The fingerprints of flexure in slab seismicity

D. Sandiford^{1,2,3}, L.M Moresi^{2,4}, M. Sandiford², R. Farrington², T. Yang⁵

3	$^1 \mathrm{Institute}$ of Marine and Antarctic Studies, University of Tasmania
4	² School of Earth Sciences, University of Melbourne
5	$^{3}\mathrm{Helmholtz}$ Centre Potsdam - German Research Centre for Geosciences (GFZ)
6	⁴ Australian National University
7	⁵ Southern University of Science and Technology

8 Key Points:

1

2

9	• Intermediate depth seismicity is controlled by bending in a wide range of settings
10	• Geometric differences lead to contrasting seismic expression between east and west
11	Pacific slabs
12	• Double seismic zones associated with bending are often masked by the strong tem-
13	perature controls on seismicity

Corresponding author: Dan Sandiford, dan.sandiford@utas.edu.au

14 Abstract

Earthquake moment tensors in east Pacific (ePac) slabs typically show downdip ten-15 sional axes (DT), whereas in the west Pacific (wPac) they typically show downdip com-16 pressional axes (DC) or have mixed orientations indicative of unbending. Prevailing con-17 ceptual models emphasise uniform stress/deformation modes, i.e. bulk stretching or short-18 ening, as the dominant control on intermediate depth seismic expression. In contrast we 19 propose that much of the diversity in seismic expression is consistent with expectations 20 of flexural strain accumulation due to systemic differences in slab geometry. Our anal-21 ysis reveals two largely unrecognised features of ePac intraslab seismicity. Firstly, earth-22 quake clusters consistent with slab unbending are present in ePac slabs, albeit at much 23 shallower depths than typical of wPac slabs. Secondly, intermediate depth ePac DT seis-24 micity is strongly localised to the upper half of zones undergoing curvature increase, such 25 as flat slab segments. Our study highlights how the seismic expression of slab flexure is 26 impacted by the relative contribution of brittle and ductile deformation. The strongly 27 asymmetric temperature structure that is preserved in sinking slabs means that seismic-28 ity disproportionately records the deformation regime in the colder part of the slab, above 29 the neutral plane of bending. The expression of in-plane stress may be discernible in terms 30 of a systematic modifying effect on the seismic expression of flexure. 31

32 1 Introduction

Inclined zones of earthquakes extending to depths of up to 700 kms beneath vol-33 canic arcs delineate the geometry of subducting slabs and provide a unique insight into 34 plate tectonics and mantle convection (e.g. McKenzie, 1969; Elsasser, 1969). To the ex-35 tent that rupture mechanisms of these subduction related earthquakes are thought to 36 reflect the force balance in subducting slabs, they have been used to provide key insights 37 into the basic mechanisms of plate tectonics. The force system in slabs includes buoy-38 ancy forces due to thermal and metamorphic density contrasts, flexural stress associated 39 with slab bending and unbending, and resistance arising from slip along the subduction 40 interface and deeper mantle penetration (e.g. Isacks & Molnar, 1971; Sleep, 1979; Fu-41 jita & Kanamori, 1981; House & Jacob, 1982). 42

Intermediate-depth earthquakes have traditionally been defined as those in the ~
 70-300 km depth range, where the subducting slab is mainly detached from the over-riding

-2-

plate (Gutenberg & Richter, 1954). The classic studies of Isacks and Molnar (1969, 1971) 45 showed that either the least or most extensive moment tensor eigenvectors tends to be 46 aligned in the slab downdip direction, consistent with the slab acting as a stress guide 47 in a weaker mantle (Fig. 1d,h. Elsasser, 1969). They also identified that the co-seismic 48 deformation patterns at intermediate depths correlate with broader seismic distribution 49 in the slab. Slabs segments with no deep earthquakes, or significant gaps between inter-50 mediate and deep earthquakes, usually exhibit downdip tension/stretching referenced 51 herein as 'DT' (Fig. 1h). In contrast, slabs with deep and continuous seismicity tend to 52 be dominated by downdip compression/shortening, referenced as 'DC' (Fig. 1d). Based 53 on these spatial relationships, Isacks and Molnar (1971) helped to establish the prevail-54 ing paradigm that slab earthquake orientations mainly reflect a uniaxial, or uniform, de-55 formation mode in the slab reference frame. The enduring nature of these insights is ex-56 emplified in a quote from a recent study "slabs seem to be stretching as gravity acting 57 on excess mass in the slabs pulls them down, like dangling springs hanging from and at-58 tached to lithosphere above" (Molnar & Bendick, 2019). 59

The correlations identified by Isacks and Molnar (1971), which relate to the seis-60 micity patterns in individual slab segments, also expose contrasts between eastern Pa-61 cific slabs (ePac) and western Pacific slabs (wPac). In ePac slabs such as Chile, inter-62 mediate depth focal mechanisms are strongly dominated by DT earthquakes whereas wPac 63 slabs such as Tonga tend to be dominated by DC events. DT regimes are often attributed 64 to uniform stretching due to slab pull (Isacks & Molnar, 1971; Rietbrock & Waldhauser, 65 2004; Bloch et al., 2018; Bailey et al., 2009), while DC regimes have been attributed to 66 the propagation of compressional stress along the slab from interactions between the deep 67 parts of the slab and the transition zone (Figs 1d & 1h, Fujita & Kanamori, 1981; Gur-68 nis et al., 2000; Billen et al., 2003). 69

In detail, it has long been recognised that slab seismicity patterns are more complex than either strictly DC or DT, leading to the proposition that other deformation modes such as flexure are expressed in some slabs, e.g. northern Japan, Kuriles, Tonga, northern Marianas and eastern Aleutians. In these cases, intermediate depth focal mechanisms exhibit a systematic polarity switch, suggesting that while the upper part of the slab is in downdip compression the lower part is in down dip tension (Engdahl & Scholz, 1977; Hasegawa et al., 1978; Sleep, 1979; Tsukahara, 1980; Samowitz & Forsyth, 1981;

-3-

77

Kawakatsu, 1986b, 1986a; Wang, 2002; Kita et al., 2010). Such Double Seismic Zones

(DSZ) are consistent with unbending in the presence of dehydration embrittlement.

However, because some DSZs continue beyond the expected depths of unbending, 79 and others have an opposite polarity to that expected from slab unbending (Comte et 80 al., 1999), additional sources of stress have been argued to play a significant role in lo-81 calising DSZ seismicity (Fujita & Kanamori, 1981; Brudzinski et al., 2007). Some stud-82 ies have focused on DSZs as an expression of metamorphic/dehydration phenomena, of-83 ten without explicit consideration of the associated rupture mechanisms or sources of 84 deviatoric stress (e.g. Peacock, 2001). Indeed, metamorphic and fluid processes have long 85 been seen as key to intermediate depth earthquake nucleation (e.g. Isacks & Molnar, 1971) 86 and have dominated discussions of slab seismicity in recent decades (Green & Houston, 87 1995; Hacker et al., 2003; Kirby et al., 2013; Seno & Yamanaka, 2013; Peacock, 2001; Tsu-88 jimori et al., 2006; Faccenda, 2014; M. Chen et al., 2019). 89

Even allowing for the strong weakening role played by dehydration, the concept that 90 some slabs undergo appreciable rates of stretching $(10^{-15} \text{ s}^{-1}, \text{ e.g. Kawakatsu}, 1986a)$ 91 implies high deviatoric stresses. This is because uniform stretching involves not only the 92 deformation of a shallow, brittle part of the slab but also the deeper, ductile slab core 93 (e.g. Capitanio et al., 2009). Conrad and Lithgow-Bertelloni (2004) argued that in or-94 der to produce bulk stretching rates in the order of 10^{-15} s⁻¹ the effective tensional stress 95 magnitudes may be as much as 500 MPa, assuming effective slab viscosity several hun-96 dred times higher than typical upper mantle. While uncertainties in slab rheology mean 97 such stress estimates are speculative, they are not implausible given the thermal and com-98 positional buoyancy forces in subducting slabs are of order 10^{13} N.m⁻¹. 99

In this study we argue that strain accompanying geometric bending (Fig. 1a,e) pro-100 vides an important control on the seismic moment release in many Pacific margin slab 101 settings, albeit in ways that are subtly obscured by the rheological transition from brit-102 tle to ductile deformation. We show, firstly, that earthquakes due to slab unbending are 103 much more widespread than previously recognised, occurring in both ePac as well as wPac 104 slabs. An important difference is that in ePac slabs the unbending takes place at much 105 shallower depths than in wPac slabs. Hence, most ePac unbending earthquakes have strong 106 spatial overlap with the megathrust zone and so have been largely overlooked in previ-107

-4-

ous analyses. In Section 2 we describe a procedure to filter megathrust earthquakes from global catalogs, that helps reveal the characteristic ePac shallow unbending signature.

We also show that ePac intermediate depth seismicity is conspicuously clustered 110 in the upper parts of curvature-increasing zones associated with full or partial slab flat-111 tening. In such zones, we speculate that seismicity is mainly restricted to the cold, up-112 per half of the slabs, where they evidence down-dip stretching and that the associated 113 shortening in the lower half of the slab is largely accommodated aseismically. Crucially, 114 while the larger earthquakes reported in the global catalogs tend to show uniform inter-115 mediate depth DT seismicity, microseismic studies in Chile have revealed oppositely-polarised 116 DSZs (Comte & Suarez, 1994), consistent with flexure. For geometric bending to be ex-117 pressed so prominently, strain rates associated with flexure (Fig. 1b,f) must be compa-118 rable to, or exceed, those associated with uniform stretching modes due to, for exam-119 ple, slab pull (Fig. 1d,h). This is consistent with the notion that slab buoyancy is largely 120 supported by drag in the upper mantle. Variations in the uncompensated slab pull com-121 ponent will impact the relative location of the bending neutral plane with respect to the 122 brittle ductile transition. This effect can have a strong impact on seismic expression, var-123 iously enhancing or impeding seismicity beneath the neutral plane. 124

¹²⁵ 2 Terminology, methods and manuscript structure

In seismology the term 'intermediate-depth' typically refers to subduction related 126 earthquakes with hypocentral depths in the range 70-300 km. We argue that the restric-127 tion to events deeper than about 70 kms has imposed somewhat arbitrary limitations 128 on analyses of subduction related seismicity. Here we use the term 'slab' or 'intraslab' 129 earthquakes to refer to all earthquakes within the subducting lithosphere from the on-130 set of bending near the outer-rise to the deepest limit of seismicity at ~ 700 km. How-131 ever, our analysis focuses only on earthquakes shallower than 300 km. This is because 132 uncertainties in slab geometry as well as earthquake hypocenters increase with depth. 133 In addition, slab earthquake activity rates are typically very low at depths of around 300 134 km (e.g. Vassiliou et al., 1984). As a consequence, our methods are not well suited to 135 depths beyond a few hundred kilometres. Importantly, we assume no intrinsic distinc-136 tion between earthquakes with hypocentral depths above and below 70 km. We still oc-137 casionally refer to the intermediate depth range, as this remains a familiar specification 138 of a particular depth range. 139

-5-

We also consider the term 'outer-rise' earthquakes is something of a misnomer because earthquakes that result from the bending of the incoming plate are concentrated in the outer trench slope and often extend landward of the trench to regions of the slab beneath the shallow part of the fore-arc.

Hence we will refer to the region where the incoming plate experiences increasing curvature as the 'outer bending zone' (or OBZ). Downdip of the OBZ, after passing through peak curvature, slabs invariably straighten in a zone of unbending which we term the primary unbending zone (or PUZ). These regions are labelled in Fig. 1a.

