Expansion and intensification of the North American Monsoon during the Pliocene

Tripti Bhattacharya,^{1*} Ran Feng,² Jessica Tierney,³ Claire Rubbelke ¹ Natalie Burls,⁴Scott Knapp,⁴ Minmin Fu⁵

¹Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Syracuse University, Syracuse NY
 ²Department of Geosciences, University of Connecticut, Storrs CT
 ³Department of Geosciences, University of Arizona, Tucson AZ
 ⁴Department of Atmospheric, Oceanic and Earth Sciences, George Mason University, Fairfax VA
 ⁵Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA

*To whom correspondence should be addressed; E-mail: trbhatta@syr.edu.

This paper is a non-peer reviewed preprint submitted to EarthArXiv.It will be updated as the manuscript progresses through peer review.

Expansion and intensification of the North American Monsoon during the Pliocene

Tripti Bhattacharya ¹, Ran Feng ², Jessica E. Tierney ³, Claire Rubbelke, ¹, Natalie Burls ⁴, Scott Knapp ⁴, Minmin Fu ⁵

5	¹ Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Syracuse University, Syracuse NY
6	² Department of Geosciences, University of Connecticut, Storrs CT
7	³ Department of Geosciences, University of Arizona, Tucson AZ
8	⁴ Department of Atmospheric, Oceanic and Earth Sciences, George Mason University, Fairfax VA
9	⁵ Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA

Key Points:

1

2

10

11	• Leaf wax hydrogen isotopes preserved in ocean sediments reveal evidence of a stronger
12	mid-Pliocene monsoon in southwestern North America
13	• Isotope-enabled simulations show that a stronger monsoon resulted from an amplified
14	east Pacific subtropical-tropical temperature gradient
15	• This mechanism is relevant to understanding present-day monsoon variability in response
16	to California margin marine heat waves

Corresponding author: Tripti Bhattacharya, trbhatta@syr.edu

17 Abstract

Southwestern North America, like many subtropical regions, is predicted to become drier in 18 response to anthropogenic warming. However, during the Pliocene, when carbon dioxide was 19 above pre-industrial levels, multiple lines of evidence suggest that southwestern North Amer-20 ica was much wetter. While existing explanations for a wet Pliocene invoke increases in win-21 ter rain, recent modeling studies hypothesize that summer rain may have also played an im-22 portant role. Here, we present the first direct evidence for an intensified Pliocene monsoon in 23 southwestern North America using leaf wax hydrogen isotopes. These new records provide 24 evidence that the Pliocene featured an intensified and expanded North American Monsoon. Us-25 ing proxies and isotope-enabled model simulations, we show that monsoon intensification is 26 linked to amplified warming on the southern California margin relative to the tropical Pacific. 27 This mechanism has clear relevance for understanding present-day monsoon variations, since 28 we show that intervals of amplified subtropical warming on the California margin, as are seen 29 during modern California margin heat waves, are associated with a stronger monsoon. Since 30 marine heat waves are predicted to increase in frequency, the future may bring intervals of 'Pliocene-31 like' rainfall that co-exist with intensifying megadrought in southwestern North America, with 32 implications for ecosystems, human infrastructure, and water resources. 33

³⁴ Plain Language Summary

The middle Pliocene, an interval approximately 3 million years ago, has long puzzled 35 climate scientists. Despite having higher-than-preindustrial carbon dioxide levels, which should 36 result in drier conditions in subtropical regions, some subtropical regions were wet during the 37 Pliocene. In southwestern North America, there were large permanent lakes and plant and an-38 imal species that cannot exist in arid regions. We used measurements of hydrogen isotopes 39 in ancient plant matter to show that wet conditions in the Pliocene southwest resulted from 40 a stronger monsoon. This stronger monsoon was caused by changes in subtropical and trop-41 ical ocean temperatures in the eastern Pacific. This study presents the first direct evidence that 42 monsoon changes caused wet conditions in the middle Pliocene. It also has relevance for the 43 present, since we find evidence that present-day changes in subtropical ocean temperatures can 44 amplify the monsoon, via a mechanism that strongly resembles what happened in the Pliocene. 45 Our study suggests that further studies of the Pliocene can shed light on how future monsoon 46 changes may influence wildfire, landscapes, and water resources across the southwest. 47

-2-

48 Introduction

Multiple lines of evidence suggest that southwestern North America (SWNA), like many 49 subtropical continents, was much wetter during the Pliocene epoch, a climate interval featur-50 ing reduced ice volume and CO_2 concentrations above preindustrial levels (Figure 1). Sedi-51 mentological data documents widespread perennial and ephemeral lakes in southern Califor-52 nia and Arizona (M. Pound et al., 2014; Ibarra et al., 2018) (Figure 1), and palynological and 53 macrobotanical evidence from southern California suggests expanded tree cover and the pres-54 ence of species that today only grow in regions with mesic conditions and summer rainfall (Remeika 55 et al., 1988; Ballog & Malloy, 1981). Faunal remains from Baja California contain Crocody-56 lus spp. fossils, which require freshwater habitats, further suggesting increased water resources 57 in regions that are arid at present (Salzmann et al., 2009; Miller, 1980). At face value, this ev-58 idence for a wet Pliocene is at odds with the theoretical and model-derived prediction that re-59 gions like SWNA, and subtropical continents more broadly, will continue to dry in coming cen-60 turies as a result of elevated greenhouse gases (Byrne & O'Gorman, 2015; Seager et al., 2010). 61

Two dominant hypotheses have been proposed to explain the evidence for wet condi-62 tions in SWNA during the Pliocene. On a global scale, a dramatically weaker meridional sea 63 surface temperature (SST) gradient could have weakened mean atmospheric circulation and 64 reduced subtropical moisture divergence (Burls & Fedorov, 2017; A. V. Fedorov et al., 2015). 65 However, current proxy-based estimates of SST patterns suggest that reductions in Pliocene 66 meridional gradients were modest (Tierney et al., 2019). Another possibility is that a weaker 67 Pacific Walker circulation shifted winter storm tracks, bringing increased moisture to SWNA, 68 similar to what occurs during El Niño events today (Ibarra et al., 2018; Molnar & Cane, 2002). 69 However, this hypothesis would require almost two-fold increases in winter rainfall to explain 70 Pliocene lake distributions, and cannot explain the presence of tree species like Castanea and 71 Carya or the expansion of Sonoran desert flora, which are interpreted as indicators of sum-72 mer rainfall (Ibarra et al., 2018; Ballog & Malloy, 1981; Axelrod, 1948). At face value, these 73 qualitative data suggest a role for the North American Monsoon (NAM), which is the primary 74 source of summer rainfall in the SWNA and maintains the floristically diverse ecosystems of 75 the Sonoran Desert (Cook & Seager, 2013). Today, the NAM is restricted to southern Arizona, 76 New Mexico and northwestern Mexico along the eastern side of the Gulf of California. 77

A recent modeling study found that warm coastal temperatures on the California mar gin, similar to those observed in Pliocene proxy records, results in an expansion of summer

-3-

rainfall across SWNA (Fu et al., 2022). In these simulations, precipitation rates associated with
a stronger monsoon exceed evaporation. If these changes are realistic, they suggest that monsoon changes alone could explain the mesic vegetation and high lake levels found in the Pliocene.
However, the hypothesis that the NAM was stronger during the Pliocene, a greenhouse climate
interval, is at odds with some model predictions of how the NAM responds to higher atmos
spheric greenhouse gases (Pascale et al., 2017).

While current-generation models do not show consensus about the response of the NAM 86 to contemporary warming (Maloney et al., 2014; Meyer & Jin, 2017; Cook & Seager, 2013; 87 Almazroui et al., 2021; Moon & Ha, 2020), a recent high-resolution modeling study with a 88 bias-corrected SST field suggests that the NAM will weaken in response to 21st century warm-89 ing. In this simulation, the NAM strength responds to the relative warming of SST in the subtropical eastern Pacific (e.g. southern California Margin) (Pascale et al., 2017). Specifically, 91 because the southern California margin warms at a slower rate than the tropical eastern equa-92 torial Pacific (EEP), SWNA experiences stronger descending motion and greater atmospheric 93 stability, reducing NAM convection. This strong sensitivity to SST gradients distinguishes the 94 NAM from other monsoons, which respond more strongly to direct CO_2 forcing. This con-95 ceptual model, similar to the 'warmer-get-wetter' paradigm (Xie et al., 2010), suggests that 96 past and future NAM strength depends less on the absolute magnitude of warming on the south-97 ern California Margin, as suggested by (Fu et al., 2022), but instead depends on the gradient 98 of temperature between the subtropical eastern Pacific and the tropical eastern Pacific. 99

In light of this uncertainty, continuous Plio-Pleistocene, summer rainfall-sensitive proxy 100 records are invaluable for identifying the mechanisms that control long-term changes in NAM 101 rainfall. However, much of our existing proxy evidence from the Pliocene consists of non-continuous 102 snapshots of Pliocene climate, or proxies that can only be interpreted in a purely qualititative 103 framework. Here, we remedy this by presenting the first continuous Plio-Pleistocene records 104 of NAM region hydroclimate, based on leaf wax biomarkers in two marine sediment cores. 105 DSDP 475 is located near the tip of southern Baja California, immediately west of the core 106 modern NAM domain. Our second site, ODP 1012 is on the CA margin, northwest of the NAM 107 domain in the present climatology, and receives virtually no monsoon rainfall today. Together, 108 these sites are especially sensitive to hydroclimate changes in the core monsoon domain (DSDP 109 475), as well as any potential expansion of the monsoon into peripheral zones (ODP 1012). 110 Previous work has shown that the hydrogen isotopic signature of terrestrial plant epicuticu-111 lar waxes (δD_{wax}) reflects the δD signature of precipitation (δD_p) across a range of ecosys-112

-4-

tem types (Sachse et al., 2012), and in SWNA, leaf wax δD is strongly sensitive to the rel-

ative contribution of monsoonal deep convection to annual rainfall totals (Bhattacharya et al.,

¹¹⁵ 2018). This proxy is therefore well-suited for investigating whether summer rainfall played

¹¹⁶ a role in driving Plio-Pleistocene hydroclimatic change. Carbon isotopes provide complemen-

tary information by recording shifts in ecosystem composition that influence the magnitude

of the offsets between δD_{wax} and δD_p (Figure S1). Our approach therefore allows us to iden-

tify changes in monsoon strength and spatial extent over the Plio-Pleistocene.

120 Materials and Methods

121 Site Background

DSDP 475 (23.03°N, 109.03°W) is located within the Gulf of California near the south-122 eastern edge of the peninsula of Baja California (Figure 1). Today, the site sits on a passive 123 continental margin at a water depth of 2631 meters (Curray et al., 1982). This region of Baja 124 California experiences northwesterly wind stress in winter and spring (Zaytsev et al., 2003). 125 In summer, the region around DSDP 475 is influenced by northward advection of waters from 126 the eastern Pacific warm pool (Zaytsev et al., 2003; Durazo & Baumgartner, 2002). The Plio-127 Pleistocene portion of the core from DSDP 475 is predominantly composed of hemipelagic 128 muds, transitioning to diatomaceous muds in the mid- to early-Pliocene section, showing ev-129 idence of a consistent marine setting for this site from the early Pliocene through the Pleis-130 tocene (Curray et al., 1982). Age control primarily comes from biostratigraphic tiepoints (Brennan 131 et al., accepted). 132

ODP 1012 (32.3°N,118.4°W) is located on the California Margin, in the east Cortes Basin, 133 with a water depth of 1772 m. This site experiences northwesterly wind stress year round. The 134 sedimentary section consists of interbedded silty clay, nannofossil mixed sediment, nannofos-135 sil ooze (Ostertag-Henning & Stax, 2000). We sample from primarily from core 1012A, with 136 supplementary samples from 1012B in the late Pleistocene, to generate composite Plio-Pleistocene 137 record of climate change. The age model, previously published in (J. LaRiviere, 2007), is based 138 on δ^{18} O of benthic foraminifera until approximately 1.8 Ma, and thereafter based on biostrati-139 graphic tiepoints (T. Herbert et al., 2001). 140

141 Leaf Wax Extraction and Measurement

Approximately 100 samples were processed from each of DSDP 475 and ODP 1012, so that the average time interval between samples was 40 kyr for DSDP 475 and 30 kyr for ODP 1012. Leaf waxes were processed via standard protocols involving extraction of the total lipid extract (TLE) and purification via column chromatography (see Text S1 for more details). Following previous work in the region, we focus our analyses on the C₃₀ fatty acid, which exclusively derives from terrestrial plants (Bhattacharya et al., 2018).

