EarthArXiv PREPRINT: Oceanic redox conditions during the terminal Cambrian extinction event

Xi Chen\textsuperscript{a,b,*}, Graham A. Shields\textsuperscript{b}, Morten B. Andersen\textsuperscript{c}, Chen Qiu\textsuperscript{a}, Si-Yu Min\textsuperscript{a}, Qing-Feng Shao\textsuperscript{d} and Hong-Fei Ling\textsuperscript{a}

\textsuperscript{a} Laboratory for Mineral Deposits Research, School of Earth Sciences and Engineering, Nanjing University, Nanjing 210023, China

\textsuperscript{b} Department of Earth Sciences, University College London, London WC1E 6BT, UK

\textsuperscript{c} School of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Cardiff University, Cardiff CF10 3AT, UK

\textsuperscript{d} Key Laboratory of Virtual Geographic Environment, Nanjing Normal University, Nanjing 210023, China

This manuscript has been submitted to Chemical Geology on 13 Jan 2022 for peer review. Since May 2022, there has been one complete review, and another pending review.

Author for correspondence:
Xi Chen, Department of Earth Sciences, UCL (x-chen@ucl.ac.uk)
EarthArXiv PREPRINT: Oceanic redox conditions during the terminal Cambrian extinction event

Xi Chen\textsuperscript{a,b,*}, Graham A. Shields\textsuperscript{b}, Morten B. Andersen\textsuperscript{c}, Chen Qiu\textsuperscript{a}, Si-Yu Min\textsuperscript{a}, Qing-Feng Shao\textsuperscript{d} and Hong-Fei Ling\textsuperscript{a}

\textsuperscript{a}Laboratory for Mineral Deposits Research, School of Earth Sciences and Engineering, Nanjing University, Nanjing 210023, China
\textsuperscript{b}Department of Earth Sciences, University College London, London WC1E 6BT, UK
\textsuperscript{c}School of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Cardiff University, Cardiff CF10 3AT, UK
\textsuperscript{d}Key Laboratory of Virtual Geographic Environment, Nanjing Normal University, Nanjing 210023, China

Abstract

Marine animal diversity during the late Cambrian was punctuated by a series of extinctions that have generally been attributed to oceanic anoxic events associated with positive carbon isotope excursions. Here we present carbon and uranium isotope compositions ($\delta^{13}$C and $\delta^{238}$U) as proxies for organic matter burial and oceanic redox, respectively, from carbonate rocks of the Wa’ergang section, South China. The dataset spans an interval that includes the last major negative $\delta^{13}$C excursion (TOCE) of the Cambrian Period. The TOCE is a globally documented event, recovery from which corresponds to the terminal Cambrian extinction event. $\delta^{13}$C and $\delta^{238}$U values covary through the section, shifting initially to lower values, with $\delta^{238}$U falling below the modern open-ocean seawater value from the start to the middle of the profile, followed by a shift to higher values towards the end of the Cambrian. The co-occurrence of $\delta^{13}$C and $\delta^{238}$U negative excursions, as well as extinctions associated with rising $\delta^{238}$U, has seldom been reported. Here we argue that positive $\delta^{13}$C vs. $\delta^{238}$U covariation can be produced by expanded intermediate reducing settings (from low-\text{O}_2 suboxia to intermittently sulfidic anoxia), which are likely to have been widespread during the late Cambrian with low atmospheric $p\text{O}_2$ and a greenhouse climate. A stepwise increase in the $\delta^{238}$U baseline in carbonates across the Ediacaran–Cambrian boundary is consistent with the growing importance of an intermediate reducing sink through this interval. We propose further that divergent trends in deep and upper ocean redox conditions, as
well as the waxing and waning of the accommodation space for organic carbon burial, in response to climate and sea-level changes, could have driven the parallel isotope excursions. An expansion of intermediate reducing conditions, rather than persistent anoxic euxinia, is more consistent with the presence of benthic faunas and shoreward extension of deeper-water fauna that may have had a greater tolerance against hypoxia.

**Keywords:** uranium isotopes; TOCE; suboxic; OMZ; intermediate reducing; end-Ptychaspid Biomere extinction

### 1. Introduction

The major body plans (phyla) of animals were already established during the early Cambrian bioradiations (‘Cambrian Explosion’), although available marine ecospace would not be filled to capacity until the Late Ordovician (Sheehan, 2001) and animal diversity suffered repeated extinctions after the ‘Cambrian Explosion’ (Palmer, 1984; Zhuravlev, 2001). Especially, during the Furongian Epoch (497–485.4 Ma, the last Cambian epoch), marine invertebrate fossil diversity decreased significantly during the so-called ‘Furongian Gap’ (Harper et al., 2019). This interval comprises three major extinction events separating suprazonal biostratigraphic units named ‘biomeres’ (Palmer, 1965; Stitt, 1971; Palmer, 1984; Taylor, 2006). Sea-level changes, cooling, upwelling, and anoxic events have all been proposed as possible triggers for those extinctions (Palmer, 1984; Taylor, 2006; Gill et al., 2011; Saltzman et al., 2015).

The youngest Cambrian extinction event, the end-Ptychaspid Biomere extinction, occurred within the last Cambrian stage. Like other end-of-biomere extinctions, it was first recognized on the Laurentian shelf where trilobites experienced major and rapid turnover (Stitt, 1971; Palmer, 1984). This extinction was subsequently shown to also affect conodonts and brachiopods simultaneously (Miller et al., 2006; Freeman et al., 2018).

Although there has been lack of paleontological studies on the global occurrences of this specific end-of-biome extinction, the earlier end-Marjumiid Biomere extinction was observed in China, Australia, and Sweden (Saltzman et al., 2000; Ahlberg et al., 2009). All three late Cambrian extinctions have been noted to be associated with globally correlative carbon isotope excursions (Ripperdan et al., 1992; Saltzman et al., 2011,
2015), confirming their global origins. While the two earlier late Cambrian extinctions are related to the SPICE Event (Steptoean Positive Carbon Isotope Excursion, Saltzman et al., 2000), the last one is related to the TOCE Event (Top Of Cambrian Excursion, Buggisch et al., 2003; Zhu et al., 2006; Peng et al., 2012; Zhu et al., 2021), a negative carbon isotope anomaly that has two synonyms (Zhu et al., 2021):

HERB (HEllmaria—Red Tops Boundary, Ripperdan, 2002; Landing et al., 2020) and SNICE (Sunwaptan Negative Isotope Carbon Excursion, Sial et al., 2013). As with other end-of-biomere extinctions, multiple triggers have been proposed (Westrop and Ludvigsen, 1987; Loch et al., 1993; Runkel et al., 2010), although no clear consensus exists over the cause of either the terminal Cambrian extinction or the TOCE. However, changes in ocean redox conditions may have been a key factor linking those biotic and abiotic events.