In discussing contributions to the slab deformation rate, we emphasise the distinc-148 tion between flexural and uniform modes (see Fig. 1). We use the terms flexure and bend-149 ing somewhat interchangeably, in keeping with historical developments in the literature. 150 Flexural strain is associated with changes in curvature. Curvature is considered positive 151 when the slab curvature is concave down. Material may respond to a change in curva-152 ture in a number of ways, for instance by simple bending, or by flexural slip. While flex-153 ural slip has been discussed in relation to slab seismicity (Romeo & Álvarez-Gómez, 2018), 154 our study focuses on simple bending, in which cross-sections orthogonal to the plate re-155 main planar. In this case the total strain is proportional to the curvature, and is char-156 acterised by anti-symmetry across the neutral plane. Regions where curvature is increas-157 ing, for example, are associated with downdip extension above and compression below 158 the neutral plane. Arguments that bending/unbending is a controlling factor stem pri-159 marily from the observation polarity switches in earthquake moment tensors in double 160 seismic zones (DSZ). In contrast, for a 'uniform' mode of slab deformation, involving ei-161 ther bulk slab stretching or shortening in the downdip direction, such polarity switches 162 are precluded. 163

Strain rates associated with changes in curvature can be separated into a time dependent and advective component. Where the morphology of the slab is changing in time, for instance a reduction in the curvature radius associated with slab steepening, there is a time dependent component of the curvature rate. However, even if the morphology is stationary, bending still occurs where material passes through finite curvature gradients. This component of the curvature rate is often referred to as advective (Ribe, 2010; Buffett & Becker, 2012) or kinematic (e.g. Kawakatsu, 1986a). Here we use the term 'ge-

-6-

ometric bending' to emphasise the association between the bending rate and the downdipcurvature gradient.

It is important to note that bending is a description of strain, and implies no spe-173 cific constitutive behavior. In particular, the reader should be wary of thinking in terms 174 of elastic sheet mechanics. If slabs behaved as perfectly elastic sheets stress would vary 175 systematically with the total curvature e.g. Fig. 1c,g), and in the process of unbending 176 the plate would simply return to an undisturbed elastic state. The occurrence of inter-177 mediate depth seismicity, along with a range of other observations, provides a strong ar-178 gument that this is not the case (Chapple & Forsyth, 1979; Goetze & Evans, 1979; Billen 179 et al., 2003; Sleep, 2012). 180

In describing the relationships between between slab geometry and seismicity, we refer frequently to the slab midplane. We use this term in relation to both observed slab geometries (sections 3 and 5) and the analysis of a numerical model (section 4). The notion of a midplane serves as a proxy for the neutral plane of bending, which plays a key role in determining the way deformation responds to changes in curvature. The estimation and applicability of the midplane is discussed in more detail in the supplementary material.

The term 'seismic expression' refers to the spatial distribution of hypocenters along with the associated moment tensors. Slab dynamics in idealised flexural and uniform modes is very different (Fig 1, and we would expect the seismic expression to reflect this to some degree. In addition to the dynamic state of the slab, the seismic expression is obviously very dependant on the relative contribution of brittle and ductile deformation.

Our analysis primarily focuses on relationships between earthquake data and slab 193 geometry, and so is limited by uncertainties in both. A detailed outline of our methods 194 are provided in the supplementary material, which covers our treatment of earthquake 195 data, and numerical methods. We combine the global CMT (Ekström et al., 2012) and 196 EHB (Engdahl et al., 1998) catalogs, to improve depth uncertainties and relate them us-197 ing the either the Slab1 (Hayes et al., 2012) or Slab2 (Hayes et al., 2018) models, as dis-198 cussed in the supplementary material. A novel step is our filtering of shallow intraslab 199 earthquakes from those on the subduction interface, as briefly described below. 200

-7-

'Megathrust' earthquakes on the subduction interface constitute a very significant 201 proportion of the overall seismic activity in the shallow part of subduction zones. Al-202 though megathrust seismicity does not overlap spatially with intermediate depth earth-203 quakes sensu stricto (> 70 km), filtering of potential megathrust events is extremely im-204 portant in terms of identifying intraslab seismicity at shallow depths beneath the fore-205 arc wedge. Even with well resolved depth locations, uncertainties mean we cannot un-206 ambiguously discriminate intraslab from megathrust events on hypocenter data alone. 207 The filtering procedure we use defines the strike and rake of the reference megathrust 208 rupture tensor $(\mathbf{M}^{\text{ref}})$, assuming a pure double-couple mechanism. A similarity condi-209 tion (χ) for a given earthquake with (\mathbf{M}^k) is referenced to the tensor dot product (:) of 210 the normalised moment tensors: 211

$$\chi = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{M}_{ij}^{\text{ref}} : \mathbf{M}_{ij}^{k} \\ \hline |\mathbf{M}^{\text{ref}}||\mathbf{M}^{k}| \end{bmatrix}$$
(1)

We assume an event is a megathrust rupture if it has a hypocentral depth less than 70 km and is within 20 km of the relevant slab surface model and a similarity condition of $\chi \ge 0.75$. Further details are provided in the supplementary material.

The manuscript is structured as follows. Section 3 provides a summary of the seis-215 mic expression and morphology of representative Pacific margin slab sections, highlight-216 ing key features that motivate our analysis. Section 4 summarises insights of slab dy-217 namics drawn from a numerical subduction model in which flexural modes dominate the 218 strain rate field. Drawing on the modeling insights, Section 5 revisits the observations 219 presented in section 3 to examine the specific relation between seismicity and curvature 220 gradients needed to assess the role played by geometric bending. In the Discussion we 221 summarise the main findings, and explore some of the broader issues that stem from them. 222

223

3 Comparative seismology and geometry of the Pacific slabs

224

225

226

227

228

229

In this section we compare three wPac slab segments (Fig. 2) in Tonga, Japan, and the Kuriles, and three ePac slab segments (Fig. 4) in Chile, Peru and Central America, using trench perpendicular transects to provide a regional overview of both slab geometry and seismicity. While deep (> 300 km) seismicity is portrayed in some of the accompanying figures, our analysis is restricted to earthquakes shallower than 300 km. In our representations (e.g. Fig. 2a), coloured points show earthquakes designated as in-

traslab events, while earthquakes that lie more that 20 km above the projected slab sur-230 face, in the slab normal direction, are shown as small black points. Because the along-231 strike slab morphology tends to more variability with depth, the deviation in hypocen-232 ters from a 'region-average' slab geometry increases with depth. This accounts, for in-233 stance, for the large number of outliers in Tonga at depths > 300 km. However, the 'region-234 average' slab geometries generally provide a consistent fit to slab seismicity at depths 235 less than 300 km for most of the regions described here. There are some complexities 236 in the case of the ePac slabs, discussed in more detail later. 237

We represent the orientation of slab earthquake moment tensors by projecting the 238 T-axis onto trench-perpendicular vertical sections (e.g. Fig. 3). The T-axes projections 239 are not scaled by magnitude, so their projected length reflects the difference in azimuth 240 of moment tensor eigenvectors with respect to the trench normal direction. We note T-241 axes necessarily lie within the quadrant with the smallest stress eigenvector and are com-242 monly assumed to represent the orientation of most extensive co-seismic strain release 243 (Isacks & Molnar, 1971; Bailey et al., 2009; Yang et al., 2017). The color of the T-axes 244 represents the angle relative to the local slab orientation. Red colours are DC events, 245 blue are DT events. 246

Seismicity associated with the OBZ is clearly evident in each of the wPac regions, 247 with the onset of characteristic normal faulting events distances of around 50 km sea-248 ward of the trench in Tonga and 100 km in Japan and the Kuriles. In all cases this DT 249 seismicity appears to continue, in a largely continuous manner, landward of the trench, 250 up to about 70 km in the case of Tonga. As discussed later, this suggests that the cur-251 vature of the slab continues to increase downdip from the trench. This morphological 252 property is corroborated in the Slab1 model, which represents a surface fit to the seis-253 micity (discussed in more detail in section 5). Yet, it runs counter to typical models of 254 elastic or elastic-plastic plate flexure (Caldwell et al., 1976), where unbending occurs be-255 fore the trench, even when the influence of yielding is carefully considered (Chapple & 256 Forsyth, 1979). Deeper DC events in the OBZ are generally viewed having a reciprocal 257 flexural origin to DT ones, reflecting shortening beneath the neutral plane (Chapple & 258 Forsyth, 1979; Craig et al., 2014). Based on the datasets used in this study, only Tonga 259 exhibits an unambiguous record of deep DC events in the OBZ. The onset of these events 260 is virtually coincident with the shallower DT events, at around 50 km from the trench. 261 In the Kuriles and Japan the number of potential DC events is very low compared with 262

-9-

the OBZ normal faulting events. Nevertheless, DC OBZ events are documented in both regions (Craig et al., 2014), as evidenced by a recent (2020-03-25) Mw 7.5 earthquake, with a hypocenter at 55 km depth located almost directly under the Kuriles trench (depth based on USGS finite fault model).

Historically, the role of unbending in slab seismicity has mainly been discussed in 267 relation to the Kuriles, Japan, Tonga, Aleutians, and northern Marianas (Engdahl & Scholz, 268 1977; Hasegawa et al., 1978; Kawakatsu, 1986b, 1986a; Tsukahara, 1980; Samowitz & 269 Forsyth, 1981; Wang, 2002). The key feature of these regions is the DSZs with a char-270 acteristic 'polarity' switch in moment tensor between an upper band dominated by DC 271 events and a lower band dominated by DT events. This distribution is very clear in the 272 Kuriles slab (Fig. 3b) where a clear offset in the locus of DC and DT events occurs at 273 depths between 70 - 200 km. The polarity switch is also evident in both Tonga and Japan, 274 although in both cases the relative proportion of lower plane DT to upper plane DC events 275 is lower than in the Kuriles (e.g. Kawakatsu, 1986b). Importantly, while the PUZ in both 276 Tonga and Japan is dominated by DC events, neither are exclusively DC (Figs. 3a,b), 277 and in both instances DT events are systematically deeper. As we discuss further be-278 low this is contrary to the expectation of uniform slab shortening proposed in previous 279 studies (e.g. Isacks & Molnar, 1971; Richter, 1979; Fujita & Kanamori, 1981). 280

In Japan a polarised DSZ is clearly evident in the PUZ at depths between 60 and 281 200 km. Compared with the Kuriles, lower plane DT events are more clustered, and oc-282 cur further downdip than the upper plane DC counterparts. The great Tohoku megath-283 rust event in 2011 occurred during the catalog interval considered here, resulting in a 284 large cluster of extensional earthquakes in the shallow part of forearc (labelled in Fig. 285 3c, Imanishi et al., 2012). The Tohoku earthquake also intraslab earthquake rates. For 286 example, a comparison of Figs. 3c&d suggests that OBZ activity rates following the To-287 hoku earthquake have been substantially elevated, consistent with a positive static stress 288 change. Interestingly, the number of unbending (PUZ) events did not increase to the same 289 extent. In particular very few additional lower plate (DT) events occurred since 2011. 290 This suggests that stress changes following to the megathrust rupture were less signif-291 icant in the deeper part of the slab than in the shallower incoming parts. These obser-292 vations reinforce the notion that even when geometric bending strain accumulation is 293 expected its seismic expression is quite variable, and can be impacted over timescales 294

of at least a decade by associated large megathrust ruptures. Despite the changes in seismicity rates since 2011, the seismic expression appears similar to earlier events.

