Heavy Metal Toxicity: A Major Driver of Past Biodiversity Crises? 1

- 2 Francesca Galasso^{1*}, Anja B. Frank¹, William J. Foster¹
- 3 4 ¹University of Hamburg, Department of Earth System Sciences, Hamburg, Germany.

5 6 *Corresponding author: francesca.galasso@uni-hamburg.de;

7 https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5391-7902

8

9 Abstract

10 Whether today's heavy metal pollution represents an unprecedented threat to biodiversity, in 11 Earth's history remains an open question. Here, we reassess the state-of-the-art research to evaluate whether heavy metal toxicity played a major role in past extinction events. Although 12 13 there is evidence to heavy metal loading during several past biotic crises, direct causal links to extinctions are still lacking. Recent studies are beginning to reveal potential connections in 14 15 terrestrial ecosystems, while geochemical signatures point to heavy metal impacts in marine 16 environments. Nonetheless, it remains unclear whether modern heavy metal toxicity represents 17 a uniquely severe threat to biodiversity in Earth's history. 18

Keywords: heavy metal toxicity, teratology, malformations, mass extinctions, bolide impact, 19 20 volcanism, anthropogenic activity

21

22 1 Introduction

23 The Industrial Revolution marked a critical turning point in the history of heavy metal pollution, 24 shifting the primary sources of emissions from natural to human-driven activities¹. Since the 1970s, heavy metals such as mercury (Hg), lead (Pb), and cadmium (Cd), have been acknowledged 25 26 as a threat to environmental integrity due to their natural abundance, persistence in the 27 environment, and detrimental effects on ecosystems. These inorganic pollutants, characterized 28 by an atomic density greater than 5 g/cm³, or at least five times the density of water, pose severe risks due to their ability to bioaccumulate in organisms and biomagnify through food chains, even 29 at low concentrations (e.g.,²). As a result, their toxic effects lead to severe damage to body tissues 30 and organs while also causing long-term ecological disruptions, particularly in apex predators and 31 throughout entire food webs^{3,4}. Throughout Earth's history, heavy metal loading was primarily 32 associated with natural processes including volcanic eruptions and the erosion of metal-bearing 33 rocks. Nevertheless, recent research suggests that heavy metal toxicity has played a significant 34 role in past mass extinctions and biodiversity crises, due to the release of vast quantities of heavy 35 36 metals into the atmosphere associated with Large Igneous Provinces (LIPs)⁵. Some LIPs, such as 37 the Siberian Traps and North Atlantic LIP, have also been linked to contact metamorphism of coal 38 and other carbonaceous sediments that, in addition to carbon dioxide, produces airborne compounds (e.g., coal ash⁶), which contain large quantities of heavy metals that settle or wash 39 out of the atmosphere into oceans, streams and land⁷⁻⁹. Evidence of heavy metals into the 40 terrestrial and marine realms has been confirmed by studies in changes in Mercury (Hg) 41 concentrations, normalised Hg concentrations, and isotopes (δ^{202} Hg, Δ^{199} Hg, Δ^{201} Hg) (e.g., ¹⁰⁻¹²). 42 These geochemical proxies serve as a stratigraphical marker and to ground truth the relationship 43 between volcanism and mass extinction events (e.g., ^{11,13-14}). Moreover, heavy metal toxicity has 44 also been invoked as being linked to bolide impacts, such as the Chicxulub impact¹⁵⁻¹⁶, which is 45

- 46 widely regarded as the cause of the end-Cretaceous mass extinction (e.g.,¹⁷). Given that LIPs and
- 47 bolide impacts are the most commonly cited triggers of past mass extinction events and
- 48 biodiversity crises, it is unsurprising that heavy metal toxicity is often hypothesised as a major
- causal mechanism for a large number of different events from the Early Palaeozoic to the present day¹⁸⁻²¹.
- The current prevailing model for heavy metal toxicity during mass extinctions suggests that toxic 51 metal emissions during these biotic crises, reached poisonous levels directly contributing to 52 widespread extinctions¹⁸⁻²⁰. Newer models are starting to include the complex interactions of 53 climate change and the methylation of mercury, e.g., through the development of anoxia²¹. 54 55 However, these models oversimplify the complexity of extinction dynamics, neglecting: (1) the 56 bioavailability of these heavy metals, which determines their potential toxicity to the organisms; 57 (2) pre-existing environmental stressors such as euxinia, which may have already destabilized/weakened ecosystems resilience prior to metal loading; and (3) the knock-on effects 58 59 of sulphur emissions and climate change, which interact to introduce additional source of heavy metals in the environment (see Fig. 1). This latter point is supported by preliminary study from 60 the Toarcian extinction event (~ 183 Ma) and the Permian-Triassic mass extinction (PTME, ~252 61 Ma) suggesting that there is evidence of terrestrial Hg being transported to the ocean^{10, 22-23}, 62 further reinforcing the complex link between LIPs, bolide impacts, climate change and heavy 63
- 64 metal mobilization within the biosphere.





65 66

Fig. 1. Proposed cause-and-effect relationships of bolide impacts, LIPs, and anthropogenic activity
with heavy metal toxicity. Despite the different sources of heavy metals, the effects are expected
to be similar. Note: Current models do not demonstrate an understanding of this complexity and
directly link heavy metal emissions to toxic metal poisoning.

71

Here, we review the current state of the literature to test the hypothesis that heavy metal loading of the environment during past mass extinctions and biodiversity crises reached toxic thresholds, potentially contributing to species loss. By doing so, we uncover several key future directions and key outstanding questions for understanding the role of heavy metal toxicity during past biodiversity crises.

- 77
- 78
- 79 80

81 1.1 Bioaccumulation, Biomagnification, and Biological Impact

Heavy metals pose a dual threat to ecosystems due to their ability to bioaccumulate (higher 82 concentrations in organisms than the surrounding environment) and biomagnify (accumulates to 83 higher concentrations with increasing trophic levels). For example, mussels can accumulate heavy 84 metals at concentrations 50-100 times greater than ambient seawater, and both consumer and 85 predators higher in the food chain ingest even greater amount through the consumption of 86 contaminated smaller organisms²⁴. The biological effects of heavy metals exposure can vary: 87 some metals affect biological functions and growth, while others accumulate in one or different 88 organs causing many serious diseases²⁵. Understanding the role of enriched heavy metals as being 89 90 toxic or not is also extremely difficult to unravel. This is because certain heavy metals are 91 bioessential elements (aka, physiological metals), meaning they are necessary for biological 92 processes up to a critical threshold before becoming toxic, and this threshold varies between organisms and heavy metals involved. Whereas other heavy metals that are not bioessential (aka 93 94 xenobiotic), such as Hg and Cd, have unknown biological functions and are toxic even at very small concentrations²⁶ (Fig. 2). 95



97

96

Fig. 2. Differences in the physiological effects between bioessential and non-bioessential heavy metals in terrestrial sporomorphs and benthic foraminifera: specimens from Hochuli et al.⁸¹ data repository and Ballent and Carignano¹⁰⁰ to show potential morphological responses to elevated heavy metal concentrations.

102

103 1.2 Heavy metal fractionation and Bioavailability

Heavy metal emissions interact with the surrounding environment, which then transform into 104 different metal species and these different species can be divided into different fractions, with 105 106 differences in their bioavailability. This involves distinguishing 4 phases: (i) Acid-soluble phase – 107 exchangeable metals bound to carbonates that are able to pass easily into the water column, 108 particularly under acidic conditions. It is the fraction with the most labile bond to the sediment 109 and the most dangerous for the environment; (ii) Reducible phase - metals bound to iron and manganese oxides, that can be released if the sediment changes from oxic to anoxic state, 110 potentially triggered for example, by organisms in the sediments (bioturbation); (iii) Oxidizable 111 112 phase - associated with organic matter and sulfides, which can became bioavailable under

oxidizing conditions. Such conditions can occur, for example, if the sediment is resuspended (e.g., 113 by currents and tides) and the sediment participles come into contact with oxygen-rich water; (iv) 114 Residual phase – lithogenic and inert metals that are tightly bound in mineral structures and are 115 virtually non-bioavailable²⁷. For example, with Hg, identifiable fractions include (i) Exchangeable 116 (HgADS1), (ii) Bound to organic matter (HgABS) and Hg sulfide (HgS), (iii) Mercury sulfate and 117 oxide (HgADS2), and (iv) Residual (HgRES), where the labile fractions (HgADS1, HgABS, and 118 HgADS2) can be easily released from sediment and readily transformed in the environment, 119 whereas HgS and HgRES are insoluble and incorporated into mineral lattices and not biologically 120 available²⁸. Previous studies have also shown that marine organisms can intercept and absorb the 121 122 labile (easily mobilized) fractions, making them bioavailable and potentially hazardous to food 123 webs²⁸. In deep-time studies of heavy metal abundances, the concentration of Hg is often normalised against TOC (Hg/TOC) or sulfur (Hg/S) to account for the variation in organic-matter 124 (OM) and sulfides drawdown (e.g., ²⁹⁻³¹), while other heavy metals are often normalised against 125 126 Al. However, these normalisations do not account for changes in metal bioavailability or fractionation, which are crucial for assessing environmental toxicity. Recent research 127 128 demonstrates that heavy metal fractionation provides deeper insights into past environmental 129 toxicity. Mercury fractionation, in particular, has been successfully applied to deep-time sedimentary records³², showing promise for reconstructing the bioavailability and ecological 130 impacts of heavy metals during past hyperthermal events. 131