 $_{148}$ Concentrations of C₃₀ FAMEs, fatty acid methyl esters, were determined using a Trace

1310 GC-FID, and their hydrogen and carbon isotopic composition were measured via gas chromatography-

¹⁵⁰ pyrolysis-isotope ratio mass spectrometry (GC-IR-MS) using a Thermo Delta V Plus mass spec-

trometer coupled to a Trace 1310 GC-FID. H₂ and CO₂ gases calibrated to an *n*-alkane stan-

dard (A7 mix provided by Arndt Schimmelmann at Indiana University) provided references

for each analysis. An internal isotopic standard consisting of a synthetic mix of FAMEs was

analyzed every 5-7 samples to monitor drift. Samples were run in triplicate for δD to obtain

a precision better than 2% (1 σ), and in duplicate or triplicate for δ^{13} C to obtain a precision

better than 0.2% (1 σ). Further details on analytical methods are available in Text S1.

157

Inference of Precipitation δD

We leverage paired measurements of carbon and hydrogen isotopes of the C_{30} fatty acid 158 (hereafter, referred to as $\delta^{13}C_{wax} \ \delta D_{wax}$) to infer the hydrogen isotopic signature of precip-159 itation, or δD_p . δD_{wax} values are offset from the hydrogen isotopic signature of the environ-160 mental waters, assumed to be the isotopic value of mean annual precipitation or δD_p . This ap-161 parent fractionation or ε_{p-w} varies across plant clades. Graminoids (e.g. grasses) tend to have 162 a larger ε_{p-w} , or are more depleted relative to δD_p , than eudicots (Gao et al., 2014) (see Text 163 S1). Following previous work, we use $\delta^{13}C_{wax}$ and a Bayesian mixing model (Tierney et al., 164 2017) to infer the proportion of waxes that come from C_4 grasses in each sample. End-member 165 constraints on C4 grasses and C3 eudicots come from modern plant waxes measured at the Arizona-166 Sonora Desert Museum in Tucson, AZ (Text S1). We then use the proportion of inferred C_4 167 vegetation to determine the appropriate ε_{p-w} to apply to a given sample. Constraints on ε_{p-w} 168 are obtained from δD_{wax} measured on the Arizona-Sonora Desert Museum modern plants. Fi-169 nally, our weighted value of ε_{p-w} is used to infer δD_p (see Text S1). Because all calculations 170 are performed in a Bayesian framework, uncertainties are propagated through all steps of the 171

calculation. This approach has been extensively used to study paleohydrological signals in leaf
waxes (Tierney et al., 2017; Windler et al., 2021), including within the NAM domain (Bhattacharya
et al., 2018).

175 SST Compilation

To identify relationships between leaf wax-inferred δD_p and Plio-Pleistocene changes in large-scale circulation over the north Pacific, we compiled available continuous alkenonebased records of Plio-Pleistocene temperatures from the northeast Pacific. Records were calibrated using BAYSPLINE, a Bayesian calibration that accounts for the attenuation of the relationship between the alkenone unsaturation index and temperature at warmer temperatures (Tierney & Tingley, 2018).

We calculate three indices of Plio-Pleistocene SSTs. First, we calculate average eastern 182 equatorial Pacific SST by taking the mean SST anomaly of sites in the eastern equatorial Pa-183 cific including sites IODP U1337, ODP 847, ODP 846, and ODP 1239 (Liu et al., 2019; Dekens 184 et al., 2007; Seki et al., 2012; Rousselle et al., 2013; Shaari et al., 2013; Etourneau et al., 2010; 185 T. D. Herbert et al., 2016; Lawrence et al., 2006). This excludes extremely low resolution records 186 or records that do not extend to 3.6 Ma (e.g. IODP U1338). Next, we calculate average south-187 ern California margin SSTs by taking the average anomaly at sites ODP 1012, ODP 1014, and 188 ODP 1010 (J. P. LaRiviere et al., 2012; J. LaRiviere, 2007; Brierley et al., 2009b; Dekens et 189 al., 2007), also excluding sites with alkenone records that do not extend to 3.6 Ma (e.g. site 190 475). Finally, we calculate an index of the subtropical/tropical gradient in the eastern Pacific 191 by subtracting tropical eastern equatorial Pacific SSTs from subtropical southern California 192 Margin SST. This index helps quantify the relative warmth on the southern California mar-193 gin, and is between -7 and -8 in the present-day climatology. 194

195

Isotope-Enabled Model Simulations

To investigate the drivers of SWNA δD_p changes during the Pliocene, we analyzed simulations conducted with the isotopologue-tracking enabled Community Earth System Model 1.2 (iCESM1.2) in atmosphere-only mode (e.g. iCAM5) (Brady et al., 2019). The atmospheric model is run at a 0.9°x1.25° horizontal resolution, with 30 vertical layers. The pre-industrial simulation of iCESM1.2 used in this study captures a similar seasonal cycle of water isotopes compared to GNIP observations, with an enriched summer monsoon compared to depleted winter rainfall (Figure S6), despite the fact that iCESM1.2's rainfall isotopes are depleted com-

-7-

manuscript submitted to AGU Advances

pared to observations at Tucson's GNIP station (Nusbaumer et al., 2017). In addition, iCAM5
 performs slightly better than other models at simulating rainfall isotope changes due to chang ing stratiform fraction (Hu et al., 2018).

We prescribe the idealized SST field used in (Fu et al., 2022), which is based on the PRISM3 SST reconstruction (Dowsett et al., 2009), but increases temperatures on the Southern California Margin to match proxy evidence. All other boundary conditions (e.g. topography, land surface conditions), including CO₂, are kept at pre-industrial values. This simplified experimental design allows us to cleanly isolate the influence of an altered SST field on SW NA hydroclimate.

We also perform 6 additional iCAM5 simulations with different SST patterns and Pliocene 212 boundary conditions in order to better understand the drivers of NAM changes. These sim-213 ulations featured two types of experiments: in one, we uniformly warm global SSTs without 214 changing the subtropical/tropical gradient in the eastern Pacific. In the other, we incrementally 215 reduce the subtropical/tropical gradient by warming the CA coast. These two sets of exper-216 iments compares whether uniform warming of tropical/subtropical ocean, or changing warm-217 ing structure is more important to drive NAM changes, and should be regarded as sensitivity 218 tests. Simulations are run for 40 years and the last 20 years of model runs are averaged to gen-219 erate climatologies. It should also be noted that all simulations have fixed atmospheric CO_2 220 concentrations to Pliocene levels of 400 ppm, resulting in a warmer troposphere with higher 22. evaporative demand. For further details, see Text S1 and Table S4. 222

223 Results and Discussion

Plio-Pleistocene Trajectory of δD_p in SWNA

Our new leaf wax-based reconstructions of δD_p indicate a large shift in SWNA hydro-225 climate between 3.0 and 2.4 Ma, right at the Plio-Pleistocene transition and coinciding with 226 the intensification of Northern Hemisphere glaciation (Figure 1). At site 1012, δD_p is ca. -20 227 to -40% between 3.5 and 3.0 Ma and then declines to ca. -50 to -60% by 2.5 Ma. Af-228 ter this point, δD_p fluctuates between -65 and -45%. A similar pattern of change is recorded 229 at DSDP 475. At this site, Pliocene values of δD_p range between -45 and -35%, 20 to 35%230 more enriched than late Pleistocene values. The most enriched values of δD_p occur between 231 3.5 and 2.9 Ma (Figure 1), after which inferred δD_p values progressively decline until 2.4 Ma. 232 Thereafter, values of δD_p at site 475 show an increase in variability. The increase in variabil-233

ity in the Pleistocene portion of both records likely reflect glacial-interglacial variability. Southward shifts in the westerlies during glacial periods weaken the NAM by promoting 'ventilation' or the import of cold, dry air into the monsoon domain (Bhattacharya et al., 2018).

The similar trajectory of δD_p change over the Plio-Pleistocene transition at both sites suggests that our δD_p reconstructions reflect large-scale reorganizations of hydroclimate rather than any local topographic effects. Furthermore, independent evidence suggests that topography in western North America was already sufficiently high to establish modern circulation patterns and block Gulf of Mexico moisture, making it unlikely that Pliocene δD_p changes reflect an increasing contribution of easterly moisture sources from the Atlantic to coastal regions of Baja and southern California (Mix et al., 2019; Wheeler et al., 2016).

We interpret the enrichment of δD_p in the Pliocene relative to late Pleistocene values 244 as reflecting a greater proportion of convective summer rainfall during this epoch. Summer 245 monsoon rainfall forms from vapor that is rapidly lifted from a warm, saturated boundary in 246 strong convective updrafts (Text S1; Figure S2). This results in an enriched isotopic signature 247 relative to winter moisture, which primarily derives from stratiform precipitation (Aggarwal 248 et al., 2016) (Figure S2). This interpretation differs from the so-called 'amount-effect' observed 249 in other parts of the tropics, but reflects the distinct climatology of the NAM region, which 250 features a high proportion of stratiform rainfall in comparison to the monsoon regions (e.g. 251 the Indian monsoon) (Schumacher & Houze, 2003). 252

Further support for the view that fluctuations in δD_p reflect proportions of convective 253 and stratiform rainfall comes from the fact that spatial gradients in modern coretop leaf wax-254 inferred δD_p in the Gulf of California show a strong positive correlation with the fraction of 255 rainfall derived from deep convection (Figure S2). Increasing proportions of deep convection 256 in the region stretching from Baja California to the southern California margin can therefore 257 explain a more positive leaf wax δD_p signature during the Pliocene. This complements the ar-258 gument made in (Bhattacharya et al., 2018), who found that δD_p reflects changing proportions 259 of summer and winter rainfall: summer rainfall is primarily deep convective and winter/spring 260 rainfall derives from stratiform rain (Figure S2). Other processes, like equilibrium tempera-261 ture effects, are too small to explain the full magnitude of the δD changes (see Text S1). 262

In the present climatology, the region around DSDP 475 receives less than 1 mm/day of rain on average, and in many years receives no monsoon rainfall (Fonseca-Hernandez et al., 2021) (Figure S3). A positive Pliocene leaf wax δD_p signature at DSDP 475 likely reflects

-9-

intensification of the monsoon in its core region as well as its expansion into Baja. Similarly, 266 the majority of rain at ODP 1012 in the present day derives from winter moisture, with vir-267 tually no contribution from summertime rainfall. The enriched signature of δD_p in the Pliocene 268 at site 1012 reflects a fundamentally different climatology, with a greater proportion of sum-269 mer rainfall. This coheres with existing qualitative inferences from southern California paly-270 nological data and faunal remains, which suggest that the Pleistocene marked a transition from 271 summer-wet to summer-dry environments in both southern California and Baja California, (Miller, 272 1980; Ballog & Malloy, 1981; Axelrod, 1948). Together, these lines of evidence suggest that 273 the Pliocene featured a stronger monsoon that was spatially more extensive, influencing the 274 entire region stretching from Baja California through southern California. Moreover, evidence 275 for a warmer and wetter climate in the NAM region is also shown by paleo-botanical evidence 276 from the Miocene (M. J. Pound et al., 2012), suggesting this mechanism may be applicable 277 to understanding other warm climate intervals. 278