The along-strike morphology of ePac slabs tends to be more variable than wPac 297 slabs and includes prominent flat slab segments in Chile (Pampean), Peru and Mexico. 298 An important consequence is that ePac slabs commonly exhibit additional zones of bend-299 ing and unbending downdip from the PUZ. An issue in characterising ePac seismicity 300 relates to the relatively low rates of OBZ and PUZ seismicity. Resolving their seismic 301 expression requires aggregating earthquakes over significant distances along strike (~ 1000 302 km). Because the slab morphology is relatively coherent at shallow depths, the analy-303 sis of aggregated earthquakes in the OBZ and PUZ is typically quite straightforward. 304 However, with increasing downdip distance this coherence degrades and the deeper slab 305 seismic expression of ePac slabs tends to be less well resolved compared to wPac slabs. 306 These issues are most significant in Chile in the vicinity of the Pampean flat slab where 307 the Juan Fernandez ridge subducts beneath the Andes (Fig. 4a). However, here we treat 308 the entire region as a single extended domain because: a) the Pampean flat slab is rel-309 atively narrow and has low intermediate depth seismicity rates compared to the north-310 ern part of the Chile slab (i.e. the north Chile seismic belt, shown in Fig. 4a) and b) OBZ 311 and PUZ seismicity rates are generally low but much more uniformly distributed, and 312 so the extended domain provides a well resolved view of OBZ and PUZ seismicity. 313

Compared with wPac settings, ePac OBZ seismicity tends to be clustered much closer 314 to the trench and with much fewer events. In Peru, OBZ events are located within about 315 10 kms, with a locus of activity slightly landward, of the trench (Fig. 5a). In the PUZ, 316 clusters of earthquakes occur about 100 km inboard of the trench in Chile, and 150 km 317 in Peru (Figs. 5a&b).In both cases a band of dominantly DC events overlies a smaller 318 band of DT events. As discussed in Section 5, these events occur in regions where in-319 ferred rates of PUZ unbending are highest. The relatively shallow depths of ePac PUZ 320 seismicity means it partly underlies the megathrust zone, and so filtering megathrust events 321 is critical to their resolution. While the significance of ePac DC events in terms of a pu-322 tative unbending DSZ was noted as long ago as 1976 (e.g. Barazangi & Isacks, 1976) it 323 has largely been overlooked, and other studies have argued for alternative explanations 324 such as slab-push (Lemoine et al., 2002) and flexural slip (Romeo & Álvarez-Gómez, 2018). 325

-11-

Downdip from the PUZ, the morphology of the Chile and Peru slabs deviates sub-326 stantially. Peru has a very long (~ 300 km) flat slab region, followed by a second zone 327 of steepening along the distal hinge of the flat slab section. The peak in curvature oc-328 curs at around 600 km from the trench. The 'regional-average' slab morphology for Chile 329 (Fig. 5a) does not contain a prominent flat slab sensu stricto. However, a subtle upwards 330 deflection beginning at around 200 km from the trench is indicative of partial flatten-331 ing. Despite its subtle form, the implied curvature gradient is significant, consistent with 332 high flexural strain rates. 333

In both Chile and Peru, slab seismicity at classic 'intermediate depths' is dominated 334 by DT events. In Peru, DT seismicity is distributed throughout the flat slab, becoming 335 more frequent towards the distal hinge, with an average depth of ~ 120 km and a slight 336 concave up distribution when projected on slab normal sections (see supplementary Fig. 337 S6). A cluster of earthquakes known as the Pucallpa seismic nest (Fig. 5c) is located prox-338 imal to a localised depression in the slab along the distal hinge of flat slab (Gutscher et 339 al., 2000; Wagner & Okal, 2019). In Chile, the DT events are clustered in two zones. The 340 first overlaps with the zone of partial slab flattening, between 200 and 350 kms from the 341 trench, centered at a depth of ~ 110 km (as depicted by red points in Fig. 4a). The sec-342 ond cluster is more diffuse, concentrated between 400 and 500 km from the trench and 343 depths of 150-300 km (displaying as blue points in Fig. 4a). As most evident in trench-344 parallel section (see Supplementary Fig. S6) the shallower zone forms a sub-horizontal 345 band best developed in the north (labelled 'north Chile seismic belt') but clearly present 346 in parts of the slab further south. The deeper second zone forms a steeply oriented band 347 shallowing to the south (highlighted with a red dashed line in Fig. S6) The clustering 348 of these earthquakes is indicative of deformation with strong lateral variability. Our study, 349 which focuses on flexural deformation in the 2d trench perpendicular plane, is unable 350 to determine any meaningful geometric correlations when such clear along-stroke (or 3d) 351 variations are present. 352

The projections onto the 'regional average' slab model highlight the anomalous nature of the slab models for Peru. For all other slabs, the locus of intermediate depth seismicity occurs in the upper 20-30 kms of slab, at or above the slab midplane, consistent with the expectation that seismicity is concentrated in the cooler parts of the slab (Emmerson & McKenzie, 2007). For Peru, intermediate depth seismicity projects at a significantly deeper level relative to the slab models, mostly below the midplane. We suspect this re-

-12-

flects systemic errors in the slab models for Peru, as for example identified by Rosenbaum

359 360

et al. (2019), with the Slab2 model around 20-30 kms too shallow.

The Central American slab is the most seismically incoherent of the slabs sections 361 described here, presumably because morphological variability blurs the patterns of ag-362 gregated seismicity, even at shallow depths (Fig. 5c). Hypocenter locations exhibit sub-363 stantial scatter at all depths, and less pronounced downdip clustering evident in both 364 Chile or Peru. Based on the region-averaged geometry, the Central America slab is char-365 acterised by two distinct zones of steepening (Fig. 5c). After bending through the OBZ, 366 the slab unbends fully at about 100 km distance from the trench, before steepening again 367 with a second peak in curvature at about 175 km. Unlike the other ePac slabs, there is 368 no distinct reduction in dip angle between the peaks in positive curvature (we note that 369 a little further north beneath Mexico there is a prominent flat slab, which shows many 370 similarities to the Peruvian flat slab in terms of relationships between seismicity and ge-371 ometry as discussed in detail by D. Sandiford et al. (2019)). The majority of earthquakes 372 in this segment of the Central American slab have DT mechanisms and are concentrated 373 at a distance of about 130 km from the trench in a zone of curvature increase where, sim-374 ilar to the outer rise, flexural stretching of the upper part of the slab is expected. While 375 several DC events (red axes in Fig. 5c) could potentially indicate unbending in the PUZ, 376 there is no clear spatial separation between DC events and the more numerous DT earth-377 quakes. Moreover, Fig. 5c shows that the principal axes of the DC events are not pref-378 erentially aligned with the slab dip direction, as is expected for flexural unbending, and 379 may reflect a more prominent role for out of plane bending or that the variations in slab 380 morphology are significant and poorly represented by the region-average geometry. 381

382

4 Insights from numerical modeling

In this section we describe results of a numerical subduction model, which provides 383 insight into the relative contribution of different modes of slab deformation, as well as 384 the geometric controls on flexural deformation. The setup is comparable to recent stud-385 ies, where flow is driven entirely by the thermal density contrast of the plate-slab, which 386 develops as a naturally evolving thermal boundary layer at the surface (Garel et al., 2014; 387 Agrusta et al., 2017). The model setup is described in detail in the Supplementary ma-388 terial (see also D. Sandiford & Moresi, 2019). Mantle rheology (including oceanic litho-389 sphere) is prescribed by a composite flow law including linear high-temperature creep 390

-13-

and a scalar visco-plasticity designed to capture both psuedo-brittle as well as distributed
 plastic deformation within the slab. We assume the stored elastic stress component is
 relaxed over relatively short time/length scales and can be neglected.

An important feature of the model is the evolution of partial slab flattening. This 394 morphological evolution is concomitant with a overall reduction in subduction velocity 395 between 10 and 25 million years, and a shift to intense shortening of the upper plate. In-396 deed this shared set of features has been discussed in a number of recent modelling stud-397 ies, in terms of interplay between the sinking/retreating slab and the structure of the 398 compensating return flow (Faccenna et al., 2017; Yang et al., 2019). In particular, the 399 dynamics exhibited in 2d models, where the trench is capable of retreat but toroidal flow 400 is absent, bears a close resemble to Chilean-type subduction systems, consistent with the 401 idea that the central Andean orocline represents a stagnation point for upper mantle toroidal 402 flow (Russo & Silver, 1994). 403

Fig. 6 shows the downdip component of the strain rate $(\dot{\epsilon}_{ss})$ at two time intervals, 404 with the top panels in each figure showing the normalised value of curvature and cur-405 vature gradient evaluated along the slab midplane. The fact that flexural deformation 406 dominates the strain rate field is evident in the strong polarisation, with zones of short-407 ening (red) on one side of the slab always accompanied by similarly elevated stretching 408 (blue) on the other side. Despite the flow being driven by the thermal buoyancy contrast 409 of the slab, the fact that the slab strain rates are polarised rather than uniform, implies 410 that the slab pull force is substantially compensated by drag in the mantle. This sub-411 duction style is often referred to as the Stokes regime (Schellart, 2004; Capitanio et al., 412 2007; Ribe, 2010). The stress in the subducting plate at 10 myr is shown in the inset in 413 Fig. 6. The peak stress of order 10 MPa is an order of magnitude lower would be than 414 anticipated if a significant component of the buoyancy deficit were transmitted to the 415 trailing surface plate (i.e. when the slab pull factor is ~ 0.5 , e.g. Conrad & Lithgow-Bertelloni, 416 2004).417

The model also highlights the strong geometric control on deformation rates for slabs in the Stokes regime. For a slab that deforms by pure bending, the distribution of strain rate in the downdip direction ($\dot{\epsilon}_{ss}$) is a function of the curvature rate multiplied by distance from the midplane (Tsukahara, 1980; Kawakatsu, 1986a; Ribe, 2001):

-14-

$$\dot{\epsilon}_{ss} = -y \frac{DK}{Dt} = -y \left(\frac{\partial K}{\partial t} + u_s \frac{\partial K}{\partial s} \right) \tag{2}$$

where s refers to a unit vector along the slab midplane, y is the distance perpendicular to the midplane, $\frac{D}{Dt}$ is the material derivative following s, K is the curvature and u_s is the velocity component parallel to the midplane. The term $u_s \frac{\partial K}{\partial s}$ is sometimes referred to as the advective or kinematic bending rate but we use the term geometric bending rate to emphasise the fact that it is the present day slab geometry that constrains the time-independent component of the bending rate.