132

133 **2** Heavy metal toxicity and its role environment crises

134 While mercury has been extensively studied in the context of past environmental crises, largely due to its application as a volcanism proxy, the roles of other detrimental heavy metals like copper 135 (Cu), chromium (Cr), cadmium (Cd), lead (Pb), arsenic (As), cobalt (Co), and nickel (Ni) have 136 received comparatively less attention³³⁻³⁵. These heavy metals are typically removed from the 137 138 water column by binding to organic matter or forming insoluble compounds with sulfides and subsequently incorporated into sediments. As a result, their elevated concentrations in the 139 sedimentary record can, in part, be attributed to fluctuation in the amount of total organic carbon 140 141 (TOC) or development of euxinic (anoxic and sulfide-rich) conditions¹³. However, such interpretation has led to controversary about whether the elevated heavy metals were a direct 142 143 driver of past extinctions or simply a byproduct of broader geochemical change (e.g.,³⁶). Even 144 when heavy metals are normalized against TOC, aluminium (AI) or titanium (Ti), uncertainties 145 persist due the complex effects of taphonomic processes on geochemical signatures. For example, the development of mercury sulfides in the sediment column or the impact of burial 146 related thermal maturity are poorly understood^{31,37}. In marine environments, mercury can be 147 sequestered either within organic matter or as insoluble mercury sulfides, the latter requiring 148 euxinic conditions to develop³⁸. In such cases, it is unclear whether Hg toxicity added substantially 149 150 to ecosystem collapse, or whether euxinia was sufficient to drive extinction events on its own. This uncertainty underscores the need to re-evaluate how mercury enrichments are interpreted 151

152 in the sedimentary record—particularly during intervals of extreme environmental change. Due

to Hg's strong affinity for organic matter (e.g.,³⁹⁻⁴¹), accurate interpretations of Hg anomalies

154 require evaluation of TOC-normalized concentrations⁴²⁻⁴³ to avoid misinterpretations 'created'

155 through variations in organic matter. A significant constraint of the Hg/TOC approach lies in its

sensitivity to samples containing low TOC concentrations (<0.2 wt%), where the analytical uncertainty can undermine the reliability of enrichment calculations^{11,44.}

Comparisons of Hg/TOC trends across five major hyperthermal events that coincided with 158 significant biotic crises: the Permian-Triassic transition, Carnian Pluvial Event, Toarcian Event, 159 latest Maastrichtian Warming Event, and the Palaeocene Eocene Thermal Maximum (fig. 3) show 160 broadly similar patterns of elevated Hg/TOC, suggesting a potential link to enhanced volcanic 161 activity and/or widespread ecosystem disruption. In most studies investigating Hg enrichment 162 trends, Hg concentrations are normalized to TOC (see fig. 3). While some studies have taken the 163 threshold of low TOC (<0.2 wt%) into account^{12, 45-46}, others have placed less emphasis on it^{22,33}. 164 165 For consistency across datasets, and because raw TOC values were not reported in some cases²². 166 this cutoff was not applied in our comparative analysis (Fig. 3). Beyond organic carbon content, 167 Hg accumulation in sediments is also influenced by additional environmental and depositional factors including variations in lithology, detrital input, and redox conditions—particularly the 168 169 presence of euxinia (anoxic, sulfide-rich conditions). To disentangle these effects additional normalization of Hg concentrations to detrital tracers such as aluminium (Al), thorium (Th) or 170 titanium (Ti), and indicators for euxinia, such as sulfur (S), is required. Despite the importance of 171 multi-proxy normalization, only⁴⁶ reported and applied both Al- and S-normalized Hg data, 172 allowing for a more robust assessment of whether observed Hg enrichments reflect increased Hg 173 flux or are driven by other depositional and/or geochemical conditions. Grasby et al.³³ provided 174 175 Al and S data, but did not apply these for normalization of Hg, while the studies by Jones et al.¹² Them et al.²² and Mazaheri-Johari et al.⁴⁵ lacked sufficient data to assess detrital or redox 176 177 influences.

178



179 180

Fig. 3. Hg concentration (ppm) and Hg/TOC (ppm/wt%) data across a) Permian-Triassic transition,
 Festningen, Svalbard³³, b) Carnian Pluvial episode, Steinbach and Polzenberg sections, Austira⁴⁵,
 C) Toarcian event, Bighorn Creek, Alberta, Canada²², d) latest Maastrichtian Warming event,
 Jiaolai Basin, China⁴⁶ and e) Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum, Central Basin, Svalbard¹². The

185 orange dotted line marks the onset of the carbon isotope excursion in each interval.

While mercury leads the discussion of metal toxicity in past biotic crises, this review
advances the field by examining the roles of other biologically toxic heavy metals such as As, Pb,
and Cd. Through two case studies from different depositional environments during the PermianTriassic Mass Extinction (PTME), we provide a broader perspective on multi-heavy metal
behaviour (Figs. 4 a, b).

192

193 <u>Case Study 1</u>: Mercury Enrichment in a Siliciclastic section during the PTME

At the Festningen section (Svalbard), application of sulfur-normalized Hg data significantly alters 194 the interpretation of previously identified Hg enrichments based solely on Hg/TOC³³. Throughout 195 196 the Early Triassic, Hg concentrations appear elevated; however, when normalized to S, these 197 enrichments disappear, suggesting Hg accumulation in the sediment corresponding to increased sulfide content (see Fig. 4a). The development of euxinia and associated sulfide formation is 198 199 further supported by elevated pyrite concentrations reported by Grasby et al.³³, suggesting that the apparent Hg enrichment reflects sequestration of Hg as insoluble mercury sulfides under 200 201 euxinic conditions, rather than from a true increase in Hg flux. As mercury sulfides are not 202 bioavailable, they are unlikely to have exerted a toxic effect on marine organisms. Instead, the anoxic, hydrogen sulfide-rich conditions would have posed a more immediate threat to marine 203 204 ecosystems. It is worth noting that both the development of euxinic conditions and mercury enrichments in the sediment occur after the extinction horizon (loss of bioturbated sediment and 205 206 silica production) at Festningen.

207 A similar pattern is observed for Cd, which shows in the Early late Triassic a flat trend when 208 normalized to S, further indicating that redox conditions, rather than external inputs, have played 209 a major role for its distribution (Fig. 4a). In contrast, As and Pb remain elevated even after 210 normalization to S near the extinction horizon (±5 m). When further normalized to Al, their 211 enrichments appear independent of a lithological control, implying a potential increase in biologically relevant toxic metal concentrations during the extinction interval. Nevertheless, 212 without direct bioavailability proxies, their ecological significance cannot be determined based 213 214 on the bulk sediment data alone.

215

216 217

Fig. 4. δ^{13} C and heavy metal trends across the Permian-Triassic mass extinction event at **a**) the siliciclastic Festningen section, Svalbard³³ and **b**) carbonate platform section, Çürük Dağ, Türkiye (δ^{13} C from Demirtaş¹¹⁵ and Richoz¹¹⁶; major and trace element data from Frank¹¹⁷). As and Pb concentrations were normalized to S and Al (ppm/wt%), while Cd and Hg concentrations were normalized to S and TOC (ppm/wt%). The Pb and Cd concentrations from Çürük Dağ were consistently below the detection limit of 3 and 0.3 ppm, respectively. The red dashed line represents the extinction horizon at both sections.

