## Cover Sheet A Comprehensive Assessment of the FireCCILT11 Global Burned Area Product

Authors Dong Chen Department of Geographical Sciences University of Maryland College Park, MD 20742, USA Email: <u>itscd@umd.edu</u>

Louis Giglio Department of Geographical Sciences University of Maryland College Park, MD 20742, USA Email: lgiglio@umd.edu

Corresponding Author: Dong Chen (itscd@umd.edu)

# Preprint Status Statement

This manuscript is a non-peer-reviewed preprint submitted to EarthArXiv.

2 Dong Chen(itscd@umd.edu)\*<sup>1</sup>, Louis Giglio (lgiglio@umd.edu)<sup>1</sup> 3 <sup>1</sup>Department of Geographical Sciences, University of Maryland, College Park, MD, USA \*Corresponding author. 4

- 5
- 6 Abstract

7 The FireCCILT11 global burned area (BA) product, developed under the ESA Climate Change Initiative, spans nearly four decades (1982–2018) and is the longest nearly continuous global 8 9 fire record currently available. Despite its growing use in high-profile studies, its performance has 10 not been comprehensively evaluated. Moreover, while two earlier studies identified severe 11 instrumental artifacts in the FireCCILT11 dataset, the supporting evidence in those studies was 12 primarily circumstantial. Here, we directly assess FireCCILT11 BA using a suite of national fire 13 history datasets and independently derived satellite-based BA products across eight countries. Our 14 analysis reveals substantial limitations in both the accuracy and consistency of FireCCILT11, 15 particularly before 2001. FireCCILT11 frequently diverges from national records in terms of annual 16 BA totals, exhibits poor spatial agreement at the pixel level, and suffers from high omission and 17 commission errors. A pixelation effect further compromises its spatial resolution and usability. 18 These findings suggest that FireCCILT11 may be unsuitable for long-term fire regime analyses, 19 especially in regions or periods not represented in its training data. We highlight the ongoing need 20 for a robust, AVHRR-based global BA product and propose best practices for the development and 21 evaluation of long-term BA datasets.

22

23 1. Introduction

#### 1 A Comprehensive Assessment of the FireCCILT11 Global Burned Area Product

24 Wildfires, ignited by natural causes such as lightning strikes or human activities like agricultural clearing and accidental ignitions, are a widespread phenomenon across diverse 25 26 ecosystems globally. These fires play a dual role, acting as both ecological regulators in fire-adapted 27 landscapes and destructive forces in human-altered environments. In ecosystems ranging from boreal forests to tropical savannas, wildfires have historically shaped vegetation structure, nutrient 28 29 cycling, and species composition (Bowman et al. 2009; Moritz et al. 2014). Depending on the 30 ecosystem and the proximity to human populations, they can impose a wide array of ecological, 31 societal, and climatic impacts. For example, in circumpolar boreal forest, the largest terrestrial biome 32 on Earth, wildfires play a pivotal role shaping these forests vegetation compositions, successional 33 trajectories, and carbon storage (Bond-Lamberty et al. 2007; Walker et al. 2019; Whitman et al. 34 2018). Societally, wildfires are the main driver of decreasing air quality in the northwestern US, 35 which carries major health implications (McClure and Jaffe 2018; O'Dell et al. 2021). Climatically, 36 boreal forest fires release vast stores of carbon, amplifying atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations and reducing albedo through soot deposition on ice sheets (Randerson et al. 2006; Zheng et al. 2023). 37 Additionally, megafires like Australia's 2019–2020 Black Summer fires emitted ~715 million tonnes 38 39 of CO<sub>2</sub>, equivalent to nearly half the country's annual fossil fuel emissions (van der Velde et al. 40 2021).

Coping with wildfires in a changing climate requires a good understanding of their impacts, whether beneficial or undesirable, which in turn generally requires knowing the extent, or burned area (BA), of the fires. It is for this reason that wildfires' burned area have been mapped by various forest and fire management agencies around the world using various methods. Among those methods, satellite remote sensing plays a pivotal role in mapping and analyzing BA, offering a unique capacity to monitor wildfires systematically across expansive, remote, and often inaccessible 47 regions. By detecting spectral changes in vegetation and surface reflectance, satellites provide48 essential data on fire extent, severity, and ecological consequences.