Fig. 6 shows that the curvature gradient $\left(\frac{\partial K}{\partial s}\right)$ correlates strongly with the downdip 428 strain rate in the model $(\dot{\epsilon}_{ss})$, with both tending to zero as the local curvature ampli-429 tude maximizes as expected when geometry is a dominant control on the both the to-430 tal bending rate and the overall slab deformation rate. At 10 Myr, a rather typical slab 431 morphology is characterised by plate bending outboard of the trench (OBZ) with un-432 bending in the PUZ centered at around 70 km depth. At 25 Myr, an upward deflection 433 at intermediate depths produces a secondary positive curvature gradient zone charac-434 terised by extension in the upper part of the slab above a zone of shortening in the lower 435 half bearing a marked similarity to the partial flattening of the Nazca slab in northern 436 Chile (Fig. 4a). 437

Because the brittle ductile transition in lithospheric mantle is thought to occur at 438 a potential temperature near 600 °C (Emmerson & McKenzie, 2007), the distribution 439 of slab temperature is key to understanding the seismic expression of slab deformation. 440 In our model, the gradual reduction in subduction velocity between 10 myr and 25 myr 441 means the maximum depth of the 600 °C isotherm reduces from about 300 km to less 442 than 150 km over that time interval. We note that because the modelled 600 $^{\circ}$ C isotherm 443 encloses the upper-half of each bending region, we expect the seismic strain release would 444 be strongly asymmetric and mainly restricted to part of the slab above neutral plane. 445 For a given slab the degree of seismic asymmetry will likely be sensitive to its thermal 446 structure, as well as variations in the level of in-plane stress (Craig et al., 2014). 447

5 Seismicity-geometry relationships

⁴⁴⁹ In this section we explore the relationship between geometric bending and the seis-⁴⁵⁰mic expression of each of the Pacific margin slabs discussed in Section 3. Within each

-15-

slab region, the relative variation in the geometric bending rate is associated with downdip 451 curvature gradient of the neutral plane, in accord with Equation 2. We calculate cur-452 vature gradient using the estimated slab midplane as a proxy for the neutral plane, as 453 described in the supplementary material. To visualise these relationships we project the 454 earthquake T-axes in a slab midplane coordinate system, with distance from the hypocen-455 ter to the midplane shown on the vertical axis, and distance along the midplane rela-456 tive to the trench on the horizontal. As in the earlier figures, the T-axes are projections 457 on to a trench normal plane, in this case they are additionally rotated so that the an-458 gle relative to the midplane is preserved. 459

Figure 7 shows seismicity geometry relationships for the wPac regions. The curvature gradient profiles associated with wPac slabs show a relatively symmetric positive peak, with a half-wavelength of between 150 - 200 km. Peak curvature (zero gradient) occurs at a considerable distance (50 - 100 km) downdip from the trench. Beyond this, the downdip gradient changes sign and thereafter tends to decay monotonically as the slab fully straightens in the mid upper mantle.

In wPac slabs, OBZ earthquakes tend to cluster either near the peak in positive 466 curvature gradient (e.g. Kuriles), or between the peak in curvature gradient and the peak 467 in curvature (e.g. Japan, Tonga), but not at the peak in curvature. A key feature of all 468 wPac slabs is the shift from dominant DT earthquakes to dominant DC earthquakes in 469 the upper slab accompanying the transition from OBZ to PUZ where the curvature gra-470 dient switches sign. This statement neglects the shallow normal earthquakes landward 471 of the Japan trench, as these are assumed to originate in the forearc (as labelled in Fig. 472 7c). Nevertheless, there are some obvious differences in the seismic expression. For ex-473 ample, in the Kuriles the OBZ-PUZ transition is marked by a zone of relatively intense 474 seismicity, where T-axes orientation is somewhat disorganised, before the characteris-475 tic polarised unbending DSZ emerges. In this transitional region many of the DC T-axes 476 are slightly CCW rotated from the slab orthogonal/vertical. This may indicate the pres-477 ence of unidentified megathrust events. In Tonga, the transition in T-axis polarity is sharper, 478 and coincides remarkably closely with the change in sign of the curvature gradient. In 479 Japan, the transition to negative curvature gradient coincides with the onset of upper-480 plane DC seismicity, whereas lower plane DT events only appear a further 100 km downdip. 481 Whereas Tonga shows a much higher proportion on upper plane DC to lower plane DT 482 events, the Kuriles is characterised by a more symmetrical distribution. 483

-16-

The seismicity-geometry relationships for ePac slabs are shown in Fig. 8. As noted in Section 3, compared with wPac slabs, there are far fewer OBZ ePac earthquakes. Those that do occur cluster landward of the peak in curvature gradient and, as in wPac slabs, they tend to cluster between the peak in curvature gradient and the peak in curvature, rather than coinciding at peak curvature. In Peru OBZ earthquakes occur beneath the trench itself.

Importantly, the Peru and Chile projections highlight the key and hitherto largely 490 overlooked point that the OBZ-PUZ transition, at the point where the curvature gra-491 dient switches sign, marks a switch from dominant upper plane DT earthquake to DC 492 earthquakes, just like wPac slabs. Moreover, Figs. 8a&c shows that the ePac PUZ DC 493 events are clustered in zones where unbending rates are highest (i.e. at maxima in the absolute curvature gradient). The key insight is that despite occurring at shallower depths 495 than in the wPac, the distributions of PUZ earthquakes in all but the Central Ameri-496 can Slab are consistent with a common mechanism. The Central America is the excep-497 tion, with the zone of normal faulting (DT) continuing in the landward direction past 498 the point when the curvature gradient changes sign. These patterns clearly do not fit 499 with the systematic variation with geometric bending observed elsewhere. 500

Whereas the wPac slabs unbend monotonically, the ePac slabs typically exhibit ad-501 ditional zones of positive (and negative) curvature gradients. In northern Chile, a zone 502 of positive curvature gradient occurs at about 200 km downdip from the trench (Fig. 8a), 503 corresponding to the partially flattened slab, which is expected to induce flexural exten-504 sion in upper half of the slab. This zone has a strong spatial overlap with the belt of DT 505 seismicity along the Chile slab at ~ 100 km depth, the most active expression being the 506 north Chile seismic belt (see Fig. 4a and supplementary Fig. S6). The full downdip seis-507 mic expression is most spectacularly revealed in Chile, where a remarkable set of tran-508 sitions from upper plane DT (OBZ) to DC (PUZ) and then back to DT quakes is ev-509 ident where the slab is partially flattened. In each case the transition correlates with a 510 change in sign of the curvature gradient, and minima in seismic activity rates. 511

There are several caveats in relating the intermediate depth earthquake belt in Chile with fluxural deformation. The first is the near-absence of deeper DC events in the CMT catalog, as would be expected by the positive bending rate. Ultimately, we argue that this is simply the result of predominately ductile deformation beneath the neutral plane.

-17-

These interpretation is elaborated in the Discussion section. Nevertheless, there is frag-516 mentary evidence in the seismic record that shortening underlying the neutral plane can 517 lead to seismic rupture. In a regional study of micro-seismicity, Comte et al. (1999) re-518 solved DC events which were systematically deeper that the DT events, a pattern they 519 referred to as an oppositely polarised DSZ. Araujo and Suárez (1994) discuss a well-located 520 DC event at a depth of 152km, around 35 km below the cluster of DT events. They posit 521 that this inverted DSZ may be linked to the flexural stresses induced by the change in 522 dip. A second issue is a small number of DT events that project well below the inferred 523 mid-plane and would seem to be more consistent with uniform downdip stretching of the 524 slab. Given the lateral variability in Chile slab morphology, we suspect these anomalously 525 deep DT events are mislocated when projected onto our 'regional-average' projection. 526 To test this, Fig. 5d shows a section covering a narrower region within the north Chile 527 seismic belt. For this smaller region, in which such projection uncertainties are signif-528 icantly reduced, a very high proportion of hypocenter locations project in the upper \sim 529 20 km of the slab, consistent with DT seismicity being localised in a rather narrow re-530 gion, consistent with a restricted brittle strain regime situated above the neutral plane. 531

While the distribution of seismic activity rates across the Peru flat slab matches 532 the general form of the curvature gradients (Fig. 8b), as noted earlier the projection places 533 the majority of these events beneath the slab midplane of the Slab2 model. There is no 534 record of deeper DC events in this region, and so the significance of this distribution re-535 mains uncertain. However, as noted the locus of Peruvian intermediate depth seismic-536 ity is much further below the projected slab surface than for Chile, as well as the other 537 slabs analysed here. This suggests systematic errors in the Slab2 model for the Peruvian 538 flat slab, with the model surface likely in error by 20-30 kms, and likely underestimat-539 ing the extent of flattening, which may even lead to negative dip angle at ~ 500 km from 540 the trench. 541

In Fig. 8b a group of slightly deeper earthquakes include the Pucallpa seismic nest cluster at the distal edge of the domain at distances > 650 km from the trench, in a region of negative curvature gradient (Fig. 8b). These events are proximal to a relative localised lateral perturbation of the slab morphology, at the landward edge of the flat slab, (Gutscher et al., 2000; Wagner & Okal, 2019). This suggests that the role of out of plane slab deformation may be significant in this region. Lateral geometric variations, or time-dependent modes of deformation (i.e. changes in slab geometry that are occur-

-18-

ring in an upper plate reference frame) can be expected to contribute to the slab strainrate field in ways the obscure down-dip gradients.

551 6 Discussion

In view of the many sources of uncertainty, attempting to elucidate the contribu-552 tion of geometric bending from the seismic expression of deforming slabs represents a 553 significant challenge. As discussed earlier, the sources of uncertainty include the earth-554 quake hypocenters, slab geometry models, the impact of out of plane bending and other 555 modes of deformation, and finally the confounding effects of temperature and metamor-556 phism in promoting or impeding brittle deformation. Despite these limitations we have 557 shown that in at least 5 of the 6 regions described, the seismic expression is remarkably 558 consistent with the expectations of flexural strain accumulation. Whereas the prevail-559 ing model sees contrasting intermediate depth seismic expression as a consequence of fun-560 damental differences in the slab force balance, our framework suggests they are largely 561 explicable in terms of differences in geometry. This is a significant finding with many ram-562 ifications, some of which we discuss more fully below. In so doing, we are not claiming 563 that geometric bending is the only source of stress responsible for slab seismicity. This 564 is clearly not the case. However the recognition that geometric bending plays a signif-565 icant provides important constraints on slab dynamics from the perspective of slab strength 566 and stress state, in particular. 567

568

6.1 Seismicity related to unbending

In reference to Japan, Kawakatsu (1986a) argued that peak rates of geometric un-569 bending were likely to be higher than uniform stretching due to slab pull. Yet it is only 570 in a few regions, northern Japan, Kuriles and Aleutians, where unbending has been recog-571 nised as a dominant control on slab seismicity. In particular, with the exception of Isacks 572 and Barazangi (1977), the role of unbending has seldom been discussed in the context 573 of ePac slabs. In this study we have shown that earthquakes consistent with unbending 574 are present in all the wPac and ePac margin slabs, excepting Central America where DC 575 earthquakes seem absent in the putative PUZ. We note, however, that along other sec-576 tions of the Middle America Trench, DC earthquakes characteristic of unbending are present 577 such as in the Mexican Flat slab region (D. Sandiford et al., 2019). In most cases the 578 PUZ is expressed as a polarised DSZ, with DC earthquakes occurring at shallow levels 579

-19-

than a dominantly DT band. These polarised DSZs are consistent with the seismic expression of shortening/extension either side of the neutral plane. However, the proportion of DT earthquakes relative to DC in the PUZ is quite variable, as exemplified in the difference between Tonga and Kuriles (Fig. 3a&b). We discuss this variability in the following sections.

A number of factors make the seismic expression of unbending in ePac slabs less obvious than in wPac slabs. ePac PUZs are shallower than the normal intermediate depth specification (> 70 km) and have often been ignored in studies that follow this somewhat arbitrary designation. Moreover, the close proximity of ePac PUZ events to the megathrust means that filtering the intraslab earthquakes from the interplate is essential. Finally, at the magnitude range of the CMT catalog, resolving the seismic expression of ePac PUZ requires aggregating seismicity over significant distances.

