This manuscript is a **preprint** and has been submitted for publication in the **Journal of the Geological Society of London**. This version of the manuscript has been accepted for publication following peer review-review but has not undergone copyediting/typestting. Please feel free to contact any of the authors directly to comment on the manuscript.

July 19<sup>th</sup> 2022

# 1 Rivers of the Variscan Foreland: fluvial morphodynamics in the Pennant

# 2 Formation of South Wales, UK

- 3 James Wood<sup>1</sup>, Jonah S. McLeod<sup>1</sup>, Sinéad J. Lyster<sup>1</sup> and Alexander C. Whittaker<sup>1\*</sup>
- <sup>4</sup> <sup>1</sup>Department of Earth Science and Engineering, Imperial College London, UK, SW7 2BX.
- 5 \*Correspondence (<u>a.whittaker@imperial.ac.uk</u>)
- 6 note the above email will expire after July 2022 alternatives include: <u>a.whittaker@imperial.ac.uk</u>,
- 7 <u>s.lyster17@imperial.ac.uk</u> & jonah.mcleod18@imperial.ac.uk
- 8 Present address: (AW) 3.51, Royal School of Mines, South Kensington Campus, Prince Consort Road,
- 9 London SW7 2AZ
- 10 Abbreviated title: Rivers of the Variscan Foreland
- 11 ORCiDs: JW 0000-0002-1673-0097, JM 0000-0002-5382-3559, SL 0000-0002-1188-533X, AW -
- 12 0000-0002-8781-7771.
- 13 Abstract

14 The morphodynamics of ancient rivers can be reconstructed from fluvial stratigraphy using quantitative techniques to provide insights into the driving forces behind the sedimentary systems. 15 16 This work explores how these drivers can be evaluated from Paleozoic stratigraphy. Field 17 measurements are taken in fluvial sediments from the Westphalian (Bolsovian and Asturian; 315.2-18 308 Ma) Pennant Formation of South Wales, UK, to reconstruct the hydrodynamics and morphologies 19 of these Carboniferous rivers, which were sourced from the Variscan (Hercynian) Mountain belt 20 located south of the study area. Field data consist of cross-set heights, grain size, palaeocurrent 21 directions, and the dimensions of fluvial architectural elements. Hydrodynamic properties, including 22 flow velocities and discharge rates, are reconstructed using a suite of numerical approaches. Results suggest median formative flow depths of 2–3 m and palaeoslopes of  $4-5 \times 10^{-4}$  (0.02–0.03°). 23 24 Quantitative planform prediction suggests these rivers were likely anastomosing but with distinct 25 single-threaded reaches. Mean single-thread width is 55 m, while mean channel-belt widths of 100-200 m are reconstructed, suggesting bankfull discharges of  $390-560 \text{ m}^3 \text{ s}^{-1}$ . This study resolves 26 27 contrasting palaeohydrological interpretations for Pennant rivers, and demonstrates how 28 reconstructions of morphology, slope and planform can be obtained from fluvial stratigraphy.

29

## 31 Supplementary Material

Field data, a field localities KMZ file, analysis of flow depth scaling methods, and fluvial facies analysis
is available at xxxxxxxx.

- 34
- 35
- 36
- 37

Rivers have been among the most significant drivers of geomorphological and hydrological change on 38 39 Earth's surface since the Archean (Hjellbakk 1997; Eriksson et al. 2006; Gibling & Davies 2012; Ielpi et 40 al. 2017; Bridgland et al. 2014, Ganti et al. 2019). Their hydrodynamic and morphodynamic properties 41 are recorded in the stratigraphic record (Whittaker 2012; Ganti et al. 2014, Bhattacharya et al. 2016), 42 allowing researchers to reconstruct the characteristics and behaviour of ancient fluvial systems from 43 the geological archive (e.g., Michael et al. 2014; Ganti et al. 2019; Chamberlin & Hajek 2019; Lyster et 44 al. 2021). These reconstructions include morphologic and hydrodynamic properties (Paola & Mohrig 45 1996; Duller et al. 2012; Chen et al. 2018; Shibata et al. 2018; Greenberg & Hajek 2021), sediment transport capacity (Holbrook and Wanas 2014; Li & Bhattacharya 2017; Sharma et al. 2017; Mahon 46 47 and McElroy 2018), and drainage area and shape (Bhattacharya and Tye 2004; Bhattacharya et al. 2016; Xu et al. 2017; Li et al. 2018; Lyster et al., 2020). As river development is closely linked to tectonic 48 49 and climatic forcing, fluvial strata provide insights into the prevailing tectono-climatic conditions at 50 the time of deposition (Duller et al. 2010; Castelltort et al. 2012; Whittaker 2012; Harries et al. 2021).

While much work in the field of sedimentology has implemented qualitative techniques (e.g., facies 51 52 analysis) to provide valuable insights into river characteristics from fluvial strata (e.g., Jones 1977; 53 Miall 1985; Bridge 2003; Plink-Bjorklund 2015, amongst many others), an increasing number of 54 quantitative approaches are beginning to present new opportunities within the discipline. Empirical 55 and theoretical equations can be used to reconstruct the morphology and hydrology of modern rivers in terms of slope, depth, and water discharge (Leopold and Maddock Jr. 1953; Hack 1957; Leopold and 56 57 Wolman 1960; Williams 1984). These methods have been increasingly adapted for stratigraphic application in recent years to facilitate multifaceted reconstructions of ancient systems (Bridge and 58 59 Mackey 1992; Leclair and Bridge 2001; Trampush et al. 2014; Bradley and Venditti 2017; Greenberg et al. 2021; Lyster et al., 2022), enabling fluvial morphodynamics such as channel dimensions, flow 60 velocities and unit discharges to be quantified in a way that is not possible from qualitative facies 61 analyses alone. Reconstruction of river behaviour within this type of palaeohydrological framework 62

63 therefore adds richness to insights offered from more classical sedimentological approaches, and in 64 some cases may even challenge pre-existing interpretations (e.g. Ganti et al, 2019). However, utilising quantitative palaeohydrological techniques can be restricted by the incomplete nature of the rock 65 66 record (Sadler 1981; Straub et al. 2020). Additionally, the limited number of data sets to-date of 67 ancient river deposits where important sedimentological observables (e.g., height and distributions of 68 cross-beds) are quantified with sufficient precision means robust reconstructions of fluvial morphodynamics are rare (c.f. Leary & Ganti 2019; Lyster et al. 2022). Nonetheless, in principle, 69 70 palaeohydrological studies offer an opportunity to assess the scale and dimensions of ancient fluvial 71 landscapes, particularly where the corresponding geomorphic archive has been lost, and to quantify 72 the fluxes of sediment and water across the surface of the Earth and other planets in the geological 73 past (Ganti et al. 2019; Stack et al. 2019; Lyster et al. 2021).

This study focuses on the palaeohydrology of Upper Carboniferous (Pennsylvanian) fluvial systems of the Pennant Sandstone Formation, South Wales, UK (Figure 1). In the UK, the Upper Carboniferous comprises the Namurian, Westphalian, Stephanian and Autunian regional stages, with the Westphalian stage, which is the subject of this study, spanning 319 Ma to 308 Ma (Davydov et al. 2012). Further, the Westphalian stage comprises the Langsettian, Duckmantian, Bolsovian and Asturian regional substages, with the Bolsovian and Asturian substages being the focus here (315.2–308 Ma; Davydov et al. 2012).

81 The Pennant Sandstone is of key interest due to its tectono-geographic setting in the foreland of the 82 Variscan Orogen, temporally close to the cessation of the northward migration of the Variscan front 83 during the Westphalian stage (Gayer and Jones 1989; Jones 1991; Burgess and Gayer 2000; Opluštil 84 and Cleal 2007). Hence, these strata record the behaviour, water discharges, and sediment fluxes of 85 rivers during the latter stages of the assembly of the Pangaean supercontinent. The formation crops 86 out extensively in the South Wales and Pembrokeshire Coalfields and has a well-constrained 87 stratigraphic framework owing to geological studies during Wales' time as a productive coal mining 88 region (Woodland et al. 1957; Kelling 1974; Jones 1977). Previous sedimentological work on the 89 Pennant has largely centred on qualitative facies and architectural observations to build a nuanced 90 picture of river behaviour and environment in the upper Carboniferous (De la Beche 1846, Strahan 91 1899, Woodland et al. 1957, Kelling 1974, Jones 1977; Jones & Hartley, 1993). These classic studies 92 provide detailed sedimentological context for our work. However to date, the morphodynamic and hydrodynamic characteristics of these fluvial systems have not been reconstructed using a 93 94 quantitative palaeohydrological framework. Here we revisit the Pennant Formation and use 95 palaeohydrological approaches, founded in bedform analysis (c.f. Ganti et al. 2019; Lyster et al. 2021), 96 to exemplify how new insights into fluvial system behaviour can be obtained for classic geological

97 formations that have received little recent study. Consequently, our field data allow us to reconstruct 98 flow depths, palaeoslopes, water discharges, and the behaviour of Carboniferous rivers draining the 99 northern margin of the Variscan mountain belt. These results provide insight into how ancient fluvial 100 systems responded to foreland basin evolution during a major orogenic event and demonstrate how 101 channel planform and characteristics can now be extracted from quantitative measurements of fluvial 102 stratigraphy.

### 103 Regional Tectono-stratigraphy

104 The Pennant Sandstone Formation comprises Bolsovian and Asturian aged fluvial sediments that were 105 deposited in the South Wales foreland basin (Figure 1a) by rivers draining mountainous terrain built 106 during the Variscan orogeny (Kelling 1974; Evans 2004). Today, these sediments crop out in the South 107 Wales and Pembrokeshire Coalfields. The Variscan (Hercynian) Orogeny was the principal formative 108 orogenic event of the supercontinent Pangaea, creating an orogenic belt that stretched east-west 109 over 1000 km (Leveridge and Hartley 2006). Many of the north-south orientated compressional structures and sedimentary basins of Europe today can be attributed to the Variscan Orogeny, 110 111 including the South Wales and Pembrokeshire coalfields that form the geographical focus of this study (Leveridge and Hartley 2006, Opluštil and Cleal 2007). The South Wales foreland basin, situated to the 112 113 north of the northward propagating Variscan Orogenic Belt (Figure 1c), was generated following 114 inversion of a regional Devonian–Lower Carboniferous extensional regime (Hartley and Warr 1990; 115 Burgess and Gayer 2000; Opluštil and Cleal 2007). The northern edge of the foreland was bounded by 116 the cratonic upland of the Wales-Brabant High (Figure 1c; Rippon 1996).

