days of the year) and for each day of the year (where chl-a anomalies were pooled 261 across pixels). The size of the pixels was 1-km for lakes in Europe and 4-km for the rest 262 of the globe based on the limitation of the data source used here ⁴⁷. 263

264

265 Remote sensing chl-a data

We used 742 million chl-a observations merged across 6 sensors (SeaWiFS, 266 MODIS AQUA, MERIS, OLCI-B, VIIRS NPP, and VIIRS JPSS-1) to assess long-term 267 trends in 345 lakes under ice-free and cloud-free conditions from year 1997 to 2020. 268 Chl-a data were retrieved from the "CHL-OC5" product produced by GlobColour⁴⁷ and 269 made available via the Copernicus Marine Environmental Monitoring Service (CMEMS) 270 271 website: http://marine.copernicus. eu/services-portfolio/access-to-products/. The algorithm used in the CHL-OC5 data product is a five-channel chlorophyll concentration 272 algorithm which was developed for optically complex "case II waters"²⁴ and has been 273 partially validated using global in situ data from marine and inland waters ^{48–50}. We build 274 on this validation by expanding it to in situ data from 53 lakes as described below. The 275 daily chl-a data reflect lake environments in the near surface layer during ice-free and 276 cloud-free conditions. Thus, the seasonal extent and the number of chl-a observations 277 varied across lakes ranging from 2601 observations for Lake Mogotoyeyo to 365 million 278 observations for Lake Ladoga. We downloaded and processed the chl-a values in the R 279 environment for statistical computing⁵¹ using the "data.table"⁵², "dismo"⁵³, "sf"⁵⁴, "gbm"⁵⁵, 280 "zyp"⁵⁶ and "lubridate"⁵⁷ packages. Data visualizations were made using "ggplot2"⁵⁸. 281

282

283 Chl-a algorithm cross validation and adaptation for inland waters

We adapted remotely sensed chl-a values specifically for lakes based on a comparison of 20,165 *in situ* chl-a measurements (filtered water samples) from 56 lakes matched to interpolated remote sensing data. To interpolate the remote sensing chl-a values, we used fully deterministic BRTs (bag fraction = 1) which modelled remotely sensed chl-a as a function of the decimal date, day of the year, sensor, latitude, and

longitude separately for each lake. We used the resulting boosted regression trees
(BRTs) to estimate remotely-sensed chl-a concentrations for all 6 sensors at the time
and location of each *in situ* measurement. These modeled values served as the
remotely-sensed matchup value for each *in situ* measurement. *In situ* data used for this
purpose were downloaded, digitized, and compiled from published sources (Table S2).

294 We modelled the difference between in situ values and their remotely sensed matchup values as a function of the raw remotely sensed chl-a value, the in situ data 295 source, and 3 lake characteristics (mean lake depth, surface area, and shoreline 296 297 development index (a metric of shoreline complexity; the ratio of a lake's shoreline length to the circumference of a circle with the equivalent lake area)) also using a BRT. 298 299 These three lake characteristic variables were used because they are associated with lake optical characteristics⁵⁹ and are freely available from the HydroLAKES database⁶⁰. 300 Thus, the BRT allowed the difference between in situ and remotely sensed chl-a values 301 302 to vary from lake to lake. We then used the resulting model to estimate the difference between in situ and remotely sensed values for all 742 million chl-a observations used 303 here. We translated the remotely sensed chl-a values into an "in situ analogue" chl-a 304 305 value by subtracting the modelled differences from the raw remotely sensed values. The resulting *in situ* analogue chl-a values were used for all subsequent analyses. 306

307

308 Chl-a anomaly calculations

To estimate lake surface chl-a anomalies, we accounted for and removed
variation in each lake's *in situ* analogue chl-a data which could be attributed to the day

of the year, latitude, longitude, and sensor. This allowed us to calculate trends over time 311 in chl-a anomalies which were not influenced by these variables or the interactions 312 among them. We used a tree complexity of 5 to allow for high levels of interactions 313 among variables (e.g. sensor type could have different effects on *in situ* analog chl-a at 314 specific grid cells within lakes and at specific times of the year). To prevent model 315 316 overfitting, the BRTs were fit separately for each lake 10 times using a randomly selected 50% of the data. Predicted values were generated from each of the 10 models 317 for all observations and averaged to generate more robust estimates. The difference 318 319 between the *in situ* analog chl-a values and the average of the 10 model predictions were termed, "chl-a anomalies." We confirmed that this process successfully removed 320 the variation attributable to the day of the year, latitude, longitude, and sensor using 321 visual diagnostic plotting for all lakes (see example for Lake Erie in Supplemental Fig. 322 S6). 323