Despite the challenges in resolving the shallow slab seismicity, we are confident that 592 the DSZs we have linked with ePac unbending are robust features. Firstly, we have shown 593 that in Peru and Chile, the DSZs have the correct polarity, and are located precisely where 594 the slab models predict peak rates of curvature reduction (e.g. Fig. 8). Secondly, we are 595 confident that DSZs do comprise intraslab events, rather than grossly mislocated and 596 atypical megathrust or upper plate ruptures. Indeed, the occurrence of isolated DC earth-597 quakes in the unbending zone in the Nazca plate has been discussed by a number of pre-598 vious studies. Lemoine et al. (2002) described these as 'slab push earthquakes' to dis-599 tinguished them from what they regarded as the more typical 'slab pull' DT earthquakes. 600 Isacks and Barazangi (1977) suggested that DC earthquakes in Peru are related to un-601 bending, an interpretation that our study supports. Fuenzalida et al. (2013) provide high-602 resolution aftershock solutions following a medium size DC event in the unbending zone 603 of the Chile slab (Mw 6.1 Michilla Earthquake, Dec. 16, 2007). The aftershock sequence 604 delineates a near-vertical fault plane between about 40 and 50 km depth (likely cross-605 ing the slab moho). This orientation is consistent with reactivation of a landward-dipping 606 outer-rise normal fault plane, and provides an important insight into the rupture char-607 acter of a shallow DC unbending event. The identification of a compelling unbending 608 signal in the Nazca plate in Chile and Peru extends the applicability of Kawakatsu's ar-609 gument that peak rates of geometric unbending should exceed the background rate of 610 uniform stretching due to slab pull. 611

-20-

612

6.2 Geometric bending and contrasting seismic expression

In the wPac slab regions we have considered, inferred rates of unbending decay mono-613 tonically as slabs straighten in the mid-upper mantle, consistent with a gradual falloff 614 in seismicity rates with depth. Whereas wPac slab morphologies represent a 'textbook' 615 view of subduction, ePac slabs are generally more complicated with alternating fully and 616 partially flattened slab sections (Isacks & Barazangi, 1977; Engdahl et al., 1998; Hayes 617 et al., 2018). We argue that these systematic geometric differences are the key control 618 on the contrasting seismic expression of ePac and wPac slabs at intermediate depths. Anal-619 ysis of the downdip curvature gradient shows that the Nazca plate fully unbends at depths 620 of around 60 km. Beyond this, additional zones of bending are associated with full or 621 partial slab flattening. The majority of ePac DT seismicity is conspicuously clustered 622 in curvature-increasing zones. We summarise these systematic geometric differences be-623 tween wPac and ePac in Fig. 9. 624

If geometric bending is the dominant control for localising DT seismicity in ePac 625 slabs, it requires that the lower half of the bending regions (i.e. beneath the neutral plane) 626 is almost completely aseismic. In this light an important observation is that an oppo-627 sitely polarised DSZ has been observed in microseismicity, near the northern limit of our 628 Chile study region at $\sim 18^{\circ}$ S (Comte & Suarez, 1994). In historical catalogues, only a 629 single moderate sized DC earthquake has occurred at intermediate depths in north Chile 630 (17/01/1977 - as labelled in Fig. 5). Using depth phases to precisely constrain the hypocen-631 ter, Araujo and Suárez (1994) placed this event about 35 km beneath proximate DT seis-632 micity, consistent with the proposed flexural dynamic state. Indeed, these authors posit 633 that this "inverted" DSZ may be linked to the flexural stresses induced by the change 634 in dip. 635

These cases notwithstanding, the lack of significant lower plane events in these pu-636 tative ePac bending zones, like the north Chile seismic belt, may seem at odds with the 637 presence of lower plane events updip in the PUZ. However, this actually follows a pat-638 tern that is quite consistent in most subduction settings we analyse. Specifically, it ap-639 pears that zones of increasing curvature tend to have less lower plane activity compared 640 to zones of decreasing curvature, or unbending. For instance, whereas OBZs tend to have 641 only limited lower plane DC events, PUZs often have more abundant lower plane DT events. 642 One explanation for this is that the flexural stress state is commonly modified by an in-643

-21-

plane component due to slab pull, acting in a sense of effective tension. This is expected 644 to modify the relative depth of the neutral plane of bending (e.g. Mueller et al., 1996; 645 Craig et al., 2014). In zones of increasing curvature, where the flexural stress state in 646 the upper half of the slab is tensional, the addition of in-plane tension shifts the neutral 647 plane deeper, closer to, or even beyond the brittle ductile transition. In zones of decreas-648 ing curvature, the opposite applies, with the neutral plane shifting towards the slab sur-649 face into colder parts of the slab, enhancing the prospect of seismic activity beneath the 650 neutral plane. 651

In this context, Tonga is somewhat anomalous in showing a more symmetric pat-652 tern in the OBZ, with numerous lower plane earthquakes, and a more asymmetric pat-653 tern in the PUZ with far fewer lower plane earthquakes. This may suggest that, rela-654 tive to other settings, the magnitude of the uniaxial stress component due to slab pull 655 is significantly reduced or possibly reversed consistent with earlier ideas that Tonga has 656 a more compressive signal than other slab regions (Isacks & Molnar, 1971; Nothard et 657 al., 1996; Gurnis et al., 2000). Alternatively, a significant change in slab strength pro-658 file may also alter the depth of the neutral plane (e.g. Craig et al., 2014). 659

660

6.3 Slab rheology, strain rates and elasticity

At peak slab curvature a purely-elastic differential stress is predicted in the order 661 of 10 GPa. Because this value greatly exceeds inferred yield stresses, inelastic deforma-662 tion is expected to accommodate the large proportion of bending strains in slabs (Chapple 663 & Forsyth, 1979), with brittle deformation dominating in the cold regions (Goetze & Evans, 1979). These predictions are supported by the observation that the cumulative strain 665 of fault throws near the trench (Sleep, 2012), as well as the seismic moment of OBZ earth-666 quakes (Chapple & Forsyth, 1979) are close to the total strain (rate) inferred from the 667 change in curvature. An important consequence of inelastic deformation is the fact that 668 the flexural stress state is often inverted with respect to the sign of the slab curvature 669 (Engdahl & Scholz, 1977). Indeed the premise that earthquakes occur as a response to 670 slab unbending (where the curvature generally still remains positive) reflects the assump-671 tion of significant inelastic deformation. When the slab yield strength is low relative to 672 the potential elastic stresses due associated with curvature, the majority of strain is ac-673 commodated by inelastic deformation, and the flexural stress state will tend to approx-674 imate the bending rate rather than the curvature. When the sign of the bending rate 675

-22-

changes, the flexural stress profile inverts and rapidly saturates with the same polarity
as the bending rate. In this study we have emphasised that, to first order, the orientation of seismic moment tensors correlates with the inferred bending rate rather than total strain (i.e. curvature gradient rather than curvature). Overall, our framework supports the conclusion of numerous previous studies suggesting that comprehensive yielding of slabs must occur throughout the subduction hinge (Engdahl & Scholz, 1977; Goetze
& Evans, 1979; Chapple & Forsyth, 1979; Billen, 2005).

683

6.4 Implications for subduction dynamics

The sources of buoyancy that drive plate motions are often separated into density 684 anomalies in the surface plates (e.g. ridges and other topography) and sublithospheric 685 sources (e.g. slabs, Coblentz et al., 1994; Ghosh et al., 2009). In both cases the scale 686 of the total anomalous density contribution is relatively well known (Turcotte & Oxburgh, 687 1967; Afonso et al., 2007), in comparison to uncertainties in the rheology of plates and 688 mantle. It is the latter that injects substantial complexity and ambiguity in terms in re-689 solving how much of the slab density deficit is propagated through slabs to the surface 690 plates. Attempts to understand the global distribution of plate velocities have concluded 691 that a large fraction of slab weight must be propagated through the slab (Forsyth & Uyeda, 692 1975; Conrad & Lithgow-Bertelloni, 2002; van Summeren et al., 2012). While the pres-693 ence of intermediate depth DT zones does not constrain the magnitude of stress in slabs, 694 the suggestion that slabs stretch uniformly is clearly compatible with the idea that stresses 695 due to slab pull are significant (e.g. Molnar & Bendick, 2019). With simple assumptions 696 made about effective slab rheology, stresses in the order of 100s of MPa have previously 697 been estimated (Conrad & Lithgow-Bertelloni, 2004). While the notion that slabs un-698 dergo uniform stretching seems consistent with inferences about the forces driving plate 699 motion, the paradox remains as to why the seismic expression of 'slab pull' is evidently 700 not expressed in wPac slabs, which are attached to the fastest moving large plate. 701

Other lines of evidence suggest slab pull must be significantly smaller than inferred from plate velocity considerations. Coblentz et al. (1994) argued that the intraplate stress field is largely explicable in terms of a balance between lithospheric potential-energy distribution and plate-boundary resistance, implying a relatively low degree of slab-plate coupling in plates is the norm. These results are implicit in other modelling studies, which capture the first order features of the intraplate stress field without considering any sub-

-23-

lithospheric sources (e.g. Ghosh et al. (2009)). Away from trenches, earthquakes in ocean 708 basins mainly show thrust faulting (Sykes & Sbar, 1973), inconsistent with large tensional 709 stress oriented towards subducting slabs. Based on stress indicators in the central In-710 dian Ocean M. Sandiford et al. (2005) showed that the effective slab pull fraction must 711 be low, around 0.1 in order to account for large magnitude reverse fault mechanisms ob-712 served in the central Indian Ocean with P-axes parallel to the Sumatran trench, imply-713 ing an average deviatoric tensional stress no more than order 10 MPa propagated via 714 the slab. 715

The dominant control of bending over stretching in slab seismic strain release is a characteristic of slabs in the Stokes regime, where resistance to slab weight is primarily supplied by drag from the mantle (Capitanio et al., 2009; Ribe, 2010; Goes et al., 2011). In this study we highlight the fact slabs in the Stokes regime can develop highly-diverse internal deformation patterns. Indeed, relatively large magnitudes of the curvature gradient, and therefore strain rates, can accompany relatively subtle changes in the slab morphology, as in northern Chile.