49 There have been a myriad of satellite-based BA products developed at the global scale, with most relying on coarse-resolution imaging sensors. Among these, the MODIS-based BA products 50 51 have been foundational for the scientific community. The now-defunct MCD45A1 product was one 52 of the first MODIS BA products that detected the approximate date of burning at 500-m resolution 53 by locating rapid changes in daily surface reflectance time series data, though it was notably affected 54 by cloud and aerosol contamination (Roy et al. 2002). The MCD64A1, which has become the 55 standard MODIS BA product since Collection 6, employs a hybrid algorithm that applies dynamic 56 thresholds to composite imagery generated from a burn-sensitive vegetation index derived from 57 MODIS short-wave infrared channels 5 and 7, coupled with 1-km MODIS active fire observations (Giglio et al. 2018). This approach enables significantly better detection of small burns, reduced 58 59 temporal uncertainty, and a substantial reduction in unclassified areas compared to MCD45A1. Meanwhile, the European Space Agency's Climate Change Initiative (ESA CCI) developed an array 60 61 of global BA products, including FireCCI41 and FireCCI50. FireCCI41, developed using the 62 MEdium Resolution Imaging Spectrometer (MERIS) data, provided global BA estimates at 300 m 63 resolution for 2005-2011 but faced limitations in spatial granularity and temporal coverage 64 (Chuvieco et al. 2018; Chuvieco et al. 2016). Its successor, FireCCI50, marked a significant 65 advancement as the first MODIS-based global BA product at 250 m resolution, utilizing MODIS 66 MOD09GQ daily surface reflectance data in red and near-infrared bands (Chuvieco et al. 2018). The 67 product was subsequently refined and released as FireCCI51 several years later (Lizundia-Loiola et al. 2020). More recently, progress has been made on the development of MCD64A1-compatible BA 68 69 product for the Visible Infrared Imaging Radiometer Suite (VIIRS) (Giglio et al. in review).

In addition to coarse-resolution BA products, higher spatial resolution BA products have
been developed using Landsat data. Based on the algorithm prototyped in Hawbaker et al. (2017),
Hawbaker et al. (2020) developed a 30-m BA product for the conterminous US based on Landsat
imagery, which was subsequently integrated into the Landsat Level-3 data suite. Meanwhile, Sentinel2, with its shorter revisit cycle (5 days) and higher spatial resolution, has also shown promising
performance in BA mapping (Bastarrika et al. 2024; Gaveau et al. 2021).

76 Despite the abundance of remotely sensed BA products, there is a notable scarcity of long-77 term BA products spanning over three decades, which is the minimum temporal span for robust climate-related trend analysis recommended by the World Meteorological Organization (World 78 79 Meteorological Organization 2017). This limitation exists because such lengthy time series must rely 80 on data acquired by the Advanced Very High Resolution Radiometer (AVHRR) sensors, which 81 present significant data quality challenges. Against this backdrop, the FireCCILT11 product (Otón et 82 al. 2021b) stands out as the only BA product currently available with such temporal extent. Produced from AVHRR data, FireCCILT11 provides global BA mapping for the period 1982–2018 83 (excluding 1994). While FireCCILT11 has received increasing attention from the scientific 84 85 community, as exhibited by its use as a primary data source in a lineup of high-profile publications 86 (e.g., Descals et al. (2022), Cardil et al. (2023), Lin et al. (2024)), limited assessments were carried out 87 on FireCCILT11 in the original product publications (Otón et al. 2021a; Otón et al. 2021b). In 88 addition, various problems with the FireCCILT11 product, including prominent spatial and 89 temporal artifacts in BA linked to the orbital drift of the AVHRR-carrying National Oceanic and 90 Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) satellites, were subsequently demonstrated (Giglio and Roy 2022, 2023, 2024; Giglio et al. 2022) but these have yet to be assessed in a systematic and 91 92 comprehensive fashion. We believe addressing this knowledge gap is crucial for the global fire

93 science community, particularly for researchers looking to appropriately utilize FireCCILT11 in
94 long-term fire regime studies.