In the last decade, uranium isotope compositions ($^{238}$U/$^{235}$U ratios; reported as $\delta^{238}$U, the permil variation of $^{238}$U/$^{235}$U compared to the standard NBL CRM-145), have been used as a novel ocean redox proxy to investigate relationships between environmental and evolutionary crises (e.g., Dahl et al., 2014, 2019; Lau et al., 2016, 2017; Jost et al., 2017; White et al., 2018; Clarkson et al., 2018; Zhang et al., 2018b, 2019, 2020; del Rey et al., 2020). The redox sensitivity of $\delta^{238}$U is due to the exchange between the common U species, U(VI) vs. U(IV), and associated U isotope fractionation. In the modern ocean, U exists as the oxidized U(VI) species in stable uranyl bicarbonate complexes and has a long oceanic residence time (ca. 400 kyr) relative to the ocean mixing time (1–2 kyr). As a consequence, its concentration and isotope composition ($\delta^{238}$U) are homogeneously distributed in open-ocean seawater (OSW) (Andersen et al., 2016). While the dissolved riverine U load is the main ocean input, removal may occur as either the oxidized U(VI) or reduced U(IV) species. The largest U sink is U uptake into reducing sediments, where U(VI) is reduced to the largely immobile U(IV) species with a preference for the heavier $^{238}$U isotope due to nuclear volume effects (Stirling et al., 2007; Weyer et al., 2008). Although U reduction occurs at a redox potential close to that for iron reduction (i.e., less reducing than ‘sulfidic anoxia’ or ‘euxinia’), and primarily at or below the sediment-water interface (Morford et al., 2005), the observed $^{238}$U/$^{235}$U fractionation between sediment and open-ocean seawater ($\Delta_{sed-osw}$), is greatest under persistently sulfidic bottom waters in semi-restricted basins in modern environments (e.g., Andersen et al., 2014; Cole et al., 2020). Along continental margins, U removal occurs in oxygen-poor
regions under a range of different and ‘intermediate’ reducing conditions from anoxia within the sediment-porewater interface to low-O_2 suboxic\(^1\) and intermittent sulfidic anoxic conditions (Dunk et al., 2002). Compared with the semi-restricted euxinic U sink, the intermediate reducing sink is associated with only minor expressed \(\Delta_{\text{sed-OSW}}\), on average, due to various reasons. Firstly, when reductive U removal occurs within sediments beneath suboxic bottom waters, the expressed \(\Delta_{\text{sed-OSW}}\) can be lowered due to diffusion limitation on the U supply (Weyer et al., 2008; Andersen et al., 2014; Lau et al., 2020). Secondly, both spatial and temporal variations of oxygen minimum zones (OMZ) may lead to non-steady state U uptake and mute the expressed \(\Delta_{\text{sed-OSW}}\) (Weyer et al., 2008; Andersen et al., 2016; He et al., 2021). Thirdly, particulate non-lithogenic uranium (PNU, Zheng et al., 2002), i.e., organic-matter-related U, can contribute significantly to total authigenic U when the bottom water has low dissolved oxygen content (<25 µM, Zheng et al., 2002). Because PNU is likely depleted in \(^{238}\text{U}\) (Holmden et al., 2015; Hinojosa et al., 2016; Abshire et al., 2020), its mixing with U uptake \textit{in situ} within the sediments, enriched in \(^{238}\text{U}\), can mute the total expressed \(\Delta_{\text{sed-OSW}}\). In contrast, the U sink of U(VI) species is smaller than the reduced U sink (Dunk et al. 2002) and also generally associated with smaller U isotope fractionation, but towards lighter isotope compositions (e.g., Fe–Mn nodules have \(^{238}\text{U}/^{235}\text{U}\) that are \(~0.2\%) lower than seawater; Goto et al., 2014). A larger U sink is the U(VI) uptake into carbonates, both via biotic or abiotic pathways. Although, a range of \(\delta^{238}\text{U}\) values have been observed from modern carbonates, both towards higher and lower \(\delta^{238}\text{U}\), the majority show little variation from modern seawater (e.g., Weyer et al., 2008; Romaniello et al., 2013; Chen et al., 2016; Clarkson et al., 2020). The observed higher \(\delta^{238}\text{U}\) values are often attributed to U(IV) incorporation in carbonate cements under reducing porewater conditions, while lower \(\delta^{238}\text{U}\) may derive from effects of U adsorption and/or organic matter (e.g., Romaniello et al., 2013; Chen et al., 2016; Clarkson et al., 2021). Because carbonates deposited un-

---

\(^1\) We choose “suboxic” to describe the depositional environments with low-O_2 (without specific upper and lower limits of dissolved O_2) bottom waters, because “hypoxic” (used by Andersen et al., 2017) is for “physiological regime” (Tyson and Pearson, 1991) and its definition depends on the specific organism. All the terms for redox conditions (oxic, suboxic, non-sulfidic anoxic, intermediate redox, sulfidic, euxinic) refer to the bottom waters unless additional specifications, because water column redox conditions are more pertinent to animals.
der oxic conditions show limited U isotope fractionation, marine carbonates are the favored geological ar-
chive for estimating the $\delta^{238}\text{U}_{\text{OSW}}$ in the past (e.g., Weyer et al., 2008; Romaniello et al., 2013; Chen et al.,
2016; Clarkson et al., 2020).

The global redox sensitivity of the uranium isotope proxy relates to changing OSW $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ values due to the
mass-weighted isotope fractionation of the burial flux ($\delta^{238}\text{U}_{\text{OSW}} = \delta^{238}\text{U}_{\text{input}} - \sum \Delta f_i; f_i$ is the proportion for
each burial flux) compared to the input. Consequently, geological records of negative $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ excursions have
been taken to indicate expansion of euxinia (Cole et al., 2020), even though both the modern carbonate and
intermediate reducing fluxes contribute a large proportion of the total U sink today compared to euxinic
semi-restricted basins (Dunk et al. 2002; Andersen et al., 2016, 2017; Cole et al., 2020). Alternatively, we
argue here that muted or positive excursions of $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ could relate instead to expansion of the intermediate
reducing sink at the expense of the euxinic sink and/or expansion of the oxic sink.

This study presents uranium and carbon isotope profiles and metal concentrations of marine limestones span-
ning the full TOCE interval at the Wa’ergang section in South China, in order to study the coupling between
oceanic redox conditions and the global carbon cycle during the late Cambrian, with implications for im-
proved understanding of the terminal Cambrian extinction event.

