Insights into Magma Storage Beneath a Frequently Erupting Arc Volcano (Villarrica, Chile) from Unsupervised Machine Learning Analysis of Mineral Compositions

Felix O. Boschetty, David J. Ferguson, Joaquín A. Cortés, Eduardo Morgado, Susanna K. Ebmeier, Daniel J. Morgan, Jorge E. Romero and Carolina Silva Parejas

1Institute of Geophysics and Tectonics, School of Earth and Environment, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK
2Department of Geography & Geology, Edge Hill University, Ormskirk, UK
3Escuela de Geología, Universidad Mayor, Manuel Montt 367, Providencia, Santiago, Chile
4Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Manchester, Manchester, UK
5Escuela de Geología, Facultad de Ingeniería, Universidad Santo Tomás, Ejército Libertador 146, Santiago, Chile

The following document is a non-peer reviewed preprint uploaded on EarthArXiv. The manuscript has been submitted for publication in Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems. Please note that the manuscript has not undergone peer-review and that subsequent versions of this paper may have slightly different content. If accepted, the final version will be available via a DOI link on this webpage. Please feel free to contact any of the authors, we welcome any feedback.
Insights into Magma Storage Beneath a Frequently Erupting Arc Volcano (Villarrica, Chile) from Unsupervised Machine Learning Analysis of Mineral Compositions

Felix O. Boschetty¹, David J. Ferguson¹, Joaquín A. Cortés², Eduardo Morgado³, Susanna K. Ebmeier¹, Daniel J. Morgan¹, Jorge E. Romero⁴, and Carolina Silva Parejas⁵

¹Institute of Geophysics and Tectonics, School of Earth and Environment, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK
²Department of Geography & Geology, Edge Hill University, Ormskirk, UK
³Escuela de Geología, Universidad Mayor, Manuel Montt 367, Providencia, Santiago, Chile
⁴Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Manchester, Manchester, UK
⁵Escuela de Geología, Facultad de Ingeniería, Universidad Santo Tomás, Ejército Libertador 146, Santiago, Chile

Key Points:

• Unsupervised machine learning reveals previously undetected compositional clusters in Villarrica’s crystal cargoes
• Thermodynamic models demonstrate magma storage occurs in a vertically extensive system containing variably evolved mushy reservoirs
• Temporal trends in crystal cargo contents and mineral zoning suggest magma mixing triggers unusual large mafic ignimbrites

Key words: Unsupervised Machine Learning, Crystal Cargoes, Thermodynamic Modeling, Magma Mixing, Large Mafic Ignimbrites, Villarrica

Corresponding author: Felix O. Boschetty, eefob@leeds.ac.uk
**Abstract**

A key method to investigate magma dynamics is the analysis of the crystal cargoes carried by erupted magmas. These cargoes may comprise crystals that crystallize in different parts of the magmatic system (throughout the crust) and/or different times. While an individual eruption likely provides a partial view of the sub-volcanic plumbing system, compiling data from multiple eruptions builds a picture of the whole magmatic system. In this study we use machine learning techniques to analyze a large (>2000) compilation of mineral compositions from a highly active arc volcano: Villarrica, Chile. Villarrica’s post-glacial eruptive activity (14 ka–present) displays large variation in eruptive style (mafic ignimbrites to Hawaiian effusive eruptions) yet its eruptive products have a near constant basalt-basaltic andesite bulk-rock composition. What therefore, is driving explosive eruptions at Villarrica and can differences in storage dynamics be related to eruptive style? We used hierarchical cluster analysis to detect previously unseen structure in olivine, plagioclase and clinopyroxene compositions, revealing the presence of compositionally distinct clusters. Using rhyolite-MELTS thermodynamic modeling we related these clusters to intensive magmatic variables: temperature, pressure, water content and oxygen fugacity. Our results provide evidence for the existence of multiple discrete (spatial and temporal) magma reservoirs beneath Villarrica where melts differentiate and mix with incoming more primitive magma. The compositional diversity of an erupted crystal cargo strongly correlates with eruptive intensity, and we postulate that mixing between primitive and differentiated magma drives explosive activity at Villarrica.

**Plain Language Summary**

Studies of volcanoes often focus on a single eruption. However, the magmatic systems beneath volcanoes are complex: magmas crystallize throughout the crust and the minerals erupted at the surface can be formed just prior to eruption, or thousands of years earlier. Here we use machine-learning methods to group mineral compositions from many eruptions of an active Chilean volcano to build a picture of the magmatic system. By using the appropriate mathematical treatment, we find that there are distinct groups of mineral compositions that were not identified by past studies. These different compositions are then used to demonstrate that different batches of magma have mixed throughout Villarrica’s post-glacial history. This suggests that mixing of different magmas drives explosive eruptions at Villarrica volcano.
1 Introduction

Arc volcanoes produce most of the Earth’s subaerial volcanic activity and are responsible for some of the largest historical eruptions (Siebert et al., 2015). However the structure of the magmatic systems that feed these volcanoes is still largely unknown. The traditional view that the magmas erupted from arc volcanoes reside within a melt-dominated sub-volcanic ‘magma chamber’ has been superseded in recent years by a more nuanced view of magma storage and supply, whereby melts ascend through a vertically-extensive series of melt-rich zones, termed a ‘transcrustal magma system’ (TCMS, Cashman et al., 2017). This conceptual model describes the complex processing of primary magmas throughout the entire crust by crystallization, assimilation, and mixing (e.g., Annen et al., 2006, 2015). This combination of processes provides a theoretical framework to investigate the origins of the variety of mineral compositions and textures found in a single eruption’s crystal cargo.

Another recent advance in understanding magmatic systems is that crystal cargoes can be rapidly assembled from different parts of a magmatic system after protracted storage (e.g., Bergantz et al., 2015; Cooper & Kent, 2014; Mutch et al., 2019). Together with the TCMS model, they explain how a mineral assemblage erupted during a single event may contain: crystals formed from the carrier melt (autocrysts), crystals remobilized from other parts of the magmatic system (antecrysts), those from outside the magmatic system (xenocrysts), and crystals that form due to undercooling upon eruption (microlites) (Jerram & Martin, 2008). Therefore the crystal cargo of an eruptive deposit can be thought of as a snapshot of the underlying magmatic system. While an individual eruption likely provides a partial view of the sub-volcanic plumbing, compiling data from multiple eruptions can be used to build up a picture of the whole system. Building this complete picture requires well-characterized magmatic products from as many closely-spaced eruptions as possible.

Here we use established unsupervised machine learning techniques to analyze a large (\(>2000\)) compilation of mineral compositions from a highly active arc volcano: Villarrica, Southern Andes, Chile. We reveal previously unidentified structure in erupted mineral compositions and identify trends throughout Villarrica’s eruptive history related to crystal zoning and eruptive style. We utilize thermodynamic modeling to constrain the physical and chemical characteristics of Villarrica’s magmatic system to assess the suit-
ability of the TCMS model. Finally we discuss the role of magma mixing in driving explosive behavior at Villarrica volcano, and the implications for future eruptions.

2 Unsupervised Machine Learning Applied to Geochemical Data

The term ‘unsupervised machine learning’ describes a class of algorithms that are designed to find patterns in multidimensional data. They are termed ‘unsupervised’ as they do not require any prior knowledge of the relationships between data. Unsupervised machine learning techniques can be used to gain insight into the structure of multivariate compositional data (data that describe quantity relative to a whole, i.e. close to a constant value such as 100%), which is common in geochemistry (e.g., Chiasera & Cortés, 2011; X. Liu et al., 2020; Templ et al., 2008). The main advantage of these methods is that they allow the data to be interrogated in a multivariate sense and can highlight trends that otherwise would be difficult to identify using traditional Harker-style bi-variate plots (Cortés, 2009). Cluster analysis is an unsupervised machine learning technique that attempts to group data by some measure of similarity. The most similar data points are iteratively combined, until all data points belong to a single cluster. Hierarchical cluster analysis describes the relationship of all the data points to each other during this process, producing a hierarchy of data clusters organized by their similarity.

The majority of past studies that utilize cluster analysis have used it to characterize the composition of volcanic products via analysis of whole-rock data sets, both for individual volcanoes (e.g., Mt Etna, Italy (Corsaro et al., 2013); Izu-Oshima, Japan (Kuritani et al., 2018)) and regional volcanism (e.g., the Virunga Volcanic Province (Barette et al., 2017)). Others have applied cluster analysis to individual phases from a single volcano e.g., silicate melt inclusions (Hamada et al., 2020); tephra glass (E. J. Liu et al., 2020); and minerals (Caricchi et al., 2020; Cortés et al., 2007). Some, but not all, of these studies have recognized that compositional data require special mathematical treatment prior to analysis. In this study we use a log-ratio approach (i.e., Aitchison, 1986) to transform the compositional data into a compatible Euclidean geometry.