95 2. Datasets

96 The FireCCILT11 product is a global BA dataset developed under the European Space 97 Agency's Climate Change Initiative, utilizing the AVHRR Land Long Term Data Record (LTDR) at 98 a spatial resolution of 0.05°. The core algorithm employs multiple random forest classifiers trained 99 using reference data from the 250-m MODIS FireCCI51 BA product spanning 2001–2018. These 100 classifiers process spectral indices derived from monthly AVHRR composites to identify BAs. A key 101 innovation in FireCCILT11 is its correction mechanism for satellite orbit drift, particularly critical 102 for pre-2000 data (1982–2000). Outputs are provided at both the native 0.05° pixel resolution and 103 an aggregated 0.25° grid, with the latter generated by summing BA values from the high-resolution 104 data. This methodology ultimately provides monthly global BA maps for 1982–2018, excluding 1994 105 (Otón et al. 2021b).

106 In this study, we evaluated the performance of the FireCCILT11 product using six datasets 107 categorized into two groups: 1) national fire history data, and 2) remotely sensed BA products. The 108 national fire history data consist of datasets sourced from the US, Canada, Australia, and Europe, 109 representing a comprehensive compilation of meticulously maintained long-term fire history records 110 available to date. Together, these datasets provide an encompassing portrayal of fire histories within 111 their respective coverage areas. The remotely sensed data comprise two global BA products, namely 112 FireCCI51 (Chuvieco et al., 2018) and MCD64A1 (Giglio et al., 2018). Both products are derived 113 from MODIS imagery and enjoy wide popularity among the global fire science community (Bastos 114 et al. 2020; Boer et al. 2020; Gatti et al. 2021; Harris et al. 2021; Pinto et al. 2020). Further details 115 regarding these six datasets are provided in Table 1.

117 Table 1. A list of the datasets that are used in this assessment. Citations: NBAC BA (Hall et al.

118 2020); NIFC BA (National Interagency Fire Center 2024); EFFIS BA (San-Miguel-Ayanz et al.

119 2012); AIFH BA (Canadell et al. 2021); FireCCI51 (Chuvieco et al. 2018); and MCD64A1 (Giglio et

120 al. 2018). The datasets that are in **bold** indicate those that provide spatially explicit BA maps.

Dataset Name	Category	Spatial Resolution	Spatial Coverage	Temporal Coverage
National Burned Area Composite (NBAC)	National Fire History	Vector-based	Canada	1986-2022
National Interagency Fire Center (NIFC) Fire Perimeters	National Fire History	Vector-based	US	1986-2021
European Forest Fire Information System (EFFIS)	National Fire History	BA summary at Nomenclature of Territorial Units for Statistics level 3 (NUTS3)	Portugal, Italy, France, Spain, and Greece	1983-2022
Australia Interagency Fire History Data (AIFH)	National Fire History	BA summary at state and territory level	Australia	1988-2019
FireCCI51	Remotely Sensed Burned Area	250 m	Global	2001-2020
MCD64A1	Remotely Sensed Burned Area	500 m	Global	2001-2023

121

### 122 3. Methodology

123 3.1. Assessment in terms of annual total BA

124 For the eight countries where reference BA statistics or maps were available (US, Canada,

125 Australia, Italy, France, Greece, Spain, and Portugal), we computed annual total BA for

126 FireCCILT11 and the other remotely sensed datasets. To minimize errors from projection or

resampling, these calculations adhered to the native resolution of each dataset: 250 m for FireCCI51

128 and 500 m for MCD64A1. For the NBAC and NIFC datasets, which provide vector-formatted fire

129 perimeter polygons, BA statistics were derived at 30-m resolution to match the spatial detail of

Landsat imagery. This resolution aligns with the foundational data used to delineate many fireperimeters in these products (Hall et al., 2020).