2. Materials and methods

The Wa’ergang section is situated in Taoyuan County, western Hunan Province, China. It is located on the
Jiangnan Slope on the southeastern margin of the Yangtze Platform (Fig. 1B). At the end of the Cambrian
Period, the Yangtze plate was located on the northern margin of the Gondwana continent. The middle to up-
per Cambrian strata were continuously deposited in the studied area, and are mainly composed of richly fos-
siliferous carbonate rocks with stratigraphically useful assemblages of conodonts and trilobites (Peng et al.,
2014; Bagnoli et al., 2017; Dong and Zhang, 2017). The basin should have been well connected to the open
ocean because the section contains a rich assemblage of cosmopolitan trilobites that can be used for intercon-
tinental correlation (Peng et al., 2012, 2014).
A total of 32 dark-gray limestone samples spanning the TOCE Event were collected from the upper part of Shenjiawan Formation at the Wa’ergang section. Our sampling was interrupted by a possibly allochthonous massive carbonate debris bed (~3 m), and this bed marks the approximate boundary between the *Eoconodon-tus* and *Cordylopus proavus* conodont zones (Bagnoli et al., 2017) and also the end-Ptychaspid Biomere extinction horizon (see section 4.4 for more details). The Wa’ergang section above this bed is not as continuous as below, and so previous biostratigraphic (Bagnoli et al., 2017) and carbon isotope chemostratigraphic (Li et al., 2017) studies also stopped around this level. Fine-grained, micritic limestones without secondary veins and recrystallization were finely powdered. 50–150 µg powder of each sample was reacted with phosphoric acid at 70 °C in a Kiel IV carbonate device, and the CO\textsubscript{2} generated was analyzed on a MAT 253 mass spectrometer in the Nanjing Institute of Geology and Palaeontology, Chinese Academy of Sciences. Both δ\textsuperscript{13}C and δ\textsuperscript{18}O values are reported relative to the V-PDB. The long-term external reproducibilities of δ\textsuperscript{13}C and δ\textsuperscript{18}O analyses are ±0.04‰ and ±0.08‰, respectively (1 SD, 600 replicates during one year of the laboratory standard GBW-04405). Metal concentration and U isotope analyses were carried out using an ELEMENT XR ICP-MS (Nanjing University) and NEPTUNE Plus MC-ICP-MS (Nanjing Normal University), respectively. Samples (~100 mg) were leached by agitation for 4 to 12 hours in 1 M HCl at room temperature, until no further effervescence was observed (Lau et al., 2016; Zhang et al., 2018a). The sample supernatant was separated from the remaining residue. A small aliquot was taken and diluted 500-fold for each sample prior to the metal analyses. Rhodium (Rh) was added as internal standard for analyses (samples and standards). Concentration of each metal was calculated by comparison of the \textsuperscript{103}Rh-normalized intensity of a sample with that of an artificial standard with high Ca and Mg contents similar to carbonates. The remaining sample was spiked with the IRMM-3636 \textsuperscript{236}U–\textsuperscript{233}U double spike, aiming for a \textsuperscript{236}U/\textsuperscript{235}U ratio of ~4 before preparation for U purification. The U purification from matrix elements were done using RE resin following published protocols used to successfully separate U from a range different matrix including carbonates (Bura-Nakić et al., 2018, 2020; Clarkson et al., 2020) and subsequently dissolved in 2% (v/v) HCl aiming for ~50 ppb U for mass spectrometric measurements. Full procedural blanks were <0.1 ng U, negligible to the sample sizes measured. Uranium isotope measurements were performed in a static collection with 10\textsuperscript{11} Ω resistors on all Faraday cups. Corrections of \textsuperscript{238}U and \textsuperscript{235}U impurities (from IRMM-3636), tailing, hydrate formation and mass
Bias corrections were carried out as described by Andersen et al. (2016). The $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ values were measured relative to the NBL CRM-145 standard. The internal precisions (2 SE) on measured $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ values are better than $\pm0.05\%$ for all samples. Consecutive measurements of the in-house CZ-1 uraninite standard gave $\delta^{238}\text{U} = −0.04 ± 0.06\%$ (2 SD, 45 replicates during two years), in excellent agreement with the obtained values for the same standard from different laboratories and analytical set-ups (e.g., Stirling et al., 2007; Andersen et al., 2014, 2016; Bura-Nakić et al., 2018; Clarkson et al., 2020). Further, analyses of the IAPSO seawater gave $\delta^{238}\text{U} = −0.38 ± 0.04\%$ (2 SD, $n = 3$) within error of other determinations of this standard (Holmden et al., 2015).

3. Results

The $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values from Wa’ergang section range between $0.15\%$ and $2.43\%$, and the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values lie within a narrow range ($−10.2$ to $−8.8\%$). The $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ profile exhibits a negative excursion in the middle (Fig. 1C). There is no covariation between $\delta^{18}\text{C}$ versus $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ or Mn/Sr (Fig. 2A, 2B).

The $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ data ranges between $−0.66\%$ and $−0.14\%$ and shows a depth profile (from 745 m to 875 m) that mimics the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ trend, with a near synchronous negative excursion. Values decrease from $−0.14\%$ to a nadir of $−0.66\%$ in the middle (at 815 m), and then return to near initial values ($−0.23\%$) at the end of the TOCE Event (Fig. 1C). The Ca-normalized U concentration ($\text{U/Ca, µmol/mol}$) ranges between 0.52 and 3.22 (Fig. 1C, 2D). The highest U/Ca ratios are observed at the very beginning and end of the depth profile, whereby the four samples with the highest U/Ca ratios also exhibit the highest $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ values. The U/Ca ratios, excluding those four samples, distribute in two groups clustering around 0.8 and 1.5, respectively (Fig. 2D), and show weak correlation with $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ values largely due to U/Ca ratios clustering around 1.5. There is no correlation with $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ values for the other samples having U/Ca ratios clustering around 0.8, and the range and trend of $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ curve exhibited by these samples remains the same as all the samples. The U/Al (ppm/ppm) ratios in the carbonate leachates range from $1.43 \times 10^{-4}$ to $1.54 \times 10^{-3}$. Neither U contents nor U isotope compositions covary with Al concentrations (with correlation coefficients $R^2 < 0.06$ and $t$-test $p$-values $>$ 0.33).
Figure 1: A: Paleogeographic map showing South China and other paleocontinents during the late Cambrian (Scotese, 2021). The red star marks Wa’ergang section. B: Simplified geological map of South China and the location of Wa’ergang section on the southeastern margin of the Yangtze plate. C: Chemostratigraphic data (carbon and uranium isotope compositions) of late Cambrian succession from Wa’ergang section in Taoyuan County, western Hunan Province, China. The $\delta^{238}$U data possibly being affected by dolomitization or reducing porewater are denoted by a triangle and open circles, respectively. The $\delta^{238}$U data are corrected for detrital U contributions. Curves of $\delta^{238}$U and $\delta^{13}$C are smoothed by LOESS fitting with shaded 95% confidence intervals. A red dashed line right below a carbonate debris bed marks the boundary between the *Eoconodontus* and *Cordylodus proavus* conodont zones (Bagnoli et al., 2017), and this biozone boundary corresponds to the rising limb of the TOCE (Landing et al., 2011; Saltzman et al., 2015; Li et al., 2017; Azmy, 2019) and the terminal Cambrian end-Ptychaspid Biomere extinction event (Palmer, 1984; Landing et al., 2011).

### 4. Discussion

#### 4.1. Assessment of the isotope data

There are a range of considerations for the obtained isotope data that require evaluation. It is particularly important to demonstrate how likely measured data show primary marine signatures or are altered by various syngenetic, diagenetic or mixing effects.

Diagenetic alteration of carbonates, by interaction with meteoric waters, tends to deplete Sr and $^{18}$O but enrich Mn. Because carbon is a major element in carbonates but minor in meteoric waters, its isotope composi-
tion is less easily altered compared with Sr and O. Limestones with Mn/Sr ratios lower than 10 are considered most likely to preserve primary $\delta^{13}$C values (Kaufman and Knoll, 1995). In our dataset, Mn/Sr ratios are all lower than 0.7, which is even lower than a proposed upper limit of 2 for preserving primary Sr isotope compositions (Kaufman and Knoll, 1995). The $\delta^{18}$O values do not correlate with Sr, Mn, or Mn/Sr (with correlation coefficients $R^2 < 0.09$ and $t$-test $p$-values $> 0.11$), suggesting that $\delta^{18}$O values are also not obviously altered. Moreover, neither $\delta^{18}$O nor Mn/Sr, as diagenetic proxies, vary systematically with changes in $\delta^{13}$C ($R^2 < 0.06$ and $p$-values $> 0.19$), which strongly supports use of these carbon isotope data for interpreting the paleoceanic environment.