3 Geological Background

Villarrica (39.5°S, 71.9°W) is a Quaternary stratovolcano in the Andean volcanic arc, and part of the Chilean Central Southern Volcanic Zone (Figure 1a). The volcano
is Chile’s most active, with more than 50 recorded eruptions since 1558 (Petit-Breuilh, 2004), and is considered by the Chilean geological survey (SERNAGEOMIN), as the most hazardous of the 92 geologically active Chilean volcanoes (SERNAGEOMIN, 2019). Villarrica’s post-glacial (14 ka–present) eruptive activity displays a wide range in eruptive intensity and magnitude. This includes two major eruptive events, that generated the Licán (ca. 13.9 ka BP) and Pucón (ca. 3.7 ka BP) mafic ignimbrites, with estimated volumes of 10 and 5 km$^3$ (non-DRE), respectively (Lohmar et al., 2012; Silva Parejas et al., 2010). In contrast, historic eruptions (1900–present) have ranged from Hawaiian to violent Strombolian and are dominated by effusive lava flows (Pizarro et al., 2019). However, the paroxysmal March 2015 eruption, which lasted just 30 minutes, was characterized by a 1.5 km high fire fountain (Romero et al., 2018) and is the most recent demonstration of Villarrica’s explosive potential. Despite this variety in post-glacial eruptive style, Villarrica’s volcanic products have a limited compositional range: 98% of the juvenile whole-rock compositions collated in this study have 52–57 wt% SiO$_2$ (Figure 1). However, whole-rock data may not fully reflect the compositional variety of a magmatic system as heterogeneity may be present at a scale smaller than that of the whole rock sample (Pichavant et al., 2007). Therefore in this study, we focus on the main mineral phases erupted at Villarrica, whose compositions give insight into magma dynamics and the physical conditions of the magmatic system.

Typical Villarrica lavas and tephras are porphyritic with 10–15% modal crystals of mainly plagioclase feldspar and olivine, subordinate clinopyroxene, and small amounts of chromian spinel (Lohmar, 2008; Lohmar et al., 2012; Morgado et al., 2015; Pioli et al., 2015; Pizarro et al., 2019). Olivine crystals are usually euhedral to subhedral, often with resorbed rims. Clinopyroxene usually occurs as an unzoned subhedral phase, while plagioclase typically occurs as subhedral, reverse-zoned crystals with oxide inclusions, or as subhedral and unzoned crystals lacking inclusions. Groundmasses range from highly vesicular to highly crystalline, and are typically formed of plagioclase microlites and glass.

4 Materials and Methods

4.1 Database Compilation

We compiled a database of existing electron microprobe analyses of the most abundant mineral phases that are present in almost all of Villarrica’s erupted products: olivine,
Figure 1.  a. Map showing the location of Villarrica (red triangle) and other nearby active volcanoes (black triangles) in Chile’s Southern Volcanic Zone (SVZ). The long-dashed black line is the Liquiñe-Ofqui Fault Zone, short-dashed black line is the Mocho-Villarrica Fault Zone (Cembrano & Lara, 2009). TSVZ, Transitional South Volcanic Zone. CSVZ, Central South Volcanic Zone. SSVZ, Southern South Volcanic Zone (Stern, 2004). Inset shows the location of the CSVZ (red box) and the capital Santiago (black square). b. Simplified geological map (modified from Moreno and Clavero (2006)) showing the extent of key Villarrica eruptive deposits. The color of each deposit corresponds to the legend in 1c. LNPC, Los Nevados Parasitic Cones. CPC, Chaillupén Parasitic Cones. DD, Dacitic Domes. The location of the March 2015 tephra is shown by the black dashed line (Romero et al., 2018). c. Total-Alkali Silica (TAS Le Bas et al., 1986) diagram showing the bulk rock compositions of Villarrica eruptions and basement rocks from past studies (Clavero-Ribes, 1996; Hickey-Vargas et al., 1989, 2016; Lohmar, 2008; McGee et al., 2017; Morgado et al., 2015; Pioli et al., 2015; Pizarro et al., 2019; Silva Parejas, 2008; Wehrmann et al., 2014; Witter et al., 2004; Zajacz & Halter, 2007). This shows the homogeneous nature of Villarrica eruptive products: the vast majority of the juvenile products (98%) have 52–57 wt% SiO$_2$. 
plagioclase and clinopyroxene. These were sourced from published studies (Costantini et al., 2011; Morgado et al., 2015; Pioli et al., 2015; Pizarro et al., 2019; Wehrmann et al., 2014; Witter et al., 2004; Zajacz & Halter, 2009), theses (Clavero-Ribes, 1996; Lohmar, 2008), and unpublished analyses. All data and their sources can be found in the Supplementary Material.

To ensure that only phases relevant to the magmatic system were considered, any analyses labeled as xenolith or microlite by the original authors were removed from the data sets. The analyses were then manually screened for errors e.g., misclassified, mixed-phase and poor-quality analyses. Any analysis without an analytical total between 98 wt% and 102 wt% was removed. The cations per formula unit (cfu) were calculated for each mineral analysis based on stoichiometry, using 4, 32 and 6 oxygens for olivine, plagioclase and clinopyroxene, respectively. Total iron was assumed to be entirely FeO for plagioclase and olivine analyses. The method of Droop (1987) was used to calculate the proportion of Fe$^{2+}$ to Fe$^{3+}$ in clinopyroxene analyses. Clinopyroxene analyses with a total cfu outside 4.00 ± 0.02 were removed. After screening, 2277 analyses (out of an initial 2611) were deemed suitable, these are broken down by eruption in Table 1.

4.2 Data Quality and Limitations

The database used in this study contains a large (>2200) total number of analyses, but the number of analyses per eruption is much smaller: only the 2015 eruption has nearly 100 analyses for either of the two most modally abundant minerals, olivine and plagioclase (Table 1). Therefore key compositional features of all the eruptions analyzed in this study might not have been detected: Cheng et al. (2017) suggests that 100 or more analyses are required to characterize the compositional and textural features of a mineral population. Furthermore, all eruptive deposits have not been sampled and analyzed equally. Table 1 shows that there are a higher number of analyses of high-volume eruptions (the Licán and Pucón ignimbrites), historic eruptions, and those with easily accessible deposits. The main route up Villarrica, the Pucón Ski Center Road, cuts both the Pucón ignimbrite and the Chaimilla Fall Deposit and provides easy access to historic eruptions. Conversely, the Los Nevados and Chaillupén parasitic cones, and the Dacitic Domes are further from established roads and tracks.
Table 1. Breakdown of Villarrica microprobe analyses included in the compiled database by eruption. Eruption stages are shown in italics where relevant. Eruptions are ordered from oldest to youngest. Radiometric ages and their source are shown where known.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Deposit</th>
<th>Age (years BP)</th>
<th>Ol</th>
<th>Plag</th>
<th>Cpx</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dacitic Dome</td>
<td>95,000 ± 15,000$^a$</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intraglacial Pyroclastic Deposit</td>
<td>40,000–14,000$^a$</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Licán Ignimbrite</td>
<td>14,500–13,500$^{b,c}$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Initial Fall Deposit</em></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Eruption</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pucurca Lava</td>
<td>&gt;10,600$^d$</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afumalhue Pyroclastic Flow</td>
<td>4,090$^d$</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Pucón Surge</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Pucón Lava</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pucón Ignimbrite</td>
<td>3,510–3,710$^e$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Initial Fall Deposit</em></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 1</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>32</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unit 2</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>34</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unspecified</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>42</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-Pucón Lava</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaimilla Fall Deposit</td>
<td>3,180 ± 40$^f$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unspecified</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Los Nevados Cones</td>
<td>&lt;2,600 &amp; &gt;2,600$^a$</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaillupén Cones</td>
<td>&lt;3,700 &amp; &gt;3,700$^a$</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>54</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1948</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>31</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1963</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1984</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March 2015</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Totals 726 1118 433

Additionally, there are likely systematic errors related to the different analytical equipment in different labs, which are in turn calibrated with different standards. This results in different analytical uncertainties for each of the past studies complicating direct comparison. There is also little overlap between the eruptions sampled by different studies. Without this, there is no way to quantify these systematic errors.