SST Patterns and Plio-Pleistocene Monsoon Changes

279

A recent modeling study hypothesized that warmer California margin temperatures in 280 the Pliocene resulted in expanded and enhanced summer convection (Fu et al., 2022). This hy-28 pothesis implies that the evolution of the Plio-Pleistocene NAM should track coastal temper-282 atures on the California Margin. In contrast, other modeling studies suggest that NAM strength 283 responds most strongly to the *relative* warming of the subtropical eastern Pacific (e.g. Cali-284 fornia Margin) compared to the eastern equatorial Pacific (EEP) (Pascale et al., 2017). To as-285 sess the importance of each of these factors in driving NAM changes, we compare our records 286 of summer convection to an index of the eastern Pacific subtropical/tropical temperature gra-287 dient, as well as an index of California margin SSTs (see Methods). 288

Our Plio-Pleistocene records of SWNA δD_p exhibit a stronger relationship to the east-289 ern Pacific subtropical/tropical gradient than to the absolute magnitude of warming on the CA 290 margin (Figure 1e and f). The subtropical/tropical gradient index shows that the temperature 291 difference between the the California Margin and the EEP was at a minimum between 3.5 and 292 3.0 Ma, and then progressively increased between 3.0 and 2.4 Ma until reaching modern val-293 ues, where the southern California Margin is approximately 7.6°C cooler than the EEP (Fig-294 ure 1e). The largest changes in this gradient coincide temporally with the step-like transition 295 to more depleted values in both our δD_p records (Figure 1). In contrast, southern CA margin 296

temperatures show a gradual long-term decline from 3.5 to 0.8 Ma, with no indication of a step change at the Plio-Pleistocene transition (Figure 1f).

²⁹⁹ CA margin temperatures and the eastern Pacific subtropical/tropical gradient index are ³⁰⁰ not independent metrics, as the former is used to calculate the latter. However, the temporal ³⁰¹ evolution of SWNA δD_p more closely mirrors the trajectory of the subtropical-tropical SST ³⁰² gradient than CA margin temperatures alone, which supports a causal link between long-term ³⁰³ NAM strength and this temperature gradient. We next use isotope enabled simulations to cor-³⁰⁴ roborate this observed relationship between SST patterns, NAM strength, and δD_p .

305

NAM changes in an Isotope-Enabled Simulation

iCAM5 produces a region of positive vapor δD anomalies that are co-located with warm 306 SST anomalies. These vapor anomalies spatially coincide with the location of enriched δD_p 307 and a weak, convergent, cyclonic circulation pattern (Figure 2). This is supported by the mois-308 ture budget analysis presented in (Fu et al., 2022), which found that both thermodynamic and 309 dynamic processes contributed to rainfall changes in their simulations. Because SST anoma-310 lies in the PRISM3 dataset are muted south of Baja California, δD_p is slightly depleted in that 311 region, differing from our record from site 475 (Figure 2, Figure S5). However, this simula-312 tion still illustrates the connection between SST, vapor and precipitation δD , and summer rain-313 fall. 314

In iCAM5, water vapor and precipitation δD act as a tracer of changes in energy for con-315 vection. We measure the latter using equivalent potential temperature or θ_e , a thermodynamic 316 quantity that integrates information about the temperature and moisture content of air parcels. 317 Vertical gradients of θ_e therefore measure the potential for instability and convection. The ver-318 tical profile of the atmosphere over the NAM region shows that positive θ_e anomalies, which 319 imply greater potential for convection, are co-located with increases in water vapor δD (Fig-320 ure 2). Warmer subtropical SSTs likely drive higher local fluxes of sensible and latent heat. 321 In addition, the convergent circulation over these warm coastal SSTs imports moist, warm air 322 into this region (Fu et al., 2022). These processes result in positive anomalies of θ_e , and also 323 change the signature of δD_p by altering the isotopic signature of the moisture source from which 324 precipitation is derived. Water vapor changes may dominate the isotopic response in iCAM5 325 because isotope-enabled models are known to underestimate δD_p changes that result directly 326 from changing proportions of convective rainfall (Hu et al., 2018). Therefore, the model pro-327

-11-

duces a smaller magnitude of change in δD_p compared to what is estimated by the proxies, although the model does overlap the 95% confidence interval of proxy-estimated δD_p change in the Pliocene at both sites.

Our iCAM5 simulation confirms that a stronger summer monsoon is linked to enriched 331 δD_p and that warm temperatures along the California margin are critical for sustaining a stronger 332 monsoon circulation. However, this single simulation does not allow us to cleanly determine 333 whether local warming on the CA margin, versus the gradient of temperature between the sub-334 tropical eastern Pacific and the EEP, is more important for driving an increase in summer rain. 335 Moreover, it is unclear whether intensification of the NAM alone could have sustained a pos-336 itive balance of precipitation minus evaporation, as is implied by qualitative proxies like mesic 337 vegetation, high lake levels, and taxa like Crocodylus. 338

To identify whether local CA margin SSTs or the larger subtropical/tropical SST gra-339 dient was responsible for the observed hydroclimatic changes, we conducted a series of sim-340 ulations with iCAM5 where we systematically varied SST patterns (Figure S5). Across all of 34 the simulations, annual P-E is strongly correlated with summer P-E (r = 0.87, p=0.04), which 342 confirms that summer precipitation is important for maintaining a year-round positive P-E bal-343 ance. However, we find a weak relationship between summer P-E and temperature anomalies 344 on the southern CA margin (Figure 3a). Even when the model SST field overlaps the range 345 of Pliocene proxy-inferred SST warming on the southern CA margin, the model does not pro-346 duce positive P-E, as is implied by available qualitative proxies from the Pliocene. In contrast, 347 summer P-E shows a statistically significant relationship with the subtropical/tropical SST gra-348 dient (Figure 3b). Simulations that weaken this gradient to near 2°C, which is within the range 349 of the change suggested by Pliocene proxies, produce positive annual P-E that is primarily driven 350 by changes in summer P-E. Moreover, across simulations, we find that summer P-E accounts 351 for nearly all of the annual P-E signal as the subtropical/tropical gradient weakens to near 2°C 352 (Figure 3b). While it is possible that the model underestimates the response of P-E to SST gra-353 dients since its low resolution does not resolve realistic patterns and statistics local convec-354 tion, these simulations provide another line of evidence suggesting that NAM strength is de-355 termined by large-scale SST gradients between the tropics and subtropics, supporting the anal-356 yses of (Pascale et al., 2017) and our hydroclimate and SST proxy data. 357

-12-

358

Implications for Current and Future Southwestern Hydroclimate

Pliocene proxy evidence and model simulations underscore the strong relationship be-359 tween subtropical/tropical SST gradients in the east Pacific and NAM strength, with implica-360 tions for understanding past and future climate in this region. Given the critical importance 361 of temperature patterns to NAM variability, climate models with significant northeast Pacific 362 SST bias may not produce reliable future predictions (Y. Zhu et al., 2020). This may contribute 363 to a lack of robust predictions of future changes in the NAM, which tend to be highly depen-364 dent on model bias and resolution (Maloney et al., 2014; Meyer & Jin, 2017; Cook & Sea-365 ger, 2013; Almazroui et al., 2021; Moon & Ha, 2020). When global SSTs are bias-corrected, 366 high-resolution models produce robust decreases in rainfall across all seasons in response to 367 warming (Pascale et al., 2017, 2018), at odds with previous work (Meyer & Jin, 2017; Cook 368 & Seager, 2013). This result is due in part to reduced California margin warming compared 369 to the tropical eastern Pacific (Pascale et al., 2017; He et al., 2020). In contrast, our results 370 suggest that the Pliocene featured enhanced California margin warming compared to the trop-371 ical eastern Pacific, amplifying monsoon strength. This enhanced warming in Pliocene sim-372 ulations may reflect the long-term influence of earth system processes related to the cryosphere 373 and vegetation, or long-term adjustments of deep ocean dynamics that alter SST patterns (Tierney 374 et al., 2019; Feng et al., 2020; Brennan et al., accepted; A. Fedorov et al., 2013; Ford et al., 375 2015). In fact, a growing body of literature suggests that the *equilibrium* response of SST and 376 hydroclimate to greenhouse boundary conditions, especially those that involve long-term earth 377 system feedbacks as likely occurred during the Pliocene, may differ fundamentally from re-378 sponses to transient warming (Sniderman et al., 2019; Zappa et al., 2020; Burls & Fedorov, 379 2017). 380

Moreover, we are able to identify events in the observational record with amplified mon-381 soon rainfall that parallel the mechanism of monsoon intensification in the Pliocene. Since the 382 mid-20th century, the northeast Pacific has experienced multi-season or multi-year marine heat 383 waves (MHW) (Myers et al., 2018; Amaya et al., 2020; Hoegh-Guldberg et al., 2014). The 384 peak of a heat wave between 2012 and 2014 occurred in summer 2014 and featured SSTs 1-385 2°C warmer than average on the southern California Margin (Myers et al., 2018), in a sim-386 ilar location to the region where proxies suggest the warmest mid-Pliocene temperatures oc-387 curred (Figure 4). During this event, eastern equatorial Pacific warming associated with a de-388 veloping El Niño event was muted. SST anomalies off the coast of Baja reached their max-389 imum in summer 2014 (Myers et al., 2018). We use reanalysis data from the North Ameri-390

-13-

manuscript submitted to AGU Advances

can Regional Reanalysis (NARR) and the NCEP-NCAR reanalysis (Mesinger et al., 2006; Kalnay 391 et al., 1996) to plot changes in precipitation, winds, and calculate changes in equivalent po-392 tential temperature θ_e . To quantify changes in deep convection, we plot changes in summer-393 time (June - September) climatological outgoing longwave radiation (OLR) over southern Baja 394 California as well as the distribution of OLR values during the heat wave (Liebmann & Smith, 395 1996). Lower values of OLR indicate cooler cloud tops and deeper convection (Figure 4). 396 Statistically significant rainfall changes occur in the core NAM domain, but also in pe-397 ripheral regions like the Baja California Peninsula, which normally experiences atmospheric 398

subsidence and receives little monsoon rain (Figure S6) (Fonseca-Hernandez et al., 2021). This 399 is illustrated by a shift in daily summertime outgoing longwave radiation (OLR) values over 400 Baja, which shows an increase in values near 240-250 W/m^2 . These values are characteris-40[.] tic of monsoon storms, while outlying low values represent tropical storms and hurricanes (Fig-402 ure 4). This increased convection is partially the result of the direct thermodynamic effect of 403 warm SSTs, but we also note the presence of southerly wind anomalies along the coast of Mex-404 ico that likely resulted in greater convergence of moisture via dynamic processes (Figure 4). 405 Circulation changes and warm SSTs increase low level moist entropy, enhancing moist con-406 vection over the NAM region (Figure 4). Our results are further corroborated by previous re-407 search showing that extreme rainfall and flooding in southern Arizona is linked to increased 408 precipitable water offshore of Baja, similar to what we observe during the MHW (Yang et al., 409 2017). Moreover, previous work found that other NE Pacific marine heat waves are associ-410 ated with above average soil moisture across the NAM domain (Shi et al., 2021). 411

Disentangling causality in a short instrumental record is challenging, and the cause of 412 MHW-related SST anomalies, which result from changes in surface radiation, may differ from 413 the cause of the California margin warming in the Pliocene, which could also involve ocean 414 dynamical adjustments (Myers et al., 2018; Brennan et al., accepted; Ford et al., 2015; A. Fe-415 dorov et al., 2013). Despite this, there are clear parallels between our conceptual model of Pliocene 416 NAM changes and MHW-related NAM changes. For reference, we plot the 2014 marine heat 417 wave on Figure 3. This event stands out as featuring only modest California margin SST anoma-418 lies, far below the range of those inferred by Pliocene proxies. However, because this marine 419 heat wave event was paired with weak positive temperature anomalies in the EEP, this event 420 featured a greatly relaxed subtropical/tropical SST gradient. This example suggests that, if ma-421 rine heat waves similar to those observed in 2013-2014 continue to intensify as projected, the 422 future may feature intervals with SST patterns and circulation anomalies that are conducive 423

-14-

to more intense, spatially expanded NAM rainfall. These extreme events in turn have impor-

tant societal and ecological consequences, including potentially amplifying wildfire risk by in-

426 creasing biomass, and increasing hazards from landslides (Mazon et al., 2016; Demaria et al.,

⁴²⁷ 2019; Pascale et al., 2018).