- 225
- 226

227 <u>Case Study 2</u>: Mercury Enrichment in a Carbonate succession during the PTME

In contrast, Çürük Dağ (Türkiye), located within a carbonate platform, shows low or undetectable

- Pb and Cd concentrations, suggesting no significant increase in sedimentary fluxes for these
- 230 metals around the extinction horizon (Fig. 4b). However, both As and Hg, show variable trends
- across the section, regardless of the normalization method. When normalized to Al and S, these

elements appear significantly enriched compared to Festningen. Yet, this discrepancy is likely a 232 233 product of differing baseline levels, as the Al and S concentrations at Çürük Dağ are approximately one order of magnitude lower than at Festningen. This highlights a critical methodological 234 challenge as comparisons between sections with differing lithologies-or even within 235 236 heterogeneous sections—must be approached with caution, since baseline differences can inflate 237 normalized values. One potential solution would be the use of enrichment factors calculated against standard materials or background values. Currently, this approach is readily applied using 238 Al as the baseline, thereby accounting only for lithological variation, but comparable methods 239 240 using S or TOC are not yet widely adopted.

241

242 **3 Biological response of terrestrial ecosystems**

243 The impact of heavy metals on plant species is complex and varies widely based on factors such 244 as the type of metal involved, concentration, exposure time, chemical form, soil composition, and pH levels⁴⁷⁻⁴⁹. While some metals like iron (Fe), copper (Cu), and zinc (Zn), nickel (Ni) or 245 molybdenum (Mo) are bioessential micronutrients required for plant growth and development⁵⁰, 246 247 their availability must be carefully regulated. Excessive concentrations of these metals can 248 surpass the physiological need of plants, leading to toxic effects, including growth inhibition and cellular damage⁵¹⁻⁵³. In contrast, heavy metals such as lead (Pb), cadmium (Cd), and mercury (Hg), 249 are non-bioessential and highly toxic, offering no benefits to plants and causing widespread 250 251 disruption to vital physiological processes⁵⁴ (see Fig. 2). These metals interfere with crucial processes such as photosynthesis, nutrient uptake, and reproduction, often resulting in 252 253 malformed sporomorph and/or reduced growth and survival⁵²⁻⁵³.

- Despite the different mechanisms by which plants uptake metals, the effects of lead (Pb), mercury 254 (Hg), cadmium (Cd) and arsenic (As) share a common outcome: they induce oxidative stress. This 255 stress is primarily driven by the generation of reactive oxygen species (ROS), which cause 256 257 significant damage to cellular structures and disrupt essential physiological processes. The 258 accumulation of ROS in plants exposed to these heavy metals leads to oxidative damage in vital components like cell membranes, proteins, lipids, and DNA⁵⁵⁻⁵⁶. This oxidative stress impairs vital 259 260 functions like photosynthesis, nutrient and water uptake, and mitochondrial activity, all of which are crucial for the plant's growth and survival (e.g.,⁵⁷). Additionally, the breakdown of antioxidant 261 262 defence mechanisms worsens this stress, making it difficult for plants to counterbalance the 263 excess ROS⁵⁸⁻⁵⁹. Consequently, plants suffer from stunted growth, chlorosis, reduced biomass, and compromised reproductive processes^{52,60-61}. In more severe cases, prolonged oxidative stress 264 caused by heavy metal exposure can lead to genetic mutations, chromosomal abnormalities, and 265 266 cell death, significantly undermining the plant's ability to grow, reproduce, and maintain overall fitness⁶²⁻⁶⁴. To mitigate these effects, plants employ both enzymatic and non-enzymatic pathways 267 to scavenge ROS⁶⁵⁻⁶⁶. In particular, metals such as Hg and Cd have been shown to interfere with 268 269 key metabolic pathways by mimicking essential nutrients, thereby replacing them in enzymatic reactions and leading to metabolic dysfunctions⁶⁷. 270
- 271

272 3.1 Malformations in deep time

273 One of the few direct clues of biological stress preserved in the fossil record during mass 274 extinction events is the significant ecological disruption observed within plant communities. 275 These disruptions are often reflected as morphological changes in palynomorphs and leaf

structures^{35,68-75}. Over the last decade, teratology—extreme morphological change or 276 277 malformation, in terrestrial biota- has proven to be an excellent proxy for increased environmental perturbations. The strength of the method is that these deformities represent in 278 vivo responses to environmental stress, and that they record this response as fossils. A well-279 280 documented example of such teratological features have been recorded at the Permian/Triassic boundary where widespread abnormalities in herbaceous lycopsids and *lsoetales* are highlighted 281 by an increased abundance of unseparated *Isoetales*-tetrads and trisaccate pollen. These features 282 have been linked to failures in microsporogenesis, indicative of impaired reproductive process⁷⁶⁻ 283 ⁷⁷. Initially, such morphological variations were attributed to enhanced solar ultraviolet B (UV-B) 284 irradiation,-presumably triggered by stratospheric ozone depletion associated with massive 285 volcanic activity—which can damage plant DNA and interfere with normal cellular activity^{76,78-80}. 286 287 However, emerging geochemical analysis have suggested that elevated concentrations of toxic 288 metals—such as arsenic (As), cobalt (Co), mercury (Hg), and nickel (Ni)—may have contributed to, or acted synergistically with, UV-B exposure in inducing mutagenesis in sporomorphs^{10,29-30,33-} 289 ^{34,42,71,80-83}. Similar ecological disruptions and significant turnover in ecosystem composition are 290 also well recorded at the Triassic/Jurassic boundary, characterized by a pronounced increase in 291 malformed pollen and spores (e.g., 69-70, 75, 84-85). These morphological changes were interpreted as 292 an acute environmental stress, coinciding with intense volcanogenic activity known as the Central 293 294 Atlantic Magmatic Province (CAMP).

295 Geochemical records reveal a positive shift in mercury concentrations across the boundary 296 interval, temporally aligned with the rise in sporomorphs malformation. This correlation supports 297 the hypothesis that the elevated atmospheric mercury emission during the CAMP volcanism may 298 have been a key factor in inducing morphological changes within plant reproductive structure⁶⁹⁻ 299 ⁷⁵. Although less severe than the end-Permian or end-Triassic mass extinctions, the Toarcian event also exerted significant stress on terrestrial vegetation. Sedimentary archives reveal spikes in 300 301 mercury levels that align with extensive volcanic outgassing from the Karoo–Ferrar Large Igneous Province^{13,22,86}. This volcanism likely led to widespread atmospheric deposition of mercury and 302 303 other heavy metals, contributing to the release of toxic compounds into the environment. 304 Palynological records from this period show evidence of spore dwarfism, malformed spores, and asymmetrical *Classopollis* tetrads, often co-occurring with elevated concentrations of Hg, Cu, Cr, 305 306 Cd, Pb, and As—indicative of prolonged environmental stress and physiological disruption in 307 terrestrial plant communities³⁵.

308 In addition to morphological changes observed in spores and pollen, teratological features are not only confined to terrestrial plant communities but also extended to marine microplankton 309 310 across extinction intervals, attributed to elevated levels of heavy metal. For instance, during the Late Ordovician extinction event Vandenbroucke et al.⁶⁸ and Munnecke et al.⁸⁷ documented 311 widespread teratology in chitinozoans and acritarchs accounting for up to 20% of assemblages. 312 313 These morphological variations were strongly linked to heavy metal enrichment and marine acidification, likely resulting from extensive volcanic emissions. 314 Together, these studies underscore the use of fossil teratology as a sensitive and direct proxy for 315

- reconstructing episodes of environmental stress, particularly those involving volcanically driven
- 317 perturbations in atmospheric and oceanic chemistry. However, teratological studies investigating
- 318 environmental disturbances driven by non-volcanic sources—such as the Chicxulub impact
- associated with the end-Cretaceous mass extinction are still unknown.

320

321 4 Biological response of marine ecosystems

Despite the well-known detrimental consequence of elevated heavy metal concentrations in 322 modern marine ecosystems, there are no studies (beyond marine palynology) that directly 323 investigate the role of heavy metal emissions in driving mass extinctions and biodiversity crises in 324 the marine realm. "Direct studies" are meant here as studies that show a link between heavy 325 metal toxicity and extinction beyond a temporal relationship. An exception is the observed 326 asymmetric geographical response of nannoplankton during the end-Cretaceous mass extinction, 327 328 interpreted as a consequence of heightened heavy metal toxicity in the Northern Hemisphere 329 (Jiang et al., 2010). Studies on the effects of anthropogenic-induced heavy metal pollution have 330 shown that the impacts are recorded in surviving species, in the form of morphological malformations (e.g.,⁸⁸), structural changes in the communities (e.g.,⁸⁹), incorporation of heavy 331 metals into skeletal material (e.g.,⁹⁰⁻⁹¹), and the accumulation of heavy metals into animal tissues 332 333 (e.g.,⁹²).