4.3 Compositional Data Constraints and the Log-Ratio Transformation

Compositional data carry only relative information, subject to non-negative and constant-sum constraints (100 wt% etc.). These constraints mean that often used statistical methods that assume that data are normally distributed (i.e. unconstrained to a constant value and varying from $-\infty$ to $+\infty$), are not directly applicable. In his seminal work, Chayes (1971) established that it is the ratios between compositional data that measure variability rather than absolute differences. To circumvent this problem, Aitchison (1986) introduced several log-ratio transformations: linear transformations that map compositional data into an unconstrained Euclidean space.

There are several proposed log-ratio transformations: the additive log-ratio transformation (Aitchison, 1986), the centered log-ratio transformation (Aitchison, 1986) and the isometric log-ratio transformation (Egozcue et al., 2003). In this study, the mineral data sets were transformed using the isometric log-ratio ($\text{ilr}$) transformation (equation 1), implemented using the Pyrolite python library (M. Williams et al., 2020). This transformation was chosen as it ensures the transformed data have a non-singular covariance matrix and preserves the geometric properties of the raw compositional data (Egozcue et al., 2003):

$$\text{ilr}(x) = \sqrt{\frac{i}{i+1}} \ln \left[ \frac{g(x_1, \ldots, x_i)}{x_{i+1}} \right], \quad i = 1, 2, \ldots, D - 1,$$

(1)

where, $x$ is a compositional analysis, $i$ is a specific part, $D$ is the number of parts (elements analyzed), and $g(x_i)$ is the geometric mean of the parts of $x$:

$$g(x_i) = \left( \prod_{j=1}^{n} x_i^j \right)^{\frac{1}{n}}.$$

(2)

A requirement of using any log-ratio transformation is that the data cannot contain zeros (Cortés et al., 2007; Fry et al., 2000). Zeros in compositional data can be structural (e.g., K in clinopyroxene), below detection of the analytical technique, or simply
not analyzed (Fry et al., 2000). We removed structural zeros by only considering elements that reasonably exist in a mineral’s structure. To deal with zeros resulting from detection limits, a detection limit of 0.05 wt% was assumed for all elements. The detection limits were generalized because detection limits were not reported in all cases. Zeros resulting from detection limits were replaced using the Multiplicative Replacement method of Martín-Fernández et al. (2000) and Fry et al. (2000), which is equivalent to distributing a detection limit threshold evenly among the below detection zeros. Not all elements (especially minor elements) were analyzed in every study. Elements that were measured for less than half of each of the mineral data sets were not used in our analysis. A table containing the elements used in cluster analysis for each of the mineral data sets can be found in the Supplementary Material.

Variables with low abundances but high relative variances (often minor and trace elements) have high log-ratio variances and therefore dominate any analysis of the complete log-ratio transformed data set (Baxter et al., 2005; Greenacre & Lewi, 2009; Greenacre, 2019). To prevent this, we normalized the log-transformed data set using the column (part) medians and standard deviations:

\[
X' = x'_{ij} = \frac{x_{ij} - \bar{x}_i}{\sigma_i}
\]  

(3)

Where \(X'\) is the normalized data set, \(x_{ij}\) the \(i^{th}\) part of the \(j^{th}\) analysis, \(\bar{x}_i\) is the column median, and \(\sigma_i\) is the column standard deviation. The median was chosen over the arithmetic mean as the transformed data sets were non-normal: all four \(ilr\)-transformed data sets failed the Henze-Zirkler multivariate normality test with a specificity of 0.05 (Henze & Zirkler, 1990). Relationships between the transformed compositional data were then explored using hierarchical clustering methods over a Euclidean space.

### 4.4 Hierarchical Cluster Analysis

Hierarchical clustering algorithms attempt to group data into clusters by some measure of similarity. Agglomerative clustering methods start by grouping the two most similar data points into a cluster, then treating them as a single data point. The most similar data points or clusters are then iteratively combined until only a single cluster containing all the data remains. To cluster the data, a measure of dissimilarity (often called distance) must be chosen. A popular measure is the Euclidean distance which is the equiv-
alent of Pythagoras’s Theorem but over more than two dimensions:

\[ d_E = \sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^{n} (x_i - y_i)^2} \]  

(4)

Where \( d_E \) is the Euclidean distance matrix, \( i \) is the number of parts, and \( x \) and \( y \) are the points considered. Next, a linkage method must be chosen, i.e. a method describing how the distances between points and clusters are used to relate them. We used ward clustering (Ward, 1963), which minimizes the in-cluster variance, over alternatives such as single-linkage or average-linkage as it doesn’t suffer from chaining (W. T. Williams & Lambert, 1966; Wishart, 1969). The hierarchical clustering algorithm was implemented using the scikit-learn python library (Pedregosa et al., 2011). Dendrograms depicting the resultant hierarchy were used to determine a suitable number of clusters independently for each mineral data set. This was chosen by drawing a horizontal line that cuts the tree at the distance which has the largest separation between branches. This finds the number of clusters that maximizes inter-cluster separation. The dendrograms for the mineral data sets are shown in Figure 2.

4.5 Multivariate Outlier Detection

Each cluster contained points normally distributed about its center, therefore outliers are, according to the empirical rule for normal distributions, those values located at distances larger than three standard deviation from its center. To identify potential outliers, the Mahalanobis distance, i.e. the distance of a given data point \( x \) and a distribution (Mahalanobis, 1936), was calculated for each cluster:

\[ D_M(\bar{x}) = \sqrt{(\bar{x} - \bar{\mu})^T C^{-1} (\bar{x} - \bar{\mu})} \]  

(5)

where \( D_M \) is the Mahalanobis distance, \( \bar{x} \) is a matrix of data points in each cluster, and \( \bar{\mu} \) and \( C \) are the location and covariance estimators. The location and covariance estimators were robustly calculated using the Minimum Covariance Determinant estimator (MCD) (as in Filzmoser & Hron, 2008), implemented using the FastMCD algorithm (Rousseeuw & Driessen, 1999) available in the scikit-learn python package (Pedregosa et al., 2011). The Mahalanobis distances for each cluster can be approximated by a \( \chi^2 \) distribution (Rousseeuw & Zomeren, 1990). A critical Mahalanobis distance was determined for each
Figure 2. Dendrogram for each mineral data set, only the top five levels of each dendrogram are shown. The cutoff line which determines the number of clusters is shown by the red horizontal line.
cluster, above which a point is considered an outlier:

\[ D_M > (\chi^2_{p,1-\alpha})^{1/2}, \]  

(6)

which is the square root of the upper-$\alpha$ quartile of the $\chi^2$ distribution with $p$ degrees of freedom, which were 5, 7, and 10 for olivine, plagioclase and clinopyroxene, respectively. The typical choice for $(1-\alpha) 0.975$ (Rousseeuw & Zomeren, 1990) was used i.e., the outliers will be contained in the upper 2.5% of the $\chi^2$ distribution. Any identified outliers were removed from the data sets.

### 4.6 Estimating Cluster Centers

To characterize each of the identified clusters, a measure of central tendency is required. For compositional data, the best unbiased estimator of the expected value is defined by the closed geometric mean (Cortés et al., 2007, and references within). To ensure that the center of the cluster is a valid mineral composition, the closed geometric mean of each cluster was calculated, and the nearest (by Euclidean distance) data point to each mean was used to represent each cluster.

### 4.7 Thermodynamic Modeling

Thermodynamic modeling was carried out to investigate the likely provenance of the identified mineral clusters with respect to the physical and chemical conditions of magma evolution at Villarrica. We used the rhyolite-MELTS v1.2.0 algorithm (Ghiorso & Gualda, 2015; Gualda et al., 2012), via the alphaMELTS 2.0 (originally Adiabat1ph (Smith & Asimow, 2005)) front end, to model crystal fractionation from a primitive input melt. The initial bulk composition of each model was estimated using the most primitive glass composition reported at Villarrica: a post-entrapment-crystallization corrected, olivine-hosted melt inclusion (VL15B-ol6-inc1, Mg# 68 at QFM+1) from an upper unit of the Chaimilla fall deposit (Pioli et al., 2015). Isobaric fractional crystallization models were performed with temperature decreasing in 1°C increments from above the liquidus, at a range of pressures (25, 50, 75 and 100 MPa and then increments of 100 up to 700 MPa), variable initial water contents (0.0–6.0 wt% in increments of 0.5), and oxygen fugacity buffers (fO$_2$) QFM-0.5 (0.5 units below the Quartz-Fayalite-Magnetite buffer)
to QFM+2.25, in increments of 0.25. A total of 1560 rhyolite-MELTS simulations were
performed, one for each pressure, H₂O and textitfO₂ permutation.