428 Conclusions

Two novel leaf wax reconstructions of SWNA hydroclimate provide proxy evidence of 429 intensification of the NAM, as well as expansion of its spatial footprint, during the Pliocene. 430 Instead of solely resulting from winter rain changes, wet conditions during this epoch were 431 at least in part driven by the summer monsoon. In fact, model simulations suggest that the ma-432 jority of the precipitation minus evaporation signal in the Pliocene may have been driven by 433 summer rainfall. Both proxies and models suggest that the Pliocene expansion of summer rain-434 fall in SWNA is linked to the subtropical/tropical SST gradient across the eastern Pacific. These 435 results cohere with the model experiments in (Pascale et al., 2017), who posit that this gra-436 dient will play a key role in the future trajectory of the NAM. Our results are also consistent 437 with the 'warmer-get-wetter' paradigm, which posits that, in warm climates, the largest rain-438 fall changes in the subtropics and tropics should occur in regions with the highest relative SST 439 warming (Xie et al., 2010). 440

SWNA is in the midst of an intensifying megadrought, driven in part by higher temper-441 atures that increase evaporation and reduce snowpack (Williams et al., 2022). Understanding 442 the role of monsoon rainfall in future hydroclimate has implications for regional water resources, 443 ecosystems, wildfire regimes, and other land surface processes. There is currently no consen-444 sus about the future trajectory of the monsoon. However, recent simulations suggest that the 445 future will feature a weaker NAM, as a result of a reduced eastern Pacific subtropical/tropical 446 gradient that enhances atmospheric stability over SWNA (Pascale et al., 2017). This is the op-447 posite of what proxies suggest for the Pliocene, which featured a greatly reduced reduced sub-448 tropical/tropical gradient (Brierley et al., 2009a; A. V. Fedorov et al., 2015). One possible rea-449 son for this discrepancy is because of the timescale of response for the Pliocene vs. near-future 450 warming: the Pliocene represents an equilibrium climate state and features SST patterns that 451 are the result of long-term adjustments of the Earth systems that have yet to emerge in tran-452 sient simulations of current warming (Heede et al., 2021). 453

-15-

Our analysis of the observational record also suggests that the future may be character-454 ized by intervals of expanded monsoon rainfall. We demonstrated that marine heat waves on 455 the southern California Margin, when coupled with muted warming in the EEP, result in a stronger 456 monsoon. While the direct influence of CO_2 is predicted to intensify individual monsoon storms 457 (Demaria et al., 2019; Pascale et al., 2018), marine heat waves complement this mechanism 458 by facilitating the spatial expansion of monsoon rainfall into regions like Baja and Southern 459 California. This example raises the intriguing possibility that the subtropical/tropical SST gra-460 dient may help aid efforts to improve the seasonal predictability of NAM rainfall (Grimm et 46 al., 2020). We also note that this mechanism of current and future monsoon change may be 462 underestimated by global models, which are known to underestimate the intensity and dura-463 tion of marine heat waves (Plecha & Soares, 2020). However, this mechanism is likely to have 464 important implications, since enhanced summer rain coupled to a warmer climate may result 465 in higher fuel loads and fire, as well as flash flooding (Moloney et al., 2019; Yang et al., 2017). 466

Our results have implications for both past and future hydroclimate change in SWNA. 467 Several modeling studies have shown that subtropical regions, especially eastern ocean bound-468 ary upwelling zones, are especially sensitive to greenhouse boundary conditions (Schneider 469 et al., 2019; J. Zhu et al., 2019). It is therefore likely that other greenhouse climate intervals 470 witnessed similar hydroclimate reorganizations on land areas near upwelling zones. The mech-471 anism we identify is also relevant to the present day, since we found evidence of an expanded 472 monsoon during the modern 2014 marine heat wave. These results underscore the fact that far 473 from representing a climate state fundamentally dissimilar from present day, the Pliocene can 474 both help test fundamental theories about the dynamics that govern regional circulation, and 475 serve as an analog for the processes that will drive hydroclimate in a warmer world. Further 476 studies of the Pliocene and similar greenhouse intervals could therefore provide key lessons 477 relevant for adapting to both near-future and long-term regional hydroclimate changes. 478

479 Data Availability Statement

New proxy data and selected modeled fields will be archived at a permanent link at the
 NOAA Paleoclimatology Database and will be made available upon publication.

482 Acknowledgments

- 483 TB acknowledges funding support from NSF Grants Paleo Perspectives on Climate Change
- (P2C2) OCE-1903148 and OCE-2103015. Measurements were made possible with support from

-16-

- 485 NSF MRI Grant EAR-2018078 to TB. MF was supported by the NSF Climate Dynamics pro-
- gram (joint NSF/NERC) grant AGS-1924538. JET acknowledges funding support from NSF
- 487 OCE-2125955. NJB and SK acknowledge funding support from NSF award AGS-1844380.
- RF acknowledges funding from NSF Grants OCE-2103055 and OCE-1903650. All simula-
- tions were conducted on Computational and Information Systems Laboratory. 2019. Cheyenne:
- 490 HPE/SGI ICE XA System (Climate Simulation Laboratory). Boulder, CO: National Center for
- Atmospheric Research. doi:10.5065/D6RX99HX. We thank lab managers Patrick Murphy at
- the University of Arizona and Jillian Aluisio and Stephanie Bullinger at Syracuse University
- ⁴⁹³ for assistance with the leaf wax analysis.



Figure 1. Plio-Pleistocene changes in SW NA hydroclimate. a) shows benthic oxygen isotope stack from (Lisiecki & Raymo, 2005), while b and c) shows our new Plio-Pleistocene reconstruction of δD_p from ODP 1012 and DSDP 475 respectively. Modern coretop values shown in dark green error bars. d) shows index of subtropical minus tropical eastern Pacific temperature, while e) shows index of Plio-Pleistocene CA margin temperatures.



Figure 2. Changes in summer rainfall and water isotopes in an isotope-enabled simulation forced with SST changes in (Fu et al., 2022). a) shows June-September SST patterns with wind anomalies; b) shows vertically integrated δD of vapor. c) shows show δD_p , with lower (outer circle), median (middle circle), and upper (inner circle) 95% confidence interval of proxy-estimated δD_p changes at site 475 and 1012. d) shows precipitation anomalies in this simulation. e) shows vertical profile of lower-atmospheric changes in δD of vapor and θ_e .







Figure 4. NAM changes during the peak of the 2014 northeast Pacific MHW. a) shows SST anomalies during summer 2014, during the peak of the MHW. b) vertical atmospheric profile of moist entropy changes over Baja California in box shown in panel c). Dashed contours show climatological values, while colored contours indicate 2014 MHW anomalies.c) shows rainfall anomalies in the North American Regional Analysis, with stippling showing values that are not significant at the 95% level. d) shows the daily distribution of climatological (gray) and MHW (purple) summertime outgoing longwave radiation (OLR). Lower OLR values indicate cooler cloud tops on deep convective clouds. Gray bracket shows 95% CI for climatological values.

494 **References**

- Aggarwal, P. K., Romatschke, U., Araguas-Araguas, L., Belachew, D., Longstaffe, F. J.,
- Berg, P., ... Funk, A. (2016). Proportions of convective and stratiform precipitation
 revealed in water isotope ratios. *Nature Geoscience*, 9(8), 624–629.
- Almazroui, M., Islam, M. N., Saeed, F., Saeed, S., Ismail, M., Ehsan, M. A., ... others
 (2021). Projected changes in temperature and precipitation over the United States,
 Central America, and the Caribbean in CMIP6 GCMs. *Earth Systems and Environ*
 - *ment*, 5(1), 1–24.

501

- Amaya, D. J., Miller, A. J., Xie, S.-P., & Kosaka, Y. (2020). Physical drivers of the summer
 2019 North Pacific marine heatwave. *Nature communications*, *11*(1), 1–9.
- Axelrod, D. I. (1948). Climate and evolution in western North America during middle
 Pliocene time. *Evolution*, 127–144.
- Ballog, R. A., & Malloy, R. E. (1981). Neogene Palynology from the Southern Califor nia Continental Borderland, Site 467, Deep Sea Drilling Project Leg 64 (Vol. 63). U.S.
 Government Printing Office.
- Bhattacharya, T., Tierney, J. E., Addison, J. A., & Murray, J. W. (2018). Ice-sheet modula tion of deglacial North American monsoon intensification. *Nature Geoscience*, 11(11),
 848–852.
- Brady, E., Stevenson, S., Bailey, D., Liu, Z., Noone, D., Nusbaumer, J., ... others (2019).
 The connected isotopic water cycle in the Community Earth System Model version 1. *Journal of Advances in Modeling Earth Systems*, 11(8), 2547–2566.
- Brennan, P. R., Bhattacharya, T., Feng, R., Tierney, J. E., & Jorgensen, E. (accepted, Octo ber). Patterns and mechanisms of northeast Pacific temperature response to Pliocene
 boundary conditions. *Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology*.
- Brierley, C. M., Fedorov, A. V., Liu, Z., Herbert, T. D., Lawrence, K. T., & LaRiviere, J. P.
 (2009a). Greatly expanded tropical warm pool and weakened Hadley circulation in the
 early Pliocene. *Science*, *323*(5922), 1714–1718.
- 521 Brierley, C. M., Fedorov, A. V., Liu, Z., Herbert, T. D., Lawrence, K. T., & LaRiviere, J. P.
- (2009b, March). Greatly Expanded Tropical Warm Pool and Weakened Hadley Circulation in the Early Pliocene. *Science*, 323(5922), 1714–1718. Retrieved 2021-05-02,
 from https://science.sciencemag.org/content/323/5922/1714
- (Publisher: American Association for the Advancement of Science Section: Report)
 doi: 10.1126/science.1167625