Figure 2: Cross plots of $\delta^{13}$C vs. proxies for diagenetic alteration (A: Mn/Sr ratio, B: $\delta^{18}$O), and $\delta^{238}$U vs. proxies for dolomitization (shift $\delta^{238}$U to lower values, C: Mg/Ca molar ratio) and reducing porewater (shift $\delta^{238}$U to higher values, D: U/Ca) in limestone samples from Wa’ergang section. The data possibly being affected by dolomitization or reducing porewater are denoted by a triangle (low $\delta^{238}$U and high Mg/Ca) and open circles (high $\delta^{238}$U and high U/Ca), respectively.

For the U isotope systematics, the potential effects of detrital contribution, U isotope fractionation mechanisms and diagenesis all require discussion. In terms of detrital contribution, the Al content in carbonates may be related to trace levels of detrital siliciclastic rock components that may dissolve during the
leaching (e.g., Clarkson et al., 2020) and can therefore be used to assess siliciclastic contamination of the leachates. Assuming that the Al is solely related to the detrital siliciclastic contribution, it is possible to correct the bulk $\delta^{238}$U values for this by mass balance, based on assumptions about the U/Al and $\delta^{238}$U of this phase. Assuming $U/Al = 3.5 \times 10^{-5}$ (ppm/ppm; McLennan, 2001) and $\delta^{238}U = -0.3\%$ (Andersen et al., 2014) for the detrital contribution results in a shift in measured $\delta^{238}$U less than 0.072%, indicating that any effect from detrital U would be negligible in these limestone leachates. Similarly, Clarkson et al. (2020) performed leaching experiments on carbonates using different leaching reagents showed no bias in the obtained $\delta^{238}$U using 1 N HCl compared to a range of other milder leaching methods.

There are several syngenetic or diagenetic effects that may affect the $\delta^{238}$U in carbonates. Carbonate $\delta^{238}$U values can shift to lower values during dolomitization, especially when molar Mg/Ca ratios are higher than ca. 0.5 (Romaniello et al., 2013). However, data from upper Jurassic carbonates do not show any correlation between the degree of dolomitization (Mg/Ca) and $\delta^{238}$U values (Herrmann et al., 2018), which is also true for our samples ($R^2 = 0.10$, $p$-value = 0.21, and see Fig. 2C). Our samples with low $\delta^{238}$U values ($<-0.6\%$) generally have low Mg/Ca molar ratios (<0.21), with only one exception whose Mg/Ca molar ratio is 0.47 (denoted by a triangle in Fig. 1C and Fig. 2C). In contrast, the authigenic uptake of additional U under reducing conditions can shift $\delta^{238}$U to higher values. This effect is likely to result dominantly from uptake of reduced U into carbonate-cements under reducing pore-water conditions (e.g., Romaniello et al., 2013; Clarkson et al., 2021). It is striking that the four samples with the highest $\delta^{238}$U values also have the highest U contents (see Fig. 2D). This suggests that they may have been affected by authigenic uptake of U under reducing conditions, analogous to modern Bahamian carbonates (Romaniello et al., 2013). In Eocene carbonate samples, Clarkson et al. (2021) did observe the effect of reduced U uptake and higher $\delta^{238}$U with increasing U/Ca, whereby the increase initiated at >0.125 (µmol/mol) in those samples. While the exact U/Ca threshold in Clarkson et al. (2021) cannot be used in our case due to different oceanographic settings and ocean U budgets, we argue that these four U-rich samples, towards the base and top of the depth profile, might record
higher $\delta^{238}$U than contemporaneous seawater. For the remaining samples with U/Ca < 1.6, there is no obvious trend of increasing U concentration with high $\delta^{238}$U (Fig 2D) and so their measured $\delta^{238}$U values are considered likely to reflect a near seawater $\delta^{238}$U value at the time of carbonate formation.

### 4.2. The TOCE Event: a global negative carbon isotope excursion

The negative $\delta^{13}$C TOCE excursion has been well-documented in nearly all late Cambrian paleocontinents, including organic carbon isotope profiles in Baltica, and carbonate carbon isotope profiles in western Laurentia, northeastern Laurentia, Precordillera terrane, Siberia, Australia, Tarim, North China and South China (Miller et al., 2015; Azmy, 2019; Landing et al., 2020; Zhu et al., 2021). The amplitude of this $\delta^{13}$C shift ranges between −0.5‰ and −4‰. The nadir of TOCE consistently occurs within the lower part of the *Eocyonodontus* Zone in most of the above-mentioned paleocontinents with sections having well-established biozones (Landing et al., 2011; Azmy, 2019; Landing et al., 2020). Our data from Wa’ergang section show that the onset of the full TOCE Event lies within the *Proconodontus muelleri* Zone, which is also true for Black Mountain in Australia (Ripperdan et al., 1992) and Sneakover Pass in Utah, USA (Miller et al., 2015). The intercontinentally correlative TOCE excursion implies a perturbation of the global carbon cycle.

There is still no clear consensus on the cause of TOCE, but it may be linked to sea-level changes. The association between the $\delta^{13}$C minimum of TOCE and a regression event is evidenced from disconformities and detailed sequence stratigraphic analysis on various paleocontinents, including Australia (Ripperdan et al., 1992), North China (Ripperdan et al., 1993) and Laurentia (Miller et al., 2015). Ripperdan (2002) proposed that weathering of ‘old carbon’ on formerly productive platforms provided the source of isotopically light carbon. However, weathering of both organic matter and carbonate would have increased after a sea level fall. Furthermore, there is no evidence of widespread shallow water organic rich sediments in the underlying strata, instead, carbonate was deposited in broad tropical epicontinental (epiric) seas throughout the late Cambrian (Landing, 2011). Therefore, enhanced weathering would have provided isotopically heavy rather than light carbon. We suggest that the TOCE Event could have been driven by changes to carbon sinks rather than sources (see detailed discussions in section 4.4 and 4.5).
4.3. Positive carbon and uranium isotope shifts and the terminal Cambrian extinction

The late Cambrian (Furongian Series) records three extinction events at the top of the Marjumiid, Pterocephaliid, and Ptychaspid biomeres, respectively (Palmer, 1984). The youngest one, the end-Ptychaspid Biomere extinction, coincides precisely with the *Eoconodontus–Cordylodus proavus* conodont Zone boundary (Palmer, 1984; Landing et al., 2011). This biostratigraphic level corresponds to the rising limb of the TOCE, i.e., a $\delta^{13}$C positive shift following the TOCE nadir (Landing et al., 2011; Saltzman et al., 2015; Li et al., 2017; Azmy, 2019).