117 By the end of the Carboniferous, the front of Variscan deformation had migrated northward to the 118 location of the South Wales Coalfield, producing shortening of up to 30% and north-south 119 compressional structures such as the major asymmetric syncline that dominates the structure of the 120 coalfield today (Figure 1b; Jones 1991; Gayer and Pesek 1992; Evans 2004). Subsidence curves of the 121 South Wales Basin suggest a rapid accommodation generation of 260 m Myr<sup>-1</sup> in the west and 130 m 122 Myr<sup>-1</sup> in the east during the late Westphalian (Burgess and Gayer 2000). As the underlying South Wales 123 Coal Measures consist of sediment sourced from the Wales-Brabant High (Evans 2004), the base of 124 the Pennant Formation represents the onset of Variscan deposition in the region (Leveridge and 125 Hartley 2006; Opluštil and Cleal 2007).

The Pennant sandstone has a maximum total thickness of 1350 m and is subdivided into 5 members shown in Figure 2 (Barclay 2011). These members, first described as 'beds' by Woodland et al. (1957) following the early classification work of De La Beche (1846) and Strahan (1899), are separated by coal horizons and form the basis for temporal differentiation in this study. Each member contains 130 sandstone (greenish-grey, lithic arenite), mudstone, siltstone, and coals of varying abundances and 131 thicknesses (Waters et al. 2007; Waters et al. 2009). The Rhondda Member is the thickest and contains the highest proportion of sand (Waters et al. 2009) so is, therefore, the most represented member in 132 133 outcrop. The Llynfi, Hughes, and Swansea members have limited outcrop due to higher proportion of 134 muds and silts, while the Brithdir Member's lesser thickness also limits the abundance of outcrop 135 (Waters et al. 2009). While the exact stratigraphic boundary between the Bolsovian and Asturian substages is not formally defined in the Pennant Sandstone, it is considered to be within the Brithdir 136 137 Member's depositional timespan (Waters et al. 2009; Barclay 2011).

138 The base of the Pennant Formation is described as the first significant 'Pennant-type' sandstone 139 (greenish-grey and blueish-grey, feldspathic, micaceous, lithic arenite) of at least 3 m thickness 140 (Waters et al. 2009), creating a diachronicity of the horizon. In the Swansea region, the base is 141 contemporaneous with the Cambriense Marine Band at the base of the Llynfi Member (Barclay 2011) 142 whilst the base rises as high in the stratigraphy as the Brithdir Member in the eastern coalfield (Waters 143 et al. 2009). The top of the Pennant Sandstone is also diachronous with the Swansea Member absent 144 in the east of the coalfield (Waters et al. 2009). The diachronous boundary means the variability of 145 thickness of the Pennant is high (Figure 2), particularly across the Neath Disturbance, a major 146 northeast-southwest trending Caledonoid fault in the modern Vale of Neath (Barclay 2011).

147 Correlation of the Pennant Sandstone between the Pembrokeshire and South Wales Coalfields is 148 contentious with an early study suggesting correlation of Pembrokeshire outcrops with the Hughes 149 Member (Jenkins 1962). More recently, a palaeobotanical study conducted by Cleal and Thomas 150 (1992) correlated these deposits with the Rhondda Member. Herein, the Pembrokeshire Pennant is 151 included in the Rhondda Member.

152 Although there has been little recent work on the sedimentology of the Pennant Formation, previous studies in the last 50 years have generally described the depositional environment of the Pennant 153 154 Sandstone as a low-sinuosity, relatively proximal braidplain, characterised by development of sheet-155 like or stacked sandstone bodies, a concentration of in-channel bedforms and a general absence of 156 point bar deposits (Kelling 1969; Jones 1977; Jones and Hartley 1993). The doctoral thesis of Jones 157 (1977), for instance, includes extensive and detailed analyses of architectural features and facies 158 within the lower Pennant, and our study makes use of this significant body of work. Jones in particular 159 identifies two major facies associations; the first is interpreted as the result of repeated incursions of 160 small deltas, or crevasse deltas, into shallow bays, and the second, which is dominant after the Llynfi 161 member, is interpreted to record braided rivers characterised by a variable discharge regime, which 162 laterally migrated through a vegetated floodplain environment. Although Jones (1977) rejects the

notion of the Pennant recording classical meandering channels (*sensu* Allen 1963) and estimates channel widths of order hundreds of metres, their thesis also suggests that individual channels may have had flow depths of >15 m based on channel body thicknesses, which would have been unusually deep for braided systems. This example serves to underscore the potential discrepancies between facies-derived reconstructions presented in the historic literature and morphodynamic considerations. Consequently, our work allows for a re-evaluation of the characteristics of these Carboniferous fluvial systems that drained the growing Variscan orogen for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century.

## 170 Study Methods

#### 171 Field Data Collection

Field data were collected in the South Wales Coalfield (17 localities) and Pembrokeshire Coalfield (2 localities) during two field campaigns in August and September 2021. All measurements were taken in channelized sandstone bodies and form the basis of the reconstruction and analysis of river morphologies in this study.

### 176 Cross-sets

177 Cross-sets in medium to very-coarse sands were measured to reconstruct the sizes of bedforms in 178 Pennant rivers using the method of Leclair and Bridge (2001). This approach requires mean cross-set 179 heights, so distributions of heights in individual cross-sets (n = 268) were measured to the nearest 10 180 mm at 10 cm intervals along the major axis of the cross-set (7 to 62 measurements per cross-set; 181 Figure 3b). From these height distributions, mean cross-set heights, h<sub>xs</sub>, were subsequently extracted. 182 Maximum heights were also extracted from the distributions to derive a scaling factor between mean-183 maximum cross-set heights for each member of the Pennant Sandstone. This method has successfully 184 been used previously on fluvial strata in Utah, USA (Lyster et al. 2021), and northwest Scotland (Ganti 185 et al. 2019).

Cross-set height maxima were also measured at each locality (n = 1809; Figure 3d). Using the new
 mean-maximum height scaling factors, mean cross-heights were estimated for each measured
 maximum height, expanding the total dataset from 268 to 2077 mean cross-set heights.

Palaeocurrent directions were determined at each field site by measuring the dip and dip direction of cross-set lee slopes (n = 1038). Bedding measurements were also taken at each site or from geological maps (n = 58). Palaeocurrent measurements were subsequently unfolded using *Stereonet 11* (Allmendinger 2020) to correct for the dip of beds and therefore decipher true palaeocurrent directions of the rivers recorded within each member of the Pennant Formation.

#### 194 Grain size

195 Where the height distribution of an individual cross-set was measured, the median grain size, D<sub>50</sub>, was 196 also estimated using the Wentworth grainsize classification (Wentworth 1922; Figure 3e) and 197 converted to a numerical value in metres (e.g., 0.000375 m for medium sand, 0.0005 m for 198 medium-coarse sand etc.). Grain-size photographs were also taken at each locality to later verify the 199 estimated grainsize using ImageJ software (Rasband 2018). Grain-sizes exceeding sand grade were 200 observed in some outcrops of the Pennant Sandstone, and typically occurred as isolated lenses at the 201 base of channel fills (Figure 3f; c.f. Jones 1977; Jones & Hartley 1993). Distributions of these 202 conglomeratic sediments were measured using the Wolman point count method (Wolman 1954) to 203 extract D<sub>50</sub> and were used to constrain the maximum possible, but rare, flow conditions in Pennant 204 rivers.

### 205 Architectural fluvial elements

206 To validate the palaeohydrological reconstructions, the dimensions of bar-scale (1-10s m scale) 207 architectural elements were independently measured (Figure 4). The heights of both channel fill 208 sandstone packages and accretion packages (downstream and lateral) were quantified using a laser 209 range finder (Haglöf Laser Geo) to a precision of 0.1 m (n = 116). These accretion packages, 210 representing bar-scale clinoforms, provide a maximum bankfull flow depth where the total height of 211 the bar-clinoform is visible, or where it can be extrapolated (Mohrig et al. 2000; Hajek and Heller 212 2012). These estimates of bankfull flow depth were used to validate flow depths calculated from cross-213 set heights. Where possible, accretion package widths were measured for channel width calculations 214 (below) and outcrop-scale photographs were taken to show the fluvial architecture of each site (Figure 215 4).

## 216 Palaeohydrology

#### 217 Flow depth

218 Cross-set heights represent a fraction of the original bedform height. Here, the scaling relation of 219 Leclair and Bridge (2001) was used to convert mean cross-set height,  $h_{xs}$ , to mean bedform height,  $h_d$ :

220

$$h_d = 2.9(\pm 0.7)h_{xs} \qquad (1)$$

This relationship is based on the theoretical model of Paola and Borgman (1991) for bedform migration over random topography on the bed with negligible angle of climb. Here, uncertainty of the scaling factor (±0.7) represents the standard deviation of the dataset used by Leclair and Bridge (2001). To account for this uncertainty, a Monte Carlo uncertainty propagation method was used, following the method of Lyster et al. (2021).  $10^6$  random values of the model parameter were generated between the uncertainty intervals (2.9 + 0.7 and 2.9 – 0.7 for Eq. 1) and were used to calculate  $h_d$ . This recovered  $10^6$  values of  $h_d$  which were subsequently carried forwards — Monte Carlo uncertainty propagation was used in all subsequent equations presented here with the stated uncertainties, and the outcome of these calculations, below, are presented as box and whisker plots which show the median and interquartile ranges for our palaeohydrological reconstructions in the results.