527	Burls, N. J., & Fedorov, A. V. (2017). Wetter subtropics in a warmer world: Contrasting					
528	past and future hydrological cycles. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences,					
529	114(49), 12888–12893.					
530	Byrne, M. P., & O'Gorman, P. A. (2015). The response of precipitation minus evapotran-					
531	spiration to climate warming: Why the "wet-get-wetter, dry-get-drier" scaling does not					
532	hold over land. Journal of Climate, 28(20), 8078-8092.					
533	Cook, B. I., & Seager, R. (2013). The response of the North American Monsoon to increased					
534	greenhouse gas forcing. Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 118(4),					
535	1690–1699.					
536	Curray, J., Moore, D., Aguayo, J., Aubry, MP., Einsele, G., Fornari, D., Vacquier,					
537	V. (1982). Baja California Passive Margin Transect: Sites 474, 475, and 476					
538	(Vol. 64). U.S. Government Printing Office. Retrieved 2021-04-06, from http://					
539	deepseadrilling.org/64/dsdp_toc.htm doi: 10.2973/dsdp.proc.64.1982					
540	Dekens, P. S., Ravelo, A. C., & McCarthy, M. D. (2007). Warm upwelling					
541	regions in the Pliocene warm period. <i>Paleoceanography</i> , 22(3). Re-					
542	trieved 2021-04-06, from http://agupubs.onlinelibrary					
543	.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1029/2006PA001394 (_eprint:					
544	https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1029/2006PA001394) doi: https://doi.org/					
545	10.1029/2006PA001394					
546	Demaria, E. M., Hazenberg, P., Scott, R. L., Meles, M. B., Nichols, M., & Goodrich, D.					
547	(2019). Intensification of the North American Monsoon rainfall as observed from					
548	a long-term high-density gauge network. Geophysical Research Letters, 46(12),					
549	6839–6847.					
550	Dowsett, H., Robinson, M., & Foley, K. (2009). Pliocene three-dimensional global ocean					
551	temperature reconstruction. Climate of the Past, 5(4), 769-783.					
552	Durazo, R., & Baumgartner, T. (2002). Evolution of oceanographic conditions off Baja Cali-					
553	fornia: 1997–1999. Progress in Oceanography, 54(1-4), 7–31.					
554	Etourneau, J., Schneider, R., Blanz, T., & Martinez, P. (2010, August). Intensification of the					
555	Walker and Hadley atmospheric circulations during the Pliocene-Pleistocene climate					
556	transition. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 297(1), 103-110. Retrieved 2021-05-					
557	02, from https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/					
558	S0012821X10003845 doi: 10.1016/j.epsl.2010.06.010					
559	Fedorov, A., Brierley, C., Lawrence, K. T., Liu, Z., Dekens, P., & Ravelo, A. (2013). Patterns					

560	and mechanisms of early Pliocene warmth. Nature, 496(7443), 43-49.
561	Fedorov, A. V., Burls, N. J., Lawrence, K. T., & Peterson, L. C. (2015). Tightly linked zonal
562	and meridional sea surface temperature gradients over the past five million years. Na-
563	ture Geoscience, 8(12), 975–980.
564	Feng, R., Otto-Bliesner, B. L., Brady, E. C., & Rosenbloom, N. (2020). Increased climate
565	response and earth system sensitivity from CCSM4 to CESM2 in mid-Pliocene simu-
566	lations. Journal of Advances in Modeling Earth Systems, 12(8), e2019MS002033.
567	Fonseca-Hernandez, M., Turrent, C., Mayor, Y. G., & Tereshchenko, I. (2021). Using ob-
568	servational and reanalysis data to explore the southern Gulf of California boundary
569	layer during the North American Monsoon onset. Journal of Geophysical Research:
570	Atmospheres, 126(7), e2020JD033508.
571	Ford, H. L., Ravelo, A. C., Dekens, P. S., LaRiviere, J. P., & Wara, M. W. (2015). The evo-
572	lution of the equatorial thermocline and the early Pliocene El Padre mean state. Geo-
573	physical Research Letters, 42(12), 4878–4887.
574	Fu, M., Cane, M. A., Molnar, P., & Tziperman, E. (2022, January). Warmer Pliocene up-
575	welling site SST leads to wetter subtropical coastal areas: a positive feedback on SST.
576	Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, e2021PA004357.
577	Gao, L., Edwards, E. J., Zeng, Y., & Huang, Y. (2014). Major evolutionary trends in hydro-
578	gen isotope fractionation of vascular plant leaf waxes. PloS one, 9(11), e112610.
579	Grimm, A. M., Dominguez, F., Cavalcanti, I. F., Cavazos, T., Gan, M. A., Silva Dias, P. L.,
580	Barreiro, M. (2020). South and North American Monsoons: Characteristics, life
581	cycle, variability, modeling, and prediction. In The multiscale global monsoon system
582	(pp. 49–66). World Scientific.
583	He, C., Li, T., & Zhou, W. (2020). Drier North American monsoon in contrast to Asian-
584	African monsoon under global warming. Journal of Climate, 33(22), 9801-9816.
585	Heede, U. K., Fedorov, A. V., & Burls, N. J. (2021). A stronger versus weaker Walker:
586	understanding model differences in fast and slow tropical Pacific responses to global
587	warming. Climate Dynamics, 57(9), 2505–2522.
588	Herbert, T., Schuffert, J., Andreasen, D., Heusser, L., Lyle, M., Mix, A., Herguera, J.
589	(2001). Collapse of the california current during glacial maxima linked to climate
590	change on land. Science, 293(5527), 71–76.
591	Herbert, T. D., Lawrence, K. T., Tzanova, A., Peterson, L. C., Caballero-Gill, R., & Kelly,
592	C. S. (2016, November). Late Miocene global cooling and the rise of modern

-24-

593	ecosystems. <i>Nature Geoscience</i> , 9(11), 843–847. Retrieved 2021-05-02, from
594	https://www.nature.com/articles/ngeo2813 (Number: 11 Publisher:
595	Nature Publishing Group) doi: 10.1038/ngeo2813
596	Hoegh-Guldberg, O., Cai, R., Poloczanska, E., Brewer, P., Sundby, S., Hilmi, K., Jung,
597	S. (2014). The ocean. in: Climate change 2014: Impacts, adaptation, and vulnerabil-
598	ity. part b: Regional aspects. contribution of working group ii to the fifth assessment
599	report of the intergovernmental panel on climate change. Intergovernmental Panel on
600	Climate Change.
601	Hu, J., Emile-Geay, J., Nusbaumer, J., & Noone, D. (2018). Impact of convective activity on
602	precipitation δ 180 in isotope-enabled general circulation models. Journal of Geophys-
603	ical Research: Atmospheres, 123(23), 13–595.
604	Ibarra, D. E., Oster, J. L., Winnick, M. J., Caves Rugenstein, J. K., Byrne, M. P., & Chamber-
605	lain, C. P. (2018). Warm and cold wet states in the western United States during the
606	Pliocene-Pleistocene. Geology, 46(4), 355-358.
607	Kalnay, E., Kanamitsu, M., Kistler, R., Collins, W., Deaven, D., Gandin, L., Joseph, D.
608	(1996). The ncep/ncar 40-year reanalysis project. Bulletin of the American meteoro-
609	logical Society, 77(3), 437–472.
610	LaRiviere, J. (2007). California margin sea surface temperature and paleoproductivity
611	records at ocean drilling program site 1012. Southern Illinois University at Carbon-
612	dale.
613	LaRiviere, J. P., Ravelo, A. C., Crimmins, A., Dekens, P. S., Ford, H. L., Lyle, M., & Wara,
614	M. W. (2012, June). Late Miocene decoupling of oceanic warmth and atmospheric
615	carbon dioxide forcing. Nature, 486(7401), 97–100. Retrieved 2021-05-02, from
616	https://www.nature.com/articles/nature11200 (Number: 7401
617	Publisher: Nature Publishing Group) doi: 10.1038/nature11200
618	Lawrence, K. T., Liu, Z., & Herbert, T. D. (2006, April). Evolution of the Eastern Tropical
619	Pacific Through Plio-Pleistocene Glaciation. Science, 312(5770), 79-83. Retrieved
620	2021-05-12, from https://science.sciencemag.org/content/312/
621	5770/79 (Publisher: American Association for the Advancement of Science Sec-
622	tion: Research Article) doi: 10.1126/science.1120395
623	Liebmann, B., & Smith, C. A. (1996). Description of a complete (interpolated) outgoing
624	longwave radiation dataset. Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society, 77(6),
625	1275–1277.

-25-

626	Lisiecki, L. E., & Raymo, M. E. (2005). A Pliocene-Pleistocene stack of 57 globally dis-
627	tributed benthic δ 18O records. <i>Paleoceanography</i> , 20(1).
628	Liu, J., Tian, J., Liu, Z., Herbert, T. D., Fedorov, A. V., & Lyle, M. (2019, April). East-
629	ern equatorial Pacific cold tongue evolution since the late Miocene linked to extra-
630	tropical climate. Science Advances, 5(4), eaau6060. Retrieved 2021-07-11, from
631	https://advances.sciencemag.org/content/5/4/eaau6060 (Pub-
632	lisher: American Association for the Advancement of Science Section: Research
633	Article) doi: 10.1126/sciadv.aau6060
634	Maloney, E. D., Camargo, S. J., Chang, E., Colle, B., Fu, R., Geil, K. L., others (2014).
635	North American climate in CMIP5 experiments: Part III: Assessment of twenty-first-
636	century projections. Journal of Climate, 27(6), 2230-2270.
637	Mazon, J. J., Castro, C. L., Adams, D. K., Chang, HI., Carrillo, C. M., & Brost, J. J. (2016).
638	Objective climatological analysis of extreme weather events in Arizona during the
639	North American monsoon. Journal of Applied Meteorology and Climatology, 55(11),
640	2431–2450.
641	Mesinger, F., DiMego, G., Kalnay, E., Mitchell, K., Shafran, P. C., Ebisuzaki, W., Shi, W.
642	(2006). North american regional reanalysis. Bulletin of the American Meteorological
643	<i>Society</i> , 87(3), 343–360.
644	Meyer, J. D., & Jin, J. (2017). The response of future projections of the North American
645	monsoon when combining dynamical downscaling and bias correction of CCSM4
646	output. Climate Dynamics, 49(1), 433-447.
647	Miller, W. E. (1980). The late Pliocene Las Tunas local fauna from southernmost Baja Cali-
648	fornia, Mexico. Journal of Paleontology, 762-805.
649	Mix, H. T., Rugenstein, J. K. C., Reilly, S. P., Ritch, A. J., Winnick, M. J., Kukla, T., &
650	Chamberlain, C. P. (2019). Atmospheric flow deflection in the late cenozoic sierra
651	nevada. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 518, 76-85.
652	Molnar, P., & Cane, M. A. (2002). El Niño's tropical climate and teleconnections as a
653	blueprint for pre-Ice Age climates. Paleoceanography, 17(2), 11–1.
654	Moloney, K. A., Mudrak, E. L., Fuentes-Ramirez, A., Parag, H., Schat, M., & Holzapfel, C.
655	(2019). Increased fire risk in Mojave and Sonoran shrublands due to exotic species and
656	extreme rainfall events. Ecosphere, 10(2), e02592.
657	Moon, S., & Ha, KJ. (2020). Future changes in monsoon duration and precipitation using
658	CMIP6. npj Climate and Atmospheric Science, 3(1), 1–7.