324 BRTs include a variety of tuning parameters which influence the model performance in cross validation. We selected a combination of tuning parameters (bag 325 fraction = 0.62, tree complexity = 5) which reliably gave good performance in 10-fold 326 327 cross validation across all lakes (median predicted residual error sum of squares = 0.35 μ g L⁻¹, and median correlation between predicted and observed values = 0.85). We 328 329 optimized the learning rate separately for each of the 10 BRTs for each lake by iteratively running the model with smaller and smaller learning rates (from 0.8, 0.4, 0.2, 330 0.1, 0.05, to 0.025) until the number of trees in the BRT which minimized the predicted 331 deviance was greater than 1000 as suggested in previous literature ⁶¹. 332

333

334 Chl-a trends

We used a bootstrapped error propagation technique to estimate chl-a trends 335 336 and the uncertainty in each trend. The residual errors from the BRT used for adapting 337 remotely sensed chl-a into in situ analogue values were propagated into the estimate of chl-a trend uncertainty. We propagated the errors by adding a residual error (the 338 339 product of a randomly selected % error residual from the BRT's error distribution and the original in situ analogue chl-a value) to each chl-a anomaly. Distinct residual errors 340 were iteratively added to each chl-a anomaly value with 100 repetitions. For each 341 repetition, Theil-Sen slopes and intercepts were calculated based on mean annual chl-a 342 343 anomalies. The statistical significance of each trend was calculated as the p-value of a Spearman rank correlation test relating mean chl-a anomalies to year. The trends and 344 their associated p-values were calculated as the average across all 100 repetitions of 345 the Theil-Sen slope and Spearman correlation calculations. 346

We calculated a single lake-wide trend where chl-a anomalies were pooled 347 across pixels and seasons for each lake. We also calculated separate trends for each 348 349 pixel (where chl-a anomalies were pooled across all days of the year) and for each day of the year (where chl-a anomalies were pooled across pixels). Chl-a percent change 350 was calculated from Theil-Sen nonparametric regression in chl-a anomalies after the 351 352 effects of the day of the year, latitude, longitude, and sensor as well as the interactions between these variables had been accounted for and removed from the data. Theil-Sen 353 nonparametric regression results were translated into a proportion change by taking the 354 355 difference between the Theil-Sen modelled chl-a anomalies in 2020 and 1997 as a

proportion of the lake's median chl-a *in situ* analog value. This proportion was translated
into a percentage by multiplying by 100.

358

Acknowledgements: BMK, KK, and RA acknowledge the 2017-2018 Belmont Forum
and BiodivERsA joint call for research proposals under the BiodivScen ERA-Net
COFUND programme and with funding from the German Science Foundation (AD
91/22-1). MWT and RA acknowledge the funding received from Marie SklodowskaCurie Actions (Marie Skłodowska-Curie grant agreement no. 722518) and EU-ITN
MANTEL project. CM acknowledges support from the German Science Foundation
(DFG) Research Training Group ConFoBi (GRK 2123/1 TPX).

366

Author Contributions: BMK conceived of the work, led the study, completed the
 analysis, and wrote the manuscript with input from all co-authors. BMK, KK, MWT, CM,
 and RA edited and revised the manuscript.

370

Competing Interest Statement: The authors declare that they have no known
 competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to
 influence the work reported in this paper.

374

Data Availability Statement: GlobColour data (http://globcolour.info) used in this study
has been developed, validated, and distributed by ACRI-ST, France. Geospatial and

377	mc	rphometric data for each lake is available from the previously published
378	Hy	droLAKES database under the identifier doi: 10.1038/ncomms13603 and can be
379	fou	nd at http://www.hydrosheds.org.
380		
381	Co	de Availability Statement: All code used here are available under the identifier,
382	DC	DI: 10.5281/zenodo.5026693
383		
384	Re	ferences:
385	1.	Oliver, S. K. et al. Unexpected stasis in a changing world: Lake nutrient and chlorophyll trends since
386		1990. Glob. Change Biol. 23 , (2017).
387	2.	Ho, J. C., Michalak, A. M. & Pahlevan, N. Widespread global increase in intense lake phytoplankton
388		blooms since the 1980s. <i>Nature</i> 574 , 667–670 (2019).
389	3.	Yvon-Durocher, G. et al. Five Years of Experimental Warming Increases the Biodiversity and
390		Productivity of Phytoplankton. PLoS Biol. 13, (2015).
391	4.	Woolway, R. I. & Merchant, C. J. Worldwide alteration of lake mixing regimes in response to climate
392		change. Nat. Geosci. 12, 271–276 (2019).
393	5.	Kosten, S. et al. Warmer climates boost cyanobacterial dominance in shallow lakes. Glob. Change
394		<i>Biol.</i> 18 , 118–126 (2012).
395	6.	Wagner, C. & Adrian, R. Cyanobacteria dominance: Quantifying the effects of climate change.
396		Limnol. Oceanogr. 54 , 2460–2468 (2009).
397	7.	Paerl, H. W. & Paul, V. J. Climate change: links to global expansion of harmful cyanobacteria. Water
398		<i>Res.</i> 46 , 1349–63 (2012).