To estimate flow depth, H, the relationship of Bradley and Venditti (2017) was used:

232 
$$H = 6.7h_d$$
 (2)

This relationship was derived following a revaluation of past work on dune-depth scaling relations that were deemed to be ineffective (Yalin 1964; van Rijn 1984; Julien and Klaassen 1995). The scaling factor in Eq. 2 (i.e., 6.7) at 50% uncertainty has a range of 4.4–10.1. A Monte Carlo propagation was again used between these values to accommodate this uncertainty. Any calculated values of H that exceeded 125% of the maximum measured package thickness at the field site were removed from the dataset at this stage (n = 89 out of more than 2000 cross-sets).

# 239 Palaeoslope

Slope, S, was reconstructed using estimates of D<sub>50</sub> and H, and using the empirical method of Trampush
et al. (2014), which is appropriate for the range of grain sizes used in this study. Here Slope, S, is given
by:

$$\log S = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 \log D_{50} + \alpha_2 \log H \qquad (3)$$

where  $\alpha_0$ ,  $\alpha_1$  and  $\alpha_2$  are constants given as  $-2.08 \pm 0.036$ ,  $0.254 \pm 0.016$ , and  $-1.09 \pm 0.044$  respectively. Monte Carlo uncertainty propagation was used to accommodate uncertainty in the constants (Trampush et al. 2014). Palaeoslope values were analysed both temporally (i.e., between members) and spatially (i.e., downstream considering resolved palaeocurrent directions where we have multiple channel measurements at a similar stratigraphic level of the Pennant).

# 249 Flow velocity and unit discharge

The equation of Manning et al. (1890) was used to derive flow velocity, U, and water discharge per unit width,  $Q_U$ , as  $Q_U = U \times H$ . Manning's equation is given as:

252 
$$U = \frac{1}{n} H^{\frac{2}{3}} S^{\frac{1}{2}}$$
 (4)

where n, Manning's Roughness Coefficient, is approximated as 0.03 following Lyster et al. (2021) based on the value for fluvial channels of the look-up table of Chow (1959). U is given in m s<sup>-1</sup> and  $Q_U$  is given in m<sup>2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>.  $Q_U$  can be multiplied by an estimated width, W, to give total bankfull discharge, Q, in m<sup>3</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>.

## 257 Fluvial style and channel widths

Determining the planform morphology of ancient river systems can be difficult as preservation of 258 259 entire channels is rare in the rock record (Brierley 1989; Parker 1976; Lyster et al. 2022). Traditionally, 260 facies analyses of architectural elements using vertical profiles and plan-view exposures of fluvial 261 strata are used to classify ancient rivers as meandering, straight, anastomosing, or braided (Miall 262 1985). However, these analyses are most effective where outcrop is complete. Therefore, quantitative 263 techniques using the Froude number (Fr), S, and aspect ratio (i.e., the ratio of channel width, W, to 264 channel depth, H) of channels can also be implemented to determine fluvial style. Fr is calculated 265 using:

$$Fr = \frac{D}{\sqrt{gH}}$$
(5)

267 where g is gravitational acceleration.

Stability fields for braided and meandering channels can be reconstructed using plots of S/Fr against the inverse of channel aspect ratio (i.e., H/W as opposed to W/H), as the seminal work of Parker (1976) originally showed. Recently, Lyster et al. (2022) re-evaluated the stability fields of Parker (1976) using a new dataset of nearly 1700 modern rivers. They showed that H/W<0.02 characterises multi-thread systems and H/W>0.02 characterises single-thread systems, while S/Fr>0.003 characterises braided multi-thread systems and S/Fr<0.003 characterises anastomosing multi-thread systems. Here, these new insights were used to reconstruct channel planform for all members of the Pennant Formation.

The method of Greenberg et al. (2021) was used to quantify single-thread channel widths,  $W_c$ , where lateral accretion package widths,  $W_L$ , were observed at field sites (n = 23).

277 
$$W_C = 2.34(\pm 0.13)W_L$$
 (6)

Where lateral accretion packages were partially preserved, W<sub>L</sub> was estimated by extrapolating accretion surfaces using structural measurements of accretion surfaces relative to bedding. Monte Carlo uncertainty propagation was used with the bounds of the scalar in Eq. 6. Across the mapped extent of the Pennant, steeper-sided escarpments are generally composed of channel sandstones whereas rolling grass-covered slopes are typically underlain by overbank fines of the Pennant. Therefore, the width of sandstone outcrops provides a constraint on the maximum width of the channel belt and, as such, were measured as an estimate of channel belt width, W (c.f. Jones, 1977). In addition, a channel aspect ratio described in the thesis of Jones of 1:56, based on observations in
 the Pennant at Rhondda Fawr, was also used to estimate W from reconstructed values of H.

## 287 Results

#### 288 Palaeohydrology

289 Distributions of height within individual cross-sets demonstrate a linear relationship between mean 290 and maximum cross-set height ( $h_{xs}$  and  $h_{xsMax}$ ), where  $h_{xs}$  is ~62% of the maximum cross-set height 291 (Figure 5a). Separating these data by member resulted in similar scaling relations in the range  $h_{xs}$  = 292  $0.59h_{xsMax}$  to  $h_{xs} = 0.65h_{xsMax}$  (Figure 5b). These scaling relationships are comparable to those reported 293 by Lyster et al. (2021) for Upper Cretaceous fluvial strata in Utah, suggesting that mean cross-set 294 heights scale predictably with cross-set maxima. Using these member-specific scaling relationships, n 295 = 1809 cross-set height maxima were converted to mean cross-set heights, and these were used to 296 supplement the n = 268 mean cross-set heights from measured distributions. Of these n = 2077 mean 297 cross-set heights, the mean value is 0.12 m.

298 Mean cross-set heights correspond to median flow depths, H, in the Pennant Sandstone of 2.3 m using 299 Eq. 1 and 2, while taking channel/accretion packages heights as a proxy for H gives a median of 2.45 300 m (Fig. 6a). This suggests that results are robust with only 4% of calculated flow depths exceeding 301 125% of the maximum measured package height at the corresponding locality (Supplement 3). Figure 302 6 further summarises the hydrodynamic properties (H, S, U, and  $Q_{U}$ ) reconstructed for the Pennant 303 Formation and its constituent members. As each measured cross-set has been used within our Monte 304 Carlo uncertainty propagation approach, the median and interquartile ranges of reconstructed fluvial 305 morphodynamcs of Pennant rivers can be extracted and shown as box and whisker plots, grouped by 306 member. This grouping aims to maximise the potential to isolate any temporal trends in the data. 307 Flow depths reconstructed for all members are similar to the mean for the Pennant Sandstone as a 308 whole (2.3 m), with interquartile depth ranges of ca. 2 to 3 m. Only the Llynfi has marginally more 309 shallow channels than the succeeding members, but its interquartile range shows significant overlap 310 with the overlying succession (Fig. 6a). Palaeoslopes show limited temporal variation with all members returning median slopes of 4.5 ×10<sup>-4</sup> and interquartile ranges of ca. 4 - 6 ×10<sup>-4</sup> (my/mx; 0.02–0.03°), 311 312 values that are consistent with sand-bedded lowland rivers today (Fig. 6b; Trampush et al., 2014). No statistically significant up-section change in S was observed following Kolmogorov-Smirnov tests 313 314 between each member (Supplement 5). Values of U and  $Q_{U}$  similarly show limited temporal variation with median values ranging between 1.2–1.3 m s<sup>-1</sup> and 2–3 m<sup>2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> respectively, and interquartile 315 ranges which also overlap (Fig. 6c, d). In the few outcrops in which conglomerates were observed, 316 317 representing the coarsest fraction of the Pennant Formation, reconstructed flow velocities are greater

318 (>1.9 m s<sup>-1</sup>) and show greater variation (1.9–2.3 m s<sup>-1</sup>) while  $Q_U$  is a factor of 1.5–2 greater than in the 319 sand fraction (blue crosses, Fig. 6).

Palaeocurrent rose diagrams were produced for each locality using structural measurements of crossset lee faces, unfolded to account for the dip of beds (Figure 7). A range of palaeocurrent directions were recovered with flow directions to the west more common (11/18 sites) than flow directions to the east. It is important to stress, however, that outcrops belonging to each member would not have necessarily formed part of a single fluvial system, as deposition in the Pennant clearly involved more than one river system in both temporal and spatial senses.

326 Spatial variation of S between outcrops of the same member shows more marked trends, despite the 327 fact that the interquartile ranges of predictions overlap (Figure 8). The clearest of these trends can be 328 seen in the Brithdir Member's three field sites, which show a westward decline in channel gradient from ~6  $\times 10^{-4}$  in the east to ~4  $\times 10^{-4}$  in the west. Two sample Kolmogorov-Smirnov tests on the 329 distributions of palaeoslopes resolved at each of the field sites of the Brithdir confirm the sites produce 330 331 distributions that are significantly different from one another (Supplement 5). It is noted that the 332 Pembrokeshire Pennant, which is here correlated with the Rhondda Member, has significantly steeper palaeoslopes of 5-6  $x10^{-4}$  than the Rhondda outcrops in the west of the South Wales Coalfield. 333 334 Consequently, the palaeogeographic relationship of these outcrops to the main part of the Pennant remains unclear, as previous authors have noted (e.g., Jones 1977; Jones and Hartley 1993). 335

## 336 Planform morphologies

Plausible estimates of the channel width of single threads in the Pennant Formation, W<sub>c</sub>, and the 337 338 channel belt width, W, are shown in Figure 9a. Mean  $W_c$  is 55 m and ranges from 12–106 m. In 339 contrast, values of W using the channel body aspect ratio of Jones (1977) have a mean value of 137 340 m, while outcrop widths measured in this study have a mean value of ca. 210 m. Bankfull water discharges, Q<sub>bf</sub>, calculated using W<sub>c</sub>, have an interquartile range of 80–200 m<sup>3</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> and a median of 140 341 m<sup>3</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> (Figure 9b). Considering the entire channel belt, bankfull discharges using the outcrop width 342 give an interquartile range of 440–760 m<sup>3</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> and a median of 560 m<sup>3</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> (Figure 9c), while using the 343 344 ratio of Jones (1977) gives an interquartile range of 320–490 m<sup>3</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> and a median bankfull discharge of 400  $m^3 s^{-1}$  (Figure 9d). 345

A key question is whether Pennant rivers were single-thread or multi-thread. Figure 10 shows the inverse of channel aspect ratio (i.e., H/W as opposed to W/H) plotted against S/Fr for n = 1227 measured cross-sets with corresponding single-thread widths, and for n = 1569 cross-sets with corresponding outcrop widths. For all data points combined (n = 2820), only 0.3% of data points fall outside of the single-thread field of Parker (1976); however, this method has been recently recognised
 to disfavour multi-thread classification for geologic examples (c.f. Lyster et al. 2022).