We quantified the goodness of fit of each rhyolite-MELTS simulation against each
of the representative mineral compositions, identified by cluster analysis, by calculating
the fit index (Gainsforth et al., 2015):

\[ FI = \sum_i \frac{|C_{i_{\text{model}}} - C_{i_{\text{rep}}}|}{C_{i_{\text{rep}}}} \] (7)

Where \( FI \) is the fit index, \( C_{i_{\text{model}}} \) is the concentration of the \( i^{\text{th}} \) oxide in a mineral com-
position as calculated by rhyolite-MELTS and \( C_{i_{\text{rep}}} \) is the concentration of the \( i^{\text{th}} \) ox-
ide for the representative cluster composition being compared. All concentrations are
in wt% oxide. For olivine, the fit index was calculated using SiO₂, MgO, FeO, CaO and
MnO concentrations. For plagioclase, SiO₂, Al₂O₃, CaO and Na₂O concentrations and
for clinopyroxene SiO₂, Al₂O₃, FeO, MgO, and CaO. The best-fitting conditions were
found by calculating the minimum fit index for each representative composition. Temperature-
fO₂ heatmaps showing the fit index for every pressure-H₂O combination and represen-
tative mineral composition can be found in the Supplementary Material.

5 Results

The compositions of minerals erupted in Villarrica’s crystal cargoes are diverse, es-
specially in comparison to whole-rock compositions (Figure 1c). Olivine compositions range
from Fo₅₀–ₘ₇, plagioclase An₉₀–₉₆, and clinopyroxene Mg₅₇–₉₂. Despite this range in min-
eral compositions, hierarchical cluster analysis and outlier detection were performed suc-
cessfully on the three mineral data sets. Dendrograms (Figure 2) were used to find the
best number of clusters to represent each mineral data set. It is a coincidence that four
clusters best describe each mineral data set: there is no direct relationship between the
clusters identified in the different mineral types. For each of the identified clusters the
Mahalanobis distance was calculated and points that fall outside of a normal distribu-
tion identified and removed. This method detected 4, 11 and 22 outliers for olivine, pla-
gioclase and clinopyroxene, which corresponds to 0.6, 1.0 and 5.1% of each respective
data set. The representative compositions (centers) of each identified mineral cluster are
shown in Table 2.
Table 2. Representative compositions of each identified mineral cluster, given in wt% oxide and cations per formula unit. The concentration of FeO and Fe$_2$O$_3$ in clinopyroxene was calculated with the method of Droop (1987). Clusters are ordered from most to least primitive.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mineral Cluster</th>
<th>Olivine</th>
<th>Plagioclase</th>
<th>Clinopyroxene</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ol$_1$</td>
<td>Ol$_2$</td>
<td>Ol$_3$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SiO$_2$ (wt%)</td>
<td>39.67</td>
<td>39.00</td>
<td>38.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TiO$_2$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al$_2$O$_3$</td>
<td>34.22</td>
<td>32.36</td>
<td>28.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cr$_2$O$_3$</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>b.d.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fe$_2$O$_3$</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FeO</td>
<td>15.57</td>
<td>21.50</td>
<td>22.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MnO</td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>0.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MgO</td>
<td>45.21</td>
<td>39.20</td>
<td>38.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CaO</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Na$_2$O</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>1.82</td>
<td>4.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K$_2$O</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Si (mol)</td>
<td>0.990</td>
<td>1.006</td>
<td>0.997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ti</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al</td>
<td>4.532</td>
<td>4.265</td>
<td>3.658</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cr</td>
<td>0.015</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>b.d.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fe$^{3+}$</td>
<td>0.325</td>
<td>0.464</td>
<td>0.490</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fe$^{2+}$</td>
<td>0.090</td>
<td>0.114</td>
<td>0.158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mn</td>
<td>0.005</td>
<td>0.007</td>
<td>0.008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mg</td>
<td>1.682</td>
<td>1.507</td>
<td>1.501</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ca</td>
<td>0.005</td>
<td>0.008</td>
<td>0.006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Na</td>
<td>0.233</td>
<td>0.395</td>
<td>0.868</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fo (mol%)</td>
<td>83.81</td>
<td>76.46</td>
<td>75.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An</td>
<td>95.03</td>
<td>90.69</td>
<td>76.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mg$_#$</td>
<td>83.21</td>
<td>78.24</td>
<td>76.52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Blank cells denote elements not used in cluster analysis. b.d., below detection limit. -, not calculated. Fo, molar forsterite content. An, molar anorthite content. Mg$_\#$, magnesium number.
To visualize the distribution of the identified clusters and verify that they were compositionally distinct, two techniques were chosen to reduce the dimensionality of the ilr-transformed data. First, principal component analysis (PCA) was performed and the resulting first and second principal components plotted (Figure 3a-c). Then a t-distributed Stochastic Neighbor Embedding (t-SNE) algorithm (Van der Maaten & Hinton, 2008) was implemented with a perplexity value of 35. 10,000 iterations were used to ensure that the projection was stable (Figure 3d-f). Both the PCA and t-SNE projections show that the clusters identified by hierarchical cluster analysis are well-defined and have good separation. The distribution of outliers implies that outlier detection was successful: outliers are evenly distributed among the identified clusters and do not form clusters of their own.

A major advantage of cluster analysis and the multivariate methods used in this study, is that they allow patterns to be identified in multivariate space and reveal trends that are hard to detect using bivariate plots. A good example of this is shown by the olivine data set. Figure 4 shows probability density functions (PDFs) for each of the mineral data sets and the identified clusters generated using Kernel Density Estimation (Silverman, 1986). The molar forsterite content \((X_{\text{Fo}}=100\cdot\frac{\text{Mg}}{\text{Mg}+\text{Fe}^{2+}+\text{Mn}})\), molar anorthite content \((X_{\text{An}}=100\cdot\frac{\text{Ca}}{\text{Ca}+\text{Na}+\text{K}})\) in moles, and molar magnesium number \((\text{Mg}^{#}=100\cdot\frac{\text{Mg}}{\text{Mg}+\text{Fe}^{2+}})\) were calculated, for olivine, plagioclase and clinopyroxene, respectively. The resulting PDFs were multiplied by the number of data points in each cluster, making them analogous to non-normalized histograms. The distribution of molar Fo for the complete olivine data set might suggest the existence of two clusters with a Fo of 76 and 84. However cluster analysis, which considers the concentration of multiple elements (including minor elements), detects four clusters which could not be identified looking at the PDF of the complete data set alone. This demonstrates how cluster analysis can identify and reveal otherwise hidden structure in mineral composition data sets by detecting similarities in all elements analyzed.

Olivine compositions were successfully grouped into four clusters, whose cfu contents show the expected proportionality with Fo (Table 2). \(\text{Fe}^{2+}\), Si and Mn are all inversely proportional to Fo. However, Ca varies independently of Fo and the other elements, and therefore has potential to give insight into differing parental magma minor-element compositions and/or differing H\(_2\)O-contents (Gavrilenko et al., 2016; Kamenevsky et al., 2006).
Figure 3. (a-c) Clustered data projected using the first and second principal components. (d-f) Clustered data projected using t-distributed stochastic neighborhood embedding (t-SNE) axes. Both projections show that the clusters identified by hierarchical clustering are well-defined.
Plagioclase compositions were grouped into four clusters. These show expected trends with increasing An-content: increasing Ca and Al; and decreasing Si, Na and K (Table 2). However, Mg and Fe covary independently of the other elements and An-content. That they covary implies that the variations reflect one or more physical processes and are not due to the potentially high analytical uncertainties associated with Fe and Mg in plagioclase (Ginibre & Wörner, 2007). Variations in Fe and Mg in plagioclase independent of other elements, have been attributed to changes in Fe and Mg in the parental melt (Ginibre & Wörner, 2007; Singer et al., 1995), but might reflect melt-plagioclase disequilibrium caused by rapid growth (Ginibre & Wörner, 2007; Mollo et al., 2011; Singer et al., 1995).