132 The interannual variation of BA as mapped by FireCCILT11 was compared with that of the 133 reference datasets. For every year when both FireCCILT11 and national fire history data were 134 available, a consistency index (CI) was calculated as

135 
$$CI_{ij} = |BA_{ij} - R_{ij}| / R_{ij} * 100\%,$$

where BA<sub>i,j</sub> and R<sub>i,j</sub> represent the annual total BA of country *i* in year *j* according to FireCCILT11
and the national fire history dataset, respectively. In addition to comparing with the national fire
history datasets, the FireCCILT11 annual total BA was also compared to the FireCCI51 product in
each country in each year. The goal of this comparison was to assess the consistency of
FireCCILT11 in relation to FireCCI51, which provided the training data during the production of
FireCCILT11 (Otón et al. 2021b).

### 142 3.2. Per-pixel-based assessment of FireCCILT11

Compared to assessments based on annual total burned area (BA), per-pixel evaluations 143 provide critical insights into the spatial distribution of mapped burned pixels. This approach is 144 145 essential for assessing BA product performance, as it reveals how accurately a product represents 146 regional fire regimes across space and time. Among the national fire history datasets analyzed, the 147 NIFC (National Interagency Fire Center) and NBAC (National Burned Area Composite) datasets are spatially explicit and notable for their long-term records. The NBAC dataset, recognized as 148 149 Canada's most consistent and accurate wildfire polygon database (Gincheva et al. 2024), integrates 150 30-m Landsat imagery and agency-collected data with spatial resolutions finer than 30 m since 1986, 151 with regular updates to ensure reliability. Both NIFC and NBAC were developed at resolutions 152 much finer than FireCCILT11 (0.05°) and are entirely independent of the dataset, making them 153 suitable references for per-pixel comparisons. We acknowledge that fire perimeters in NIFC and

154 NBAC may include unburned islands, potentially leading to overestimations of BA within mapped 155 fire scars. Consequently, these datasets were treated as reasonable approximations of "ground truth" 156 rather than absolute references. This inherent uncertainty was explicitly accounted for in our 157 analytical framework to ensure robust conclusions. 158 A robust assessment of multiple datasets requires a uniform coordinate system and spatial 159 resolution. As the target FireCCILT11 dataset uses a geographic coordinate system (latitude/longitude) at 0.05° resolution, all spatially explicit BA datasets—NBAC, NIFC, FireCCI51, 160 and MCD64A1-were gridded to this system. Binary BA classifications from these datasets were 161 162 converted to gridded BA (km<sup>2</sup>) at 0.05° resolution by counting original BA pixels within each 0.05° cell. For per-pixel assessments, gridded national fire history datasets (NBAC for Canada and NIFC 163 164 for the US) were superimposed annually onto FireCCILT11. The same procedure was applied to 165 FireCCI51 and MCD64A1 to enable performance comparisons with FireCCILT11 using the national datasets as benchmarks. For each dataset pair (e.g., FireCCILT11 vs. NBAC), the Pearson 166 167 correlation coefficient (R) was calculated as:

168
$$R = \frac{\sum [(BA_j - \overline{BA}) \times (Ref_j - \overline{Ref})]}{\sqrt{\sum (BA_j - \overline{BA})^2 \times \sum (Ref_j - \overline{Ref})^2}}$$