A feature of our framework is that it obviates appeals to profound differences in 723 the force balance (or strength) between different slabs, such as is required in the con-724 ventional interpretation of uniform stretching in Chile, versus shortening in Tonga (e.g. 725 Isacks & Molnar, 1971; Fujita & Kanamori, 1981; P.-F. Chen et al., 2004). In the ge-726 ometric bending framework, the contrasts in ePac and wPac seismic expression exem-727 plified by Chile and Tonga arise as a natural consequence of different slab morphology. 728 In the ePac, zones of positive bending rate are associated with full or partial slab flat-729 tening. Of course, differences in slab morphology will ultimately be an outcome of the 730 subduction force balance. As our numerical models show, however, slabs may evolve very 731 different morphologies while remaining in the Stokes regime. An important implication 732 of our numerical model is the forces required to produce significant changes in slab mor-733 phology (over millions-of-year periods) can be much smaller that those that would be 734 necessary to produce a transition from flexurally dominated to uniform mode slab de-735 formation. 736

Recent work suggests that the characteristic ePac/wPac morphology contrasts may
 be controlled by the interplay between the sinking/retreating slab, and structure of the
 compensating return flow which tends to determine the upper plate kinematics (Faccenna

-24-

et al., 2017; Yang et al., 2019). In the ePac margins slab rollback drives a large scale poloidal 740 return flow, in turn promoting fast trench-ward motion of South America and compression-741 dominated tectonics in the overriding plate. These conditions have been argued to favour 742 flat-slab development along the ePac margin (Manea & Gurnis, 2007; van Hunen et al., 743 2004; Schellart, 2017; Yang et al., 2019). In contrast, large-scale downwelling beneath 744 Asia, revealed by seismic imaging, geodynamic models, and plate reconstructions restrains 745 trench-ward motion of East Asia. Along with the greater ages of wPac slabs, this pro-746 motes steeper subduction, extension-dominated upper-plate tectonics, and less flat-slab 747 subduction episodes along the wPac margin (Yang et al., 2019). 748

It is important to note that the numerical model presented here is likely to repre-749 sent an end member example of subduction in the Stokes regime. The reason is that in 750 the 2d setup, the only significant forces that balance slab buoyancy are mantle drag, plate 751 bending and friction on the subduction interface. When the mantle drag component is 752 largest, the slabs are said to be in the Stokes regime (Ribe, 2010), which is demonstra-753 bly the case for our model. In 3d mantle convection, slabs and plates interact with other 754 parts of the flow on a range of scales (Hager & O'Connell, 1979). This means that in-755 dividual plates and slabs are influenced by additional tractions, either basally or along 756 plate boundaries, that may either amplify or resist the slab driven flow. When these ad-757 ditional forces resist motion toward the subduction zone, the compensation of the slab 758 buoyancy within the mantle is reduced, and larger stresses will be propagated through 759 the subduction hinge to the plate. In a 2d modelling setup, these influences may be re-760 produced, to a degree, when the plate velocity is fixed by surface boundary conditions 761 (e.g. Sleep, 1979). In this case, when the mantle viscosity is reduced, the slab is unable 762 to respond with a proportionate increase its sinking rate. The mantle drag is reduced, 763 a greater component of the slab buoyancy is propagated through the slab to the plate, 764 and the component of uniform stretching, relative to geometric bending is thus increased 765 (Sleep, 1979). An end member in this type of setup occurs when the velocity of the sur-766 face plates is zero, and the attached slab will predominately undergo necking in the as-767 thenosphere. 768

Following the thread of the preceding paragraph, our framework provides an interesting perspective on the dynamics of intra-continental intermediate depth seismic zones. High seismic strain rates $(10^{-14}s^{-1})$ have been inferred in the Hindu Kush and the Vrancea zone beneath the Carpathians (Lorinczi & Houseman, 2009; Molnar & Bendick, 2019).

-25-

Tr₃ These are an order of magnitude greater than typical intermediate depth seismic strain

in subducting slabs (~ $10^{-15}s^{-1}$). The strain rates beneath the Hindu Kush and Vrancea

may indicate deformation dominated by lithospheric necking (e.g. uniform stretching Lis-

ter et al., 2008; Lorinczi & Houseman, 2009). Meanwhile, as we have argued, earthquakes

- ⁷⁷⁷ in Pacific margin subduction zones reflect rates imposed by geometric bending consis-
- tent with the observed seismic release rates closer to $10^{-15}s^{-1}$ (Kawakatsu, 1986a; Nothard et al., 1996).
- 780

6.5 Limitations and future work

In investigating the potential signal of flexure in slab seismicity, we have focused 781 on the geometric (or advective) component of the bending rate (Ribe, 2001, 2010; Buf-782 fett, 2006). The time-independence allows us to infer the relative variation in long-term 783 bending rates from present day slab geometry. The geometric component should be the 784 dominant bending term for slabs in which: a) the hinge morphology is not changing rapidly, 785 and b) our of plane contributions to the stress/deformation are relatively minor (Buffett 786 & Becker, 2012). Clearly these conditions will not be met in all slab regions, and this 787 caveat will require careful attention in trying to test this hypothesis in other settings. 788 In this study we have primarily focused on the variation in the orientation of moment 789 tensors with respect to slab geometry in general, especially the curvature gradient. We 790 have been more circumspect about the correlation between seismicity rates and the rel-791 ative magnitude of the curvature gradient. This is primarily because seismic activity rates 792 are not necessarily proportional to the long term strain rate (i.e. the bending rates in-793 ferred via the curvature gradient). The influence of metamorphic processes, and distri-794 bution of fluids, in subducting slabs is likely to influence the rates of seismicity. For ex-795 ample, Boneh et al. (2019) have shown that the intermediate depth seismic activity rate 796 varies with the inferred amount of plate hydration in the outer-rise region, with simi-797 lar mechanisms being linked to rapid changes seismic expression along-strike (Shillington 798 et al., 2015). Such process may explain the very different seismic activity rates in the 799 north Chile seismic belt, compared with the Nazca slab further south (e.g. Fig. 4a). An-800 other factor is the increasing role of ductile deformation as the slab heats up from above 801 and below. As a result, the relative amount of seismic/ductile deformation is likely to 802 vary in a complex manner with changes in pressure and temperature. Finally, short cat-803 alog times also bias the relative number of earthquakes in different parts of the slab. We 804

-26-

highlight, for instance, the increase in OBZ seismicity in Northern Japan following theTohoku earthquake.

As noted in Section 5, there are number of instances where the correlation between 807 curvature gradient and seismic expression is ambiguous, absent, or opposite to expec-808 tations for a primary geometric bending control. We briefly discuss these below, some 809 of which are readily explained, and some not. In the ePac settings, several clusters of 810 seismicity are likely to be unrelated to downdip geometric bending. The Pucallpa seis-811 mic nest in Chile appears to be spatially correlated with a relatively localised lateral per-812 turbation of the slab morphology (Gutscher et al., 2000; Wagner & Okal, 2019) and it 813 is reasonable to assume that these features are related. While for Chile we demonstrate 814 a close spatial association between the main peak in positive curvature gradient (see Fig. 815 8a) and the primary cluster of DT seismicity (the north Chile seismic belt, see Fig. 4a), 816 the relationship is less evident at greater depths. Based on our geometric analysis, the 817 slab would be expected to go through an additional zone of unbending (i.e. a secondary 818 unbending zone), where the sign of the curvature gradient returns to negative (e.g. Fig. 819 8a) in analogous fashion to our numerical model, which predicts a return to downdip short-820 ening at around 550 km from the trench (RHS of lower panel in Fig. 6). Instead, the in-821 termediate depth seismicity beneath 150 km remains dominated by DT axes. As we have 822 noted, this deeper cluster is unusual in that it forms a nearly continuous, steeply dip-823 ping band that shallows toward the south (as shown in supplementary Fig. S6). 824

The apparent absence of deep DC earthquakes associated with upper plane unbend-825 ing at the expected depth-distance range in ePac slabs, may signal the slab stress de-826 formation state transitions from flexurally-dominated to a more prominent uniaxial com-827 ponent (Bloch et al., 2018). Alternatively, progressive warming of the upper part of the 828 slab and/or processes related to dehydration, may leave it essentially aseismic at these 829 depths, with the consequence that the seismically active zone lies beneath the midplane. 830 These points highlight an important caveat in our ability to relate earthquake hypocen-831 ters accurately within a geometric framework, as seismicity still provides the best con-832 straint on the geometry. Uncertainties in both hypocentral locations and slab models are 833 significant and require ongoing work. 834

-27-

7 Conclusions

Our study suggests that flexural deformation plays a significant role in the seismic 836 expression of subducting slabs. We have analysed the contribution of the geometric bend-837 ing rate, and found that in several key locations, the orientation of slab seismic moment 838 tensors vary systematically with the anticipated sense of deformation. The fact that flex-839 ure controls seismicity patterns in the OBZ is of course, already widely accepted, as is 840 the effect of unbending in a limited number of slab settings. In terms of extending the 841 role of bending/unbending, our contributions are twofold. Firstly we show that seismic-842 ity characteristic of unbending is prevalent in ePac slabs, albeit at shallower depths than 843 wPac slabs. We then show that geometric differences between ePac and wPac slabs lead 844 to additional zones of bending at intermediate depths in ePac slabs. The majority of ePac 845 DT seismicity is conspicuously clustered in these curvature-increasing zones, which are 846 associated with full or partial slab flattening. Hence, the contrasting seismic expression 847 of ePac and wPac slabs appears to arise due to systematic differences in slab morphol-848 ogy rather than differences in in-plane stress associated with either uniform downdip ex-849 tension in the former or shortening in the latter. The observed correlation of earthquake 850 T-axes orientations with the curvature gradient, rather than the curvature, arises from 851 the fact that a very significant proportion of flexural strain is accommodated by inelas-852 tic deformation, of which seismic slip itself is a key component. The seismic expression 853 of flexure is strongly modified by the relative contribution of brittle deformation above 854 and below the neutral plane. Within the time frame of historical catalogues, this may 855 range from abundant seismicity in both planes (i.e. the Kuriles PUZ) to virtually no seis-856 micity in the lower plane (i.e. the north Chile seismic belt). A simple qualitative expla-857 nation is that the depth of the neutral plane exhibits variability with respect to the ther-858 mal structure of slabs, with the latter defining the transition from dominantly brittle to 859 dominantly ductile deformation. 860

861 Acknowledgments

862	This work was supported by the Australian Research council (Discovery grant DP150102887).
863	$Development \ of \ the \ Underworld2 \ code \ (http://www.underworldcode.org/) \ was \ supported$
864	by AuScope. DS's postgraduate research at the University of Melbourne was supported
865	by a Baragwanath Geology Research Scholarship. This work was supported by resources
866	provided by The Pawsey Supercomputing Centre with funding from the Australian Gov-
867	ernment and the Government of Western Australia. This work was supported by the Nec-
868	tar Research Cloud, a collaborative Australian research platform supported by the Na-
869	tional Collaborative Research Infrastructure Strategy (NCRIS). The study benefited from
870	discussions and reviews by Greg Houseman, Claire Currie, Norman Sleep and Laurent
871	Jolivet.

872 References

- Afonso, J., Ranalli, G., & Fernandez, M. (2007). Density structure and buoyancy of the oceanic lithosphere revisited. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 34(10).
- Agrusta, R., Goes, S., & van Hunen, J. (2017). Subducting-slab transition-zone
 interaction: Stagnation, penetration and mode switches. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 464, 10–23.
- Araujo, M., & Suárez, G. (1994). Geometry and state of stress of the subducted
 nazca plate beneath central chile and argentina: evidence from teleseismic
 data. Geophysical Journal International, 116(2), 283–303.
- Bailey, I. W., Becker, T. W., & Ben-Zion, Y. (2009). Patterns of co-seismic strain
 computed from southern California focal mechanisms. *Geophysical Journal In- ternational*, 177(3), 1015–1036.
- Barazangi, M., & Isacks, B. (1976). Spatial distribution of earthquakes and subduction of the Nazca plate beneath South America. *Geology*, 4(11), 686.
- Billen, M. I. (2005). Constraints on subducting plate strength within the Kermadec
 trench. Journal of Geophysical Research, 110(B5).
- Billen, M. I., Gurnis, M., & Simons, M. (2003). Multiscale dynamics of the TongaKermadec subduction zone. *Geophysical Journal International*, 153(2), 359–
 388.
- Bloch, W., Schurr, B., Kummerow, J., Salazar, P., & Shapiro, S. A. (2018). From
 slab coupling to slab pull: Stress segmentation in the subducting Nazca plate.