Generally, there is evidence against sea-level changes as the ‘killing mechanism’ of the late Cambrian end-of-biomere extinctions: 1) The lithological changes associated with all three end-of-biomere extinctions are not uniform in different locations, and are usually minimal, although obvious faunal turnovers are similar. 2) Well-defined continent-wide regressions occurred within the Pterocephaliid and Ptychaspid biomeres without obvious faunal effects (Palmer, 1984; Loch et al., 1993; Taylor, 2006). Specifically, the link between sea-level (and/or climate) changes and the end-Ptychaspid extinction is highly controversial (Westrop and Ludvigsen, 1987, cf. comments by Loch et al., 1993 and Taylor, 2006; Runkel et al., 2010, cf. comments by Landing, 2011). In contrast, positive $\delta^{13}$C excursions are strongly related with recurring extinctions from the late Cambrian Furongian Stage to Early Ordovician Tremadocian Stage, providing evidence of periodic expansions of anoxia delaying further animal diversification (Saltzman et al., 1995, 2011, 2015). Coincidence of positive $\delta^{34}$S shifts at the tops of Marjumiid (Gill et al., 2011) and Symphysurinid (Saltzman et al., 2015) biomeres, and a negative $\delta^{238}$U shift at the top of the Marjumiid biomere (equivalent to the onset of SPICE, Dahl et al., 2014), provide further evidence for anoxia. However, there has been no strong evidence for anoxia linked with all the other biomeres. Moreover, a negative shift (end-Marjumiid, Dahl et al., 2014), positive shift (end-Ptychaspid, this study), and fluctuation (end-Pterocephaliid, Dahl et al., 2014) of $\delta^{238}$U have all been observed during the end-of-biomere extinctions, which appears to weaken the proposed link between end-of-biomere extinctions and anoxia.
Both positive and negative $\delta^{13}C$ shifts are observed to be associated with negative $\delta^{238}U$ shifts indicating anoxia during other extinction events or delayed biotic diversifications/recoveries. Broad coincidence of a positive $\delta^{13}C$ shift with a negative $\delta^{238}U$ shift was observed from late Ediacaran (Zhang et al., 2018b), early and late Cambrian (Dahl et al., 2014, 2019), late Silurian (del Rey et al., 2020), Late Devonian (White et al., 2018), Early Triassic (Lau et al., 2016), earliest Jurassic (Jost et al., 2017), and mid-Cretaceous (Clarkson et al., 2018) successions, which is commonly explained by enhanced organic carbon ($^{13}C$-depleted) burial due to expansion of anoxia (with $^{238}U$-enriched sediments). In comparison, negative shifts of both $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{238}U$ have been reported less commonly, from Cryogenian (Lau et al., 2017), end-Permian to earliest Triassic (Zhang et al., 2020), Early Triassic (Zhang et al., 2019), and Triassic/Jurassic boundary (Jost et al., 2017) successions. This type of correlation has been attributed to anoxia caused by the release of isotopically light carbon sourced from volcanic degassing and/or decomposition of sedimentary or oceanic organic carbon reservoirs. In other words, changes in the global carbon cycle, as proxied by $\delta^{13}C$ shifts, are regarded as the cause in the latter situation, rather than the result of anoxic events as in the former situation. As a special case, isotopically light C emissions during the mid-Cretaceous OAE2 accompanied insignificant negative $\delta^{13}C$ shifts, but induced pronounced and prolonged anoxia as reflected by positive $\delta^{13}C$ shifts and negative $\delta^{238}U$ shifts (Clarkson et al., 2018).

Positive $\delta^{238}U$ shifts follow negative shifts through most $\delta^{238}U$ ‘excursions’ (contra: Lau et al., 2017), indicating the waning of anoxia after a perturbation. During a positive $\delta^{13}C$ excursion, a positive $\delta^{238}U$ shift usually corresponds to the recovery/falling limb of the $\delta^{13}C$ excursion (e.g., del Rey et al., 2020; White et al., 2018; Lau et al., 2016; Jost et al., 2017; Clarkson et al., 2018). However, during a negative $\delta^{13}C$ excursion, a positive $\delta^{238}U$ shift can simply correspond to the recovery/rising limb of the $\delta^{13}C$ excursion (Zhang et al., 2020), or lag behind a subsequent positive $\delta^{13}C$ shift due to sustained anoxia (i.e., corresponds to the recovery/falling limb of the secondary positive $\delta^{13}C$ excursion, e.g., Jost et al., 2017; Clarkson et al., 2018), or be absent due to even more prolonged anoxia (Lau et al., 2017). Therefore, cases with coeval positive shifts of both $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{238}U$ are rare. Besides the aforementioned one case with nearly synchronous recoveries of C and U isotope data during negative $\delta^{13}C$ excursions (Zhang et al., 2020), positive $\delta^{238}U$ shifts have also been
observed during ongoing positive $\delta^{13}C$ shifts (Dahl et al., 2014; Clarkson et al., 2018). It is plausible that the latter cases may have resulted from a smaller oceanic reservoir of U than C, so that $\delta^{238}U$ responded more rapidly than $\delta^{13}C$ in dynamic states when anoxia waned (Dahl et al., 2014; Clarkson et al., 2018). However, this ‘reservoir effect’ is inconsistent with similar decay timescales for $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{238}U$ excursions during the SPICE, which implies that other control factors than extent of anoxia may have existed (Dahl et al., 2014).

Nearly synchronous negative excursions (including both falling and rising limbs) of $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{238}U$, as we observe for TOCE, are indeed rare (e.g., Zhang et al., 2020). Besides, all the aforementioned cases with negative shifts of both $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{238}U$ are likely related to warming and anoxia (Lau et al., 2017; Jost et al., 2017; Zhang et al., 2019, 2020), while the falling limb of TOCE has been linked to sea-level fall and therefore cooling. Almost all the aforementioned negative $\delta^{238}U$ shifts are also accompanied by the deleterious effects of anoxia on animals (contra: Tostevin et al., 2019), but the terminal Cambrian extinction is above the nadir of TOCE and coincident with a positive $\delta^{238}U$ shift indicating oxygenation. These unusual features of the TOCE Event could be explained by significant abiotic and biotic roles played by intermediate reducing conditions, as discussed in the following three sub-sections.

### 4.4. Positive $\delta^{13}C$ vs. $\delta^{238}U$ correlation corroborated by intermediate reducing settings

The seawater $\delta^{13}C$ value is proportional to the relative fraction of carbon buried as organic matter when there are no significant changes in the sources. In modern oceans, ~80% of organic carbon is buried in deltaic sediments and mainly of terrestrial origin (Schlesinger and Melack, 1981; Berner, 1982). The deltaic sink of the late Cambrian would have been significantly reduced because of the lack of land plants. If we omit this sink, the euxinic organic C sink comprises only <5% of the total, whereas about half of organic C burial occurs in intermediate reducing settings (Berner, 1982). By comparison, U isotopic fractionation is most significant in euxinic settings, while muted in intermediate reducing settings (see Section 1 and following discussions).

Therefore, $\delta^{238}U$ is a proxy for the extent of persistent sulfidic anoxia, and is highly sensitive because a disproportionately large fraction (~24%) of reduced U is buried in modern euxinic settings accounts for only <0.1% of global sea-floor area (Dunk et al., 2002; Andersen et al., 2016). As similarly proposed by Dahl...
et al. (2014), although a negative $\delta^{238}$U still requires expansion of anoxia, larger contributions from intermediate reducing settings (vs. deltaic sediments in Dahl et al., 2014) for both C and U burial can corroborate the positive $\delta^{13}$C vs. $\delta^{238}$U correlation, as we observed throughout the TOCE Event. Such intermediate reducing settings could have been common in late Cambrian oceans.