Clinopyroxene compositions were also grouped into four clusters. However, the representative compositions show more complex trends than for plagioclase and olivine (Table 2). The identified clusters were characterized as follows: (1) a high-Cr and high-Mg#, (2) high-Al and high-Ti, (3) low-Al and low-Mg#, and (4) low-Fe3+. This might be the result of the higher-complexity of the clinopyroxene mineral structure, compared to feldspar and olivine. However, the identified clusters still appear to show some expected correlations with Mg#, with the most primitive Cpx1 having the lowest incompatible elements, e.g., Mn and Ti, and Cpx3 having higher incompatible elements and Ca. Cpx4 has much lower calculated Fe3+ content compared to the other three clusters which could reflect significantly different oxidation conditions during crystallization.

5.1 Controls On Cluster Membership

5.1.1 Crystal Zoning

Original studies classified each mineral analysis as unzoned, zoned – cores, intermediate, or rim. This information was not reported for a significant number of analyses (olivine: 20%, plagioclase: 32%, clinopyroxene: 35%), and there is no way to judge the accuracy of the designations. Therefore it was assumed that each of the source studies categorized their analyses in the same manner. Figure 5 shows the proportion of crystal zones in each cluster for each category. There is no clear relationship between the cluster distribution and zoning for any of the three minerals.
Figure 4. Plots of probability density functions (PDF) generated using Kernel Density Estimators (KDE) of each mineral subset and its clusters. Each PDF is scaled by the number of data points it was generated from, analogous to a histogram. Comparisons of the distribution of identified clusters with each respective complete data set highlights the ability of cluster analysis to identify otherwise hidden structure in mineral compositions.
Figure 5. Stacked bar charts showing the effect of crystal zoning on cluster membership. The number of analyses in each category is shown in brackets. There is no clear pattern between cluster membership and crystal zoning.
5.1.2 Eruption Age

Figure 6 shows the proportion of phenocrysts from each cluster within individual eruptive deposits sorted by age. There is a stark contrast between the composition of crystal cargoes of historic eruptions (erupted in the last 100 years) and prehistoric eruptions (ca. 95–1.6 ka). Generally, the crystal cargoes of historic eruptions contain a smaller variety of crystal compositions. This is especially pronounced for feldspar and clinopyroxene compositions (Figure 6b,c). Both feldspar and clinopyroxene compositions become markedly more homogeneous through to the present day: erupted plagioclase compositions are dominated by Pl\textsubscript{3} and erupted clinopyroxene compositions are dominated by Cpx\textsubscript{1}. Generally, historic eruptions contain a higher proportion of Ol\textsubscript{2} than prehistoric eruptions, but olivine compositions are more variable than plagioclase and clinopyroxene (Figure 6).

Of the three minerals analyzed in this study, olivine cluster proportions vary the most from eruption to eruption. For example, the Licán ignimbrite has a large proportion of primitive olivine (Ol\textsubscript{1}) whereas the Pucón ignimbrite is made up almost entirely of more evolved olivine (Ol\textsubscript{3} and Ol\textsubscript{4}). The historic eruptions are dominated by more evolved olivine (Ol\textsubscript{2} and Ol\textsubscript{3}). However, the March 2015 eruption is distinct from the other historic eruptions, as it has large proportion of all four olivine clusters. Therefore the olivine cluster proportions of the 2015 eruption is more similar to the prehistoric, than the other historic eruptions.

The proportion of plagioclase clusters varies widely between the historic and prehistoric eruptions. Generally, the prehistoric eruptions contain a greater variety of plagioclase compositions: the Licán and Pucón ignimbrites are the only to contain all four plagioclase clusters. The most evolved plagioclase cluster (Pl\textsubscript{4}) only occurs in the three oldest eruptions: the Dacitic Dome, and the Licán and Pucón ignimbrites. The most primitive plagioclase (Pl\textsubscript{1}) is restricted almost entirely to prehistoric eruptions. In contrast, the crystal cargoes of the historic eruptions are dominated by the intermediate Pl\textsubscript{3}, whose proportion increases through time from the 1921 through to the March 2015 eruption.

Clinopyroxene cluster membership broadly corresponds to that of olivine and plagioclase: the greatest amount of variation is present in the oldest eruptions. Clinopyroxene becomes scarcer and more compositionally homogeneous in later eruptions: cluster Cpx\textsubscript{2} and Cpx\textsubscript{3} are most dominant in the prehistoric eruptions while Cpx\textsubscript{1} is much
more dominant in the historic eruptions. Very little to no clinopyroxene was erupted after the 1948 eruption.

5.1.3 Eruptive Center Location

Villarrica’s flanks host over 30 parasitic or adventitious cones which form two groups: the Los Nevados group to the northeast and the Chaillupén group to the south (Moreno & Clavero, 2006) (Figure 1b). Other than the scoria and lavas of these two groups of cones, all other eruptive deposits are thought to originate from Villarrica’s main vent, although the location of this main vent has changed through time (Moreno & Clavero, 2006). The cluster membership for the two groups of parasitic cones are shown in Figure 6 (labeled LNPC and CPC, respectively). The proportion of phenocrysts in each cluster for the two groups of cones are distinct. For example, the Chaillupén cones contain the most primitive olivine (Ol$_1$) and the most evolved clinopyroxene (Cpx$_4$), unlike the Los Nevados cones. This might be because the two sets of cones tap different parts of Villarrica’s magmatic system, or they sample the system at different points in time. Compared to the eruptions from the central vent, the two sets of parasitic cones are more diverse than the historic eruptions, and most similar to the prehistoric eruptions. This is especially apparent when comparing the olivine and clinopyroxene cluster memberships. More detailed studies of the two groups of cones are needed to constrain their ages and their petrological differences to each other and products from the main vent (e.g., Robidoux et al., 2021).

5.1.4 Eruption Volume and Intensity

Villarrica’s post-glacial eruptions show large variation in volume and intensity, most notable are the differences between the explosive high-volume mafic ignimbrites (Licán and Pucón) with the smaller-volume comparatively-effusive historic eruptions. The large volume of the ignimbrites and association with caldera collapse suggests that a large proportion of Villarrica’s magmatic system was evacuated during those eruptions. This might be expected to produce products with a higher compositional variety, e.g., both evolved and primitive compositions, especially if the magmatic system were to contain multiple somewhat isolated bodies that evolved independently. This is indeed reflected in the cluster memberships of the historic versus older eruptions. Generally, the more explosive, older eruptions have a higher diversity in mineral compositions, especially the Licán and
Figure 6. (a-c) Stacked bar charts showing the cluster membership of the different eruptions sorted by age. The number of analyses for each eruption are shown in brackets. Only those eruptions with more than 10 phenocryst compositions are shown. DD, Dacitic Dome. LI, Licán Ignimbrite. PI, Pucón Ignimbrite. PPL, Post-Pucón Lava. CFD, Chaimilla Fall Deposit. LNPC, Los Nevados Parasitic Cones. CPC, Chillupén Parasitic Cones. Historic eruptions are labeled by eruption year. (d) Plot of mean whole-rock SiO₂ and MgO contents. Error bars show ±1 standard deviation. Whole-rock data sources are the same as in Figure 1c.
Table 3. The best fitting conditions for each identified mineral cluster from rhyolite-MELTS thermodynamic modeling. Oxygen fugacity is shown in log units relative to the QMF buffer.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mineral</th>
<th>Cluster</th>
<th>T (°C)</th>
<th>P (MPa)</th>
<th>∆fO₂</th>
<th>H₂O (wt%)</th>
<th>Min FI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Olivine</td>
<td>Ol₁</td>
<td>1041</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>0.202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ol₂</td>
<td>1047</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>-0.25</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>0.063</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ol₃</td>
<td>1039</td>
<td>400</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>0.065</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ol₄</td>
<td>1042</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>-0.50</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>0.035</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plagioclase</td>
<td>Pl₁</td>
<td>1020</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>-0.50</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>0.843</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pl₂</td>
<td>1016</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>-0.50</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>0.113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pl₃</td>
<td>1039</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>0.108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pl₄</td>
<td>967</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>0.040</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinopyroxene</td>
<td>Cpx₁</td>
<td>1041</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.083</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cpx₂</td>
<td>985</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>0.061</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cpx₃</td>
<td>1011</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.079</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cpx₄</td>
<td>970</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.037</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

T, temperature. P, pressure. Min FI, minimum fit index calculated for each mineral using equation 7.

Pucón ignimbrites. Of the historic eruptions the intense March 2015 eruption, that produced a 1.5 km high fire fountain, erupted more diverse olivine compositions than any other historic eruption.