334

335 4.1 Malformations

Morphological abnormalities in marine organisms have been intensely studied in modern 336 environments. It is important to highlight that abnormalities can be divided into two types: 337 deformations/discontinuous abnormalities (i.e., developed following mechanical damage to an 338 339 organism) and malformations/continuous abnormalities (i.e., developed during the growth of an organism). Evidence based on modern studies, suggest that heavy metal pollution would produce 340 341 malformations as it affects the growth of organisms rather than physical damage. Examples of 342 heavy metal induced malformations include: bivalves with both posterior and ventral scores, flattening of the posterior shell, changes in height/thickness ratios and asymmetry, with up to 46-343 87.5% of specimens showing malformations in heavily polluted areas^{88,93-94} gastropods with 344 345 shorter spires, globular shape, smaller relative size, globular malformations on the inner 346 surface⁹⁵; and benthic foraminifera, with reduced chamber size, twisted and distorted chamber arrangement, overdeveloped chambers, aberrant chamber shape, changes in coiling direction, 347 and malformations can even be so extreme that species identification is not possible⁹⁶⁻⁹⁷. The 348 intense investigation of benthic foraminiferal malformations in modern ecosystems has also led 349 350 to the establishment of the Foraminiferal Abnormality Index (FAI), which has shown up to 23% of 351 communities showing malformations in heavily polluted areas⁹⁸.

Such morphological malformations are also preserved in the fossil record and have been recorded 352 at the end-Cretaceous mass extinction in foraminifera⁹⁹⁻¹⁰⁰, the end-Triassic mass extinction in 353 354 ammonites¹⁰¹, end-Permian mass extinction in foraminifera and ammonoids¹⁰²⁻¹⁰³, and the Frasnian-Famennian extinction in conodonts and brachiopods¹⁰⁴⁻¹⁰⁵. In addition, certain 355 nannoplankton and planktic foraminifera described from the end-Cretaceous mass extinction and 356 357 Eocene hyperthermals have also been described as "Excursion taxa", characterized by malformations that deviate significantly from the typical symmetrical structures, often showing 358 features such as weak or excessive calcification (e.g., ¹⁰⁶). There are even cases where species are 359 defined by their growth malformations and likely represents an extinction survivor of another 360 species, e.g., *Guembelitria irregularis*, a planktic foraminifera from the end-Cretaceous event⁹⁹. 361

Morphological abnormalities have been heavily investigated in modern, coastal marine ecosystems, however because multiple environmental factors can cause malformations, previous

- studies have found it difficult to isolate exactly which environmental changes, or specific heavy 364 365 metal(s), is the cause of the malformations^{96,107}. One key reason why previous studies have not combined malformation development with independent metal fractionation data is because the 366 use of malformations was developed as a cost-effective and efficient biomonitoring tool, 367 especially for developing nations (e.g., ¹⁰⁸⁻¹⁰⁹). A similar problem exists for deep-time occurrences 368 of malformations, which means that even though malformations have been reported from the 369 fossil record, scientists have indicated that malformations can be associated with heavy metal 370 toxicity but held-back in directly suggesting that heavy metal toxicity played a role in the past 371 (e.g.,^{99-100,102}). This means that both in modern and past studies the utility of malformations, 372 373 without simultaneous tests for the bioavailability of heavy metals from the same samples, makes 374 malformations as a bioindicator of heavy metal toxicity equivocal.
- 375 Similar to deep time studies, challenges exist when understanding historical ecological responses 376 to heavy metal pollution, because it often co-occurs with other forms of pollution, such as 377 eutrophication and/or high levels of Polycyclic Aromatic Hydrocarbons (PAHs). Some of the 378 challenges faced in modern environmental studies are similar to those encountered in deep-time, 379 which use geochemistry alone to understand environmental toxicity. Many studies that fail to find a relationship between ecological responses and heavy metals often overlook weather the heavy 380 metals present in the environment were actually biologically available (e.g., ¹¹⁰). One example is 381 the influx of Hg and other heavy metals into the Bay of Trieste over the last 300 years, where the 382 383 lack of an ecological response in foraminifera was interpreted as evidence that the Hg was not biologically available¹¹⁰, whereas molluscs from the same sediments show a clear ecological 384 response, suggesting that Hg was indeed biologically available to certain taxa¹¹². This discrepancy 385 386 highlights the importance of considering different ecological responses between phyla to heavy metal toxicity as well as the need for independent proxies for heavy metal bioavailability, such as 387 388 heavy metal fractionation to evaluate the true ecological impact of heavy metal contamination.
- 389

390 4.2 Ecological responses beyond malformations

Ecological changes beyond malformations that could be associated with heavy metal toxicity for 391 marine organisms have not been investigated for deep time events, with one exception (see¹⁶). 392 Expected community structural changes would vary related to the different vital effects between 393 394 species, where certain marine organisms are known to be more resilient to heavy metal toxicity 395 than others, but also because heavy metals both bioaccumulate and biomagnify through the food 396 chain. Hence, you may expect the selectivity of certain groups of organisms and organisms at higher trophic levels (Fig. 5). Another approach has been to investigate the incorporation of heavy 397 398 metals in skeletal elements and animal tissues (e.g.,¹¹³). Whilst it is obvious that animal tissues 399 cannot be studied for past biodiversity crises, the incorporation of heavy metals into skeletal 400 material could be informative. Caution, however, must be taken as the incorporation of heavy metals into the skeletal elements is physiologically controlled and not homogenous across an 401 organism, and therefore the absence of heavy metals does not mean that the organism was not 402 affected by heavy metal toxicity¹¹³⁻¹¹⁴. 403

404

405

406
407 Fig. 5. The transfer and bioaccumulation (purple arrows) of heavy metals through a marine
408 ecosystem and how that relates to the ecology of different organisms. Note: bioturbation, erosion
409 and water column conditions can remobilize heavy metals from the sediment but are not included
410 in the diagram.

411

412 5 Future directions/ Key outstanding questions

The hypothesis that heavy metal toxicity played a major role in deep-time biodiversity and mass extinction events is still largely an underexplored hypothesis that clearly requires further testing from multiple geoscientific perspectives.

416 In this review, we used the PTME to highlight the complexities involved in evaluating heavy metal enrichments during hyperthermal events. First, the simple normalization of metal concentrations 417 to a single baseline, such as TOC, may obscure the true environmental signal, as multiple 418 419 geochemical processes can influence sedimentary metal accumulation. Second, lithological 420 comparisons are challenged with potential misinterpretation, as differences in normalized values may reflect baseline variability rather than actual disparities in metal concentrations. 421 422 Furthermore, even when metal enrichments are robustly identified, they do not automatically 423 imply biological toxicity without assessing their bioavailability.

- 424
- 425
- 426
- 427
- 428 429
- 429

431 Key outstanding scientific questions include:

- Can heavy metal fractionation provide novel insights into the bioavailability of
 heavy metals during related extinctions?
- Were heavy metals biologically available at sufficiently high enough
 concentrations to be toxic and contribute to extinction during past biodiversity crises
 and mass extinction events?
- 437
 Are monstrosities and malformations in both the terrestrial and marine
 438
 ecosystems related to metal toxicity or other environmental changes?
- 439 440
- Is heavy metal pollution at toxic levels a phenomenon exclusive to modern-day ecosystems or did it also contribute to extinction earlier in the Phanerozoic?

The questions outlined in this review paper highlight critical gaps in our understanding and addressing these will be essential for disentangling the complex environmental dynamics of Earth's deep-time history. By further investigating the bioavailability of heavy metals, their isotopic signatures, and their broader ecological impacts, we can gain invaluable insights into both past and present environmental challenges. We hope that the methods and models summarized herein will motivate further research and testing of these and other related questions.

447

448 Acknowledgement

The authors thank Stephen Grasby for providing the Cd concentration data for Festningen, Svalbard, used in Fig. 4a, and many stimulating discussions about this topic. This work was supported by Alexander von Humboldt foundation and funded by DFG grant FO1297/1.

452

453 **Author contributions:** Francesca Galasso and William J. Foster conceptualized and designed the 454 project. Anja Frank contributed in the interpretation of geochemical data. All authors actively 455 participated in drafting the manuscript and critically revising it for important intellectual content, 456 approving the final version for publication.

457 458 **References**

459 **1.** Nriagu, J. O. (1996). A history of global metal pollution. Science, 272(5259), 223-223.

460 **2.** [EC] European Commission. 2019. Regulation (EU) 2019/1021 of the European Parliament and of 461 the Council of 20 June 2019 on persistent organic pollutants. Official Journal L169.