893	Geophysical Research Letters, 45(11), 5407–5416.
894	Boneh, Y., Schottenfels, E., Kwong, K., Zelst, I., Tong, X., Eimer, M., Zhan, Z.
895	(2019). Intermediate-depth earthquakes controlled by incoming plate hydration
896	along bending-related faults. Geophysical Research Letters, 46(7), 3688–3697.
897	Brudzinski, M. R., Thurber, C. H., Hacker, B. R., & Engdahl, E. R. (2007). Global
898	prevalence of double benioff zones. Science, 316(5830), 1472–1474.
899	Buffett, B. A. (2006). Plate force due to bending at subduction zones. Journal of
900	Geophysical Research, 111(B9).
901	Buffett, B. A., & Becker, T. W. (2012). Bending stress and dissipation in subducted
902	lithosphere. Journal of Geophysical Research, 117(B5).
903	Caldwell, J., Haxby, W., Karig, D. E., & Turcotte, D. (1976). On the applicability of
904	a universal elastic trench profile. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, $31(2)$,
905	239–246.
906	Capitanio, F., Morra, G., & Goes, S. (2007). Dynamic models of downgoing plate-
907	buoyancy driven subduction: Subduction motions and energy dissipation.
908	Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 262(1-2), 284–297.
909	Capitanio, F., Morra, G., & Goes, S. (2009). Dynamics of plate bending at the
910	trench and slab-plate coupling. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, $10(4)$.
911	Chapple, W. M., & Forsyth, D. W. (1979). Earthquakes and bending of plates at
912	trenches. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 84 (B12), 6729–6749.
913	Chen, M., Manea, V. C., Niu, F., Wei, S. S., & Kiser, E. (2019). Genesis of
914	intermediate-depth and deep intraslab earthquakes beneath Japan constrained
915	by seismic tomography, seismicity, and thermal modeling. Geophysical Re-
916	search Letters, 46(4), 2025–2036.
917	Chen, PF., Bina, C. R., & Okal, E. A. (2004). A global survey of stress orienta-
918	tions in subducting slabs as revealed by intermediate-depth earthquakes. $Geo{-}$
919	physical Journal International, 159(2), 721–733.
920	Coblentz, D. D., Richardson, R. M., & Sandiford, M. (1994). On the gravitational
921	potential of the Earth's lithosphere. $Tectonics$, $13(4)$, 929–945.
922	Comte, D., Dorbath, L., Pardo, M., Monfret, T., Haessler, H., Rivera, L., Mene-
923	ses, C. (1999). A double-layered seismic zone in Arica, northern Chile. Geo -
924	physical Research Letters, 26(13), 1965–1968.
925	Comte, D., & Suarez, G. (1994). An inverted double seismic zone in Chile: Evidence

926	of phase transformation in the subducted slab. Science, $263(5144)$, 212–215.
927	Conrad, C. P., & Lithgow-Bertelloni, C. (2002). How mantle slabs drive plate tec-
928	tonics. Science, 298(5591), 207–209.
929	Conrad, C. P., & Lithgow-Bertelloni, C. (2004). The temporal evolution of plate
930	driving forces: Importance of "slab suction" versus "slab pull" during the
931	Cenozoic. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 109(B10).
932	Craig, T. J., Copley, A., & Jackson, J. (2014). A reassessment of outer-rise seis-
933	micity and its implications for the mechanics of oceanic lithosphere. $Geophysi$ -
934	cal Journal International, 197(1), 63–89.
935	Ekström, G., Nettles, M., & Dziewoński, A. (2012). The global CMT project
936	2004–2010: Centroid-moment tensors for 13, 017 earthquakes. $Physics of the$
937	Earth and Planetary Interiors, 200-201, 1–9.
938	Elsasser, W. M. (1969). Convection and stress propagation in the upper mantle.
939	Emmerson, B., & McKenzie, D. (2007). Thermal structure and seismicity of sub-
940	ducting lithosphere. Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, 163(1-4),
941	191-208.
942	Engdahl, E. R., & Scholz, C. H. (1977). A double Benioff Zone beneath the cen-
943	tral Aleutians: An unbending of the lithosphere. Geophysical Research Letters,
944	4(10), 473-476.
945	Engdahl, E. R., van der Hilst, R., & Buland, R. (1998). Global teleseismic earth-
946	quake relocation with improved travel times and procedures for depth determi-
947	nation. Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America, 88(3), 722–743.
948	Faccenda, M. (2014). Water in the slab: A trilogy. <i>Tectonophysics</i> , 614, 1–30.
949	Faccenna, C., Oncken, O., Holt, A. F., & Becker, T. W. (2017). Initiation of the
950	andean orogeny by lower mantle subduction. Earth and Planetary Science Let-
951	ters, 463, 189-201.
952	For syth, D., & Uyeda, S. (1975). On the relative importance of the driving forces of
953	plate motion. Geophysical Journal International, $43(1)$, 163–200.
954	Fuenzalida, A., Schurr, B., Lancieri, M., Sobiesiak, M., & Madariaga, R. (2013).
955	High-resolution relocation and mechanism of after shocks of the 2007 Tocopilla $% \left({{{\rm{T}}_{{\rm{T}}}}} \right)$
956	$({\rm Chile}) \ {\rm earthquake.} \ Geophysical \ Journal \ International, \ 194(2), \ 1216-1228.$
957	Fujita, K., & Kanamori, H. (1981). Double seismic zones and stresses of intermedi-
958	ate depth earthquakes. Geophysical Journal International, $66(1)$, 131–156.

manuserin	t C11	bmittec	to l'ect	omice
manuserip	u su	DIIII0000		010003

	Canal F	Coor	Darriga	D Davios	ти	Knomon	C C	Ŷ-	Wilcon	CD
959	Garei, r	GOES, 5.	, Davies,	, D., Davies,	Ј. П.,	nramer.	ъ. U.	. a	WINSON,	U. n.

- (2014). Interaction of subducted slabs with the mantle transition-zone: A
 regime diagram from 2-d thermo-mechanical models with a mobile trench and
 an overriding plate. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 15*(5), 1739–1765.
- Ghosh, A., Holt, W. E., & Flesch, L. M. (2009). Contribution of gravitational po tential energy differences to the global stress field. *Geophysical Journal Inter- national*, 179(2), 787–812.
- Goes, S., Capitanio, F., Morra, G., Seton, M., & Giardini, D. (2011). Signatures
 of downgoing plate-buoyancy driven subduction in Cenozoic plate motions.
 Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, 184(1-2), 1–13.
- Goetze, C., & Evans, B. (1979). Stress and temperature in the bending lithosphere
 as constrained by experimental rock mechanics. *Geophysical Journal Interna- tional*, 59(3), 463–478.
- Green, H. W., & Houston, H. (1995). The mechanics of deep earthquakes. Annual
 Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences, 23(1), 169–213.
- Gurnis, M., Ritsema, J., Heijst, H.-J. V., & Zhong, S. (2000). Tonga slab deformation: The influence of a lower mantle upwelling on a slab in a young
 subduction zone. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 27(16), 2373–2376.
- Gutenberg, B., & Richter, C. (1954). Seismicity of the world and associated phenom ena. Princeton University Press, Princeton, NJ.
- Gutscher, M.-A., Spakman, W., Bijwaard, H., & Engdahl, E. R. (2000). Geodynamics of flat subduction: Seismicity and tomographic constraints from the
 Andean margin. *Tectonics*, 19(5), 814–833.
- Hacker, B. R., Peacock, S. M., Abers, G. A., & Holloway, S. D. (2003). Subduction
 factory 2. are intermediate-depth earthquakes in subducting slabs linked to
 metamorphic dehydration reactions? Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid *Earth*, 108(B1).
- Hager, B. H., & O'Connell, R. J. (1979). Kinematic models of large-scale flow in the
 earth's mantle. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 84 (B3), 1031–
 1048.
- Hasegawa, A., Umino, N., & Takagi, A. (1978). Double-planed structure of the deep
 seismic zone in the northeastern Japan arc. *Tectonophysics*, 47(1-2), 43–58.
- Hayes, G. P., Moore, G. L., Portner, D. E., Hearne, M., Flamme, H., Furtney, M.,

-32-

992	& Smoczyk, G. M. (2018). Slab2, a comprehensive subduction zone geometry
993	model. <i>Science</i> , <i>362</i> (6410), 58–61.
994	Hayes, G. P., Wald, D. J., & Johnson, R. L. (2012). Slab1.0: A three-dimensional
995	model of global subduction zone geometries. Journal of Geophysical Research:
996	Solid Earth, 117(B1).
997	House, L. S., & Jacob, K. H. (1982). Thermal stresses in subducting lithosphere can
998	explain double seismic zones. Nature, 295 (5850), 587–589.
999	Imanishi, K., Ando, R., & Kuwahara, Y. (2012). Unusual shallow normal-faulting
1000	earthquake sequence in compressional northeast japan activated after the 2011
1001	off the pacific coast of tohoku earthquake. Geophysical Research Letters, $39(9)$.
1002	doi: 10.1029/2012gl051491
1003	Isacks, B., & Barazangi, M. (1977). Geometry of benioff zones: Lateral segmentation
1004	and downwards bending of the subducted lithosphere. In Island arcs, deep sea
1005	trenches and back-arc basins (pp. 99–114). American Geophysical Union.
1006	Isacks, B., & Molnar, P. (1969). Mantle Earthquake Mechanisms and the Sinking of
1007	the Lithosphere. <i>Nature</i> , 223(5211), 1121–1124.
1008	Isacks, B., & Molnar, P. (1971). Distribution of stresses in the descending litho-
1009	sphere from a global survey of focal-mechanism solutions of mantle earth-
1010	quakes. Review of Geophysics, $9(1)$, 103.
1011	Kawakatsu, H. (1986a). Double seismic zones: Kinematics. Journal of Geophysical
1012	Research, 91 (B5), 4811.
1013	Kawakatsu, H. (1986b). Downdip tensional earthquakes beneath the Tonga Arc: A
1014	double seismic zone? Journal of Geophysical Research, $91(B6)$, 6432.
1015	Kirby, S., Engdahl, R. E., & Denlinger, R. (2013). Intermediate-depth intraslab
1016	earthquakes and arc volcanism as physical expressions of crustal and upper-
1017	most mantle metamorphism in subducting slabs. In Subduction top to bottom
1018	(pp. 195–214). American Geophysical Union.
1019	Kita, S., Okada, T., Hasegawa, A., Nakajima, J., & Matsuzawa, T. (2010). Exis-
1020	tence of interplane earthquakes and neutral stress boundary between the upper
1021	and lower planes of the double seismic zone beneath Tohoku and Hokkaido,
1022	northeastern Japan. Tectonophysics, $496(1-4)$, 68–82.
1023	Lemoine, A., Madariaga, R., & Campos, J. (2002). Slab-pull and slab-push earth-
1024	quakes in the Mexican, Chilean and Peruvian subduction zones. Physics of the

1025	Earth and Planetary Interiors, 132(1-3), 157–175.
1026	Lister, G., Kennett, B., Richards, S., & Forster, M. (2008). Boudinage of a stretch-
1027	ing slablet implicated in earthquakes beneath the Hindu Kush. $Nature \ Geo-$
1028	science, 1(3), 196.
1029	Lorinczi, P., & Houseman, G. (2009). Lithospheric gravitational instability beneath
1030	the Southeast Carpathians. Tectonophysics, $474(1-2)$, $322-336$.
1031	Manea, V., & Gurnis, M. (2007). Subduction zone evolution and low viscosity
1032	wedges and channels. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 264(1-2), 22–45.
1033	McKenzie, D. P. (1969). Speculations on the consequences and causes of plate mo-
1034	tions. Geophysical Journal International, 18(1), 1–32.
1035	Molnar, P., & Bendick, R. (2019). Seismic moments of intermediate-depth earth-
1036	quakes beneath the Hindu Kush: Active stretching of a blob of sinking thick-
1037	ened mantle lithosphere? Tectonics, 38, 1651–1665.
1038	Mueller, S., Spence, W., & Choy, G. L. (1996). Inelastic models of lithospheric
1039	stress-11. implications for outer-rise seismicity and dynamics. Geophysical
1040	Journal International, $125(1)$, $54-72$.
1041	Nothard, S., McKenzie, D., Haines, J., & Jackson, J. (1996). Gaussian curvature
1042	and the relationship between the shape and the deformation of the Tonga slab.
1043	Geophysical Journal International, 127(2), 311–327.
1044	Peacock, S. M. (2001). Are the lower planes of double seismic zones caused by ser-
1045	pentine dehydration in subducting oceanic mantle? Geology, $29(4)$, 299.
1046	Ribe, N. M. (2001). Bending and stretching of thin viscous sheets. Journal of Fluid
1047	Mechanics, 433, 135–160.
1048	Ribe, N. M. (2010). Bending mechanics and mode selection in free subduction: a
1049	thin-sheet analysis. Geophysical Journal International, $180(2)$, $559-576$.
1050	Richter, F. M. (1979). Focal mechanisms and seismic energy release of deep and
1051	intermediate earthquakes in the Tonga-Kermadec Region and their bearing on
1052	the depth extent of mantle flow. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth,
1053	84 (B12), 6783–6795.
1054	Rietbrock, A., & Waldhauser, F. (2004). A narrowly spaced double-seismic zone in
1055	the subducting Nazca plate. Geophysical Research Letters, $31(10)$, n/a–n/a.
1056	Romeo, I., & Álvarez-Gómez, J. (2018). Lithospheric folding by flexural slip in sub-
1057	duction zones as source for reverse fault intraslab earthquakes. Scientific re-

ports, 8(1), 1367.