where BA<sub>j</sub> and Ref<sub>j</sub> represent annual BA in year *j* from the target dataset and gridded national fire history data, respectively. To avoid overestimating performance, unburned pixels (where both datasets reported zero BA) were excluded from calculations. Only pixel pairs with at least one nonzero BA value were included in the analysis. While spatially explicit fire history data for Australia and the five EFFIS countries (Italy, France, Greece, Spain, Portugal) are not publicly available, R values between FireCCILT11 and FireCCI51 were also computed to assess their consistency outside North America. 176 In addition to evaluating the Pearson correlation, a confusion matrix-based accuracy 177 assessment was conducted to further evaluate FireCCILT11's performance. For this analysis, NBAC 178 and NIFC were treated as references. Both datasets were converted to binary burned/unburned 179 classifications, where a 0.05° grid cell was classified as "burned" if it contained non-zero BA values 180 and "unburned" otherwise. FireCCILT11 was similarly converted to a binary format. 181 Following the methodological framework of Olofsson et al. (2014), we generated 1,000 182 stratified random samples per year for Canada (NBAC) and the United States (NIFC) across the 183 study period (1986–2018, excluding 1994). The sampling strategy allocated 750 points to unburned areas and 250 points to burned areas annually, ensuring proportional representation of fire events. 184 185 These points were used to extract binary classifications (burned/unburned) from FireCCILT11 186 maps for the corresponding years. Results were compiled into annual confusion matrices, from which three key accuracy metrics were derived: commission error (burned and unburned pixels 187 188 incorrectly classified), omission error (burned and unburned pixels missed), and overall accuracy (the 189 proportion of correctly classified pixels, both burned and unburned). 190 4. Results

191 4.1. Results of the assessment based on annual total BA

192 In this study, the FireCCILT11 product was subjected to a series of analyses whose goals 193 were to assess the performance of FireCCILT11 BA from multiple perspectives. When compared 194 with national fire history datasets, including NBAC, NIFC, EFFIS, and AIFH, FireCCILT11 195 showed generally low consistencies. In our CI-based comparison, we adopted a threshold of 50%196 (i.e., annual total BA must be at least 50% higher or at least 50% lower than that mapped by the 197 national fire history datasets to be considered as inconsistent), which we believed was quite liberal. 198 Despite this generous criterion, annual BA as mapped by FireCCILT11 was inconsistent with 199 national fire histories in most years between 1986 and 2018 in seven of the eight countries that we

200	assessed: US (Figure 1a), Australia (Figure 1c), Portugal (Figure 2a), Italy (Figure 2b), France (Figure
201	2c), Spain (Figure 2d), and Greece (Figure 2e). The only exception was Canada, where good
202	interannual consistency between FireCCILT11 and NBAC was found (Figure 1b). In addition to the
203	national fire history datasets, we specifically included FireCCI51 as a reference dataset against which
204	FireCCILT11 was assessed. Considering that FireCCILT11 was trained based on FireCCI51, high
205	consistency between the two datasets was expected in all countries. However, to our surprise, this
206	was not the case, as in four countries (i.e., Portugal, France, Spain, and Greece), FireCCILT11's BA
207	was inconsistent with that of FireCCI51 in most years between 1986 and 2018 (Figure 2).





209 Figure 1. Comparisons of the consistencies of FireCCILT11 against reference datasets and

210 FireCCI51 in terms of annual total BA. The reference datasets in the Panels a-c are NIFC BA,

211 NBAC BA, and AIFH BA, respectively. The color bars below the bar graphs show the levels of

- 212 consistency between FireCCILT11 and the reference dataset (top row) and FireCCI51 BA (bottom
- row), with red, green, and gray indicating larger than 50%, within 50%, and Not Available,
- 214 respectively.



Figure 2. Comparisons of the consistencies of FireCCILT11 against reference datasets (EFFIS BA) and FireCCI51 in terms of annual total BA in each of the five countries covered by EFFIS. The color bars below the bar graphs show the levels of consistency between FireCCILT11 and the reference dataset (top row) and FireCCI51 BA (bottom row), with red, green, and gray indicating larger than 50%, within 50%, and Not Available, respectively.

221 4.2. Results of the per-pixel-based assessments

222 Both of our per-pixel-based assessments of FireCCILT11 BA against the US and Canadian 223 national fire history datasets suggest low FireCCILT11 performance, particularly during the pre-2001 224 era. In the US, the correlation between BA values as mapped by FireCCILT11 and NIFC never 225 exceeded 20% during 1986-2001 (Figure 3a). While the FireCCILT11-NIFC correlation improved 226 since 2002, it fluctuated around a mean value of 30%, with the maximum value below 50% (i.e., 227 43% in 2004). In Canada, the pre-2001 correlation between FireCCILT11 and NBAC was also 228 strikingly low (Figure 3b). Improvements were also recorded during the post-2001 era, however, the 229 average correlation between the two products over the 17-year period was still below 50% (i.e., 230 47%). Additionally, The correlation values between FireCCILT11 and NBAC before 2001 were 231 noticeably dominated by negative values (Figure 3b), indicating conflicting trends of BA 232 representation between FireCCILT11 and NBAC. In comparison, both FireCCI51 and MCD64A1 233 BA products performed much more consistently in both the US and Canada with the corresponding 234 reference datasets.