399	8.	Rigosi, A., Carey, C. & Ibelings, B. The interaction between climate warming and eutrophication to
400		promote cyanobacteria is dependent on trophic state and varies among taxa. Limnol. Oceanogr. 59,
401		99–114 (2014).

- 402 9. Dodds, W. K. *et al.* Eutrophication of U.S. Freshwaters: Analysis of Potential Economic Damages.
- 403 Environ. Sci. Technol. **43**, 12–19 (2009).
- 404 10. O'Reilly, C. M., Alin, S. R., Plisnier, P.-D., Cohen, A. S. & McKee, B. A. Climate change decreases
- 405 aquatic ecosystem productivity of Lake Tanganyika, Africa. *Nature* **424**, 766–8 (2003).
- 406 11. Tierney, J. E. *et al.* Late-twentieth-century warming in Lake Tanganyika unprecedented since AD
- 407 500. *Nat. Geosci.* **3**, 422–425 (2010).
- 408 12. Behrenfeld, M. J. *et al.* Climate-driven trends in contemporary ocean productivity. *Nature* 444, 752–
 409 755 (2006).
- 410 13. Michelutti, N. *et al.* Climate change forces new ecological states in tropical Andean lakes. *PLoS ONE*411 **10**, e0115338 (2015).
- 412 14. Kraemer, B. M., Mehner, T. & Adrian, R. Reconciling the opposing effects of warming on
- 413 phytoplankton biomass in 188 large lakes. *Sci. Rep.* **7**, (2017).
- 414 15. Yvon-Durocher, G., Montoya, J. M., Trimmer, M. & Woodward, G. Warming alters the size spectrum
- and shifts the distribution of biomass in freshwater ecosystems. *Glob. Change Biol.* 17, 1681–1694
 (2011).
- 417 16. Kraemer, B. M. *et al.* Global patterns in lake ecosystem responses to warming based on the
- 418 temperature dependence of metabolism. *Glob. Change Biol.* **23**, 1881–1890 (2017).
- 419 17. Vanderploeg, H. A. et al. Dispersal and emerging ecological impacts of Ponto-Caspian species in the
- 420 Laurentian Great Lakes. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences vol. 59 (2002).

- 421 18. Warner, D. M. & Lesht, B. M. Relative importance of phosphorus, invasive mussels and climate for
- 422 patterns in chlorophyll a and primary production in Lakes Michigan and Huron. *Freshw. Biol.* 60,
 423 1029–1043 (2015).
- 424 19. Jeppesen, E. *et al.* Lake responses to reduced nutrient loading An analysis of contemporary long-
- 425 term data from 35 case studies. *Freshw. Biol.* **50**, 1747–1771 (2005).
- 426 20. Evans, M. A., Fahnenstiel, G. & Scavia, D. Incidental oligotrophication of North American Great
 427 Lakes. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 45, 3297–3303 (2011).
- 428 21. Anderson, N. J., Jeppesen, E. & Søndergaard, M. Ecological effects of reduced nutrient loading
- 429 (oligotrophication). An introduction. *Freshwat Biol* **50**, 1589–1593 (2005).
- 430 22. Vörösmarty, C. J. *et al.* Global threats to human water security and river biodiversity. *Nature* 467,
 431 555–561 (2010).
- 432 23. Kraemer, B. M. Rethinking discretization to advance limnology amid the ongoing information
 433 explosion. *Water Res.* 178, 115801 (2020).
- 434 24. Gohin, F., Druon, J. N. & Lampert, L. A five channel chlorophyll concentration algorithm applied to
- 435 Sea WiFS data processed by SeaDAS in coastal waters. *Int. J. Remote Sens.* **23**, 1639–1661 (2002).
- 436 25. Blukacz, E. A., Sprules, W. G. & Brunner, J. Use of the bootstrap for error propagation in estimating
- 437 zooplankton production. *Ecology* **86**, 2223–2231 (2005).
- 438 26. Vammen, K., Pitty, J. & Montenegro Guillén, S. Evaluación del proceso de eutroficación del lago
- 439 Cocibolca, Nicaragua y sus causas en la cuenca. En Eutrofización En América Sur Consecuencias
- 440 Tecnol. Gerenc. Control Inst. Int. Ecol. Interacademic Panel Int. Issues 35–58 (2006).
- 441 27. Cohen, A. S. et al. Climate warming reduces fish production and benthic habitat in Lake Tanganyika,
- 442 one of the most biodiverse freshwater ecosystems. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* **113**, 9563–9568 (2016).
- 28. Rugema, E. *et al.* Long-term change of phytoplankton in Lake Kivu: The rise of the greens. *Freshw.*
- 444 *Biol.* **64**, 1940–1955 (2019).