352 Here, using the revised stability fields of Lyster et al. (2022), 94% of points calculated using the width 353 scaling method of Greenberg et al. (2021) plot in the revised single-thread stability field of Lyster et 354 al. (2022; Figure 9), which is expected as this method (Equation 6) recovers estimates of single-thread 355 channel widths. Given that single thread widths appear to have been of order 50 m and that outcrop 356 widths have mean values of ~200 m, but maximum values up to 300 m, it is reasonable to anticipate 357 that multiple threads could have coexisted within channel belts. This is consistent with the observation 358 that 90% of data points using our measured outcrop width, which give an upper limit on maximum 359 channel active width, plot in the multi-thread stability field of Lyster et al. (2022). Ultimately, we do 360 not know whether multiple threads were present. However, if present, it is likely that a few active 361 threads existed rather than many active threads, given the relative magnitudes of bar clinoform 362 widths, thread widths and outcrop widths (e.g., Greenberg et al. 2021). Further, if multiple threads 363 coexisted then, using the y-axis of the multi-thread stability field proposed by Lyster et al. (2022), 364 Pennant rivers were more likely to have been anastomosing multi-thread rivers than braided multi-365 thread rivers (Figure 9).

These results underline that reconstruction of channel planform depends on effective evaluation of channel width estimates alongside facies-based interpretations. Nevertheless, the results presented here suggest that both single-thread and anastomosing multi-thread planforms may have prevailed during Pennant deposition. Therefore, these results do not support the notion that the Pennant Formation preserves predominantly braided multi-thread systems (Kelling 1974; Jones and Hartley 1993).

# 372 Discussion

## 373 What did the rivers of the Pennant Sandstone look like?

374 This study provides the first application of a quantitative palaeohydrological framework to the upper 375 Carboniferous rivers of the Pennant Formation, based on a combination of bedform scale 376 measurements, grain size and channel architectural elements. Rivers of the Pennant had individual 377 threads with bankfull widths of ~50 m while channel belts spanned 100–300 m. Median flow depths were 2–3 m, implying median bankfull discharges of 390–560 m<sup>3</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> across the channel belt. Channel 378 379 morphodynamics and hydrodynamics remain similar up-section, within the propagated uncertainties, 380 although channels were likely steeper in the Pennant of Pembrokeshire where conglomerates are 381 more abundant and Variscan deformation is more pronounced. Channels with depths of 10 to 15 m

were not reconstructed and no measured cross-sets that might suggest such large depths wereobserved.

384 This study finds that, although the ancient rivers of the Pennant Sandstone drained northwards from 385 the Variscan Mountains in the South (Jones and Hartley 1993; Evans 2004), field results from most 386 localities (11/18) suggest west-directed palaeoflow, matching the study of Jones (1977). Axial drainage 387 is common in foreland basins and can be seen in the modern Ganges Basin, at the foot of the 388 Himalayas, or the rivers of the upper Amazon Basin (Garcia-Castellanos 2002). Flow to the north would 389 have been limited spatially by the presence of the Wales-Brabant High at the northern margin of the 390 foreland basin (Opluštil and Cleal 2007). The landscape was relatively flat in the foreland with river gradients of  $4-5 \times 10^{-4}$  (0.02–0.03°), comparable to upper reaches of the continental Guadalquivir 391 392 River, southern Spain, (S = 3.9 ×10<sup>-4</sup>; Baena-Escudero et al. 2016) and of the Ebro River, Northern Spain  $(S = 6.7 \times 10^{-4}; Ollero Ojeda 1990).$ 393

394 While previous work on the Pennant produced estimates for channel depths of 10-15 m (Jones 1977), 395 our analyses suggest that rivers of the Rhondda Member were likely 5 times shallower than this. Our 396 data also suggests that planform channel belt widths were 3-8 times narrower than those resolved by 397 Jones (1977). Architectural elements unambiguously related to individual channels and large enough 398 to reflect rivers of the previously reconstructed size were not observed in our field study but 399 amalgamated sandstone packages were observed to reach scales comparable to those previously 400 reported. As such, our results provide constraints between insights that can be drawn from the 401 bedform scale compared to the channel body scale. Jones and Hartley's (1993) study on the reservoir 402 characteristics of the Pennant Sandstone presents a channel depth to width ratio of 1:5–15 based on 403 channel fill deposits while we find a single-thread depth to width ratio of 1:15–30, greater by a factor 404 of ~2, again based on depths derived from cross-set analysis.

405 Within the channel sandstones of the Pennant, distinct horizons of wood (Lepidodendron and 406 Calamites) debris are observed. These packages resemble clast-supported deposits in places with 407 wood fossils up to 1 m in length found in outcrops of the Llynfi Member (Figure 11). This, along with 408 the presence of coal seams at all stratigraphic intervals of the Pennant, provides evidence of a heavily 409 vegetated region. This is in agreement with the palaeofloral work of Opluštil and Cleal (2007) where 410 an ever-wet, tropical palaeoclimate is proposed. The presence of these wood debris dominated beds 411 in the Pennant indicates rivers displayed marked discharge variability as is also hypothesized in the 412 thesis of Jones (1977). Conglomeratic lags in several outcrops of the Pennant, where reconstructed 413 flow velocities are 1.5-2 times greater than in sands, likely reflect flow dynamics of the largest 414 discharge events that would have occurred in rivers of the upper Carboniferous South Wales foreland

basin. In the Westphalian, Britain was palaeogeographically sub-equatorial (Scotese 2001) meaning
tectono-climatic conditions may have been analogous to the modern Amazon and Congo basins. Given
water discharges of 300–600 m<sup>3</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> it is estimated that the ancient rivers had drainage areas of 4500–
9500 km<sup>2</sup>, based on an average precipitation rate of 2 m yr<sup>-1</sup> from modern equatorial rainforests (e.g.,
Amazon Rainforest; Sombroek 2001), and assuming water discharge scales with drainage area.

420 Various planforms likely existed over the course of these ancient rivers. Using outcrop widths as a 421 proxy for channel belt widths, many of these rivers may have been multi-threaded. Of these multi-422 thread rivers, quantitative analysis using estimates of slope and Froude number (Equations 3 and 5), 423 and the stability fields of Lyster et al. (2022), suggest that multi-thread Pennant rivers were likely to 424 have been anastomosing. There is, however, both facies-based and quantitative evidence for single-425 thread reaches in Pennant rivers. Facies evidence includes laterally dipping accretion surfaces 426 representing meander growth while the correspondence between estimates of single-thread widths 427 and outcrop widths for some localities of the Hughes and Llynfi Members also suggests some outcrops 428 preserve rivers with a single-thread planform. In addition, the variability in resolved palaeocurrent 429 between field sites of similar spatio-temporal setting in the Pennant may suggest that the sinuosity of 430 the rivers was higher than previously reported.

431 The anastomosing river planform morphologies implied by the results in this study suggest that Pennant rivers were likely more stable than previous interpretations of relatively proximal braided 432 433 systems. Anastomosing rivers are often characterised by large, typically vegetated, mid-channel bars 434 or islands, in contrast to the highly mobile barforms that are typically observed in braided systems 435 (e.g., Makaske 2001). The abundant vegetation in the Variscan foreland in the Westphalian (Opluštil 436 and Cleal 2007) would have acted as a stabilising agent for the river systems, generating the large, but 437 spatially limited, sandstone bodies that occur between the extensive mudstone dominated landscapes 438 in the valleys of South Wales. Overall, results suggest that the hydrodynamics of fluvial systems in the 439 Variscan foreland were remarkably similar throughout Pennant deposition, despite the 10 km Myr<sup>1</sup> 440 northward advancement of the Variscan Mountains (Burgess and Gayer 2000) with rivers showing 441 limited temporal trends up-section.

442 Upstream to downstream trends, however, are more visible in the data, particularly for slope; in the 443 Brithdir Member, slope decreases from  $\sim 6 \times 10^{-4}$  to  $4 \times 10^{-4}$  across the >10 km plan view distance 444 between three field sites. Considering these trends in palaeoslopes, it is hypothesized here that the 445 three field sites visited in the Brithdir Member sites formed part of the same fluvial system, based on 446 slope, palaeocurrent and the authors' observations of similar facies. The three westernmost localities 447 in the Rhondda Member in the South Wales Coalfield also show decreasing S downstream although the facies evidence is less convincing that they comprise the same system here. The Llynfi and Hughes members do not have field sites showing evidence of being part of the same system and, given the spatial scale (>100 km), are interpreted as outcrops representing spatially separated but temporally equivalent river systems.

The mean hydrodynamic parameters and morphologies of Pennant rivers are summarised in Figure 12. Figure 12 represents the morphology of a hypothetical modern fluvial system, using the parameters reconstructed in this study, which suggest anastomosing morphologies of ~200 m width and ~2.5 m flow depths were most common in the rivers of the Pennant.

Overall, results of this study suggest that Pennant rivers exhibited both anastomosing and single threaded planforms with bankfull discharges up to 560 m<sup>3</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. To a first order, the rivers were similar
 in scale and tectonic setting to the modern Guadalquivir and Ebro rivers of Spain, and the upper Kuban
 River, Russia.