Redox reconstruction of a continental margin transect provides evidence for the early Cambrian establishment of modern-type OMZs dominated by ferruginous conditions and surrounded by oxic waters (Guilbaud et al., 2018). The persistence of small carbonaceous fossils within the Baltic OMZ suggests that the OMZ oscillated between oxic and ferruginous conditions (Guilbaud et al., 2018). Such specific and dynamic oceanic redox conditions are likely to lead to muted expressed average $\Delta_{\text{sed-OSW}}$ (Weyer et al., 2008; Cole et al., 2020; He et al., 2021). The occurrence of such dynamic OMZs could have increased in the late Cambrian due to the progressive warming that occurred since the early Cambrian (Frakes et al., 1992), and therefore their impacts on U and C budgets could have also been enhanced. The sea-level controlled changes in intersection areas of OMZs and continental margins (Lau et al., 2016) would have enhanced the coupling between $\delta^{13}$C and $\delta^{238}$U.

Low atmospheric $p$O$_2$ (ca. 50% present atmospheric level, Krause et al., 2018), together with low O$_2$ solubility in a typical greenhouse climate (Berner, 1990; Frakes et al., 1992; Trotter et al., 2008; Landing, 2012), would have suppressed the dissolved-oxygen level in the surface ocean seawater during the late Cambrian. Furthermore, there is no unambiguous evidence for late Cambrian polar ice caps, and thus modern-like thermohaline circulation ventilating the deep ocean may not have existed then (Landing, 2012). Saline seawater with low O$_2$ concentration from lower latitude marginal seas may have contributed to the deep ocean seawater, leading to halothermal instead of thermohaline circulation (Brass et al., 1982; Railsback et al., 1990). Therefore, redox conditions with suboxic bottom waters and underlying anoxic sediments could have been more expansive in both shallow epeiric/marginal and deep open oceans, rather than mainly confined within highly productive continental shelves like today (ca. 6% of modern sea-floor area, Andersen et al., 2016). It is noteworthy that eukaryote-dominated “aquatic bioturbation” may have suppressed persistent euxinia and maintained the ventilation of the deep ocean since the early Cambrian (Butterfield, 2018), even when suboxic
waters may have expanded due to above mentioned physical causes. In contrast to the marginal OMZs, such deep ocean suboxic conditions could have been more stable, although the effective Δ_{sed–OSW} could potentially have been diffusion-limited because of reductive U removal within the sediments under suboxic waters (Weyer et al., 2008; Andersen et al., 2014; Lau et al., 2020).

Under both of the above two intermediate reducing settings, organic-related PNU may have been high, even in pelagic settings because of higher preservation potential for the ‘marine snow’ in a less-oxygenated ocean than today. Moreover, because PNU is likely depleted in $^{238}\text{U}$ (Holmden et al., 2015; Hinojosa et al., 2016; Abshire et al., 2020), the coupling between organic-related PNU and intermediate reducing conditions could further corroborate the positive $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ vs. $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ correlation.

To test the potential of the intermediate reducing U sink as a key driver of oceanic $\delta^{238}\text{U}$, we utilize a simple semi-quantitative mass balance model to evaluate the impact of intermediate reducing settings on the global U cycle. Firstly, the duration and magnitude of the $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ excursion during TOCE Event have to be estimated. The whole excursion, including both decreasing and rising limbs, spans about two conodont zones, or half of Cambrian Stage 10 (489.5–485.4 Ma), which suggests a duration of ca. 2 Myr. Because the starting and ending levels of the $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ dataset likely have been impacted by incorporation of reduced U, we choose the lowest sample with relatively low U/Ca, and use its $\delta^{238}\text{U}_{\text{carb}}$ value (−0.41‰) as the starting level for $\delta^{238}\text{U}_{\text{OSW}}$.

For the sake of simplification, we consider that the studied interval ends at the same level as indicated by the overall $\delta^{238}\text{U}_{\text{carb}}$ trend.

Table 1: Parameters used in U mass balance modeling.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>U concentration$^1$ and isotope composition$^2$ in modern open-ocean seawater</td>
<td>3.238 ppb, −0.39‰</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total volume of the ocean</td>
<td>$1.37 \times 10^{21}$ L</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total area of ocean floor</td>
<td>$3.61 \times 10^{14}$ m²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern rate of U output flux and isotope fractionation$^2$:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Euxinic</td>
<td>$1.130 \times 10^{-3}$ g m$^{-2}$ yr$^{-1}$, 0.42‰</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate reducing</td>
<td>$2.088 \times 10^{-4}$ g m$^{-2}$ yr$^{-1}$, 0.15‰</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carbonates (oxic)</td>
<td>$1.158 \times 10^{-4}$ g m$^{-2}$ yr$^{-1}$, 0‰</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metalliferous (oxic)</td>
<td>$7.121 \times 10^{-7}$ g m$^{-2}$ yr$^{-1}$, −0.25‰</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern U output flux and isotope fractionation: hydrothermal$^2, 3$</td>
<td>$6 \times 10^6$ mol, 0.25‰</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern total U input flux and isotope composition$^2, 4$</td>
<td>$45 \times 10^6$ mol, −0.246‰</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
(1) Chen et al. (1986); (2) based on U output flux and areal fraction of each redox setting estimated by Andersen et al. (2016); (3) assume constant values; (4) assume steady state of modern marine $^{238}$U–$^{235}$U budget.

Figure 3: The results of simple semi-quantitative mass balance modeling for the evolution of open-ocean seawater (OSW) $\delta^{238}$U under two scenarios of changing intermediate reducing and euxinic areas during the terminal Cambrian. The initial $f_A^{\text{inter}}$ is 30% and 60% in scenarios A and B, respectively, and it evolves to decrease by 20% in both scenarios. The oxic areal extent of carbonate deposits is held constant. This modeling mainly demonstrates: 1) An obtained $\delta^{238}$U$_{OSW}$ value could accommodate various combinations of proportions of redox conditions; 2) A scenario with higher $f_A^{\text{inter}}$ has a smaller oceanic U reservoir; 3) How [U] and $\delta^{238}$U of OSW respond to changes in negatively correlated $f_A^{\text{eux}}$ and $f_A^{\text{inter}}$, and the magnitude of increase in $f_A^{\text{eux}}$ could be less than the magnitude of decrease in $f_A^{\text{inter}}$ (scenario A).