- 445 29. Michalak, A. M. et al. Record-setting algal bloom in Lake Erie caused by agricultural and
- 446 meteorological trends consistent with expected future conditions. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 110, 6448–
 447 6452 (2013).
- 30. Rukhovets, L. A. *et al.* Studying the response of Lake Ladoga ecosystem to a decrease in phosphorus
 load. *Water Resour.* 38, 806–817 (2011).
- 450 31. Kuhn, C. & Butman, D. Declining greenness in Arctic-boreal lakes. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* 118,
 451 e2021219118 (2021).
- 452 32. Sommer, U. & Lewandowska, A. Climate change and the phytoplankton spring bloom: warming and
- 453 overwintering zooplankton have similar effects on phytoplankton. *Glob. Change Biol.* **17**, 154–162
- 454 (2011).
- 33. O'Connor, M. I. M., Piehler, M. F. M., Leech, D. M. D., Anton, A. & Bruno, J. F. Warming and resource
 availability shift food web structure and metabolism. *PLoS Biol.* 7, e1000178 (2009).
- 457 34. Kraemer, B. M. et al. Morphometry and average temperature affect lake stratification responses to
- 458 climate change. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **42**, 4981–4988 (2015).
- 459 35. Richardson, D. C. *et al.* Transparency, geomorphology and mixing regime explain variability in trends
- 460 in lake temperature and stratification across Northeastern North America (1975-2014). *Water Switz*.
- 461 **9**, (2017).
- 462 36. Winder, M. & Sommer, U. Phytoplankton response to a changing climate. *Hydrobiologia* 698, 5–16
- 463 (2012).
- 464 37. Multi-decadal improvement in US Lake water clarity IOPscience.
- 465 https://iopscience.iop.org/article/10.1088/1748-9326/abf002/meta.
- 466 38. Wilkinson, G., Walter, J. A., Buelo, C. & Pace, M. No evidence of widespread algal bloom
- 467 intensification in hundreds of lakes. in (AGU, 2020).

- 468 39. Modabberi, A. *et al.* Caspian Sea is eutrophying: the alarming message of satellite data. *Environ. Res.*469 *Lett.* 15, 124047 (2020).
- 470 40. Stow, C. A. et al. Phosphorus targets and eutrophication objectives in Saginaw Bay: A 35year

471 assessment. J. Gt. Lakes Res. 40, 4–10 (2014).

- 472 41. Archundia, D. et al. How uncontrolled urban expansion increases the contamination of the titicaca
- 473 lake basin (El Alto, La Paz, Bolivia). *Water. Air. Soil Pollut.* **228**, 44 (2017).
- 474 42. Ignatieva, N. V. Distribution and release of sedimentary phosphorus in Lake Ladoga. *Hydrobiologia*475 **322**, 129–136 (1996).
- 476 43. Woolway, R. I. *et al.* Phenological shifts in lake stratification under climate change. *Nat. Commun.*
- **12**, 2318 (2021).
- 478 44. Feng, L. *et al.* Concerns about phytoplankton bloom trends in global lakes. *Nature* 590, E35–E47
 479 (2021).
- 480 45. Palmer, S. C. J., Kutser, T. & Hunter, P. D. Remote sensing of inland waters: Challenges, progress and

481 future directions. *Remote Sens. Environ.* **157**, 1–8 (2015).

- 482 46. Matthews, M. W. A current review of empirical procedures of remote sensing in inland and near-
- 483 coastal transitional waters. *Int. J. Remote Sens.* **32**, 6855–6899 (2011).
- 484 47. Maritorena, S., d'Andon, O. H. F., Mangin, A. & Siegel, D. A. Merged satellite ocean color data
- 485 products using a bio-optical model: Characteristics, benefits and issues. *Remote Sens. Environ.* 114,
 486 1791–1804 (2010).
- 487 48. Gbagir, A.-M. G. & Colpaert, A. Assessing the Trend of the Trophic State of Lake Ladoga Based on
- 488 Multi-Year (1997–2019) CMEMS GlobColour-Merged CHL-OC5 Satellite Observations. Sensors 20,
- 489 6881 (2020).