### 460 **Tectonic implications**

The ancient river deposits preserved in the stratigraphy of the Pennant Sandstone provide an 461 462 opportunity to explore the evolution of the northern foreland basin margin of the Variscan mountain belt. Our data analysis shows that there is no statistical temporal change in the morphodynamic 463 464 parameters resolved in the Pennant rivers over the approximately 7 Myr depositional interval of the 465 formation, despite a reconstructed northward migration of the Variscan Front of greater than 50 km 466 in the same period (Burgess and Gayer 2000). In contrast, recent quantitative palaeohydrological studies of ancient rivers draining the Sevier fold-and-thrust belt of the Upper Cretaceous of Utah, 467 468 which flowed in a broadly similar orogenic setting to the Pennant's rivers, show marked steepening 469 temporal trends in palaeoslope over a 9 Myr period relating to the migration of the thrust front (Lyster 470 et al. 2021; Lyster et al., 2022). Rivers of the Pennant Formation appear to be remarkably insensitive 471 to tectonic forcing by comparison.

472 Various mechanisms could be responsible for this stability in reconstructed palaeoslopes. Firstly, 473 subsidence rates of approximately 130-260 m Myr<sup>-1</sup> in the centre of the South Wales basin (Burgess 474 and Gayer 2000) may have been neatly balanced by sediment supply from Pennant rivers, maintaining 475 the fluvial topography of the depocenter despite the advancing thrust front, which continued to 476 migrate until 305 Ma, after the end of Pennant deposition. In this explanation our sample sites are 477 hypothesised to be sufficiently downstream within the basin that we do not capture any steepening 478 palaeoslopes of feeder rivers located to the South. Instead our data capture, in relative terms, a 479 topographic steady-state within the fluvial fill of the basin despite the evolving tectonic context. One

480 potentially important influence on the slopes of the foreland that has not as yet been explored, is the 481 presence of the Wales-Brabant High bounding the North of the basin (Figure 1c) which would act as a 482 secondary source of the sediment for the rivers of the Pennant. This contribution from the north is 483 consistent with the spread in palaeoflow directions presented earlier (Figure 7). This palaeogeography 484 creates a pronounced contrast in tectonic setting to the Upper Cretaceous rivers of the Sevier fold-485 and-thrust belt that drained directly into the Western Interior Seaway (Lyster et al. 2021) and 486 additional sediment supply from the Wales-Brabant High thus would also have helped to offset any 487 slope increases. Finally, we must also acknowledge that climatic forcing can also influence the 488 morphodyamics of rivers, with slope and sediment supply variations also being coupled directly to 489 river discharge. The presence of abundant vegetation on the banks of the rivers could have acted as 490 a stabilising agent against tectonic forcing. Palaeoclimatic reconstructions (e.g., Opluštil and Cleal 491 2007) however, do not propose significant local climatic variations in the Westphalian and as our data 492 analyses do not show a uni-directional change in palaeohydrological variables or in water discharge, 493 we therefore suggest that the morphodynamics of the Pennant's rivers reflect an equilibrium between 494 accommodation generation and sediment supply within the foreland basin setting.

# 495 Future perspectives and challenges

496 Dominantly qualitative approaches have produced valuable insights into the hydrodynamics of the 497 ancient rivers of the Pennant (e.g., Kelling 1974; Jones 1977; Jones and Hartley 1993) but the methods 498 presented in this study show that a well-constrained quantitative framework can be used to determine 499 hydrodynamic and morphological parameters using easily measurable field data (e.g., cross set 500 heights). This is particularly pertinent where poor outcrop preservation limits architectural mapping 501 but cross sets and grain sizes can be measured. However, it remains critical to consider qualitative and 502 facies-based evidence together where available to validate quantitative reconstructions (e.g., 503 Supplement 3). The combination of methodologies used in this study demonstrates how to tackle this 504 issue in the rock record. Here, reconstructions of hydrodynamics using cross-set and grain size 505 measurements (Leclair and Bridge 2001; Trampush et al. 2014; Bradley and Venditti 2017) are found 506 to provide results in agreement with evidence and observations of, for instance, the heights of 507 accretion packages. The reconstruction of anastomosing and single thread planforms is consistent 508 with facies associations and bedforms previously documented in the Pennant Sandstone (Kelling 1969, 509 1974; Jones and Hartley 1993) but the data in this work also allow us to rule out some reconstructions such as channel depths as great as 15 m (c.f. Jones 1977), which are inconsistent with the scale of the 510 511 dune-scale cross-set heights, and the implied original bedform heights, documented here. Recent 512 theoretical work has continued to improve extraction of quantitative information from fluvial strata

(e.g., Greenberg et al. 2021; Lyster et al. 2022) and further refinements will facilitate reconstructions
in a broader number of ancient fluvial systems to greater resolution than previously possible.

As all the equations used in this study carry forward calculated parameters (e.g., slope calculations implement the previously calculated flow depths), errors and uncertainties are compounded in this type of analysis. This must be addressed carefully and, here, we use a Monte Carlo uncertainty approach to propagate error throughout. Despite this, the greatest confidence remains in parameters calculated early in the methodology, due to the potential for architectural validation (i.e., H) while uncertainty is greater in parameters calculated later in the workflow which require more assumptions to be made (i.e., Q<sub>bf</sub>).

Moving beyond the scope of this study, further detailed work is required to identify and trace 522 523 individual fluvial systems in the Pennant Sandstone, which will serve to better constrain upstream to 524 downstream trends in these rivers and to constrain the pathways of sediment dispersal from the 525 Variscan highlands in the south. Additionally, previous interpretations of wet climatic conditions 526 throughout Pennant deposition, as well as the presence of conglomeratic channel fills and woody 527 debris pointing to the occurrence of floods, could be used to better constrain potential 528 palaeohydrological variability in these systems and the climate drivers behind this (Fielding et al. 2018; 529 Leary and Ganti 2020). Assuming uncertainties are appropriately acknowledged, there is clear potential to apply the methodology used in this study to many more ancient fluvial systems on Earth, 530 531 but also increasingly on other planetary surfaces including Mars, where high resolution imagery 532 increasingly enables grain-sizes, bedforms, and larger scale architectures to be quantified (e.g., Edgar et al. 2018; Davis et al. 2019; Stack et al. 2019; Balme et al. 2020; Mangold et al. 2021). 533

#### 534 Conclusion

535 During the Westphalian stage of the Upper Carboniferous, the Variscan foreland in South Wales was characterised by large fluvial systems with median bankfull discharges of 390-560 m<sup>3</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>, that 536 537 deposited over 1300 m of sediment over a period of approximately 4 Myr. The reconstruction of the 538 ancient fluvial systems of the Pennant Formation presented in this study suggests these rivers had 539 median flow depths of 2–3 m, median slopes of  $4-5 \times 10^{-4}$  (m/m), individual channel thread widths of 540 a few tens of metres, and channel belt widths of 100–200 m — these ancient rivers likely possessed 541 both anastomosing and single-thread reaches. The reconstructed depositional setting is consistent 542 with modern rivers in similar tectonic regimes such as the Ebro and Guadalquivir rivers, Spain, and in 543 climatically similar regions such as the upper Amazon Basin. There is little variation in these key 544 palaeohydrological and morphodynamic variables up-section through the five members of the 545 Pennant.

546 This study provides new insights into river behaviour during the latter stages of supercontinent 547 assembly. Despite rapid subsidence rates in the South Wales foreland basin, little temporal variation is observed in key hydrodynamics and morphodynamics up-section, which implies these ancient fluvial 548 549 systems were relatively stable in a time of intense compressional tectonism. This study of 550 Carboniferous rivers in the UK adds to the growing body of recent work applying quantitative 551 techniques to fluvial strata (e.g., Ganti et al. 2019; Lyster et al. 2021) and builds on the qualitative and 552 facies-based fluvial sedimentological studies undertaken on the Pennant Sandstone. This work 553 demonstrates the utility of reconstructing hydrodynamics and styles of ancient fluvial systems from 554 quantitative field data and could be applied even where facies-based reconstructions are equivocal or 555 where outcrop is limited.

#### 556 Acknowledgements

The authors acknowledge research support from Imperial College London. We thank Gary Hampson and Cedric John for useful feedback on an early version of the manuscript and the reviewers and editor for their comments on the manuscript. This feedback has resulted in a much improved study.

### 560 Author contributions

JW: Data curation (lead), formal analysis (lead), investigation (lead), methodology (lead), visualization (lead), writing – original draft (lead), writing – review and editing (equal); JM: Data curation (supporting), investigation (supporting), writing – review and editing (supporting); SL: Data curation (supporting), formal analysis (supporting), investigation (supporting), methodology (supporting), supervision (equal), writing – review and editing (equal); AW: Data curation (supporting), formal analysis (supporting), investigation (supporting), methodology (supporting), formal analysis (supporting), investigation (supporting), methodology (supporting), supervision (equal), writing – review and editing (equal).

## 568 Data availability

569 All data generated or analysed during this study are included in this published article (and its 570 supplementary information files).