- 462 **3.** Järup, L. (2003). Hazards of heavy metal contamination. British medical bulletin, 68(1), 167-182.
- 463 4. Paul, D. (2017). Research on heavy metal pollution of river Ganga: A review. Annals of Agrarian
 464 Science, 15(2), 278-286.
- 465 5. Coffin, M. F., & Eldholm, O. (1993). Scratching the surface: Estimating dimensions of large igneous
 466 provinces. Geology, 21(6), 515-518.
- Grasby, S. E., Sanei, H., & Beauchamp, B. (2011). Catastrophic dispersion of coal fly ash into oceans
 during the latest Permian extinction. Nature Geoscience, 4(2), 104-107.
- 469 7. Svensen, H., Planke, S., Polozov, A. G., Schmidbauer, N., Corfu, F., Podladchikov, Y. Y., & Jamtveit, B.
 470 (2009). Siberian gas venting and the end-Permian environmental crisis. Earth and Planetary Science Letters,
 471 277(3-4), 490-500.

Svensen, H. H., Jones M. T., Percival, L. M. E., Grasby, S. E, Mather, T. A. (2023) Release of mercury
during contact metamorphism of shale: implications for understanding the impacts of large igneous
province volcanism. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 619: 118306, doi: 10.1016/j.epsl.2023.118306

475 9. Aarnes, I., Svensen, H., Connolly, J. A., & Podladchikov, Y. Y. (2010). How contact metamorphism
476 can trigger global climate changes: Modeling gas generation around igneous sills in sedimentary basins.
477 Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 74(24), 7179-7195.

478 **10.** Grasby, S. E., Shen, W., Yin, R., Gleason, J. D., Blum, J. D., Lepak, R. F., Hurley, P. J., & Beauchamp, B.
479 (2017). Isotopic signatures of mercury contamination in latest Permian oceans. Geology, 45(1), 55-58.

480 **11.** Grasby, S.E., Them, T.R., Chen, Z., Yin, R., Ardakani, O.H. (2019). Mercury as a proxy for volcanic
481 emissions in the geologic record. Earth-Science Review 196, 102880.
482 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earscirev.2019.102880.

Jones, M.T., Percival, L.M.E., Stokke, E.W., Frieling, J., Mather, T.A., Riber, L., Schubert, B.A., Schultz,
B., Tegner, C., Planke, S., Svensen, H.H. (2019). Mercury anomalies across the Palaeocene–Eocene Thermal
Maximum. Clim. Past 15, 217–236. https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-15-217-2019

13. Percival, L. M. E., Witt, M. L. I., Mather, T. A., Hermoso, M., Jenkyns, H. C., Hesselbo, S. P., Al-Suwaidi, A.H., Storm, M. S., Xu, W., & Ruhl, M. (2015). Globally enhanced mercury deposition during the end-Pliensbachian extinction and Toarcian OAE: A link to the Karoo–Ferrar Large Igneous Province. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 428, 267-280.

490 14. Sial, A. N., Chen, J., Korte, C., Pandit, M. K., Spangenberg, J. E., Silva-Tamayo, J. C., de Lacerda L. D.,
491 Pinto ferreira, V., Barbosa, J. A., Gaucher, C., Silva Pereira, N. & Riedel, P. R. (2021). Hg isotopes and
492 enhanced hg concentration in the meishan and guryul ravine successions: Proxies for volcanism across the
493 permian-triassic boundary. Frontiers in Earth Science, 9, 651224.

494 15. Erickson III, D. J., & Dickson, S. M. (1987). Global trace-element biogeochemistiry at the K/T
495 boundary: oceanic and biotic response to a hypothetical meteorite impact. Geology, 15(11), 1014-1017.

496 16. Jiang, S., Bralower, T. J., Patzkowsky, M. E., Kump, L. R., & Schueth, J. D. (2010). Geographic controls
497 on nannoplankton extinction across the Cretaceous/Palaeogene boundary. Nature Geoscience, 3(4), 280498 285.

Hull, P. M., Bornemann, A., Penman, D. E., Henehan, M. J., Norris, R. D., Wilson, P. A., Blum, P.,
Alegret, L., Batenburg, S. J., Bown, P. R., Bralower, T. J., Cournede, C., Deutsch, A., Donner, B., Friedrich, O.,
et al. (2020). On impact and volcanism across the Cretaceous-Paleogene boundary. Science 367, 266–272.

Bond, D. P., & Grasby, S. E. (2017). On the causes of mass extinctions. Palaeogeography,
Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 478, 3-29.

504 This comprehensive review synthesizes evidence for major extinction drivers, emphasizing the roles of 505 large igneous provinces, climate shifts, and toxic environmental stressors.

506 **19.** Clapham, M. E., & Renne, P. R. (2019). Flood basalts and mass extinctions. Annual Review of Earth 507 and Planetary Sciences, 47(1), 275-303.

508 20. Galloway, J. M., & Lindström, S. (2023). Impacts of large-scale magmatism on land plant 509 ecosystems. Elements, 19(5), 289-295.

510 **21. Grasby, S. E., & Bond, D. P. (2023).** How large igneous provinces have killed most life on Earth— 511 numerous times. Elements, 19(5), 276-281.

512 A synthesis of evidence linking repeated biotic crises to large igneous province eruptions, focusing on 513 shared geochemical and ecological signals.

- Them, T.R., Jagoe, Baranyi C.H., Caruthers, A.H., Gill, B.C., Grasby, S.E., Gröcke, D.R., Yin, R., Owens,
 J.D. (2019). Terrestrial sources as the primary delivery mechanism of mercury to the oceans across the
 Toarcian Oceanic Anoxic Event (Early Jurassic). Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 507, 62–72.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2018.11.029
- Zheng, X., Percival, L., Yin, R., Al Suwaidi, A., Storm, M., Ruhl, M., Xu, W., Hesselbo, S., P. & Jenkyns,
 H. C. (2023). Mercury (Hg) isotope evidence for enhanced importance of terrestrial Hg to the global ocean during the early Jurassic oceanic anoxic event (Toarcian OAE). In Goldschmidt 2023 Conference.
 GOLDSCHMIDT
- 522 24. Danovaro, R., Cocozza di Montanara, A., Corinaldesi, C., Dell'Anno, A., Illuminati, S., Willis, T. J.,
 523 & Gambi, C. (2023). Bioaccumulation and biomagnification of heavy metals in marine micro-predators.
 524 Communications Biology, 6(1), 1206.
- 525 This study provides critical evidence of how heavy metals accumulate and magnify through marine 526 micro-predator food webs, highlighting potential risks to marine ecosystems and the broader 527 implications for biodiversity under increasing pollution pressures.
- 528 **25.** Briffa, J., Sinagra, E., & Blundell, R. (2020). Heavy metal pollution in the environment and their toxicological effects on humans. Heliyon, 6(9).
- 530 26. Heintz, A. & Reinhardt G. (1990) Chemie und Umwelt, ein Studienbuch für Chemiker, Physiker,
 531 Biologen und Geologen [Chemistry and the Environment, a study book for Chemists, Physicists, Biologists
 532 and Geologists] Verlag Vieweg, Braunschweig, pp. 229-255.
- 533 27. Sarkar, S. K., Favas, P. J., Rakshit, D., & Satpathy, K. K. (2014). Geochemical speciation and risk
 534 assessment of heavy metals in soils and sediments. In Environmental risk assessment of soil contamination.
 535 IntechOpen.
- 536 28. Kwasigroch, U., Łukawska-Matuszewska, K., Jędruch, A., Brocławik, O., & Bełdowska, M. (2023).
 537 Mobility and bioavailability of mercury in sediments of the southern Baltic sea in relation to the chemical
 538 fractions of iron: Spatial and temporal patterns. Marine Environmental Research, 191, 106132
- Shen, J., Algeo, T. J., Planavsky, N. J., Yu, J., Feng, Q., Song, H., Rowe, H., Zhou, L., & Chen, J. (2019).
 Mercury enrichments provide evidence of Early Triassic volcanism following the end-Permian mass
 extinction. Earth-Science Reviews, 195, 191-212.
- Shen, J., Yu, J., Chen, J., Algeo, T. J., Xu, G., Feng, Q., Shi, X., Planavsky, J. N., Shu, W., & Xie, S. (2019).
 Mercury evidence of intense volcanic effects on land during the Permian-Triassic transition. Geology,
 47(12), 1117-1121.

545 **31.** Charbonnier, G., Adatte, T., Föllmi, K. B., & Suan, G. (2020). Effect of intense weathering and 546 postdepositional degradation of organic matter on Hg/TOC proxy in organic-rich sediments and its 547 implicationsfor deep-time investigations. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 21(2), e2019GC008707.