490	49. Pitarch, J., Volpe, G., Colella, S., Krasemann, H. & Santoleri, R. Remote sensing of chlorophyll in the
491	Baltic Sea at basin scale from 1997 to 2012 using merged multi-sensor data. Ocean Sci. 12, 379–389
492	(2016).

- 493 50. Lavigne, H. *et al.* Quality-control tests for OC4, OC5 and NIR-red satellite chlorophyll-a algorithms
 494 applied to coastal waters. *Remote Sens. Environ.* 255, 112237 (2021).
- 495 51. R Core Team. *R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing. R Foundation for Statistical*496 *Computing* (R Foundation for Statistical Computing, 2020).
- 497 52. Dowle, M. et al. Package 'data. table'. Ext. 'data Frame (2019).
- 498 53. Hijmans, R. J., Phillips, S., Leathwick, J., Elith, J. & Hijmans, M. R. J. Package 'dismo'. *Circles* 9, 1–68
 499 (2017).
- 500 54. Pebesma, E. J. Simple features for R: Standardized support for spatial vector data. *R J* **10**, 439 (2018).
- 501 55. Ridgeway, G. & Ridgeway, M. G. The gbm package. *R Found. Stat. Comput. Vienna Austria* 5, (2004).

502 56. Bronaugh, D., Werner, A. & Bronaugh, M. D. Package 'zyp'. *CRAN Repos.* (2009).

- 503 57. Grolemund, G. & Wickham, H. Dates and times made easy with lubridate. *J. Stat. Softw.* **40**, 1–25 (2011).
- 505 58. Wickham, H. ggplot2: Elegant Graphics for Data Analysis. (Springer-Verlag New York, 2009).
- 506 59. Eleveld, M. A. et al. An optical classification tool for global lake waters. Remote Sens. 9, (2017).
- 60. Messager, M. L., Lehner, B., Grill, G., Nedeva, I. & Schmitt, O. Estimating the volume and age of
 water stored in global lakes using a geo-statistical approach. *Nat. Commun.* 7, (2016).
- 509 61. Elith, J., Leathwick, J. & Hastie, T. A working guide to boosted regression trees. J. Anim. Ecol. 77,
- 510 802–813 (2008).

512 Supplemental Figures:

513



- 515 Supplemental Fig. S1 | Chl-a percent change (1997-2020) based on lake-wide
- 516 averages for European lakes with data at higher spatial resolution (1 km x 1 km).
- 517 The color of the dot indicates the trend with green values corresponding to increases in
- chl-a and blue values corresponding to decreases in chl-a. The opacity of the trend is
- 519 proportional to its significance with more opaque circles indicating more statistically
- significant trends. The size of the dot is proportional to the area of each lake.



523 Supplemental Fig. S2 | Greening near the mouths of major inflowing rivers. Maps

shown for Saginaw Bay, Lake Huron (**a**), the Northern Caspian Sea (**b**), and Lake

525 Titicaca (**c**).



Supplemental Fig. S3 | Statistical significance of trends across space within

- lakes. Lakes shown are the same as those in Fig 3. Darker reds indicate relatively
- higher statistical significance. P-values less than 0.5 appear white.









Supplemental Fig. S5 | Cross validation of remotely sensed chl-a. Relationship between *in situ* chl-a and the nearest raw remote sensing chl-a value (a). Relationship between *in situ* chl-a and the *in situ* analogue chl-a values after adapting the chl-a algorithm for specific lakes according to their characteristics (b). The shaded area reflects the density of the chl-a observations at each gridcell. The red dots are the lakewide averages for each of the 56 lakes where *in situ* chl-a data were available.



548 Supplemental Fig. S6 | Calculation of chl-a anomalies from *in situ* analog chl-a

549 **values**. We used boosted regression trees to remove the variation in chl-a (*in situ*

analog values) attributable to the sensor (**a**, **b**), the day of the year (**c**, **d**), and the

551 location (latitude and longitude) (**e**, **f**). Locally weighted scatterplot smoothing

(LOWESS) lines are shown for raw chl-a values (**a**, **c**, **e**) and chl-a anomaly values (**b**,

553 **d**, **f**) demonstrating that the variation attributable to three variables (sensor, day of the

year, and location) and their interactions was successfully removed by this method.

- 556 Supplemental Table S1 | List of all large lakes included in the analysis including their
- 557 characteristics.
- 558 **Supplemental Table S2** | *In situ* chl-a data used for chl-a algorithm tuning.