## 571 References

- Allen, J.R.L., 1963. The classification of cross-stratified units, with notes on their origin.
- 573 Sedimentology, 2: 93–114.
- 574
- 575 Allmendinger, R. 2020. Stereonet 11.
- 576 http://www.geo.cornell.edu/geology/faculty/RWA/programs/stereonet.html

577	
578	Baena-Escudero, R., Guerrero-Amador, I., García-Martínez, B., & Carlos Posada-Simeón, J. 2016.
579	Human activities and inundation risks in the plain of the Guadalquivir River (in the reach between
580	palma del río and seville, spain). Boletín de La Asociación de Geógrafos Españoles , 72, 572–534.
581	
582	Balme, M. R., Gupta, S., Davis, J. M., Fawdon, P., Grindrod, P. M., Bridges, J. C., Sefton-Nash, E., &
583	Williams, R. M. E. 2020. Aram Dorsum: An Extensive Mid-Noachian Age Fluvial Depositional System
584	in Arabia Terra, Mars. Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets, 125(5).
585	https://doi.org/10.1029/2019JE006244.
586	
587	Barclay, W.J. 2011. Geology of the Swansea district – a brief explanation of the geological map. Sheet
588	Explanation of the British Geological Survey. 1:50,000 Sheet 247 Swansea (England and Wales).
589	
590	Bhattacharya, J. P., & Tye, R. S. 2004. Searching for Modern Ferron Analogs and Application to
591	Subsurface Interpretation. In Regional to Wellbore Analog for Fluvial-Deltaic Reservoir Modeling: The
592	Ferron Sandstone of Utah (Vol. 50, pp. 39–57). American Association of Petroleum Geologists.
593	
594	Bhattacharya, J. P., Copeland, P., Lawton, T. F., & Holbrook, J. 2016. Estimation of source area, river
595	paleo-discharge, paleoslope, and sediment budgets of linked deep-time depositional systems and
596	implications for hydrocarbon potential. Earth-Science Reviews, 153, 77–110.
597	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earscirev.2015.10.013
598	
599	Bradley, R. W., & Venditti, J. G. 2017. Reevaluating dune scaling relations. In Earth-Science Reviews
600	(Vol. 165, pp. 356–376). Elsevier B.V. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earscirev.2016.11.004
601	
602	Bridge, J. S., & Mackey, S. D. 1992. A Theoretical Study of Fluvial Sandstone Body Dimensions. In The
603	Geological Modelling of Hydrocarbon Reservoirs and Outcrop Analogues (pp. 213–236). John Wiley &
604	Sons, Ltd. <u>https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1002/9781444303957.ch14</u>
605	
606	Bridgland, D.R., Bennett, J.A., McVicar-Wright, S.E. & Scrivener, R.C. 2014. Rivers through geological
607	time: the fluvial contribution to understanding our planet. Proceedings of the Geologists'
608	Association, 125 (5-6). pp. 503-510. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pgeola.2014.11.001
609	

610	Brierley, G. J. 1989. River planform facies models: the sedimentology of braided, wandering and
611	meandering reaches of the Squamish River, British Columbia. Sedimentary Geology, 61(1), 17–35.
612	https://doi.org/10.1016/0037-0738(89)90039-0
613	
614	Burgess, P. M., & Gayer, R. A. 2000. Late Carboniferous tectonic subsidence in South Wales:
615	implications for Variscan basin evolution and tectonic history in SW Britain. Journal of the Geological
616	Society, 157, 93-104, https://doi.org/10.1144/jgs.157.1.93
617	
618	Castelltort, S., Goren, L., Willett, S. D., Champagnac, J. D., Herman, F., & Braun, J. 2012. River
619	drainage patterns in the New Zealand Alps primarily controlled by plate tectonic strain. Nature
620	Geoscience, 5(10), 744–748. https://doi.org/10.1038/ngeo1582
621	
622	Chamberlin, E. P., & Hajek, E. A. 2019. Using bar preservation to constrain reworking in channel-
623	dominated fluvial stratigraphy. <i>Geology</i> , 47(6), 531–534. <u>https://doi.org/10.1130/G46046.1</u>
624	
625	Chow, V.T., 1959, Open-channel hydraulics: New York, McGraw-Hill Book Co., 680pCleal, C. J., &
626	Thomas, B. A. 1992. Lower Westphalian D fossil plants from the Nolton-Newgale Coalfield, Dyfed
627	(Great Britain). <i>Geobios, 25</i> (3), 315–322. https://doi.org/10.1016/0016-6995(92)80002-U
628	
629	Davis, J. M., Gupta, S., Balme, M., Grindrod, P. M., Fawdon, P., Dickeson, Z. I., & Williams, R. M. E.
630	2019. A Diverse Array of Fluvial Depositional Systems in Arabia Terra: Evidence for mid-Noachian to
631	Early Hesperian Rivers on Mars. Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets, 124(7), 1913–1934.
632	https://doi.org/10.1029/2019JE005976
633	
634	Davydov V.I., Korn D., Schmitz M.D., Gradstein F.M. and Hammer O. 2012. The Carboniferous Period.
635	In: Gradstein F.M., Ogg J.G., Schmitz M.D. and Ogg G.M. (eds) The Geologic Time Scale 2012, Volume
636	2. Elsevier, Amsterdam, 603–651.
637	
638	De la Beche, Sir H. 1846. On the formation of rocks of South Wales and South Western England.
639	Memoirs of the Geological Survey. 1. 1-296.
640	
641	Duller, R. A., Whittaker, A. C., Fedele, J. J., Whitchurch, A. L., Springett, J., Smithells, R., Fordyce, S., &
642	Allen, P. A. 2010. From grain size to tectonics. Journal of Geophysical Research: Earth Surface, 115(3).
643	https://doi.org/10.1029/2009JF001495

644	
645	Edgar, L. A., Gupta, S., Rubin, D. M., Lewis, K. W., Kocurek, G. A., Anderson, R. B., Bell, J. F., Dromart,
646	G., Edgett, K. S., Grotzinger, J. P., Hardgrove, C., Kah, L. C., Leveille, R., Malin, M. C., Mangold, N.,
647	Milliken, R. E., Minitti, M., Palucis, M., Rice, M., Williams, A. J. 2018. Shaler: in situ analysis of a
648	fluvial sedimentary deposit on Mars. Sedimentology, 65(1), 96–122.
649	https://doi.org/10.1111/sed.12370
650	
651	Eriksson, P. G., Bumby, A. J., Brümer, J. J., & van der Neut, M. 2006. Precambrian fluvial deposits:
652	Enigmatic palaeohydrological data from the c. 2–1.9 Ga Waterberg Group, South Africa. Sedimentary
653	Geology, 190(1), 25–46. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sedgeo.2006.05.003
654	
655	Evans, B. G. 2004. An introduction to the South Wales Pennant Formation: its origin, outcrop and
656	conservation. Geologica Balcanica, 34.
657	
658	Fielding, C. R., Alexander, J., & Allen, J. P. (2018). The role of discharge variability in the formation
659	and preservation of alluvial sediment bodies. In Sedimentary Geology (Vol. 365, pp. 1–20). Elsevier
660	B.V. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sedgeo.2017.12.022
661	
662	Ganti, V., Lamb, M. P., & McElroy, B. 2014. Quantitative bounds on morphodynamics and
663	implications for reading the sedimentary record. Nature Communications, 5.
664	https://doi.org/10.1038/ncomms4298
665	
666	Ganti, V., Whittaker, A. C., Lamb, M. P., & Fischer, W. W. 2019. Low-gradient, single-threaded rivers
667	prior to greening of the continents. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United
668	States of America, 116(24), 11652–11657. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1901642116
669	
670	Garcia-Castellanos, D. 2002. Interplay between lithospheric flexure and river transport in foreland
671	basins. Basin Research, 14(2), 89–104. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2117.2002.00174.x
672	
673	Gayer, R., & Jones, J. 1989. The Variscan foreland in south Wales. Proceedings of the Ussher Society,
674	7(2), 177–179.
675	
676	Gayer, R., & Pesek, J. 1992. Cannibalisation of coal measures in the south wales coalfield-significance
677	for foreland basin evolution. Proceedings of the Ussher Society, 8, 44-49

678	
679	Gibling, M., & Davies, N. 2021. Palaeozoic landscapes shaped by plant evolution. Nature Geosci 5,
680	99–105. https://doi.org/10.1038/ngeo1376
681	
682	Greenberg, E., Ganti, V., & Hajek, E. 2021. Quantifying bankfull flow width using preserved bar
683	clinoforms from fluvial strata. Geology, 49(9), 1038–1043. https://doi.org/10.1130/G48729.1
684	
685	Hack, J. T. 1957. Studies of longitudinal stream profiles in Virginia and Maryland. Shorter
686	Contributions to General Geology 1956, 294(B), 45-97 https://doi.org/10.3133/pp294B
687	
688	Hajek, E. A., & Heller, P. L. 2012. Flow-depth scaling in alluvial architecture and nonmarine sequence
689	stratigraphy: Example from the Castlegate Sandstone, Central Utah, U.S.A. Journal of Sedimentary
690	Research, 82(2), 121–130. https://doi.org/10.2110/jsr.2012.8
691	
692	Harries, R. M. et al. 2021. Impact of climate on landscape form, sediment transfer and the
693	sedimentary record. Earth Surface Processes and Landforms (2021)
694	https://doi.org/10.1002/esp.5075.
695	
696	Hartley, A. J., & Warr, L. N. 1990. Upper Carboniferous foreland basin evolution in SW Britain.
697	Proceedings of the Ussher Society, 7(3), 212–216.
698	
699	Hjellbakk, A. 1997. Facies and fluvial architecture of a high-energy braided river: the Upper
700	Proterozoic Seglodden Member, Varanger Peninsula, northern Norway. Sedimentary Geology,
701	114(1), 131–161. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0037-0738(97)00075-4
702	
703	Holbrook, J., & Wanas, H. 2014. A fulcrum approach to assessing source-to-sink mass balance using
704	channel paleohydrologic paramaters derivable from common fluvial data sets with an example from
705	the cretaceous of Egypt. Journal of Sedimentary Research, 84(5), 349–372.
706	https://doi.org/10.2110/jsr.2014.29
707	
708	Ielpi, A., Rainbird, R. H., Ventra, D., & Ghinassi, M. 2017. Morphometric convergence between
709	Proterozoic and post-vegetation rivers. Nature Communications, 8(1), 15250.
710	https://doi.org/10.1038/ncomms15250