659	Myers, T. A., Mechoso, C. R., Cesana, G. V., DeFlorio, M. J., & Waliser, D. E. (2018).
660	Cloud feedback key to marine heatwave off Baja California. Geophysical Research
661	Letters, 45(9), 4345–4352.
662	Nusbaumer, J., Wong, T. E., Bardeen, C., & Noone, D. (2017). Evaluating hydrological
663	processes in the C ommunity A tmosphere M odel V ersion 5 (C AM5) using sta-
664	ble isotope ratios of water. Journal of Advances in Modeling Earth Systems, 9(2),
665	949–977.
666	Ostertag-Henning, C., & Stax, R. (2000). Data report: Carbonate records from sites 1012,
667	1013, 1017, and 1019 and alkenone-based sea-surface temperatures from site 1017. In
668	Proc. ocean drill. program, sci. results (Vol. 167, pp. 297-302).
669	Pascale, S., Boos, W. R., Bordoni, S., Delworth, T. L., Kapnick, S. B., Murakami, H.,
670	Zhang, W. (2017). Weakening of the North American monsoon with global warming.
671	Nature Climate Change, 7(11), 806–812.
672	Pascale, S., Kapnick, S. B., Bordoni, S., & Delworth, T. L. (2018). The influence of CO2
673	forcing on North American monsoon moisture surges. Journal of Climate, 31(19),
674	7949–7968.
675	Plecha, S. M., & Soares, P. M. (2020). Global marine heatwave events using the new cmip6
676	multi-model ensemble: from shortcomings in present climate to future projections. En-
677	vironmental Research Letters, 15(12), 124058.
678	Pound, M., Tindall, J., Pickering, S., Haywood, A., Dowsett, H., & Salzmann, U. (2014).
679	Late Pliocene lakes and soils: a global data set for the analysis of climate feedbacks in
680	a warmer world. Climate of the Past, 10(1), 167–180.
681	Pound, M. J., Haywood, A. M., Salzmann, U., & Riding, J. B. (2012). Global vegeta-
682	tion dynamics and latitudinal temperature gradients during the mid to late miocene
683	(15.97–5.33 ma). Earth-Science Reviews, 112(1-2), 1–22.
684	Remeika, P., Fischbein, I. W., & Fischbein, S. A. (1988). Lower Pliocene petrified wood
685	from the Palm Spring Formation, Anza Borrego Desert State Park, California. Review
686	of palaeobotany and palynology, 56(3-4), 183–198.
687	Rousselle, G., Beltran, C., Sicre, MA., Raffi, I., & De Rafélis, M. (2013, January).
688	Changes in sea-surface conditions in the Equatorial Pacific during the middle
689	Miocene–Pliocene as inferred from coccolith geochemistry. <i>Earth and Plane-</i>
690	tary Science Letters, 361, 412–421. Retrieved 2021-05-02, from https://www
691	.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0012821X12006115

692	doi: 10.1016/j.epsl.2012.11.003
693	Sachse, D., Billault, I., Bowen, G. J., Chikaraishi, Y., Dawson, T. E., Feakins, S. J., oth-
694	ers (2012). Molecular paleohydrology: interpreting the hydrogen-isotopic composition
695	of lipid biomarkers from photosynthesizing organisms. Annual Review of Earth and
696	Planetary Sciences, 40, 221–249.
697	Salzmann, U., Haywood, A. M., & Lunt, D. J. (2009). The past is a guide to the future?
698	Comparing Middle Pliocene vegetation with predicted biome distributions for the
699	twenty-first century. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical,
700	Physical and Engineering Sciences, 367(1886), 189–204.
701	Schneider, T., Kaul, C. M., & Pressel, K. G. (2019). Possible climate transitions from
702	breakup of stratocumulus decks under greenhouse warming. Nature Geoscience,
703	12(3), 163–167.
704	Schumacher, C., & Houze, R. A. (2003). The TRMM precipitation radar's view of shallow,
705	isolated rain. Journal of Applied Meteorology and Climatology, 42(10), 1519–1524.
706	Seager, R., Naik, N., & Vecchi, G. A. (2010). Thermodynamic and dynamic mechanisms
707	for large-scale changes in the hydrological cycle in response to global warming. Jour-
708	nal of climate, 23(17), 4651–4668.
709	Seki, O., Schmidt, D. N., Schouten, S., Hopmans, E. C., Damsté, J. S. S., & Pancost, R. D.
710	(2012). Paleoceanographic changes in the Eastern Equatorial Pacific over the last 10
711	Myr. Paleoceanography, 27(3). Retrieved 2021-05-02, from https://agupubs
712	.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1029/2011PA002158
713	(_eprint: https://agupubs.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1029/2011PA002158)
714	doi: https://doi.org/10.1029/2011PA002158
715	Shaari, H. b., Yamamoto, M., & Irino, T. (2013, September). Enhanced upwelling in
716	the eastern equatorial Pacific at the last five glacial terminations. Palaeogeog-
717	<i>raphy, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 386</i> , 8–15. Retrieved 2021-05-12,
718	<pre>from https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/</pre>
719	S0031018213001600 doi: 10.1016/j.palaeo.2013.03.022
720	Shi, H., García-Reyes, M., Jacox, M. G., Rykaczewski, R. R., Black, B. A., Bograd, S. J.,
721	& Sydeman, W. J. (2021). Co-occurrence of california drought and northeast pa-
722	cific marine heatwaves under climate change. Geophysical Research Letters, 48(17),
723	e2021GL092765.
724	Sniderman, J., Brown, J. R., Woodhead, J. D., King, A. D., Gillett, N. P., Tokarska, K. B.,

-28-

725	Meinshausen, M. (2019). Southern Hemisphere subtropical drying as a transient
726	response to warming. Nature Climate Change, 9(3), 232-236.
727	Tierney, J. E., Haywood, A. M., Feng, R., Bhattacharya, T., & Otto-Bliesner, B. L. (2019).
728	Pliocene warmth consistent with greenhouse gas forcing. Geophysical Research Let-
729	ters, 46(15), 9136–9144.
730	Tierney, J. E., Pausata, F. S., & deMenocal, P. B. (2017). Rainfall regimes of the green sa-
731	hara. <i>Science advances</i> , <i>3</i> (1), e1601503.
732	Tierney, J. E., & Tingley, M. P. (2018). BAYSPLINE: A new calibration for the alkenone pa-
733	leothermometer. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 33(3), 281-301.
734	Wheeler, L. B., Galewsky, J., Herold, N., & Huber, M. (2016). Late cenozoic surface uplift
735	of the southern sierra nevada (california, usa): A paleoclimate perspective on lee-side
736	stable isotope paleoaltimetry. Geology, 44(6), 451-454.
737	Williams, A. P., Cook, B. I., & Smerdon, J. E. (2022). Rapid intensification of the emerging
738	southwestern North American megadrought in 2020–2021. Nature Climate Change,
739	1–3.
740	Windler, G., Tierney, J. E., & Anchukaitis, K. J. (2021). Glacial-interglacial shifts dominate
741	tropical indo-pacific hydroclimate during the late pleistocene. Geophysical Research
742	Letters, 48(15), e2021GL093339.
743	Xie, SP., Deser, C., Vecchi, G. A., Ma, J., Teng, H., & Wittenberg, A. T. (2010). Global
744	warming pattern formation: Sea surface temperature and rainfall. Journal of Climate,
745	23(4), 966–986.
746	Yang, L., Smith, J., Baeck, M. L., Morin, E., & Goodrich, D. C. (2017). Flash flooding
747	in arid/semiarid regions: Dissecting the hydrometeorology and hydrology of the 19
748	August 2014 storm and flood hydroclimatology in Arizona. Journal of Hydrometeorol-
749	<i>ogy</i> , <i>18</i> (12), 3103–3123.
750	Zappa, G., Ceppi, P., & Shepherd, T. G. (2020). Time-evolving sea-surface warming patterns
751	modulate the climate change response of subtropical precipitation over land. Proceed-
752	ings of the National Academy of Sciences, 117(9), 4539–4545.
753	Zaytsev, O., Cervantes-Duarte, R., Montante, O., & Gallegos-Garcia, A. (2003). Coastal
754	upwelling activity on the Pacific shelf of the Baja California Peninsula. Journal of
755	oceanography, 59(4), 489–502.
756	Zhu, J., Poulsen, C. J., & Tierney, J. E. (2019). Simulation of Eocene extreme warmth and
757	high climate sensitivity through cloud feedbacks. Science advances, 5(9), eaax1874.

- Zhu, Y., Zhang, R.-H., & Sun, J. (2020, September). North Pacific Upper-Ocean Cold
- 759 Temperature Biases in CMIP6 Simulations and the Role of Regional Vertical
- 760 Mixing. Journal of Climate, 33(17), 7523–7538. Retrieved 2021-12-20, from
- 761 https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/clim/33/17/
- 762 jcliD190654.xml doi: 10.1175/JCLI-D-19-0654.1

Supporting Information for "Expansion and intensification of the North American Monsoon during the Pliocene"

Tripti Bhattacharya ¹, Ran Feng ², Jessica E. Tierney ³, Claire Rubbelke ¹,

Natalie Burls 4, Scott Knapp 4, Minmin Fu 5

 $^1\mathrm{Department}$ of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Syracuse University, Syracuse NY

 $^2\mathrm{Department}$ of Geosciences, University of Connecticut, Storrs CT

³Department of Geosciences, University of Arizona, Tucson AZ

 $^4\mathrm{Department}$ of Atmospheric, Oceanic and Earth Sciences, George Mason University, Fairfax VA

 $^5\mathrm{Department}$ of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA

Contents of this file

- 1. Text S1 $\,$
- $2. \ {\rm Text} \ {\rm S2}$
- 3. References
- 4. Tables S1 to S4
- 5. Figures S1 to S6

Text S1 - Detailed Methods

Leaf Wax Extraction and Measurement

Approximately 100 samples were processed from DSDP 475 and ODP 1012 respectively. Samples were freeze dried and homogenized. Total lipids were extracted using an accelerated solvent extractor system (ASE 350, Dionex) at a temperature of 100°C and a maximum pressure of 1500 psi. Following previous work in the region, we focus our analysis on the terrestrially-derived C_{30} fatty acid (Bhattacharya et al., 2018; Eglinton & Hamilton, 1967)

Fatty acids were separated from other lipid compounds on a LC-NH₂ gel column. The neutral fraction was eluted using a 2:1 mix of dichloromethane:isopropanol, and the acid fraction was eluted with 4% acetic acid in dichloromethane. We methylated the acids to replace exchangeable hydrogen on the carboxyl group with a methyl group of known isotopic composition. The resultant FAMEs (fatty acid methyl esters) were purified again over silica gel using dichloromethane.

Concentrations of C_{30} FAMEs were determined using a Trace 1310 GC-FID. Hydrogen and carbon isotopic composition of the FAMEs were measured via gas chromatographypyrolysis-isotope ratio mass spectrometry (GC-IR-MS) using a Thermo Delta V Plus mass spectrometer. H₂ and CO₂ gases calibrated to an *n*-alkane standard (A7 mix provided by Arndt Schimmelmann at Indiana University) provided references for each analysis. An internal isotopic standard consisting of a synthetic mix of FAMEs was analyzed every 5-7 samples to monitor drift. Samples were run in triplicate for δD to obtain a precision better than 2%, and in duplicate or triplicate for $\delta^{13}C$ to obtain a precision better than 0.2%. To account for the added methyl group during methylation, the δD and

 δ^{13} C of the methanol was determined by methylating a phthalic acid standard of known isotopic composition obtained from Arndt Schimmelmann at Indiana University, and a mass balance correction was applied to the δ D and δ^{13} C values of our FAMEs. While we initially corrected for ice volume changes using a million-year smoothed version of the benthic oxygen isotope stack (Lisiecki & Raymo, 2005) following the method of (Schrag et al., 1996), this correction had a minimal influence on each record (Figure S1), was omitted in our final analysis.

Modern Plant Sampling and Inferring δD of Precipitation

 δD_{wax} values are offset from δD_p by the apparent fractionation ε_{p-w} . Values of ε are related to ecological differences in wax synthesis across plant clades. Waxes synthesized by graminoids (e.g. grasses) tend to have a larger ε_{p-w} , or are more depleted relative to δD_p , than eudicots (e.g. broadleaved herbs, shrubs and trees (Sachse et al., 2012)). These differences are likely the result of differences in the seasonal leaf wax production in each group, or differences in the pools of intermediate hydrocarbon compounds used in wax synthesis (Gao et al., 2014). Members of Cactaceae, which use the Crassulaic Acid Metabolism (CAM photosynthesis), are also present in the Sonoran Desert. Greenhouse experiments suggest that CAM species may have similar ε values to eudicots (Gao et al., 2014). However, we suggest that members of Cactaceae may not be major contributors to sedimentary leaf waxes. Herbs and shrubs in the NAM region primarily use the C₃ pathway, while most grasses are C₄ taxa (Sachse et al., 2012). C₃ and C₄ taxa exhibit differences in leaf wax δ^{13} C, with a more enriched carbon isotopic signature in C₄ graminoids (Collister et al., 1994). To infer the hydrogen isotopic signature of precipitation, or δD_p , we leverage paired measurements of carbon and hydrogen isotopes of leaf waxes. Our

analyses use an approach that has been widely used in the literature to study hydroclimate signals in leaf wax hydrogen isotopes (Tierney et al., 2017; Bhattacharya et al., 2018; Windler et al., 2020).