5.2 Thermodynamic Modeling

The representative compositions identified by hierarchical clustering were well reproduced by the relatively simple model set up, shown by the low minimum fit indexes (Table 3). However, the most primitive clusters (Ol₁ and Pl₁) have higher minimum fit indexes than the other olivine and plagioclase clusters. This suggests that the initial bulk composition used, the most primitive melt inclusion found at Villarrica, was not sufficiently primitive to reproduce exactly these compositions. However the calculated fit indexes are not so different as to suggest that the models do not provide a reasonable indication of the conditions of crystallization.

The best fitting pressure and temperature conditions from the rhyolite-MELTS simulations broadly agree with thermobarometry results from past studies (Figure 7). Pressures from both simulations and past thermobarometry show that polybaric crystallization, extending to at least the mid to lower crust (ca. 600 MPa), is required to produce the variety of erupted mineral compositions at Villarrica. The predicted temperatures from rhyolite-MELTS (950-1100°C) are less than those calculated by thermobarometry.
Figure 7. a. Best fitting temperature and pressures from rhyolite-MELTS simulations for each of the identified mineral clusters. b. Pressure-temperature plot of geothermobarometry results from past studies of Villarrica (Lohmar, 2008; Lohmar et al., 2012; Morgado et al., 2015; Pioli et al., 2015; Pizarro et al., 2019; Witter et al., 2004). The error bars correspond to the range of uncertainty for each result. The corresponding depth is calculated assuming a constant density of 2.7 g cm$^{-3}$. The black dotted line is the calculated depth (ca. 4.2 km) of the deformation source for the March 2015 eruption (Delgado et al., 2017). The gray shading corresponds to an area of high conductivity (ca. 19-50 km) (Kapinos et al., 2016).

(1050–1250°C). This discrepancy is likely due to the high (>2 wt%) water contents of majority of the best fitting rhyolite-MELTS simulations: the olivine-augite geothermometer which was used in the past studies was not calibrated on experiments with high water contents, and therefore overestimated temperatures (Loucks, 1996).

The most primitive olivine (Ol$_1$) formed at relatively high temperatures and pressures (1041 °C, 300 MPa). Furthermore, Ol$_1$ has both the highest $f_\text{O}_2$ and water content (QFM+1.00, 5.5 wt%). This is in agreement with experimental and natural stud-
ies of olivine crystallization from basaltic melts (Feig et al., 2010; Gavrilenko et al., 2016).

This suggests that it formed from relatively primitive undegassed melts with a relatively low residence time in the crust prior to crystallization. In contrast, the most evolved olivine cluster (Ol4) has a lower pressure, fO2, and water content. The two most primitive plagioclase clusters (Pl1 & Pl2) have high water contents (5.0 wt%) and relatively high temperatures (1020 and 1016 °C), as expected from experimental studies (Panjasawatwong et al., 1995; Takagi et al., 2005; Waters & Lange, 2015). In contrast, the most evolved plagioclase (Pl4) has a significantly lower crystallization temperature (967 °C), and a notably higher pressure and fO2 (600 MPa, QFM+1.75). All representative clinopyroxene compositions are best fit at lower pressures (25–100 MPa), and at a variety of temperatures (970–1041°C) and water contents (0-1.5 wt%).

6 Discussion

6.1 Vertically and Laterally Extensive Magma Processing

Several models of volcanic systems that integrate geophysical, geochemical, and petrological information have concluded that magma processing beneath arc volcanoes likely takes place throughout the crust in trans-crustal magma systems (Annen et al., 2006, 2015; Cashman et al., 2017; Hildreth & Moorbath, 1988). There are multiple lines of evidence that suggest that this is the case at Villarrica volcano. We have compared representative mineral compositions identified via clustering, with thermodynamic fractional crystallization models of a simple Villarrica-like system. The comparisons suggest that polybaric crystallization, at pressures up to 600 MPa, are required to produce the mineral compositions erupted at Villarrica (Figure 7a). This is supported by thermobarometry from past studies that focused on individual eruptions (Figure 7b). The majority of pressures calculated from thermobarometry are in the shallow crust (0–150 MPa), but pressures calculated from olivine-augite pairs erupted during historic eruptions extend to 700 MPa. Additionally, Kapinos et al. (2016) detected a low conductivity zone beneath Villarrica volcano that extends from 19–50 km, beyond the base of the crust.

As well as vertical connectivity, there is also evidence of lateral connectivity within Villarrica’s magmatic system (e.g., Ebmeier et al., 2018; Lerner et al., 2020) (Figure S1). Nested calderas, kilometers in diameter, were produced during large eruptions at Villarrica and surround the current central vent: Caldera 1 (ca. 100ka), Caldera 2 (ca. 14ka),...
and Caldera 3 (ca. 3.7ka) (Moreno & Clavero, 2006). Calderas 1 and 2 cover an area of
6.5 by 4.2 km (long axes), Caldera 3 is roughly circular and 2 km in diameter. After the
March 2015 eruption, Delgado et al. (2017) detected reinflation (4.2 km deep) of part
of Villarrica’s magmatic system, ca. 5 km SE of the central vent near the edge of Calderas
1 and 2. Further afield still, are the two groups of parasitic cones on Villarrica’s flanks.
The Los Nevados group contain fissures and cones that extend to ca. 10 km to the NE
and the Chaillupén group extend ca. 12 km to the south of the present central vent. Re-
cently Pavez et al. (2020) detected a low conductivity zone (ca. 4 km deep) associated
with the Los Nevados group. Combined, all these lines of evidence demonstrate that Vil-
lardica’s magmatic system is spatially extensive and imply that different parts of the sys-
tem are tapped to accumulate the crystal cargo of each eruption.

6.2 The Role of Magma Mixing

The compositional variety observed within crystal cargoes erupted, combined with
evidence for spatially extensive magma processing, suggest that Villarrica’s magmatic
system comprises multiple, variably-evolved reservoirs distributed throughout the crust.
This is supported by widely varying best fitting intensive variables from Rhyolite-MELTS
thermodynamic simulations (Table 3). In addition to the range of best-fit pressures, there
is a large range of best fitting crystallization temperatures that reproduce crystal com-
positions (967–1047°C). There is also a large variation in best-fitting water contents from
anhydrous to 5.5 wt%. This implies that degassing plays a large role in driving crystal-
lization in Villarrica’s magmatic system, as has been suggested for other arc volcanoes
(e.g., Bouvet de Maisonneuve et al., 2012; Blundy et al., 2006). The large range of best
fitting fO2 values (-0.5–2.00 ∆QFM) suggests that crystallization is occurring from melt
that has undergone different amounts of degassing, fractional crystallization, and/or mix-
ing (Carmichael, 1991; Lindsley & Frost, 1992; Sato, 1978). Together these results im-
ply that reservoirs that are infrequently disturbed by ascending primitive magma, cool
and differentiate via fractional crystallization to produce evolved crystal compositions
e.g., Pl4 (An62). Prior to eruption, ascending primitive melt interacts with multiple reser-
voirs. This mixing of magmas with different compositions produces new compositions
which may be recorded in zoned crystals (Figure 5). These antecrysts are accumulated
as melts ascend resulting in the variety of erupted mineral compositions in a single crys-
tal cargo (Figure 6).
The important role of magma mixing at Villarrica is supported by our observation that the proportion of identified clusters do not show clear trends when they are compared to crystal zoning (Figure 5). If fractional crystallization is the dominant process during magma processing in Villarrica’s magmatic system, we would expect mineral cores to be dominated by primitive compositions and rims by more evolved compositions. However, both primitive and evolved clusters are present as cores, intermediate, and rim zones of all three of the commonly erupted minerals. This implies that magma mixing plays a role in assembling crystal cargoes at Villarrica (e.g., Ruprecht et al., 2012; Streck, 2008).

Furthermore, textural evidence for magma mixing is present in almost all Villarrica’s eruptive deposits. The Dacitic Dome contains reverse and oscillatory-zoned plagioclase, olivine with fayalitic rims (Fo58) and reverse-zoned clinopyroxene (Lohmar, 2008). The Licán ignimbrite has both reverse and oscillatory-zoned plagioclase, reverse-zoned clinopyroxene, and orthopyroxene rims surrounding olivine crystals (Lohmar et al., 2012). A pre-Pucón surge deposit contains banded pumice, the pale bands have a bulk SiO$_2$ of 63 wt% (Moreno et al., 1994; Lohmar, 2008). The Pucón ignimbrite contains plagioclase crystals with resorbed cores and rims, sieve textures, and low-An microlites. Clinopyroxene is often reverse-zoned (Lohmar, 2008). Additionally, what is thought to be a dacitic enclave in a scoria bomb of the Pucón ignimbrite has been observed (McCurry & Schmidt, 2001; McCurry et al., 2004). The Chaimilla Fall Deposit contains complexly zoned plagioclase crystals with both reverse rims and widespread evidence of resorption (Pioli et al., 2015). Multiple historic eruptions also contain similar indicators: An-poor plagioclase is present as both rims of oscillatory-zoned crystals and crystals with resorption textures. Both olivine and clinopyroxene crystals display resorption textures (Morgado et al., 2015; Pizarro et al., 2019).