Figure 3. Interannual variation of the Pearson correlation coefficients (R) as calculated between the
following dataset pairs on a per-pixel basis: red: FireCCILT11 v. Reference, blue: MCD64A1 v.
Reference, green: FireCCI51 v. Reference. The reference datasets in Panels a and b are NIFC BA
and NBAC BA, respectively.

240 In the five EFFIS countries as well as Australia where spatially explicit national fire history

241 data are not openly available, our pixel-based correlation analysis cannot be used to infer the

- accuracy of FireCCILT11 BA. However, by correlating FireCCILT11 and MCD64A1 with
- 243 FireCCI51 respectively, we can reveal the consistency of FireCCILT11 in relation to the two existing
- 244 MODIS-based BA products. Our results showed that FireCCILT11/FireCCI51 BA consistency was



and Australia (Figure 10).

Figure 4. Interannual variation of the Pearson correlation coefficients (*R*) as calculated between the
following dataset pairs on a per-pixel basis: gray: FireCCILT11 v. FireCCI51, yellow: MCD64A1 v.
FireCCI51.

251

252 Our confusion matrix-based analysis provided additional insights into the performance of 253 FireCCILT11. In Canada, FireCCILT11 (in its binary form) showed exceptionally high omission 254 error (i.e., 79.5%) for the burned class during 1986-2000 (Table 2). This metric dropped to 50.4% 255 during 2001-2018, but was still considerable. In terms of the commission error for the burned class,

256	FireCCILT11 mistakenly classified 18% of unburned pixels as burned during 1986-2000. Between
257	2001 and 2018, however, FireCCILT11's commission error for the burned class dropped
258	substantially to 1.5%. In comparing FireCCILT11's performance against FireCCI51 and MCD64A1
259	for the common period of 2001-2018, both FireCCI51 and MCD64A1 outperformed FireCCILT11
260	in every metric, particularly with respect to the omission error for the burned class (Table 2). In the
261	US, the confusion matrices revealed a similar pattern. FireCCILT11 had the highest values of
262	omission error and commission error among the three products during 2001-2018. During 1986-
263	2000, FireCCILT11 not only showed high omission error for the burned class (i.e., 70.7%), but also
264	high commission error (i.e., 48.7%).

Table 2. Confusion matrices for FireCCILT11, FireCCI51, and MCD64A1 based on NBAC forCanada.

			Reference (NBAC)			
			Burned	Unburned	Total	Commission Error
FireCCILT11		Burned	717	157	874	18.0%
1986-2000	Classified	Unburned	2,783	10,343	13,126	21.2%
		Total	3,500	10,500	14,000	
		Omission Error	79.5%	1.5%		79.0%
			Re	ference (NBA	C)	
			Burned	Unburned	Total	Commission Error
FireCCILT11		Burned	2,232	35	2,267	1.5%
2001-2018	Classified	Unburned	2,268	13,465	15,733	14.4%
		Total	4,500	13,500	18,000	
		Omission Error	50.4%	0.3%		87.2%
			Reference (NBAC)			
			Burned	Unburned	Total	Commission Error
FireCCI51		Burned	3,129	24	3,153	0.8%
2001-2018	Classified	Unburned	1,371	13,476	14,847	9.2%
		Total	4,500	13,500	18,000	
		Omission Error	30.5%	0.2%		92.3%
MCD64A1			Re	ference (NBA	C)	
2001-2018			Burned	Unburned	Total	Commission Error

Classified	Burned	2,896	32	2,928	1.1%
	Unburned	1,604	13,468	15,072	10.6%
	Total	4,500	13,500	18,000	
	Omission Error	35.6%	0.2%		90.9%