In the modern, the intermediate reducing sink of U has a lower burial rate and a smaller average isotope fractionation factor ($\Delta_{\text{inter--OSW}} \approx +0.15\%$) than the euxinic sink (cf. typical $\Delta_{\text{eux--OSW}}$ is between $+0.4\%$ and $+0.6\%$, Andersen et al., 2014; Cole et al., 2020). Combining those two factors, a greater areal fraction of the intermediate reducing settings ($f_A^{\text{inter}}$) at the cost of euxinic settings ($f_A^{\text{eux}}$) would have increased both the ocean U reservoir and the $\delta^{238}$U$_{OSW}$, and vice versa, as demonstrated in the modeled oceanic U evolution through time in Fig. 3. An obtained $\delta^{238}$U$_{OSW}$ value could accommodate various combinations of proportions
of redox conditions, as demonstrated by modeling scenario A versus B in Fig. 3. A scenario with a higher $f^{\text{A}}_{\text{inter}}$ has a smaller oceanic U reservoir. For example, obtaining a $\delta^{238}\text{U}_{\text{OSW}}$ of $-0.41\%$, as used as the initial state, scenario B with a higher $f^{\text{A}}_{\text{inter}}$ (60%) than scenario A (30%), it induces a lower $[\text{U}]_{\text{OSW}}$ for scenario B than A (18% vs. 31% of modern level for A and B, respectively). Therefore, even if the $\delta^{238}\text{U}_{\text{OSW}}$ was similar to the modern value, the oceanic U reservoir could have been smaller and probably more sensitive to changes in oceanic redox state during times when intermediate reducing settings were more expansive (scenario B vs. A, or late Cambrian vs. modern).

Obviously, the modeling has some caveats including the definition and choice of set values of the parameters used (listed in Table 1). However, our main purpose here is to illustrate how different changes in the relative proportions of intermediate reducing and euxinic U sinks can drive the same observed shifts in $\delta^{238}\text{U}$, and to highlight the importance of the intermediate reducing sink in minimizing the oceanic U reservoir and inducing positive $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ shifts. An overall increasing size of the intermediate reducing U sink, including modern-type dynamic OMZ settings and persistently suboxic settings overlying anoxic sediments, should create a higher $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ baseline than an ocean dominated by a sustained euxinic sink. Plotting a compilation of available carbonate $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ data from late Ediacaran to Cambrian times (Fig. 4) shows, despite considerable variability in the data, a higher $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ baseline (reflected in median, mean, and nadirs of negative excursions) during the Cambrian than the Ediacaran. The $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ data from this study are consistent with this higher baseline.

### 4.5. Plausible climatic and oceanic drivers

Unlike all the reported cases with covarying negative $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ shifts (Lau et al., 2017; Jost et al., 2017; Zhang et al., 2019, 2020), there is no evidence for either significant injection of isotopically light carbon (e.g., volcanic degassing, oxidization of methane hydrates or DIC pool) or warming during the TOCE Event. Although weathering of ‘old carbon’ may have contributed to the negative $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ shift, it is unlikely that those recalcitrant sedimentary carbon could have significantly increased the atmosphere $\rho\text{CO}_2$ and global temperature. On the contrary, as mentioned in section 4.2, there is evidence for sea-level fall and thus cooling associated with the TOCE nadir.
With generally high $p\text{CO}_2$ levels, the relationship between the extent of anoxia and $p\text{CO}_2$ is highly non-linear, and both cooling and warming can induce expansion of anoxia (modeling results shown in Fig. 2 of Pohl et al., 2021). The trends for deep and upper ocean redox conditions in response to cooling can be divergent, such as the cases of the last glacial maximum (LGM, Jaccard and Galbraith, 2012) and end-Ordovician (Bartlett et al., 2018; Pohl et al., 2021). Cooling increases oxygen solubility and oxygenates the upper ocean (<1500 m, Riedinger et al., 2021). However, less efficient ocean circulation transporting oxygen to depth (i.e., ventilation) and/or slowing down of the degradation of sinking organic matter (i.e., biological pump) could deoxygenate the deep ocean (Sigman et al., 2010; Matsumoto, 2007). Therefore, we prefer scenario A in Fig. 3 as better fitting the ocean redox changes during the TOCE Event, with a spread of both anoxic (possibly in deep ocean) and oxic areas (possibly in shallower ocean). When the magnitude of a $\delta^{238}\text{U}_{\text{OSW}}$ negative excursion is a known fixed value, a higher $f_A^{\text{inter}}$ baseline requires a larger expansion of euxinia to compensate for the inefficiency of the intermediate reducing sink in burying the heavier $^{238}\text{U}$ isotope during the negative $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ shift. As demonstrated in Fig. 3, when the $f_A^{\text{inter}}$ evolves to decrease by 20% in both scenarios, scenario A with a smaller initial $f_A^{\text{inter}}$ (30%) requires $f_A^{\text{eux}}$ to be ca. 10%, whereas scenario B with a larger initial $f_A^{\text{inter}}$ (60%) requires $f_A^{\text{eux}}$ to be ca. 23%. In scenario B, the increase in $f_A^{\text{eux}}$ is comparable to the decrease in $f_A^{\text{inter}}$, which is inconsistent with the negative $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ shift observed. Considering that the modern deep ocean (water depth >1500 m) comprises 86% of the total ocean area, the intermediate reducing conditions have to be largely distributed in the deep ocean for scenario B with a higher $f_A^{\text{inter}}$ baseline (60%). In contrast, our preferred scenario A with a lower $f_A^{\text{inter}}$ baseline (30%) implies relatively limited distribution of intermediate reducing conditions, probably in areas covered by the oldest and most O$_2$-deficient bottom seawater and/or related with eastern boundary upwelling and thus high primary productivity. Slower ventilation and/or a more efficient biological pump during cooling would have promoted euxinia in those areas.
Figure 4: $\delta^{238}$U in carbonates from late Ediacaran to Cambrian. A) $\delta^{238}$U data measured in this study are colored in blue. Grey data points are literature data compiled by Chen et al. (2021). Circles are data greater than the riverine input value ($-0.24\%o$, note that the highest estimate compiled by Andersen et al. (2016) is used as the criteria) marked by the black dashed line. The blue dashed line marks the modern seawater value ($-0.39\%o$, Andersen et al., 2016). The red lines are the medians of late Ediacaran and Cambrian, excluding values higher than the riverine input value. B) Probability distribution plots of $\delta^{238}$U values of late Ediacaran (yellow, $n = 229$) and Cambrian (green, $n = 172$), excluding values higher than the riverine input value. The mean $\delta^{238}$U value (red dots) increased significantly (a one-sided $t$-test yields a $p$-value of $4.4 \times 10^{-7}$) from late Ediacaran to Cambrian.

Although the deep ocean can be deoxygenated, both organic carbon burial and intermediate reducing conditions tend to focus towards (on or near) the continental margin, because of higher nutrient availability (from river or eastern boundary upwelling) and higher preservation potential in areas with higher sedimentation rates (Berner, 1982). Therefore, sea level changes can significantly affect the extent of intermediate reducing conditions and the accommodation space for organic carbon burial, and thus contribute to the positive $\delta^{13}$C
vs. $\delta^{238}$U correlation. Such effects could have been more exacerbated during Cambrian Stage 10, because sea level is estimated to be more than 100 m higher than today (Miller et al., 2005), and marginal/epeiric seas were extensive (see the paleogeographic map reconstructed by Scotese (2021) in Fig. 1A).

The more doctrinal convergent trends in deep and upper ocean redox conditions during a warming/transgressive interval would have increased the extent of both anoxic and intermediate reducing settings, and been reflected by a more usual negative $\delta^{13}$C vs. $\delta^{238}$U correlation, such as observed from the onset of the SPICE (Dahl et al., 2014). However, the upper part of the positive $\delta^{13}$C shift of SPICE is associated with a positive $\delta^{238}$U shift and a regression (Saltzman et al., 2000; Dahl et al., 2014; Egenhoff et al., 2015), which is explained by increasing deltaic sinks for both C and U by Dahl et al. (2014). We propose that it may also have been due to oxygenation of former anoxic areas and increasing intermediate reducing settings after massive reductant (organic carbon and pyrite) burial (Gill et al., 2011; Saltzman et al., 2011) and cooling. It is noteworthy that those positive shifts of both $\delta^{13}$C and $\delta^{238}$U start with an end-of-biomere extinction, follow an ongoing positive $\delta^{13}$C shift, and are associated with a regression, while the scenario for the rising limb of TOCE is quite the opposite for all those aspects.