Following previous work, we use a Bayesian framework to calculate δD_p from δD_{wax} and $\delta^{13}C_{wax}$. First, we use carbon isotopes in a Bayesian mixing model to identify the proportion of waxes that derive from C₄ graminoids (e.g. grasses using the C₄ photosynthetic pathway). End-members of $\delta^{13}C_{wax}$ were obtained from our own measurements of modern plant communities at the Arizona-Sonora Desert Museum, which include taxa from both the Sonoran Desert ecoregion and southern Baja Thornscrub vegetation (Table S2). These values are based on repeated measurement of new growth on each plant once a month for a calendar year. In order to make measurements more comparable to Plio-Pleistocene leaf wax carbon isotopes measurements, values of $\delta^{13}C$ inferred from modern plants have been corrected for the Suess effect.

Next, we use the proportion of inferred C_4 vegetation to determine the appropriate ε_{p-w} to apply to a given sample. Constraints on ε_{p-w} are obtained from δD_{wax} measurements on Arizona Sonora Desert Museum modern plants. The approach involves weighting the value of ε_{p-w} for C_3 and C_4 plants by the inferred fraction of C_3 and C_4 plants in the sample (Eq. 1).

$$\varepsilon = f_{C4} \cdot \varepsilon_{C4} + (1 - f_{C4}) \cdot \varepsilon_{C3} \tag{1}$$

Finally, we then apply our weighted value of ε_{p-w} to obtain an inferred value of the hydrogen isotopic value of precipitation using Eq. (2). Because all calculations are performed in a Bayesian framework, uncertainties are propagated through all steps of the

calculation. Therefore, while our initial 1σ precision for δD_w measurements is 2 ‰, 1σ uncertainty for our final estimate of δD_p is 6 ‰ for each measurement. Moreover, our inferred values of both end-members of $\delta^{13}C$ and ε_{p-w} agree previous leaf wax datasets from the western US (Smith & Freeman, 2006; Feakins & Sessions, 2010; Sachse et al., 2012).

$$\delta D_{precip} = \frac{1000 + \delta D_{wax}}{(\varepsilon/1000) + 1} - 1000 \tag{2}$$

iCAM5 Simulations with Fixed SSTs

To establish a linkage between precipitation isotopes, monsoon rainfall, and SST changes, we performed a simulation with the isotopologue-tracking enabled Community Earth System Model 1.2 (iCESM1.2) in atmosphere-only mode (e.g. iCAM5) (Brady et al., 2019). The atmospheric model is run at a $0.9^{\circ}x1.25^{\circ}$ horizontal resolution, with 30 vertical layers. While isotope-enabled models have limitations, we note that the preindustrial simulation of iCAM5 used in this study is able capture the seasonal contrast in precipitation δ D found in GNIP station data in Tucson AZ, with an enriched summer monsoon compared to depleted winter rainfall (Figure S6), despite the fact that iCESM1.2's rainfall isotopes are depleted compared to observations at Tucson's GNIP station (Nusbaumer et al., 2017). In addition, iCAM5 performs slightly better than other models at simulating rainfall isotope changes due to changing stratiform fraction (Hu et al., 2018). We therefore suggest that this model is appropriate for investigating changes in δ D_p associated with Pliocene boundary conditions.

We perform one simulation using the SST field from (Fu et al., 2022), which uses reconstructed Pliocene SSTs with amplified warming on the southern California Margin. SSTs used in this simulation are shown in Figure S5, panel a. This simulation is used to diagnose the linkage between SST changes, δD_p , and summer rainfall. In this simulation, we analyze isotopes of water vapor and precipitation, and plot changes in precipitation, winds, as well as derived fields like equivalent potential temperature (θ_e).

To identify the influence of different SST patterns on NAM strength, we perform a set of 7 sensitivity experiments using iCAM5 with prescribed SST fields. All simulations use the same Pliocene boundary conditions adapted for Community Earth System Model, and use CO_2 concentrations of 400 ppm (Feng et al., 2020). Two experiments were designed analyze the impact of uniform warming. SSTs in these experiments are increased by 1°C and 2°C without any changes in spatial patterns (Table S4). The 1°C warming field is shown in Figure S5, panel b. This means that this experiment represents a uniform warming of 1°C *on top of* the SST anomalies from a coupled CESM1.2 simulation from (Feng et al., 2020).

Four of the experiments are designed to sample a range of SST gradient changes associated with CA coastal warming. The coastal warming pattern is derived from the pattern of SST anomalies during the 2014 western U.S. coast marine heat wave event. In order to create prescribed SSTs for the iCAM5 simulations, these SST anomalies were scaled by 1x, 2x, 3x, and 4x and added to Pliocene SST field obtained from a fully-coupled model simulations using the Community Earth System Model version 1.2 (CESM1.2) using the same boundary conditions (Feng et al., 2020). The 1x pattern from these 'MHW-like' experiments is shown in Figure S5, panel c. All experiments were run for 40 model years. The last 20 model years are averaged to produce climatologies. For clarity, Table S4 de-

tails each experiment's SST design, how CA margin and the subtropical/tropical gradient vary across simulations.

Text S2 - Interpretation of Inferred δD_p

Plio-Pleistocene changes in leaf wax isotopes reflect changes in the intensity and spatial extent of moist convection over southern California and Baja California. Modern coretop samples show a more enriched value of δD_p in the southern Gulf of California, where monsoonal, convective rainfall forms a greater proportion of total rainfall (Figure S2). Seasonal changes in precipitation isotopes, measured at a GNIP station in Tucson, also suggest that the summer months, which feature more convective rainfall, have a more enriched isotopic signature (Figure S2) (Bhattacharya et al., 2018).

Monsoon rainfall is characterized by a greater proportion of deep convection, and exhibits a more positive value of δD_p . Deep convective monsoon rainfall results from ice hydrometeors that develop when vapor evaporated in a warm, saturated boundary layer is lifted in strong updrafts, resulting in a more enriched isotopic signature for rainfall (Aggarwal et al., 2016). In contrast, stratiform rainfall tends to form in environments with relatively weak updrafts, and may develop relatively slowly, incorporating mid to upper tropospheric water vapor and undergoing more phase changes, resulting in a depleted isotopic signature (Aggarwal et al., 2016). Intervals with enhanced deep convective and monsoon rainfall to exhibit more enriched values of δD_p , since a greater proportion of annual rainfall comes from enriched, convective rainfall. This is opposite to the 'amount effect,' where more rainfall is associated with a more depleted isotopic signature (Risi et al., 2008), but is consistent with our understanding of regional isotope systematics. The NAM region differs from other tropical regions (e.g. the Asian monsoon) as it receives

a substantial amount of stratiform rainfall, which likely overprints any 'amount effect (Schumacher & Houze, 2003). Other processes, like temperature and changes in vapor source region, may influence inferred δD_p values. Equilibrium temperature effects (e.g. changes in the fractionation between atmospheric water vapor and rainfall) likely only account for 5-7 % of the overall change observed in δD_p values at most. SST anomalies between 3.5 and 3.0 Ma at DSDP 475 and ODP 1012 were between 4-6°C warmer than pre-industrial values, which would translate into a 4 to 6 % change in δD_p relative to atmospheric water vapor, assuming that condensation temperatures shifted similarly to SSTs. This is smaller than the magnitude of δD_p change at both sites, suggesting other

processes are responsible for the full magnitude of the signal.

References

- Adler, R. F., Sapiano, M. R., Huffman, G. J., Wang, J.-J., Gu, G., Bolvin, D., ... others (2018). The Global Precipitation Climatology Project (GPCP) monthly analysis (new version 2.3) and a review of 2017 global precipitation. Atmosphere, 9(4), 138.
- Aggarwal, P. K., Romatschke, U., Araguas-Araguas, L., Belachew, D., Longstaffe, F. J., Berg, P., ... Funk, A. (2016). Proportions of convective and stratiform precipitation revealed in water isotope ratios. *Nature Geoscience*, 9(8), 624–629.
- Ballog, R. A., & Malloy, R. E. (1981). Neogene Palynology from the Southern California
 Continental Borderland, Site 467, Deep Sea Drilling Project Leg 64 (Vol. 63). U.S.
 Government Printing Office.

- Bhattacharya, T., Tierney, J. E., Addison, J. A., & Murray, J. W. (2018). Ice-sheet modulation of deglacial North American monsoon intensification. *Nature Geoscience*, 11(11), 848–852.
- Brady, E., Stevenson, S., Bailey, D., Liu, Z., Noone, D., Nusbaumer, J., ... others (2019).
 The connected isotopic water cycle in the Community Earth System Model version
 1. Journal of Advances in Modeling Earth Systems, 11(8), 2547–2566.
- Collister, J. W., Rieley, G., Stern, B., Eglinton, G., & Fry, B. (1994). Compound-specific δ 13c analyses of leaf lipids from plants with differing carbon dioxide metabolisms. Organic geochemistry, 21(6-7), 619–627.
- Eastoe, C., & Dettman, D. (2016). Isotope amount effects in hydrologic and climate reconstructions of monsoon climates: Implications of some long-term data sets for precipitation. *Chemical Geology*, 430, 78–89.
- Eglinton, G., & Hamilton, R. J. (1967). Leaf epicuticular waxes: The waxy outer surfaces of most plants display a wide diversity of fine structure and chemical constituents. *Science*, 156(3780), 1322–1335.
- Feakins, S. J., & Sessions, A. L. (2010). Controls on the D/H ratios of plant leaf waxes in an arid ecosystem. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 74 (7), 2128–2141.
- Feng, R., Otto-Bliesner, B. L., Brady, E. C., & Rosenbloom, N. (2020). Increased climate response and earth system sensitivity from ccsm4 to cesm2 in mid-pliocene simula-

tions. Journal of Advances in Modeling Earth Systems, 12(8), e2019MS002033.

- Fu, M., Cane, M. A., Molnar, P., & Tziperman, E. (2022, January). Warmer Pliocene upwelling site SST leads to wetter subtropical coastal areas: a positive feedback on SST. Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, e2021PA004357.
- Gao, L., Edwards, E. J., Zeng, Y., & Huang, Y. (2014). Major evolutionary trends in hydrogen isotope fractionation of vascular plant leaf waxes. *PloS one*, 9(11), e112610.
- Hu, J., Emile-Geay, J., Nusbaumer, J., & Noone, D. (2018). Impact of convective activity on precipitation δ 180 in isotope-enabled general circulation models. *Journal* of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 123(23), 13–595.
- Ibarra, D. E., Oster, J. L., Winnick, M. J., Caves Rugenstein, J. K., Byrne, M. P., & Chamberlain, C. P. (2018). Warm and cold wet states in the western United States during the Pliocene–Pleistocene. *Geology*, 46(4), 355–358.
- Lisiecki, L. E., & Raymo, M. E. (2005). A Pliocene-Pleistocene stack of 57 globally distributed benthic $\delta 180$ records. *Paleoceanography*, 20(1).
- Miller, W. E. (1980). The late Pliocene Las Tunas local fauna from southernmost Baja California, Mexico. Journal of Paleontology, 762–805.
- Nusbaumer, J., Wong, T. E., Bardeen, C., & Noone, D. (2017). Evaluating hydrological processes in the C ommunity A tmosphere M odel V ersion 5 (CAM5) using stable

isotope ratios of water. Journal of Advances in Modeling Earth Systems, 9(2), 949–977.