- Jenkins, T. B. 1962. The Sequence and Correlation of the Coal Measures of Pembrokeshire. *Quarterly Journal of the Geological Society of London*. 118, 65-101.
- 714
- Jones, C. M. 1977. The sedimentology of Carboniferous fluvial and deltaic sequences; the Roaches
  Grit Group of the south-west Pennines and the Pennant Sandstone of the Rhondda Valleys. *PhD Thesis*.
- 718
- Jones, J. A. 1991. A mountain front model for the Variscan deformation of the South Wales coalfield. *Journal of the Geological Society*, *148*(5), 881 LP 891. https://doi.org/10.1144/gsjgs.148.5.0881
- Jones, J. A., & Hartley, A. J. 1993. Reservoir characteristics of a braid-plain depositional system: the
- 723 Upper Carboniferous Pennant Sandstone of South Wales. Geological Society, London, Special
- 724 Publications, 73(1), 143 LP 156. https://doi.org/10.1144/GSL.SP.1993.073.01.09
- 725
- Julien, P. Y., & Klaassen, G. J. 1995. Sand-dune geometry of large rivers during floods. *Journal of Hydraulic Engineering*, *121*(9), 657–663. https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)0733-9429(1995)121:9(657)
- 729 Kelling, G. 1969. The environmental significance of cross stratification parameters in an upper
- 730 Carboniferous fluvial basin. *Journal of Sedimentary Research*, *39*(3), 857–875.
- 731 https://doi.org/10.1306/74D71D52-2B21-11D7-8648000102C1865D
- 732
- 733 Kelling, G. 1974. Upper Carboniferous sedimentation in South Wales. In T. R. Owen (Ed.), *The Upper-*
- 734 *Palaeozoic and Post-Palaeozoic rocks of Wales*, 185–225. University of Wales Press.
- 735
- 736 Leary, K. C. P., & Ganti, V. 2020. Preserved Fluvial Cross Strata Record Bedform Disequilibrium
- 737 Dynamics. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 47(2). https://doi.org/10.1029/2019GL085910
- 738
- 739 Leclair, S. F., & Bridge, J. S. 2001. Quantitative Interpretation of Sedimentary Structures Formed by
- 740 River Dunes. Journal of Sedimentary Research; 71 (5): 713–716. https://doi.org/10.1306/2DC40962-
- 741 0E47-11D7-8643000102C1865D
- 742

743 744 745 746	Leopold, L. B., & Maddock Jr., T. 1953. The hydraulic geometry of stream channels and some physiographic implications. <i>USGS Numbered Series Professional Paper</i> . 252. https://doi.org/10.3133/pp252
747 748 749	Leopold, L. B., & Wolman, M. G. 1960. River meanders. <i>Geological Society of America Bulletin</i> , 71(6), 769–793. https://doi.org/10.1130/0016-7606(1960)71[769:RM]2.0.CO;2
750	Leveridge, B., & Hartley, A. J. 2006. The Variscan Orogeny : the development and deformation of
751	Devonian/Carboniferous basins in SW England and South Wales. In P. J. Brenchley & P. F. Rawson
752 753	(Eds.), <i>The Geology of England and Wales</i> (pp. 225–255). Geological Society of London.
754	Li, Y., Bhattacharya, J. P., Ahmed, S., & Garza, D. 2018. Re-evaluating the paleogeography of the
755	river-dominated and wave-influenced Ferron notom delta, Southern central Utah: An integration of
756	detailed facies-architecture and paleocurrent analysis. Journal of Sedimentary Research, 88(2), 214-
757 758	240. https://doi.org/10.2110/jsr.2018.9
759	Lyster, S. J., Whittaker, A. C., Allison, P. A., Lunt, D. J., & Farnsworth, A. 2020. Predicting sediment
760	discharges and erosion rates in deep time—examples from the late Cretaceous North American
761 762	continent. <i>Basin Research, 32</i> (6), 1547–1573. https://doi.org/10.1111/bre.12442
763	Lyster, S. J., Whittaker, A. C., Hampson, G. J., Hajek, E. A., Allison, P. A., & Lathrop, B. A. 2021.
764	Reconstructing the morphologies and hydrodynamics of ancient rivers from source to sink:
765	Cretaceous Western Interior Basin, Utah, USA. <i>Sedimentology, n/a</i> (n/a).
766	https://doi.org/10.1111/sed.12877
767	
768	Lyster, S.J., Whittaker, A.C. and Hajek, E.A. 2022, Accepted. The problem of Paleo-planforms.
769	Geology
770	
771	Mahon, R.C. and McElroy, B. 2018. Indirect estimation of bedload flux from modern sand-bed rivers
772	and ancient fluvial strata. <i>Geology</i> , 46(7), 579–582, <u>https://doi.org/10.1130/G40161.1</u>

774	Makaske, B. 2001. Anastomosing rivers: a review of their classification, origin and sedimentary
775	products. <i>Earth-Science Reviews</i> (Vol. 53). https://doi.org/10.1016/S0012-8252(00)00038-6
776	

Mangold, N., Gupta, S., Gasnault, O., Dromart, G., Tarnas, J. D., Sholes, S. F., Horgan, B., QuantinNataf, C., Brown, A. J., Mouélic, S. L., Yingst, R. A., Bell, J. F., Beyssac, O., Bosak, T., Calef, F., Ehlmann,
B. L., Farley, K. A., Grotzinger, J. P., Hickman-Lewis, K., ... Williford, K. H. 2021. Perseverance rover
reveals an ancient delta-lake system and flood deposits at Jezero crater, Mars. *Science*, *374*(6568).
https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abl4051

782

- Manning, R., Griffith, J. P., Pigot, T. F., & Vernon-Harcourt, L. F. 1890. On the flow of water in open
  channels and pipes. *Transactions of the Institution of Civil Engineers of Ireland*. Vol XX, 161-207.
- Miall, A. D. 1985. Architectural-element analysis: A new method of facies analysis applied to fluvial
  deposits. *Earth-Science Reviews*, 22(4), 261–308. https://doi.org/10.1016/0012-8252(85)90001-7

788

Michael, N. A., Whittaker, A. C., Carter, A. & Allen, P. A. 2014. Volumetric budget and grain-size
fractionation of a geological sediment routing system: Eocene Escanilla Formation, south-central

791 Pyrenees. GSA Bulletin 126, 585–599. https://doi.org/10.1130/B30954.1

792

- 793 Mohrig, D., Heller, P. L., Paola, C., & Lyons, W. J. 2000. Interpreting avulsion process from ancient
- alluvial sequences: Guadalope-Matarranya system (northern Spain) and Wasatch Formation
- 795 (western Colorado). GSA Bulletin, 112(12), 1787–1803. https://doi.org/10.1130/0016-
- 796 <u>7606(2000)112<1787:IAPFAA>2.0.CO;2</u>
- 797
- Ollero Ojeda, A. 1990. Slope, sinuosity and channel patterns in the Ebro river. *Cuadernos de*
- 799 Investigación Geográfica, 16(0), 73. https://doi.org/10.18172/cig.985

800

Opluštil, S., & Cleal, C. J. 2007. A comparative analysis of some Late Carboniferous basins of Variscan
Europe. *Geological Magazine*, 144(3), 417–448. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0016756807003330

804	Paola, C., & Borgman, L. 1991. Reconstructing random topography from preserved stratification.
805	Sedimentology, 38(4), 553–565. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-3091.1991.tb01008.x
806	
807	Paola, C., & Mohrig, D. 1996. Palaeohydraulics revisited: palaeoslope estimation in coarse-grained
808	braided rivers. <i>Basin Research, 8</i> (3), 243–254. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2117.1996.00253.x
809	
810	Parker, G. 1976. On the cause and characteristic scales of meandering and braiding in rivers. Journal
811	of Fluid Mechanics, 76(3), 457–480. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022112076000748
812	
813	Plink-Bjorklund, P. 2015. Morphodynamics of rivers strongly affected by monsoon precipitation:
814	Review of depositional style and forcing factors. Sedimentary Geology, 323.
815	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sedgeo.2015.04.004
816	
817	Rasband, W. S. 2018. ImageJ. https://imagej.nih.gov/ij/
818	
819	Rippon, J. H. 1996. Sand body orientation, palaeoslope analysis and basin-fill implications in the
820	Westphalian A–C of Great Britain. Journal of the Geological Society, 153(6), 881–900.
821	https://doi.org/10.1144/gsjgs.153.6.0881
822	
823	Sadler, P. M. 1981. Sediment Accumulation Rates and the Completeness of Stratigraphic Sections.
824	The Journal of Geology, 89(5), 569–584. https://doi.org/10.1086/628623
825	
826	Scotese, C. R. 2001. Atlas of Earth History, Volume 1, Paleogeography. PALAEOMAP Project.
827	
828	Sharma, S., Bhattacharya, J. P., & Richards, B. 2017. Source-to-sink sediment budget analysis of the
829	Cretaceous Ferron Sandstone, Utah, U.S.A, using the fulcrum approach. Journal of Sedimentary
830	Research, 87(6), 594–608. https://doi.org/10.2110/jsr.2017.23
831	
832	Shibata, K., Adhiperdana, B. G., & Ito, M. 2018. Quantitative reconstruction of cross-sectional
833	dimensions and hydrological parameters of gravelly fluvial channels developed in a forearc basin

834 835 836	setting under a temperate climatic condition, central Japan. <i>Sedimentary Geology, 363</i> , 69–82. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sedgeo.2017.10.014
837 838 839 840	Sombroek, W. 2001. Spatial and temporal patterns of Amazon rainfall: Consequences for the planning of agricultural occupation and the protection of primary forests. <i>Ambio</i> , <i>30</i> (7), 388–396. https://doi.org/10.1579/0044-7447-30.7.388
841 842 843 844 845 846	Stack, K. M., Grotzinger, J. P., Lamb, M. P., Gupta, S., Rubin, D. M., Kah, L. C., Edgar, L. A., Fey, D. M., Hurowitz, J. A., McBride, M., Rivera-Hernández, F., Sumner, D. Y., van Beek, J. K., Williams, R. M. E., & Aileen Yingst, R. 2019. Evidence for plunging river plume deposits in the Pahrump Hills member of the Murray formation, Gale crater, Mars. <i>Sedimentology</i> , <i>66</i> (5), 1768–1802. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/sed.12558</u>
847 848 849	Strahan, A. 1899. The geology of the South Wales Coalfield. Part I. The country around Newport, Monmouthshire. 1st edit. <i>Memoirs of the Geological Survey</i> . 249.
850 851 852 853	Straub, K. M., Duller, R. A., Foreman, B. Z., & Hajek, E. A. 2020. Buffered, Incomplete, and Shredded: The Challenges of Reading an Imperfect Stratigraphic Record. <i>Journal of Geophysical Research: Earth</i> <i>Surface</i> , <i>125</i> (3). <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/2019JF005079</u>
854 855 856 857	Trampush, S. M., Huzurbazar, S., & McElroy, B. 2014. Empirical assessment of theory for bankfull characteristics of alluvial channels. <i>Water Resources Research</i> , <i>50</i> (12), 9211–9220. <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/2014WR015597</u>
858 859 860 861	van Rijn, L. C. 1984. Sediment Transport, Part III: Bed forms and Alluvial Roughness. <i>Journal of Hydraulic Engineering</i> , <i>110</i> (12), 1733–1754. <u>https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)0733-</u> 9429(1984)110:12(1733)
862 863 864	Waters, C. N., Browne, M. A., Dean, M. T., & Powell, J. H. 2007. Lithostratigraphical framework for Carboniferous successions of Great Britain (Onshore). <i>British Geological Survey</i> .