The ubiquity of evidence for magma mixing in Villarrica’s eruptive products implies complex magma dynamics involving multiple variably-evolved reservoirs. These may be intermittently connected and tapped prior to eruption resulting in the variable crystal cargoes of eruptive deposits.
6.3 Linking Crystal Cargo and Whole-Rock Composition to Eruptive Behavior

The complex temporal trends in the compositions of erupted crystal cargoes show strong correlations with both whole-rock composition and eruptive style. There is a stark contrast between the composition of crystal cargoes of historic eruptions and prehistoric eruptions (Figure 6). Generally, the crystal cargoes of historic eruptions contain a smaller variety of crystal compositions, this is especially pronounced for feldspar and clinopyroxene compositions. This disparity strongly correlates with whole-rock compositions (Figure 6d): historic eruptions have average bulk SiO$_2$ and MgO contents of 54 and 5 wt%, respectively, whereas prehistoric eruptions range from 54–65 wt% SiO$_2$ and 1–5 wt% MgO. Both the composition of erupted crystal cargoes and whole-rock compositions strongly correlate with eruptive style: the most differentiated eruptive deposits contain the more variable crystal cargoes and are the most explosive and high-volume.

6.3.1 Dacitic Dome

The Dacitic Dome (c.a. 95 ka) is the most differentiated of Villarrica’s products analyzed to date, with substantially higher bulk SiO$_2$ content than any subsequent eruption (65 wt% vs. 55 wt%, Figure 1). However the magma that formed the Dacitic Dome is almost certainly a mix of evolved and more primitive magmas (e.g., Eichelberger et al., 2006; Reubi & Blundy, 2009), supported by textural observations described above (Lohmar, 2008). The dacitic composition may have formed from mafic magmas ascending through evolved mushes (e.g., Reubi & Blundy, 2009) or from differentiated melts ascending through mafic mushes (e.g., Kent et al., 2010). Of the three eruptions that contain it, the crystal cargo of the Dacitic Dome contains the highest proportion of An-poor plagioclase (Pl$_4$, Figure 6b), along with its high bulk-SiO$_2$ content.

6.3.2 The Licán and Pucón Mafic Ignimbrites

The Licán (ca. 14 ka) and Pucón (ca. 3.7 ka) mafic ignimbrites are deposits from the two most explosive, high-volume eruptions at Villarrica (Lohmar et al., 2012; Silva Parejas, 2008). Both have high, but variable, bulk-SiO$_2$ contents (Figure 6d) compared to historic eruptions. They are also the last two eruptions whose crystal cargoes contain the evolved Pl$_4$. Their whole-rock chemistry correlates with the proportion of Pl$_4$ in their
crystal cargoes: the Licán has lower MgO and slightly higher SiO$_2$ than the Pucón, and

Rhyolite-MELTS models show that Pl$_4$ likely crystallized from an evolved melt (ca. 60 wt% SiO$_2$), after substantial differentiation via crystal fractionation, resulting in a bulk crystal fraction of at least 50%. The eruption of a reservoir with such a high crystal fraction requires liberation via mush disaggregation to reduce its viscosity (references). This may result from a combination of chemical or thermal mixing, and/or volatile fluxing from an incoming more primitive basaltic melt (e.g. Bachmann & Bergantz, 2006; Bergantz et al., 2015; Bouvet de Maisonneuve et al., 2012; Pistone et al., 2017; Zellmer et al., 2016). Upon mixing with the primitive magma, plagioclase crystals from the evolved reservoir would become reversely-zoned, with low-An cores and higher-An rims. In turn, primitive plagioclase carried by this primitive melt would grow low-An rims upon mixing (as suggested in Lohmar, 2008; Lohmar et al., 2012). Therefore mixing between an evolved and primitive magma explains how Pl$_4$ can exist as cores, intermediates, and rims (Figure 5).

The correlation of whole-rock compositions with the proportion of low-An Pl$_4$ in erupted crystal cargoes, combined with textural data and thermodynamic modeling, supports the triggering of these mafic-ignimbrite generating eruptions via destabilization of a differentiated (dacitic) mush by influx of primitive magma.

6.3.3 The March 2015 Fire Fountain

In contrast to the ignimbrite-forming eruptions, historic eruptions have been dominated by effusive activity, punctuated by fire fountaining which appears to be related to lahhar generation (e.g., 1908, 1948-49, 1963, 1964 1971 and 2015, (Lara & Clavero, 2004)). The paroxysmal eruption of March 2015 is significant in that it was the most intense historic eruption at Villarrica, producing a fire fountain that was 1.5 km in height but lasted just thirty minutes (Romero et al., 2018). The composition of olivine erupted in 2015 are more varied than all other historic eruptions (Figure 6), in contrast with homogeneous plagioclase, consisting only of cluster Pl$_3$ and few clinopyroxene crystals. This implies that primitive magma accumulated olivine (and minor clinopyroxene) antecrysts as it ascended through the magmatic system. Plagioclase may have formed in response to degassing upon ascent (as in Blundy et al., 2006). The low-SiO$_2$ and high-MgO bulk
composition of erupted spatter suggests that the intensity of the eruption is unlikely to be caused by the same mechanism as the mafic ignimbrites. Instead high primary volatile contents likely drove fast magma ascent, resulting in the vigorous fountaining behavior (Allison et al., 2021; Barth et al., 2019; La Spina et al., 2021).

6.4 A Model for Generating Explosive Eruptions at Villarrica Volcano

The eruption of the Dacitic Dome (ca. 95 ka) demonstrates that evolved portions of Villarrica’s magmatic system existed prior to the most explosive post-glacial eruptions known at Villarrica, the Licán ignimbrite. Therefore portions of Villarrica’s magmatic
system were differentiated beyond the typical whole rock compositions of erupted historic products (Figure 1). The existence of this evolved (dacitic) reservoir has implications for magma dynamics. It has been shown that felsic mushes are sufficiently viscous that they are non-eruptible (Marsh, 2002; Sparks & Marshall, 1986). In combination with their low relative density, they can act as a density filter, preventing more dense mafic melts from ascending to the surface (Kent et al., 2010). Therefore the establishment of a significant volume of evolved mush within the magmatic system could dampen the eruption of mafic magma and increase the overall volume of evolved melt until a sufficiently large volume of ascending primitive melt is able to destabilize it (Sparks & Marshall, 1986).

The eruption of large-volume eruptive deposits, such as Licán and Pucón ignimbrites, requires significant volumes of mobile magma to exist within the magmatic system (Druitt & Sparks, 1984). If the majority of Villarrica’s magmatic system is composed of near-solidus mush (as implied by the TCMS model), this would require a large volume of magma to destabilize it (Marsh, 2002; Sparks & Marshall, 1986). The composition of minerals and melt inclusions at Villarrica (Ol and Pl, Table 2) suggest primitive magmas were present within its system (Pioli et al., 2015). Therefore we propose that the trigger of the Licán and Pucón ignimbrites was a large influx of primitive magma mixing with an evolved reservoir (Figure 8a). The remnants of the mush that this primitive magma interacted with is shown by the presence of evolved plagioclase, Pl4 in both ingimbrites’ crystal cargoes. In the case of the Licán ignimbrite, the trigger may have been magnified by widespread deglaciation in the Southern Andes around 14 ka ago, altering the stress state of the crust to facilitate magma ascent (e.g., Jellinek et al., 2004; Rawson et al., 2016; Watt et al., 2013; Wilson & Russell, 2020). After the eruption of the Licán ignimbrite, another evolved reservoir of similar composition likely formed over a period of ca. 10 ka. The existence of an evolved reservoir prior to the Pucón Ignimbrite (ca. 3.7 ka) is suggested by a Pre-Pucón pyroclastic surge deposit Lohmar (2008), which contains a large proportion of evolved (63 wt% SiO2) pumice. The Pucón ignimbrite forming eruption may then have been triggered in a similar fashion to the Licán eruption, i.e. destabilization of an evolved reservoir by an influx of primitive magma.