### 4.6. Implications for the terminal Cambrian extinction

We propose that the shifts to higher values for both $\delta^{13}$C and $\delta^{238}$U, following nadirs, at the terminal Cambrian extinction level, resulted from an expansion of intermediate reducing settings and a concurrent reduction of anoxic (euxinic) settings. This apparently contradicts the traditional hypothesis that anoxia was the ‘killing mechanism’ for the end-of-biomere extinctions. An expansion of persistent anoxic euxinia would have exterminated both shallow- and deeper-water fauna, and inhibited animal diversification (e.g., end-Permian extinction). However, such a scenario contradicts the observations that: 1) Benthic faunas and/or bioturbation occur in worldwide successions during the SPICE interval encompassing the first and second end-of-biomere extinctions (Wotte and Strauss, 2015; Egenhoff et al., 2015); 2) Abundant epifaunal orthid brachiopods co-occurred with the olenimorphs during the second and third end-of-biomere extinctions (Taylor, 2006); 3) All the end-of-biomere extinctions had both high diversification and high extinction rates (Fortey,
1989), and shoreward extending deeper-water benthos, such as olenid trilobites, show a significant higher survival than endemic shelf taxa (Stitt, 1975; Palmer, 1984; Westrop and Ludvigsen, 1987). By contrast, an expansion of intermediate reducing conditions would remove onshore high-O$_2$-obligatory incumbents, while giving opportunities to the offshore low-O$_2$-tolerant fauna (Hallam et al., 1989), such as olenimorphs and brachiopods (Farrell et al., 2011). Moreover, intermediate reducing conditions may also reinforce evolutionary innovations (Wood and Erwin, 2018). It is noteworthy that the innovation-promoting ‘anoxia’, with DO < ~0.5 mL/L and/or dynamic redox, used by Wood and Erwin (2018; see section “II. Low-oxygen habitats: ecology and evolution”), is almost equivalent to the ‘intermediate reducing’ term used herein, rather than to persistent anoxia or euxinia.

Importantly, the loci of reducing conditions are even more pertinent to the extinctions/turnovers than their areal extents. A negative $\delta^{238}$U shift is observed to coincide with the end-Marjumiid Biomere extinction (Dahl et al., 2014) and precede the terminal Cambrian end-Ptychaspid Biomere extinction (this study), respectively, which indicates an expansion of anoxia possibly occurring in the deep ocean for both cases. However, the former case may have also been associated with increasing intermediate reducing conditions killing shelf animals, while animals can still thrive in the oxic shallow ocean for the latter case (similar to the scenario for terminal Ediacaran proposed by Tostevin et al., 2019). The later positive shifts of both $\delta^{13}$C and $\delta^{238}$U for the latter case is associated with transgression (Miller et al., 2015), and possibly also warming. Both warming and transgression induce upward and landward movements of OMZ (Riedinger et al. 2021), which may progressively invade the shelf areas and finally trigger the terminal Cambrian extinction. Although the direction of sea-level change at the exact time of the terminal Cambrian extinction is still in dispute (see section 4.3), the invasion of OMZ over the shelf could have been geologically transient and blurred in geological records, but still sufficient to kill.

5. Conclusions

Wa’ergang section $\delta^{238}$U data, spanning an interval that includes the terminal Cambrian extinction event, exhibit a negative excursion parallel to the TOCE carbon isotope event. This kind of covariation between $\delta^{13}$C
and $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ has only rarely been reported and discussed, and is usually attributed to global warming which is inconsistent with evidence for a regression at the nadir of the TOCE. As with other end-of-biomere extinctions, the terminal Cambrian extinction level is associated with a positive $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ shift (i.e., rising limb of the TOCE Event). However, unlike some of the end-of-biomere and many major Phanerozoic extinctions, which were also linked to anoxic events based on S (positive $\delta^{34}\text{S}$ shift) and/or U (negative $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ shift) isotope data, the terminal Cambrian extinction horizon is associated with a positive $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ shift, which is generally considered to indicate ocean oxygenation.

Positive $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ vs. $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ correlation can be explained by intermediate reducing conditions that are likely to have been widespread during the late Cambrian with low atmospheric $p\text{O}_2$ and a greenhouse climate. A higher $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ baseline in Cambrian compared with late Ediacaran oceans is consistent with the increasing importance of the intermediate reducing sink.

Coeval negative $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ excursions could have driven by divergent trends in deep and upper ocean redox conditions in response to climate changes, as well as the waxing and waning of the accommodation space for organic carbon burial due to sea-level changes. The rising limbs of those isotope excursions, at the terminal Cambrian extinction level, could have resulted from an increase in the intermediate reducing sink for both C and U. An expansion of intermediate reducing settings, rather than anoxic euxinia, is more consistent with the presence of benthic faunas and biogeographical changes associated with not only the terminal Cambrian, but also other late Cambrian end-of-biomere extinctions.

A shift in the $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ value indicates a change in the extent of anoxia, it may co-occur with a change in the extent of intermediate reducing conditions. The loci, rather than merely the extents, of those reducing conditions are particularly pertinent to the biotic effects. Therefore, both positive and negative shifts in $\delta^{238}\text{U}$ have been linked with extinction events. Progressive understanding about geochemical proxies and the nature of specific biotic events should be combined to keep testing the proposed cause-and-effect linkage between past environmental changes and biological evolution.
Acknowledgements

This research was supported by Natural Science Foundation of China (41603006, 41661134048) and Strategic Priority Research Program (B) of the Chinese Academy of Sciences (XDB26000000). We thank Shan-Chi Peng and Xue-Jian Zhu (NIGPAS) for guidance on fieldwork; Tao Yang (NJU) for help with ICP-MS; Jing Liu (NIGPAS) for carbon isotope analyses; Qian Liu and Pan Sun (NJU) for their assistance in the chemistry lab. Thomas Algeo and an anonymous reviewer provided perceptive and constructive critical comments on the manuscript, and their input significantly improved the manuscript.

References


https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2020.06.002

Dong, X., Zhang, H., 2017. Middle Cambrian through lowermost Ordovician conodonts from Hunan, South China. J. Paleontol. 91, 1–89. https://doi.org/10.1017/jpa.2015.43


https://doi.org/10.2110/palo.2011.p11-050r


https://doi.org/10.1017/jpa.2018.8

https://doi.org/10.1038/nature09700


Jaccard, S.L., Galbraith, E.D., 2012. Large climate-driven changes of oceanic oxygen concentrations during the last deglaciation. Nat. Geosci. 5, 151–156. https://doi.org/10.1038/ngeo1352


https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2020.01.021

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0016756817000188

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022336000024859


https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1116412

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.palwor.2006.10.017

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annpal.2015.04.008

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2005.05.015


https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.2107034118


https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gr.2012.10.014


https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1155814