269 Table 3. Confusion matrices for FireCCILT11, FireCCI51, and MCD64A1 based on NIFC for the

270 US.

			Reference (NIFC)			
			Burned	Unburned	Total	Commission Error
FireCCILT11		Burned	1,026	974	2,000	48.7%
1986-2000	Classified	Unburned	2,474	9,526	12,000	20.6%
		Total	3,500	10,500	14,000	
		Omission Error	70.7%	9.3%		75.4%
			Re	ference (NIF	C)	
			Burned	Unburned	Total	Commission Error
FireCCILT11		Burned	2,305	847	3,152	26.9%
2001-2018	Classified	Unburned	2,195	12,653	14,848	14.8%
		Total	4,500	13,500	18,000	
		Omission Error	48.8%	6.3%		83.1%
			Reference (NIFC)			
			Burned	Unburned	Total	Commission Error
FireCCI51		Burned	2,676	237	2,913	8.1%
2001-2018	Classified	Unburned	1,824	13,263	15,087	12.1%
		Total	4,500	13,500	18,000	
		Omission Error	40.5%	1.8%		88.6%
			Re	ference (NIF	C)	
			Burned	Unburned	Total	Commission Error
MCD64A1		Burned	2,396	265	2,661	10.0%
2001-2018	Classified	Unburned	2,104	13,235	15,339	13.7%
		Total	4,500	13,500	18,000	
		Omission Error	46.8%	2.0%		86.8%

271

272 5. Discussion

273 5.1. FireCCILT11 performance

274 In this study, we systematically assessed the performance of FireCCILT11 against the best

275 available reference datasets as well as alternative BA products that overlap temporally with the

276	FireCCILT11 data record. The results reveal FireCCILT11's generally low performance which is
277	reflected in two aspects: accuracy and consistency. First, FireCCILT11 does not provide an accurate
278	representation of the interannual BA dynamics in many parts of the world. Our analysis of yearly
279	total BA revealed large discrepancies between FireCCILT11and the national fire history datasets
280	between 1985 and 2018 in the US (Figure 1a), Australia (Figure 1c), Portugal (Figure 2a), Italy
281	(Figure 2b), France (Figure 2c), Spain (Figure 2d), and Greece (Figure 2e). Admittedly, the BAs in
282	the latter 5 EFFIS countries are relatively small, which means it may be somewhat easy for a BA
283	product to show large discrepancies with the official BA statistics in these countries. However, the
284	large differences between FireCCILT11 and the official BA statistics in the US and Australia are
285	particularly alarming considering the prevalence of fires in both countries. In the US, in 32 of the 33
286	years that we examined, yearly total BA as mapped by FireCCILT11 differs more than 50% from
287	what the NIFC dataset recorded (Figure 1a). In Australia, 21 out of 31 years showed larger-than-
288	50% discrepancies between FireCCILT11 and AIFH, which is still not trivial (Figure 1c).
289	In addition to the yearly total BA, the spatial distribution of burned pixels as reflected by
290	FireCCILT11 is sometimes severely flawed. In the US and Canada, where high-quality spatially
291	explicit national fire history datasets are available, FireCCILT11 showed extremely low per-pixel
292	correlations with the reference fire history datasets before 2001 (Figure 3). The strikingly low spatial
293	correlation during this period offers additional insight into FireCCILT11's performance in Canada
294	since our yearly-total BA analysis revealed that FireCCILT11 performed well temporally in Canada
295	(Figure 1b). This discrepancy means that while FireCCILT11 can provide a generally good
296	representation of the overall interannual dynamics of BA for Canada, it is unable to do so for a
297	spatially explicit representation of burned pixels. Our confusion matrix-based assessment lends
298	further evidence of FireCCILT11's poor performance in this regard. Specifically, FireCCILT11
299	shows exceptionally high omission errors for the burned pixels, particularly during the pre-2001 era