865 866 867	Waters, C. N., Waters, R. A., Barclay, W. J., & Davies, J. R. 2009. A lithostratigraphical framework for the Carboniferous successions of southern Great Britain (onshore). <i>British Geological Survey</i> .
868 869 870	Wentworth, C. K. 1922. A Scale of Grade and Class Terms for Clastic Sediments. <i>The Journal of Geology</i> , <i>30</i> (5), 377–392.
871 872 873	Whittaker, A. C. 2012. How do landscapes record tectonics and climate? <i>Lithosphere</i> , <i>4</i> (2), 160–164. <u>https://doi.org/10.1130/RF.L003.1</u>
874 875 876 877	Williams, G. P. 1984. Paleohydrological Methods and Some Examples from Swedish Fluvial Environments II—River Meanders. <i>Geografiska Annaler: Series A, Physical Geography</i> , 66(1–2), 89– 102. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/04353676.1984.11880101</u>
878 879 880	Wolman, G. M. 1954. A method of sampling coarse river-bed material. <i>American Geophysical Union</i> , 35(6).
881 882 883 884	Woodland, A. W., Evans, W. B., & Stephens, J. v. 1957. Classification of the Coal Measures of South Wales with special reference to the Upper Coal Measures. <i>Bulletin of the Geological Survey of Great Britain. No. 13.</i> , 6-13.
885 886 887 888	Xu, J., Snedden, J. W., Galloway, W. E., Milliken, K. T., & Blum, M. D. 2017. Channel-belt scaling relationship and application to early Miocene source-to-sink systems in the Gulf of Mexico basin. <i>Geosphere</i> , <i>13</i> (1), 179–200. https://doi.org/10.1130/GES01376.1
889 890 891	Yalin, M. S. 1964. Geometrical Properties of Sand Waves. <i>Journal of Hydraulic Engineering, 90</i> , 105–119.
892	Figure Captions
893 894 895	Fig. 1 – (a) Location map showing the extent of the Pennant Sandstone Formation in South Wales, UK. (b) Geological map of the primary study area, the South Wales Coalfield with field sites shown (excludes Pembrokeshire localities). Contains British Geological Survey materials ©UKRI 2021. (c)

- Simplified paleogeographic reconstruction of England and Wales in the Westphalian Stage. Modified
  after Burgess and Gayer (2001) and Opluštil and Cleal (2007).
- 898 Fig. 2 Stratigraphy of the Pennant Sandstone Formation, correlated across the Neath Disturbance

899 (major N-S trending Caledonoid fault). Major named coal seams are indicated. Approximate

stratigraphic interval of this study's field sites also shown. Modified after (Barclay 2011) with age

- 901 data from BGS Geological Timechart.
- 902 Fig. 3 Selected field photographs. (a-d) Cross-sets of the Pennant Sandstone (a-b = Rhondda
- 903 Member, c-d = Brithdir Member). (**b & d**) Interpreted cross-sets in photos (**a & c**). Cyan lines show
- 904 where height measurements were taken for distributions, red lines show where cross-set height
- 905 maxima were measured. (e) Grain size photograph of medium sand fraction, D50 = 0.375 mm. (f)
- 906 Grain size photograph of conglomeratic lag in the Pennant Sandstone Formation, D50 = 9 mm.
- 907 Fig. 4 Selected photographs and architectural interpretations of field localities of each member of
- 908 the Pennant Sandstone. Note channel and accretion packages are not distinguished here but
- package type was noted at each example. (a & b) Swansea Member; (c & d) Hughes Member; (e & f)
- 910 Brithdir Member; (**g & h**) Rhondda Member; (**I & j**) Llynfi Member.
- 911 Fig. 5 Plots of measured mean cross-set height from distributions (n = 268) against maximum cross
- 912 set heights, separated into (a) plot of data from all Pennant Sandstone Formation and (b) plot of
- 913 data separated by member within the formation. Scaling relationships are derived from a linear
- 914 regression through the origin of the dataset.
- 915 Fig. 6 Boxplots of palaeohydrological characteristics of the rivers of the Pennant Sandstone
- 916 Formation and each of its members. Every cross-set measured in each member is represented in the
- 917 median and interquartile range of each plot. Conglomerate fraction indicated by blue cross (no
- 918 conglomerate present in Brithdir Member). Median package height for each member is indicated as
- 919 green cross on flow depth plots.
- 920 Fig. 7 Palaeocurrent rose diagrams using field data from each field site in the (a) South Wales
- 921 Coalfield and (b) Pembrokeshire Coalfield. Although there is variability with some northwards
- 922 directed currents, flow is predominantly to the west in the Pennant Sandstone Formation (11/18
- 923 localities). It is also unclear if our localities of the same member represent the same fluvial system.
- 924 Fig. 8 Trampush et al. (2014) palaeoslope boxplots for each locality arranged by longitude showing
- 925 possible downstream trend in palaeoslope. Pemb. = Pembrokeshire Coalfield. Legend as Fig. 6. Note.
- field sites in each member are not known to be of the same fluvial system. Swansea member is not
- 927 included here as field sites do not show sufficient spatial variation.

- 928 Fig. 9 Summary of single-thread and channel belt widths and discharges in the Pennant Sandstone
- 929 Formation. (a) Widths calculated using the methods of Jones (1977; error = interquartile range),
- 930 Greenberg et al. (2021; error = standard error of Eq. 6), and the outcrop width. Arranged by locality,
- 931 west-east. (**b-d**) Cumulative frequency plots of water discharge assuming widths shown here and
- 932 unit discharges (Figure 6d) for each member. (b) Single-thread discharges using Greenberg et al.
- 933 (2021). (c) Channel belt discharge using outcrop width. (d) Channel belt discharge using Jones (1977)
- width.
- 935 Fig. 10 Plot predicting the fluvial style of the Pennant Sandstone Formation. Plot of H/W against
- 936 S/Fr using width estimates from Greenberg et al. (2021) and the outcrop width. Stability fields for
- 937 single- and multi-threaded systems of Parker (1976; grey dashed line) and Lyster et al. (2022;
- 938 red/green dashed lines) are shown.
- Fig. 11 Photographs of *Lepidodendron* wood preserved as clasts in conglomeratic horizons of the
  Llynfi Member at Kilvey Hill, Swansea (Supplement 1). In places fossils exceed 1 m along their long
  axis and are found in distinct sedimentary packages, in places forming clast-supported deposits of
  wood clasts.
- Fig. 12 Graphical representation of the ancient rivers of the Pennant Sandstone. (a) Mean singlethread channel cross section. (b) Average planform morphology. Note: single-threaded river sections
  also exist but are not represented here. (c) Longitudinal cross-section showing mean flow depths,
  dune heights and palaeoslopes. Note: slope is heavily exaggerated.









Accretion/channel packages Accr

Accretion/bedding surfaces

Vegetation

<u>\*</u>



# Click here to access/download;figure;Figure 5 - Mean-Max Relations.pdf









±











supplementary material

Click here to access/download **supplementary material** Rivers of the Variscan Foreland - Supplementary Information.docx supplementary material - field data

Click here to access/download supplementary material Field Data.xlsx supplementary material - field localities KMZ

Click here to access/download supplementary material doc.kml supplementary figure - S1 - Scaling verification

Click here to access/download supplementary material Figure S1 - Scaling Verification.pdf supplementary figure - S2 - facies rose diagrams

Click here to access/download **supplementary material** Figure S2 - Facies Rose Diagrams.pdf supplementary material - ks tests full

Click here to access/download supplementary material KS tests.xlsx

# THE PROBLEM OF PALEO-PLANFORMS

Sinéad J. Lyster<sup>1</sup>, Alexander C. Whittaker<sup>1</sup> and Elizabeth A. Hajek<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Earth Science & Engineering, Imperial College London, UK. <sup>2</sup>Department of Geosciences, The Pennsylvania State University, USA. \*s.lyster17@imperial.ac.uk

Manuscript received: 15 November 2021

Revised manuscript received: 5 February 2022

Manuscript accepted: 9 February 2022

DOI: 10.1130/G49867.1

# ABSTRACT

Reconstructing river planform is crucial to understanding ancient fluvial systems on Earth and other planets. Paleo-planform is typically interpreted from qualitative facies interpretations of fluvial strata, but these can be inconsistent with quantitative approaches. We tested three well-known hydraulic planform predictors in Cretaceous fluvial strata (in Utah, USA) where there is a faciesderived consensus on paleo-planform. However, the results of each predictor are inconsistent with facies interpretations and with each other. We found that one of these predictors is analytically best suited for geologic application but favors single-thread planforms. Given that this predictor was originally tested using just 53 data points from natural rivers, we compiled a new data set of hydraulic geometries in natural rivers (n = 1688), which spanned >550 globally widespread, sandand gravel-bed rivers from various climate and vegetative regimes. We found that the existing criteria misclassified 65% of multithread rivers in our data set, but modification resulted in a useful predictor. We show that depth/width (H/W) ratio alone is sufficient to discriminate single-thread (H/W > 0.02) and multithread (H/W < 0.02) rivers, suggesting bank cohesion may be a critical determinant of planform. Further, we show that the slope/Froude (S/Fr) ratio is useful to discriminate process in multithread rivers; i.e., whether generation of new threads is an avulsiondominated (anastomosing) or bifurcation-dominated (braided) process. Multithread rivers are likely to be anastomosing when S/Fr < 0.003 (shallower slopes) and braided when S/Fr > 0.003 (steeper slopes). Our criteria successfully discriminate planform in modern rivers and our geologic examples, and they offer an effective approach to predict planform in the geologic past on Earth and on other planets.