These evolved reservoirs were likely depleted by mixing with primitive magma prior to the ignimbrite-forming eruptions as subsequently erupted crystal cargoes (3.7 ka to present) contain no trace of Pl4 (Figure 6). Without the density filter provided by the evolved reservoirs, the most recently erupted magmas have been able to ascend through
Villarrica’s magmatic system faster, perhaps only mixing in the shallowest parts, resulting in less differentiated erupted compositions (Figure 8b). The absence of mixing between highly differentiated and primitive compositions results in substantially lower explosivity. Instead recent lava fountaining is likely driven by rapid ascent, enabled by high volatile-contents (e.g., the March 2015 eruption). The near continuous activity at Villarrica’s lava lake demonstrates the ability of magma to ascend relatively unhindered through the magmatic system. Absence of activity at the summit and/or the eruption of crystals in equilibrium with differentiated melt compositions (e.g., Pl4) may signal the onset of evolved reservoir development, and signal an increased likelihood of high-volume explosive eruption occurring.

7 Conclusions

Use of multivariate cluster analysis has allowed us to identify previously unidentified structure in the composition of minerals erupted throughout Villarrica’s eruptive history. Comparisons of identified representative compositions with >1500 Rhyolite-MELTS thermodynamic simulations show that magma processing at Villarrica takes place at a range of pressures, temperatures, water-contents, and oxygen fugacities. These thermodynamic models strongly suggest that magma storage beneath the volcano is characterized by a series of ephemerally-connected, variably-evolved mush dominated sills. Prior to eruption, magma ascends through this trans-crustal magmatic system, accumulating different antecrysts which are erupted as variable crystal cargoes.

We have identified temporal trends in the composition of erupted crystal cargoes that correlate with trends in whole-rock composition and eruption style. We propose that prior to high-volume, ignimbrite-forming explosive mafic eruptions (the Licán and Pucón ignimbrites) much of Villarrica’s volcanic system had differentiated by fractional crystallization. These evolved reservoirs acted as density filters, suppressing the eruption of small volumes of primitive magma. Only when a sufficiently-large influx of primitive magma entered the system was this evolved portion destabilized. Extensive magma mixing ensued, producing the complex textures observed by past studies, and resulting in the relatively primitive, basaltic-andesite compositions of the two ignimbrites. The only remnants of the evolved reservoir are low-anorthite plagioclase which is present as both cores and rims of more primitive crystals.
The absence of an evolved reservoirs, after these high-volume explosive eruptions, explains the homogeneous, more primitive, whole-rock compositions of subsequent eruptions. Without the density filter of the evolved reservoirs, more primitive melts ascend relatively uninhibited, mixing and degassing in the shallow subsurface before eruption.

Further petrological work utilizing melt inclusion compositions, high-resolution trace-element data, and diffusion chronometry will allow further investigation of magma dynamics at Villarrica.

Data Availability Statement

All compositional data used in the clustering analysis for this study are available in the Supplementary Material.

Acknowledgments

FOB is funded by the National Environmental Research Council (NERC) Panorama Doctoral Training Partnership (DTP) NE/S007458/1, SKE is funded by a NERC Independent Research Fellowship (NE/R015546/1). JR is supported through a Dean’s Doctoral Scholar Awards of the University of Manchester and NSFGEO-NERC-funded project Dseqm (NE/N018575/1) and V-PLUS projects. All authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest. The authors would like to thank Silke Lohmar for facilitating access to compositional data.
References


Ginibre, C., & Wörner, G. (2007). Variable parent magmas and recharge regimes of the Parinacota magma system (N. Chile) revealed by Fe, Mg and Sr zoning in plagioclase. *Lithos, 98*(1-4), 118–140. doi: 10.1016/j.lithos.2007.03.004


MELTS: A Modified Calibration of MELTS Optimized for Silica-rich, Fluid-
bearing Magmatic Systems. *Journal of Petrology, 53*(5), 875–890. doi:
10.1093/petrology/egr080

Arc Volcanism over 10 Myr: Constraints from Statistical Analysis of Melt
Inclusion Compositions. *Journal of Petrology, 61*(1), egaa022. doi:
10.1093/petrology/egaa022

normality. *Communications in statistics-Theory and Methods, 19*(10), 3595–
3617.

ic variations in Andean basaltic and silicic lavas from the Villarrica-Lanin
volcanic chain (39.5° S): An evaluation of source heterogeneity, fractional crys-
tallization and crustal assimilation. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology,
103*(3), 361–386. doi: 10.1007/BF00402922

Hickey-Vargas, R., Sun, M., & Holbik, S. (2016). Geochemistry of basalts from small
eruptive centers near Villarrica stratovolcano, Chile: Evidence for lithospheric
mantle components in continental arc magmas. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica
Acta, 185*, 358–382. doi: 10.1016/j.gca.2016.03.033

Hildreth, W., & Moorbath, S. (1988, April). Crustal contributions to arc magma-
tism in the Andes of Central Chile. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology,

cause volcanic eruptions in eastern California? Probing the mechanics of dike
formation: VOLCANISM AND DEGLACIATION. *Journal of Geophysical
Research: Solid Earth, 109*(B9), n/a-n/a. doi: 10.1029/2004JB002978

significance through the magma plumbing system. *Geological Society, London,
Special Publications, 304*(1), 133–148. doi: 10.1144/SP304.7

Kamenetsky, V. S., Elburg, M., Arculus, R., & Thomas, R. (2006). Mag-


McCurry, M., Chadwick, J., Wright, K., Smith, R., & Ford, M. (2004). Preliminary la/icp-ms and epma examination of dacite enclaves and melt inclusions in phenocrysts from basaltic andesite pyroclasts from the pucón ignimbrite, volcán villarrica, southern andean volcanic zone: Implications for mafic ignimbrite volcanism..

McGee, L. E., Brahm, R., Rowe, M. C., Handley, H. K., Morgado, E., Lara, L. E.,...
... Valdivia, P. (2017). A geochemical approach to distinguishing competing
tectono-magmatic processes preserved in small eruptive centres. *Contributions
to Mineralogy and Petrology, 172*(6), 44. doi: 10.1007/s00410-017-1360-2

thermometry, barometry and hygrometry. *Lithos, 125*(1-2), 221–235. doi:
10.1016/j.lithos.2011.02.008

Moreno, H. (1993). Volcán villarrica, geología y evaluación del riesgo volcánico, re-
regiones IX y x, 39 25 s. *Informe Final Proyecto FONDECYT, 1247*, 1–112.

Araucanía y de Los Lagos. *Carta Geológica de Chile, Serie Geología Básica,
No. 98. Servicio Nacional de Geología y Minería. Mapa Escala 1:50,000. Santi-
ago, Chile.*

Volcan Villarrica, Andes del Sur (39o25’S). In *7th Congreso Geológico Chileno

Morgado, E., Parada, M., Contreras, C., Castruccio, A., Gutiérrez, F., & McGee, L.
(2015). Contrasting records from mantle to surface of Holocene lavas of two
nearby arc volcanic complexes: Caburgua-Huelemolle Small Eruptive Centers
and Villarrica Volcano, Southern Chile. *Journal of Volcanology and Geother-

Rapid transcrustal magma movement under Iceland. *Nature Geoscience,
12*(7), 569–574. doi: 10.1038/s41561-019-0376-9

An experimental study of the effects of melt composition on plagioclase-melt
equilibria at 5 and 10 kbar: Implications for the origin of magmatic high-An
plagioclase. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 118*(4), 420–432. doi:
10.1007/s004100050024

preferential magmatic and geothermal fluid pathways via electric conductivity
at Villarrica Volcano, S-Chile. *Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal

Pedregosa, F., Varoquaux, G., Gramfort, A., Michel, V., Thirion, B., Grisel, O., . . .


Robidoux, P., Pastén, D., Levresse, G., Diaz, G., & Paredes, D. (2021, July). Volatile Content Implications of Increasing Explosivity of the Strombolian Eruptive Style along the Fracture Opening on the NE Villarrica Flank: Mi-
(No. 26). Boca Raton: Chapman & Hall/CRC.


tions in magma-mush ponding depths, H$_2$O contents, and surface heat flux. 

*American Mineralogist, 101*(11), 2405–2422. doi: 10.2138/am-2016-5701