- Remeika, P., Fischbein, I. W., & Fischbein, S. A. (1988). Lower Pliocene petrified wood from the Palm Spring Formation, Anza Borrego Desert State Park, California. *Review of palaeobotany and palynology*, 56(3-4), 183–198.
- Risi, C., Bony, S., & Vimeux, F. (2008). Influence of convective processes on the isotopic composition (δ18O and δD) of precipitation and water vapor in the tropics:
 2. Physical interpretation of the amount effect. Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 113(D19).
- Sachse, D., Billault, I., Bowen, G. J., Chikaraishi, Y., Dawson, T. E., Feakins, S. J., ... others (2012). Molecular paleohydrology: interpreting the hydrogen-isotopic composition of lipid biomarkers from photosynthesizing organisms. *Annual Review* of Earth and Planetary Sciences, 40, 221–249.
- Schrag, D. P., Hampt, G., & Murray, D. W. (1996). Pore fluid constraints on the temperature and oxygen isotopic composition of the glacial ocean. *Science*, 272(5270), 1930–1932.
- Schumacher, C., & Houze, R. A. (2003). The TRMM precipitation radar's view of shallow, isolated rain. Journal of Applied Meteorology and Climatology, 42(10), 1519–1524.
- Smith, F. A., & Freeman, K. H. (2006). Influence of physiology and climate on δD of leaf

wax n-alkanes from C3 and C4 grasses. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 70(5), 1172–1187.

- Tierney, J. E., Pausata, F. S., & deMenocal, P. B. (2017). Rainfall regimes of the Green Sahara. Science advances, 3(1), e1601503.
- Windler, G., Tierney, J. E., Zhu, J., & Poulsen, C. J. (2020). Paleoceanography and Paleoclimatology, 35(12), e2020PA003985.

Site	Name	Lat	Lon	Age (Ma)	Interpretation	Source
1	Diablo Formation	33.26	-116.37	3.8 - 2.6	mesic plant taxa incl Juglans, Carya, Umbellu- laria, Populus	(Remeika et al., 1988)
2	DSDP 467	33.83	-120.75	15 - 2.4	Carya, Juglans indicate summer wet to summer dry transition	(Ballog & Malloy, 1981)
3	Las Tunas	23.3	-109.7	4.75 - 2.6	faunal remains incl. and tortoise indicate perennial freshwater, tropical envi- ronment	(Miller, 1980)
4	Palm Springs	33.57	-115.85	3.3 - 2.6	Lacustrine Deposits	Macrostrat, (Ibarra et al., 2018)
5	Gila Conglomerate	32.48	-108.26	4.0 - 2.6	Lacustrine Deposits	Macrostrat, (Ibarra et al., 2018)
6	Fort Hancock	31.91	-106.5	3.6 - 1.9	Lacustrine Deposits	Macrostrat, (Ibarra et al., 2018)
7	Santa Fe Group 1	33.05	-105.61	19.3 - 1.9	Lacustrine Deposits	Macrostrat, (Ibarra et al., 2018)
8	Santa Fe Group 2	34.15	-107.28	4.9 - 0.7	Lacustrine Deposits	Macrostrat, (Ibarra et al., 2018)
9	Sunshine Ranch/Saugus Fm	34.3	-118.53	3.1 - 2.8	Lacustrine Deposits	Macrostrat, (Ibarra et al., 2018)
10	Hueca Bolson, TX	30.90	-105.30	4.75 - 1.8	Lacustrine Deposits	Macrostrat, (Ibarra et al., 2018)
11	Hungry Valley	34.67	-118.66	4.9 - 2.6	Lacustrine Deposits	Macrostrat, (Ibarra et al., 2018)
12	Paso Robles	36.5	-121.74	1.9-8.3	Lacustrine Deposits	Macrostrat, (Ibarra et al., 2018)
13	Bidahochi	35.95	-109.91	2.6-5.3	Lacustrine Deposits	Macrostrat, (Ibarra et al., 2018)

 Table S1.
 Locations and interpretations of Pliocene data shown in Figure 1

:

Table S2. Individual plant taxa from the Arizona-Sonora Desert Museum of δD_w and $\delta^{13}C$ for C_4 monocots/grasses and C_3 eudicots used to infer ε_{p-w} . Values are for the C₃₀

Metabolism δ^{13} C (%VPDB) δD_w (%VSMOW) Taxon Ecosystem Acacia willardiana -97.1 Thornscrub C_3 no data Ambrosia ambrosoides Sonoran Desert C_3 -35.7 -126 Ambrosia cordifolia Sonoran Desert C_3 -37.5-115 $Ambrosia\ deltoidea$ Sonoran Desert C_3 -31.8-116 Aristida ternipes* Sonoran Desert -29.1 C_4 -158Brongniartia tenuifolia Thornscrub C_3 no data -124 Bursera laxiflora Thornscrub \mathbf{C}_3 no data -151 $Bursera\ microflora$ Thornscrub C_3 no data -132Cathestecum brevifolum* Sonoran Desert C_4 -27.1-164 $Dyschoriste\ hirsutissima$ Thornscrub C_3 no data -137 Sonoran Desert -30.9 -149 Encelia farinosa C_3 Sonoran Desert C_3 $Eupatorium \ sagittatum$ no data -141.8 $Chromolaena\ sagittata$ Thornscurb C_3 no data -145Forchhammeria watsonii Thornscrub C_3 no data -90.07 $Fouqueria\ macdougalii$ Thornscrub C_3 no data -143 $Guaiacum \ coulteri$ Thornscrub \mathbf{C}_3 no data -113 Haematoxylon brasilleto Thornscrub C_3 -34.8-126Henrya insularis Thornscrub C_3 no data -145Ipomnea arborescens Thornscrub no data -126 C_3 Jacquinia macrocarpa Thornscrub no data C_3 -157Jatropha cartiophylla Sonoran Desert C_3 -30.1-179Larrea tridentata Sonoran Desert C_3 -31.7-116 Melochia tomentosa Thornscrub \mathbf{C}_3 no data -155 -26.5 $Muhlenbergia \ porterii^*$ Sonoran Desert C_4 -162Olneya tesota Sonoran Desert C_3 -30.1 -111 $Park in sonia\ microphylla$ Sonoran Desert C_3 -31.9 -156Piscidia mollis Sonoran Desert C_3 no data -149Prosopis velutina Sonoran Desert C_3 no data -106 Randia echinocarpa Sonoran Desert C_3 no data -119 Simmondsia chinensis Sonoran Desert -31.8 -134 C_3 $Solanum \ tridynamum$ Thornscrub \mathbf{C}_3 no data -150Trixis californica Sonoran Desert C_3 -37.2-138 Vachellia campechiana Thornscrub C_3 no data -119Vachellia constricta Thornscrub C_3 -37.1 -105

fatty acid unless otherwise noted. Graminoids/grasses are marked with an asterisk (*).

Table S3. End-members of δ^{13} C and ε_{p-w} used for our calculation of leaf wax-inferred δD_p . δ^{13} C values have been corrected for the Suess effect. All carbon end-members come from modern plants at the Arizona-Sonora Desert Museum

Value	Mean	Standard Error	Sample Size
$\delta^{13}C_3$ (Eudicots)	-32.1	0.7	12
$\delta^{13}C_4$ (Graminoids)	-26.5	2.3	3
ε_{C4} (Eudicots)	-113	3	3
ε_{C3} (Graminoids)	-81	4	31

Table S4. Overview of iCAM5 simulations used in this study, along with the response they identify (see Text S1). Simulations include Pliocene-like SST run using (Fu et al., 2022), as well as six sensitivity experiments.

Experiment	Description	Response	
Pliocene SSTs	SST pattern from (Fu et al., 2022)	Hydroclimate response to Pliocene SSTs	
1°C Uniform	$1^{\circ}\mathrm{C}$ warming + CESM1.2 coupled SSTs	Uniform warming with no pattern change	
2°C Uniform	$2^{\circ}\mathrm{C}$ warming + CESM1.2 coupled SSTs	Uniform warming with no pattern change	
1x MHW	$1\mathrm{x}$ MHW pattern + CESM1.2 coupled SSTs	Amplified Subtropical warming relative to EEP	
2x MHW	$2 \mathrm{x}$ MHW pattern + CESM1.2 coupled SSTs	Amplified Subtropical warming relative to EEP	
3x MHW	$3 \mathrm{x}$ MHW pattern + CESM1.2 coupled SSTs	Amplified Subtropical warming relative to EEP	
4x MHW	4x MHW pattern + CESM1.2 coupled SSTs	Amplified Subtropical warming relative to EEP	



Figure S1. C_{30} alkanoic acid δD , $\delta^{13}C$, and inferred δD_p from sites DSDP 475 (left) and ODP 1012 (right). All values are shown with 1σ uncertainties. a) and d) show δD of the C_{30} alkanoic acid, with gray curve reflecting ice-volume corrected values. The effect of a million-year ice volume correction is extremely minor. b) and e) show carbon isotope data with 1σ analytical error. At site 475, carbon isotopes were analyzed at a lower resolution since for several depths sample material was consumed for hydrogen isotope analysis. c) and f) show inferred δD_p values for each site. Note the larger uncertainty that includes analytical uncertainty and uncertainty from the Bayesian mixing model.



Figure S2. a) Coretop-inferred δD_p in the Gulf of California from (Bhattacharya et al., 2018). Original data replotted using updated $\delta^{13}C$ and ε_{p-w} corrections from Table S2. Background contours indicate the percentage of NAM contribution to annual rainfall. b) Coretop δD_p plotted against the percentage of rainfall on adjacent land regions that derives from stratiform rainfall (decreasing stratiform fraction indicates a greater share of convective precipitation). Stratiform fraction is used following the convention of (Aggarwal et al., 2016). c) seasonal cycle in Tucson GNIP station versus percent stratiform rainfall.



Figure S3. July-September climatology, calculated from 1950 - 2018, of a) rainfall in mm/day, b) sea surface temperatures, and c) equivalent potential temperature or θ_e (solid contours are mid-tropospheric or 400 mb θ_e , while colored contours are low-level (surface to 900 mb) average θ_e). The location of DSDP 475 and ODP 1012 is indicated on each plot.





Figure S4. Mid-Pliocene (3.3 to 3.0 Ma) SST anomalies in alkenone-based temperature records from across north Pacific. Inner circle represents upper 95% confidence interval, middle circle is median value, while outer circle is the lower 95% confidence interval of an ensemble of correlation estimates with analytical and calibration errors propagated through both timeseries. Regions used to create averages of subtropical eastern Pacific (southern California Margin) and eastern equatorial Pacific outlined in dashed rectangles.



Figure S5. SST fields used for iCAM5 simulations (see section 1 and Table S4. a) SSTs from (Fu et al., 2022), which are used in Figure 2 in the main text. b) SSTs from a global 1 degree warming simulation. c) SST pattern with amplified coastal warming (taken from 2014 marine heat wave). In Figure 3, we show results from iCAM5 simulations using 1x and 2x the warming pattern shown in panel b), as well as results from iCAM5 forced with 1x, 2x, 3x, and 4x this pattern.



Figure S6. Observational vs. iCAM5 climatology for rainfall and seasonal cycle of isotopes. a) shows GPCP July-September rainfall (Adler et al., 2018).b) shows the model climatology for the same interval. c) shows the climatology and standard error of measured precipitation δD from the Tucson GNIP station (Eastoe & Dettman, 2016) in dark blue compared to iCAM5's precipitation climatology for a region surrounding Tucson in red.