1058

- Rosenbaum, G., Sandiford, M., Caulfield, J., & Garrison, J. M. (2019). A trapdoor
 mechanism for slab tearing and melt generation in the northern Andes. *Geology*, 47(1), 23–26.
- Russo, R., & Silver, P. (1994). Trench-parallel flow beneath the nazca plate from
 seismic anisotropy. *Science*, 263(5150), 1105–1111.
- Samowitz, I. R., & Forsyth, D. W. (1981). Double seismic zone beneath the Mariana
 Island Arc. Journal of Geophysical Research, 86(B8), 7013-7021.
- Sandiford, D., & Moresi, L. (2019). Improving subduction interface implementation
 in dynamic numerical models. *Solid Earth*, 10(3), 969–985.
- Sandiford, D., Moresi, L., Sandiford, M., & Yang, T. (2019). Geometric controls on
 flat slab seismicity. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 527, 115787.
- Sandiford, M., Coblentz, D., & Schellart, W. P. (2005). Evaluating slab-plate coupling in the Indo-Australian plate. *Geology*, 33(2), 113.
- Schellart, W. P. (2004). Quantifying the net slab pull force as a driving mechanism
 for plate tectonics. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 31(7), L07611.
- Schellart, W. P. (2017). Andean mountain building and magmatic arc migration
 driven by subduction-induced whole mantle flow. *Nature communications*,
 8(1), 2010.
- Seno, T., & Yamanaka, Y. (2013). Double seismic zones, compressional deep trench outer rise events, and superplumes. In *Subduction top to bottom* (pp. 347–355).
 American Geophysical Union.
- Shillington, D. J., Bécel, A., Nedimović, M. R., Kuehn, H., Webb, S. C., Abers,
- G. A., ... Mattei-Salicrup, G. A. (2015). Link between plate fabric, hydration
 and subduction zone seismicity in Alaska. *Nature Geoscience*, 8(12), 961.
- Sleep, N. H. (1979). The double seismic zone in downgoing slabs and the viscosity of
 the mesosphere. Journal of Geophysical Research, 84 (B9), 4565.
- Sleep, N. H. (2012). Constraint on the recurrence of great outer-rise earthquakes
 from seafloor bathymetry. *Earth, Planets and Space*, 64 (12), 19.
- ¹⁰⁸⁷ Sykes, L. R., & Sbar, M. L. (1973). Intraplate earthquakes, lithospheric stresses and ¹⁰⁸⁸ the driving mechanism of plate tectonics. *Nature*, 245 (5424), 298–302.
- ¹⁰⁸⁹ Tsujimori, T., Sisson, V., Liou, J., Harlow, G., & Sorensen, S. (2006). Very-low-¹⁰⁹⁰ temperature record of the subduction process: A review of worldwide lawsonite

1091	eclogites. $Lithos$, $92(3-4)$, $609-624$.
1092	Tsukahara, H. (1980). Physical conditions for double seismic planes of the deep seis-
1093	mic zone. Journal of Physics of the Earth, 28(1), 1–15.
1094	Turcotte, D., & Oxburgh, E. (1967). Finite amplitude convective cells and continen-
1095	tal drift. Journal of Fluid Mechanics, 28(1), 29–42.
1096	van Hunen, J., van den Berg, A. P., & Vlaar, N. J. (2004). Various mechanisms to
1097	induce present-day shallow flat subduction and implications for the younger
1098	Earth: a numerical parameter study. Physics of the Earth and Planetary
1099	Interiors, 146(1-2), 179–194.
1100	van Summeren, J., Conrad, C. P., & Lithgow-Bertelloni, C. (2012). The importance
1101	of slab pull and a global asthenosphere to plate motions. Geochemistry, Geo-
1102	$physics, \ Geosystems, \ 13(2).$
1103	Vassiliou, M., Hager, B., & Raefsky, A. (1984). The distribution of earthquakes with
1104	depth and stress in subducting slabs. Journal of Geodynamics, $1(1)$, 11–28.
1105	Wagner, L. S., & Okal, E. A. (2019). The Pucallpa Nest and its constraints on the
1106	geometry of the Peruvian Flat Slab. Tectonophysics, 762, 97–108.
1107	Wang, K. (2002) . Unbending combined with dehydration embrittlement as a cause
1108	for double and triple seismic zones. Geophysical Research Letters, $29(18)$, $36-$
1109	1-36-4.
1110	Yang, T., Gurnis, M., & Zhan, Z. (2017). Trench motion-controlled slab morphology
1111	and stress variations: Implications for the isolated 2015 Bonin Islands deep
1112	earthquake. Geophysical Research Letters, $44(13)$, 6641–6650.
1113	Yang, T., Moresi, L., Gurnis, M., Liu, S., Sandiford, D., Williams, S., & Capitanio,
1114	F. A. (2019). Contrasted East Asia and South America tectonics driven by
1115	deep mantle flow. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 517, 106–116.



Figure 1: Schematic illustration of key geometrical/mechanical concepts motivating our analysis of the seismic expression of subducting slabs. Left side - typical west Pacific style subduction geometry as represented for example by Tonga. Right side - typical east Pacific style subduction geometry as represented for example by Chile. A,E top panel slab midplane curvature (dashed) and curvature gradient(solid). A,E bottom panel - geometric strain rate. Box in E shows areas enlarged in F-H. B,F stress distribution for a elasto-plasto-viscous rheology deforming in by flexural bending. C,G - stress distribution for an elastic rheology deforming by geometric bending. D,H - stress distribution for for a elasto-visco-plastic rheology deforming in response to uniform downdip compression (left) and extension (right).Insets show schematic differential stress profiles across the slab, as marked by solid black line with positive values implying extension.



Figure 2: Overview of western Pacific margin slab segments analysed in this study. Colored points show intraslab seismicity which is consistent with best available slab geometry model (e.g. Slab1 for Tonga). Earthquakes lying more that 20 km above the slab surface, shown as small black points, are considered upper-plate events, outliers (presumably due to depth error), or regions where our slab models do not properly resolve the local slab morphology, and so along with earthquakes identified as likely megathrust ruptures (not shown) are excluded from our analysis. Left hand panels show slab earthquakes in map view. Right hand panels shows projection of the earthquakes on a trench-parallel cross section: the solid black line shows the region-averaged slab surface model; the gray region shows the lateral variation in slab surface model across the domain; the dashed black line shows the slab midplane (an orthogonal translation of the slab surface, as discussed in the supplementary material); the red dashed line shows the Slab2 model for Tonga, which shows less consistency with the earthquake hypocenters (ISC-EHB catalog).



Figure 3: wPac trench-perpendicular projection of CMT T-axes (ISC-EHB hypocenters) on a vertical cross-sections, along the nearest trench normal azimuthal lines shown Fig. 2, with data aggregated across the entire domain. The origin of the horizontal axis represents the trench location. The T-axes are plotted as projections of uniform-length vectors, with the length variation in the plotted T-axes reflecting the magnitude of the projected component of the vector. T-axes are coloured according to the orientation relative to the slab midplane (shown with dashed black line): red represents earthquakes with a DC sense, blue with a DT sense.



Figure 4: Overview of eastern Pacific margin slab segments analysed in this study. See Fig. 2 caption for details of figure organisation and preparation. The black points represent earthquakes that lie more the 20 km above the slab surface model. For Chile, these mainly represents the relatively small number of earthquakes that occur in close proximity to the Pampean flat slab in the south, where the slab morphology is quite different to northern Chile. In B, the Pucallpa nest earthquakes are indicated by open circles (as discussed in the main text).







Figure 6: Strain rate distribution in numerical model at 10 Myr and 25 Myr. For each figure the main panel shows the downdip strain rate component in the slab $(\dot{\epsilon}_{ss})$ resolved parallel to the slab midplane. We show only the strong interior part of the slab: the subduction interface zone, upper plate, and parts of the mantle are above 1100°C isotherm have been masked. +ve values (blue) show zones of downdip extension, -ve values (red) are shortening. Solid black lines show isotherms as labelled. Dashed black line is the slab midplane. Shaded green region represents the subduction interface. Inset in the panel at time 10 Myr shows the temperature and stress (horizontal component) profile in the plate at 300 km to the LHS of the trench. The upper panels show the curvature and curvature gradient of slab midplane, plotted along the same horizontal axes as the main panels (distance from trench).



Figure 7: Summary of wPac slab seismicity-geometry relationships. a) Tonga, b) Kuriles, c) Japan. Top panels show CMT T-axes plotted in a slab midplane coordinate system, with distance from the hypocenter to the midplane on the vertical axis, and distance along the midplane relative to the trench on the horizontal axis. The T-axes have been rotated so that the angle relative to the midplane is preserved. The length variation in the plotted T-axes reflects the magnitude of the projected component of the vector. The blue solid line shows the value of the curvature gradient plotted against the distance along the midplane. The red dashed line shows the reflection of the curvature gradient about the midplane. Together, these lines show parts of the slab that are expected to be stretching (blue half) and shortening (red half), due to the geometric component of the bending rate. For each regions, the bottom panel includes a histogram showing the relative variation in number of slab earthquakes as a function of distance along the midplane with the solid and dashed lines showing the absolute value of the midplane curvature and the curvature gradient.



Figure 8: Summary of ePac slab seismicity-geometry relationships. a) Chile, b) Peru, c) Central America. See caption to Fig. 7 for further details.



Figure 9: Comparison of characteristic features of wPac (left) and ePac (right) slab geometries. Upper panel shows slab profiles, middle panel shows curvatures and lower panels show curvature gradients. The geometric rate of bending is governed by the curvature gradient. In the lower two panels (either side) we have scaled the horizontal distance (distance along the midplane) so that the transition from the OBZ to the PUZ lies at the same point (i.e. the first zero crossing of the curvature gradient is equal for the ePac and wPac groups respectively). The color is indicative of the anticipated sense of deformation above the neutral plane: blue - extension, red - shortening.