548 **32.** Frieling, J., Fendley, I. M., Nawaz, M. A., & Mather, T. A. (2024). Assessment of Hg speciation 549 changes in the sedimentary rock record from thermal desorption characteristics. Geochemistry, 550 Geophysics, Geosystems, 25(4), e2024GC011502.

551 This study reveals how mercury speciation varies in sedimentary records, providing crucial insights into 552 historical mercury cycling and its environmental impacts during past climatic events.

553 **33.** Grasby, S.E., Beauchamp, B., Bond, D.P.G., Wignall, P., Talavera, C., Galloway, J.M., Piepjohn, K.,
554 Reinhardt, L., Blomeier, D. (2015). Progressive environmental deterioration in northwestern Pangea leading
555 to the latest Permian extinction. GSA Bull. 127, 1331–1347. https://doi.org/10.1130/B31197.1

556 **34. Chu, D., Dal Corso, J., Shu, W., Song, H., Wignall, P. B., Grasby, S. E., van de Schootbrugge, B.,** 557 **Keqing Z., Wu, Y., & Tong, J. (2021).** Metal-induced stress in survivor plants following the end-Permian 558 collapse of land ecosystems. Geology, 49(6), 657-661.

559 This research reveals elevated metal stress in early Triassic flora, indicating persistent environmental 560 toxicity that delayed terrestrial recovery after the Permian extinction.

35. Baranyi, V., Jin, X., Dal Corso, J., Shi, Z., Grasby, S. E., & Kemp, D. B. (2023). Collapse of terrestrial
ecosystems linked to heavy metal poisoning during the Toarcian oceanic anoxic event. Geology, 51(7), 652656.

564 The authors link widespread terrestrial ecosystem collapse during the Toarcian event to elevated heavy 565 metal concentrations, offering strong evidence for metal toxicity as a mass extinction driver.

566 **36.** Mitchell, C. E., & Melchin, M. J. (2020). Late Ordovician mass extinction caused by volcanism, 567 warming, and anoxia, not cooling and glaciation: Comment. *Geology*, *48*(8), e509-e509.

Indraswari, A. O., Frieling, J., Mather, T. A., Dickson, A. J., Jenkyns, H. C., & Idiz, E. (2024).
Investigating the behavior of sedimentary mercury (Hg) during burial-related thermal maturation.
Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 25(6), e2024GC011555.

S71 38. Percival, L. M. E., Tedeschi, L. R., Creaser, R. A., Bottini, C., Erba, E., Giraud, F., Svensen, H., Savian,
J., Trindade, R., Coccioni, R., Frontalini, F., Jovane, L., Mather, T. A. & Jenkyns, H. C. (2021). Determining the
style and provenance of magmatic activity during the Early Aptian Oceanic Anoxic Event (OAE 1a). Global
and Planetary Change, 200, 103461.

575 **39.** Benoit, J. M., Mason, R. P., Gilmour, C. C., & Aiken, G. R. (2001). Constants for mercury binding by
576 dissolved organic matter isolates from the Florida Everglades. Geochimica et cosmochimica acta, 65(24),
577 4445-445

40. Han, S., Gill, G. A., Lehman, R. D., & Choe, K. Y. (2006). Complexation of mercury by dissolved organic matter in surface waters of Galveston Bay, Texas. Marine chemistry, 98(2-4), 156-166.

580 **41.** Gehrke, G.E., Blum, J.D., Meyers, P.A. (2009). The geochemical behavior and isotopic composition
581 of Hg in a mid-Pleistocene western Mediterranean sapropel. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 73, 1651–1665.
582 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2008.12.012

583 **42.** Sanei, H., Grasby, S.E., Beauchamp, B. (2012). Latest Permian mercury anomalies. Geology 40, 63–
 584 66. https://doi.org/10.1130/G32596.1

Grasby, S.E., Sanei, H., Beauchamp, B., Chen, Z. (2013). Mercury deposition through the Permo–
Triassic Biotic Crisis. Chem. Geol. 351, 209–216. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemgeo.2013.05.022

587 This paper documents a global mercury spike coinciding with the Permian–Triassic extinction, 588 strengthening the volcanic mercury poisoning hypothesis.

589 44. Grasby, S.E., Beauchamp, B., Bond, D.P.G., Wignall, P.B., Sanei, H. (2016). Mercury anomalies 590 associated with three extinction events (Capitanian Crisis, Latest Permian Extinction and the 591 Smithian/Spathian 285–297. Extinction) in NW Pangea. Geol. Mag. 153, 592 https://doi.org/10.1017/S0016756815000436.

Mazaheri-Johari, M., Gianolla, P., Mather, T.A., Frieling, J., Chu, D., Dal Corso, J. (2021). Mercury
deposition in Western Tethys during the Carnian Pluvial Episode (Late Triassic). Sci. Rep. 11, 17339.
https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-021-96890-8

596 46. Li, S., Grasby, S.E., Zhao, X., Chen, J., Zheng, D., Wang, H., Fang, Y., Zhang, Q., Yu, T., Tian, J., Du, S., 597 Jarzembowski, E.A., Wang, Q., Zhang, H., Wan, X., Wang, B. (2022). Mercury evidence of Deccan volcanism 598 driving the Latest Maastrichtian event. Geology 50, 1140-1144. warming 599 https://doi.org/10.1130/G50016.1

Singh, S., Parihar, P., Singh, R., Singh, V. P., & Prasad, S. M. (2016). Heavy metal tolerance in plants:
role of transcriptomics, proteomics, metabolomics, and ionomics. Frontiers in plant science, 6, 1143.

602 48. Goyal, D., Yadav, A., Prasad, M., Singh, T. B., Shrivastav, P., Ali, A., Datu, K. P., & Mishra, S. (2020).
603 Effect of heavy metals on plant growth: an overview. Contaminants in agriculture: sources, impacts and
604 management, 79-101.

605 49. Shukla, S., Das, S., Phutela, S., Triathi, A., Kumari, C., & Shukla, S. K. (2024). Heavy metal stress in
606 plants: Causes, impact and effective management. In Heavy Metal Toxicity: Human Health Impact and
607 Mitigation Strategies (pp. 187-215). Cham: Springer Nature Switzerland.

608 **50.** Wintz, H., Fox, T., & Vulpe, C. (2002). Responses of plants to iron, zinc and copper 609 deficiencies. *Biochemical Society Transactions*, *30*(4), 766-768.

610 **51.** Reeves, R.D, and Baker, A.J.M. (2000) Metal accumulating plants. In: Raskin I, Ensley B (eds)
611 Phytoremediation of toxic metals: using plants to clean up the environment. Wiley, New York, pp 193–229

612 **52.** Nagajyoti, P. C., Lee, K. D., & Sreekanth, T. V. M. (2010). Heavy metals, occurrence and toxicity for 613 plants: a review. Environmental chemistry letters, 8, 199-216.

53. Vardhan, K. H., Kumar, P. S., & Panda, R. C. (2019). A review on heavy metal pollution, toxicity and
remedial measures: Current trends and future perspectives. Journal of Molecular Liquids, 290, 111197.

- 616 54. Pambudiono, A., Suarsini, E., & Amin, M. (2018). The Potential of Indigenous Bacteria for Removing
 617 Cadmium from Industrial Wastewater in Lawang, East Java. Journal of Tropical Life Science, 8(1).
- 55. Shaw, B. P., Sahu, S. K., & Mishra, R. K. (2004). Heavy metal induced oxidative damage in terrestrial
 plants. Heavy metal stress in plants: from biomolecules to ecosystems, 84-126.
- 56. Lin, A. J., Zhang, X. H., Chen, M. M., & Qing, C. A. O. (2007). Oxidative stress and DNA damages
 induced by cadmium accumulation. Journal of Environmental Sciences, 19(5), 596-602.
- 622 **57.** Assad, M., Parelle, J., Cazaux, D., Gimbert, F., Chalot, M., & Tatin-Froux, F. (2016). Mercury uptake 623 into poplar leaves. Chemosphere, 146, 1-7.
- 624 **58.** Di Toppi, L. S., & Gabbrielli, R. (1999). Response to cadmium in higher plants. Environmental and 625 experimental botany, 41(2), 105-130.
- 59. Sharma, P., Jha, A. B., Dubey, R. S., & Pessarakli, M. (2012). Reactive oxygen species, oxidative damage, and antioxidative defense mechanism in plants under stressful conditions. *Journal of botany*, *2012*(1), 217037.
- 629 **60.** Iqbal, M. Z., & Shazia, Y. (2004). Reduction of germination and seedling growth of Leucaena 630 leucocephala caused by lead and cadmium individually and in combinations.
- 631 61. Islam, E., Yang, X., Li, T., Liu, D., Jin, X., & Meng, F. (2007). Effect of Pb toxicity on root morphology,
 632 physiology and ultrastructure in the two ecotypes of Elsholtzia argyi. Journal of hazardous materials,
 633 147(3), 806-816.
- 634 62. De Flora, S., Bennicelli, C., & Bagnasco, M. (1994). Genotoxicity of mercury compounds. A review.
 635 Mutation Research/Reviews in Genetic Toxicology, 317(1), 57-79.
- 636 **63.** Sawidis, T., Baycu, G., Cevahir–Öz, G., & Weryszko-Chmielewska, E. (2018). Effect of mercury on 637 pollen germination and tube growth in Lilium longiflorum. Protoplasma, 255, 819-828.
- 638 64. Patra, M., & Sharma, A. (2000). Mercury toxicity in plants. *The botanical review*, *66*, 379-422.
- 639 65. Mansoor, S., Sharma, V., Mir, M. A., Mir, J. I., un Nabi, S., Ahmed, N., Alkahtani, J., Alwahibi, S. M.,
 640 & Masoodi, K. Z. (2020). Quantification of polyphenolic compounds and relative gene expression studies
 641 of phenylpropanoid pathway in apple (Malus domestica Borkh) in response to Venturia inaequalis
 642 infection. Saudi journal of biological sciences, 27(12), 3397-3404.
- 643 66. Mansoor, S., Ali Wani, O., Lone, J. K., Manhas, S., Kour, N., Alam, P., Ahmad, A., & Ahmad, P. (2022).
 644 Reactive oxygen species in plants: from source to sink. Antioxidants, 11(2), 225.
- 645 67. Berni, R., Luyckx, M., Xu, X., Legay, S., Sergeant, K., Hausman, J. F., Lutts, S., Cai, G., & Guerriero, G.
 646 (2019). Reactive oxygen species and heavy metal stress in plants: Impact on the cell wall and secondary
 647 metabolism. Environmental and Experimental Botany, 161, 98-106.
- 648 68. Vandenbroucke, T. R., Emsbo, P., Munnecke, A., Nuns, N., Duponchel, L., Lepot, K., Quijada, M.,
 649 Paris, F., Servais, T., & Kiessling, W. (2015). Metal-induced malformations in early Palaeozoic plankton are
 650 harbingers of mass extinction. Nature Communications, 6(1), 7966.

651 69. Lindström, S., Sanei, H., van De Schootbrugge, B., Pedersen, G.K., Lesher, C.E., Tegner, C., Heunisch,
652 C., Dybkjaer, K., Outridge, P.M. (2019). Volcanic mercury and mutagenesis in land plants during the end653 Triassic mass extinction. Science Advances, 5(10), eaaw4018.

654 **70.** Gravendyck, J., Schobben, M., Bachelier, J. B., & Kürschner, W. M. (2020). Macroecological patterns 655 of the terrestrial vegetation history during the end-Triassic biotic crisis in the central European Basin: a 656 palynological study of the Bonenburg section (NW-Germany) and its supra-regional implications. Global 657 and Planetary Change, 194, 103286.

Shen, J., Chen, J., Yu, J., Algeo, T. J., Smith, R. M., Botha, J., Frank, D. T., Fielding, C. R., Ward, P. D. &
Mather, T. A. (2023). Mercury evidence from southern Pangea terrestrial sections for end-Permian global
volcanic effects. Nature Communications, 14(1), 6.

72. Vajda, V., McLoughlin, S., Slater, S. M., Gustafsson, O., & Rasmusson, A. G. (2023). The 'seed-fern'Lepidopteris mass-produced the abnormal pollen Ricciisporites during the end-Triassic biotic crisis.
Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 627, 111723.

Vajda, V., McLoughlin, S., Slater, S. M., Gustafsson, O., & Rasmusson, A. G. (2024). Confirmation
 that Antevsia zeilleri microsporangiate organs associated with latest Triassic Lepidopteris ottonis
 (Peltaspermales) leaves produced Cycadopites-Monosulcites-Chasmatosporites-and Ricciisporites-type
 monosulcate pollen. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 640, 112111.

668 74. De Backer, T., Day, J. J. E., Emsbo, P., McLaughlin, P. I., & Vandenbroucke, T. R. (2024). Chitinozoan
669 response to the 'Kellwasser events': population dynamics and morphological deformities across the
670 Frasnian–Famennian mass extinction. Papers in Palaeontology, 10(3), e1557.

75. Bos, R., Zheng, W., Lindström, S., Sanei, H., Waajen, I., Fendley, I. M., Mather, T. A., Wang, Y.,
Rohovec, J., Navratil, T., Sluijs, A. & van de Schootbrugge, B. (2024). Climate-forced Hg-remobilization
associated with fern mutagenesis in the aftermath of the end-Triassic extinction. Nature Communications,
15(1), 3596.

The study identifies post-extinction mercury remobilization and mutagenesis in plants, highlighting the
 long-lasting biological impacts of volcanic emissions.

76. Visscher, H., Looy, C. V., Collinson, M. E., Brinkhuis, H., Van Konijnenburg-Van Cittert, J. H.,
Kürschner, W. M., & Sephton, M. A. (2004). Environmental mutagenesis during the end-Permian ecological
crisis. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 101(35), 12952-12956.

Foster, C. B., & Afonin, S. A. (2005). Abnormal pollen grains: an outcome of deteriorating
atmospheric conditions around the Permian–Triassic boundary. Journal of the Geological Society, 162(4),
653-659.

Benca, J. P., Duijnstee, I. A., & Looy, C. V. (2018). UV-B-induced forest sterility: Implications of ozone
shield failure in Earth's largest extinction. Science Advances, 4(2), e1700618.

79. Benca, J. P., Duijnstee, I. A., & Looy, C. V. (2022). Fossilized pollen malformations as indicators of
past environmental stress and meiotic disruption: insights from modern conifers. Paleobiology, 48(4), 677710.

Liu, F., Peng, H., Marshall, J. E., Lomax, B. H., Bomfleur, B., Kent, M. S., Fraser, T. W., & Jardine, P. E.
(2023). Dying in the Sun: Direct evidence for elevated UV-B radiation at the end-Permian mass extinction.
Science Advances, 9(1), eabo6102.

691 **81.** Hochuli, P. A., Schneebeli-Hermann, E., Mangerud, G., & Bucher, H. (2017). Evidence for 692 atmospheric pollution across the Permian-Triassic transition. Geology, 45(12), 1123-1126.

82. Rampino, M. R., Rodriguez, S., Baransky, E., & Cai, Y. (2017). Global nickel anomaly links Siberian
Traps eruptions and the latest Permian mass extinction. Scientific Reports, 7(1), 12416.

83. Paterson, N. W., Rossi, V. M., & Schneebeli-Hermann, E. (2024). Volcanogenic mercury and plant
mutagenesis during the end-Permian mass extinction: Palaeoecological perturbation in northern Pangaea.
Gondwana Research, 134, 123-143.

698 **84.** Kürschner, W. M., Batenburg, S. J., & Mander, L. (2013). Aberrant Classopollis pollen reveals 699 evidence for unreduced (2 n) pollen in the conifer family Cheirolepidiaceae during the Triassic–Jurassic 700 transition. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences, 280(1768), 20131708.

701 **85.** Van de Schootbrugge, B. A. S., & Wignall, P. B. (2016). A tale of two extinctions: converging end-702 Permian and end-Triassic scenarios. Geological Magazine, 153(2), 332-354.

86. Svensen, H., Planke, S., Polozov, A. G., Schmidbauer, N., Corfu, F., Podladchikov, Y. Y., & Jamtveit, B.
(2009). Siberian gas venting and the end-Permian environmental crisis. Earth and Planetary Science Letters,
277(3-4), 490-500.

706 87. Munnecke, A., Delabroye, A., Servais, T., Vandenbroucke, T. R., & Vecoli, M. (2012). Systematic
 707 occurrences of malformed (teratological) acritarchs in the run-up of Early Palaeozoic δ13C isotope
 708 excursions. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 367, 137-146.

Yap, C. K., Ahmad Wakid, S., Chew, J. M., Sutra, J., Syazwan, W. M., Aziz, N. A. A., Mustafa, M., Nulit,
R., Okamura, H., Horie, Y., Ong, C. M., Ismail, S. M., Setyawan, D. A., Kumur, K., Zakaly, H. M. H., & Cheng,
W. H. (2023). Shell Deformities in the Green-Lipped Mussel Perna viridis: Occurrence and Potential
Environmental Stresses on the West Coast of Peninsular Malaysia. Pollutants, 3(3), 406-418.

713 **89.** Du Châtelet, É. A., Debenay, J. P., & Soulard, R. (2004). Foraminiferal proxies for pollution 714 monitoring in moderately polluted harbors. Environmental pollution, 127(1), 27-40.

71590.Frontalini, F., & Coccioni, R. (2008). Benthic foraminifera for heavy metal pollution monitoring: a716case study from the central Adriatic Sea coast of Italy. Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science, 76(2), 404-417.

91. Mayk, D., Harper, E. M., Fietzke, J., Backeljau, T., & Peck, L. S. (2022). 130 years of heavy metal
pollution archived in the shell of the intertidal dog whelk, Nucella lapillus (Gastropoda, Muricidae). Marine
Pollution Bulletin, 185, 114286.

Filice, M., Reinero, F. R., Cerra, M. C., Faggio, C., Leonetti, F. L., Micarelli, P., Giglio, G., Sperrone, E.,
Barca, D., & Imbrogno, S. (2023). Contamination by trace elements and oxidative stress in the skeletal
muscle of Scyliorhinus canicula from the Central Tyrrhenian Sea. Antioxidants, 12(2), 524.

93. Sunila, I., & Lindström, R. (1985). Survival, growth and shell deformities of copper-and cadmium exposed mussels (Mytilus edulis L.) in brackish water. Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science, 21(4), 555-565.

94. Riani, E., Cordova, M. R., & Arifin, Z. (2018). Heavy metal pollution and its relation to the
malformation of green mussels cultured in Muara Kamal waters, Jakarta Bay, Indonesia. Marine pollution
bulletin, 133, 664-670.

Harayashiki, C. A. Y., Márquez, F., Cariou, E., & Castro, Í. B. (2020). Mollusk shell alterations resulting
 from coastal contamination and other environmental factors. Environmental Pollution, 265, 114881.

96. Yanko, V., Ahmad, M., & Kaminski, M. (1998). Morphological deformities of benthic foraminiferal
tests in response to pollution by heavy metals; implications for pollution monitoring. The Journal of
Foraminiferal Research, 28(3), 177-200.

Polovodova, I., & Schönfeld, J. (2008). Foraminiferal test abnormalities in the western Baltic Sea.
The Journal of Foraminiferal Research, 38(4), 318-336.

735 98. Coccioni, R., Frontalini, F., Marsili, A., & Mana, D. (2009). Benthic foraminifera and trace element
 736 distribution: a case-study from the heavily polluted lagoon of Venice (Italy). Marine Pollution Bulletin, 59(8 737 12), 257-267.

This study demonstrates how benthic foraminifera respond to heavy metal pollution, providing crucial insights into the use of microfossils as indicators of marine environmental contamination and ecosystem health.

- 99. Coccioni, R., & Luciani, V. (2006). Guembelitria irregularis bloom at the KT boundary:
 morphological abnormalities induced by impact-related extreme environmental stress?. In Biological
 processes associated with impact events (pp. 179-196). Berlin, Heidelberg: Springer Berlin Heidelberg.
- Ballent, S. C., & Carignano, A. P. (2008). Morphological abnormalities in Late Cretaceous and early
 Paleocene foraminifer tests (northern Patagonia, Argentina). Marine Micropaleontology, 67(3-4), 288-296.
- von Hillebrandt, A., & Krystyn, L. (2009). On the oldest Jurassic ammonites of Europe (Northern
 Calcareous Alps, Austria) and their global significance. Neues Jahrbuch für Geologie und Paläontologie,
 253(2-3), 163-195.
- 102. Krainer, K., & Vachard, D. (2011). The Lower Triassic Werfen Formation of the Karawanken
 Mountains (southern Austria) and its disaster survivor microfossils, with emphasis on Postcladella n.
 gen.(Foraminifera, Miliolata, Cornuspirida). Revue de Micropaléontologie, 54(2), 59-85.
- 103. Korn, D., Ghaderi, A., Leda, L., Schobben, M., & Ashouri, A. R. (2016). The ammonoids from the
 Late Permian Paratirolites Limestone of Julfa (East Azerbaijan, Iran). Journal of Systematic Palaeontology,
 14(10), 841-890.
- 104. Long, G., & Day, J. (2022). Late Devonian aberrant conodont morphotypes from Lower Kellwasser
 extinction and post-extinction interval of the Sweetland Creek Shale, Iowa Basin-Central North America. In
 Geological Society of America Abstracts (Vol. 54, p. 375854).
- 758 **105.** Zong, R., & Gong, Y. (2022). Malformations in Late Devonian brachiopods from the western Junggar,
 759 NW China and their potential causes. PeerJ, 10, e13447.

106. Bralower, T. J., & Self-Trail, J. M. (2016). Nannoplankton malformation during the PaleoceneEocene Thermal Maximum and its paleoecological and paleoceanographic significance. Paleoceanography,
31(10), 1423-1439.

- Falasco, E., Bona, F., Badino, G., Hoffmann, L., & Ector, L. (2009). Diatom teratological forms and
 environmental alterations: a review. Hydrobiologia, 623, 1-35.
- 765 This review highlights the use of abnormal diatom forms as sensitive bioindicators of environmental 766 stress and pollution, emphasizing their value in monitoring aquatic ecosystem health.
- 108. Reddy, B. S. R., Jayaraju, N., Sreenivasulu, G., Suresh, U., & Reddy, A. N. (2016). Heavy metal
 pollution monitoring with foraminifera in the estuaries of Nellore coast, East coast of India. Marine
 Pollution Bulletin, 113(1-2), 542-551.
- 109. El-Kahawy, R. M., & Mabrouk, M. S. (2023). Benthic foraminifera as bioindicators for the heavy
 metals in the severely polluted Hurghada Bay, Red Sea coast, Egypt. Environmental Science and Pollution
 Research, 30(27), 70437-70457.
- Francescangeli, F., Milker, Y., Bunzel, D., Thomas, H., Norbisrath, M., Schönfeld, J., & Schmiedl, G.
 (2021). Recent benthic foraminiferal distribution in the Elbe Estuary (North Sea, Germany): A response to
 environmental stressors. Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science, 251, 107198.
- 111. Vidović, J., Nawrot, R., Gallmetzer, I., Haselmair, A., Tomašových, A., Stachowitsch, M., Cosovic, V.,
 & Zuschin, M. (2016). Anthropogenically induced environmental changes in the northeastern Adriatic Sea
 in the last 500 years (Panzano Bay, Gulf of Trieste). Biogeosciences, 13(21), 5965-5981.
- **112.** Gallmetzer, I., Haselmair, A., Tomašových, A., Stachowitsch, M., & Zuschin, M. (2017). Responses
 of molluscan communities to centuries of human impact in the northern Adriatic Sea. PLoS One, 12(7),
 e0180820.
- **113.** Bruggmann, S., Klaebe, R. M., Paulukat, C., & Frei, R. (2019). Heterogeneity and incorporation of
 chromium isotopes in recent marine molluscs (Mytilus). Geobiology, 17(4), 417-435.
- 114. Galgani, F., Senia, J., Guillou, J. L., Laugier, T., Munaron, D., Andral, B., Guillaume, B., Coulet, E.,
 Boissery, P., Brun, L., & Bertrandy, M. C. (2009). Assessment of the environmental quality of French
 continental Mediterranean lagoons with oyster embryo bioassay. Archives of environmental contamination
 and toxicology, 57, 540-551.
- **115.** Demirtaş, F. (2018). Antalya civarındaki Permiyen-Triyas geçişinin sedimantolojik, petrografik ve
 jeokimyasal açıdan incelenmesi (PhD Thesis) Akdeniz Üniversitesi, Antalya, Turkey.
- 790 **116.** Richoz, S. (2006). Stratigraphie et variations isotopiques du carbone dans le Permien supéreur et
 791 le Trias inférieur de quelques localités de la Néotethys (Turquie, Oman et Iran) (PhD thesis), Université de
 792 Lausanne, Switzerland.
- **117.** Frank, A.B., Grasby, S.E., Karapunar, B., Lahajnar, N., Gomez Correa, M.A., Buchwald, S.Z., J., Metzke, M., Kosun, E., Foster, W.J., in review. Redox changes across the Permain-Triassic transition in the shallow marine Neothethys: New insights from Antalya, Turkey. Submitted to Chemical Geology. Data available at: https://zenodo.org/records/15287022.