300	(Tables 2 and 3), which suggests that FireCCILT11 is very likely to miss BAs when a pixel was
301	actually burned according to the national fire history datasets. In the US, FireCCILT11 also shows
302	high commission errors for the burned class, suggesting that it also tends to overestimate BAs at
303	unburned pixels. These pieces of evidence, taken together, indicate that FireCCILT11 is unable to
304	represent BA reliably in the US and Canada. This claim is corroborated by visual examination of the
305	yearly BA maps. As shown in Figures 5 and 6, which depict 1989 and 2011, respectively, the spatial
306	distribution of the BAs as mapped by FireCCILT11 is strikingly different visually from those
307	mapped by NIFC and NBAC. While we do not have spatially explicit official fire history datasets
308	that allows for such visual comparisons in EFFIS countries and Australia, the large contrasts
309	between FireCCILT11 and other two existing BA product (i.e., FireCCI51 and MCD64A1) indicate

that FireCCILT11 may suffer from the same issues in these countries (Figures 7 and 8).







- 313 (NBAC in Canada and NIFC in the conterminous US). Both NBAC and NIFC BA were projected
- 314 and resampled to  $0.05^{\circ}$  to be consistent with FireCCILT11.



- 317 Figure 6. Comparisons of BA in 2011 as mapped by a) FireCCILT11, b) reference datasets (NBAC
- 318 in Canada and NIFC in the conterminous US), c) FireCCI51, and d) MCD64A1. All datasets were
- 319 projected and resampled to 0.05° to be consistent with FireCCILT11.



- 321 Figure 7. Comparisons of BA in 2017 in the five European countries as mapped by a) FireCCILT11,
- b) FireCCI51, and c) MCD64A1. Both FireCCI51 and MCD64A1 BA were projected and resampled
- to 0.05° to be consistent with FireCCILT11.



325	Figure 8. Comparisons of BA in 2016 in Australia as mapped by a) FireCCILT11, b) FireCCI51, and
326	c) MCD64A1. Both FireCCI51 and MCD64A1 BA were projected and resampled to 0.05° to be
327	consistent with FireCCILT11.

Second, FireCCILT11 has low consistency in mapping BAs. The ability to map BAs 329 330 consistently is a prerequisite of a reliable BA product, particulary one that is used for long-term 331 trend analyses. However, FireCCILT11 lacks in this regard. Numerous pieces of evidence presented 332 by our study suggest a strong dichotomy in FireCCILT11's performance between the pre-2001 (i.e., 333 1986-2000) and post-2001 (i.e., 2001-2018) eras, whether based on yearly total BAs (Figures 1 and 2) 334 or per-pixel comparisons (Figure 3, Tables 2 and 3). In general, the accuracy of FireCCILT11 during 335 the pre-2001 era is much lower than that of the post-2001 era. Such low accuracies are not only reflected in the inconstancies in BA values with the reference fire history datasets, but also in the 336 337 drastically different spatial representation of the overall fire regimes (Figures 5-8). While this 338 phenomenon itself is not surprising considering FireCCILT11 was trained based on data from the 339 post-2001 era, the strong deterioration in performance of FireCCILT11 going back in time to the 340 pre-2001 era indicates that FireCCILT11 is not generally suitable for robust long-term trend 341 analyses. Another indicator of FireCCILT11's lack of consistency involves the overall poor 342 correlation of FireCCILT11 BA with FireCCI51 BA, which was the training input used to produce 343 FireCCILT11. As revealed in our analyses based on yearly total BAs (Figure 2), FireCCILT11's 344 yearly BAs deviate from those of the FireCCI51 product substantially in all five EFFIS countries 345 except for Italy (Figure 2). This pattern is corroborated by our per-pixel analyses, which show that 346 FireCCILT11 always has lower correlations relative to FireCCI51 when compared against a common 347 BA product (Figures 3 and 4, Tables 2 and 3).

348 5.2. Limitations of the FireCCILT11 design and original accuracy assessment

349 The lack of accuracy and consistency in the performance of FireCCILT11 deviates from the goal set by its producers of delivering a reliable long-term global BA product. These issues were 350 351 likely not clearly identified in the original accuracy assessment as a result of two key features of the 352 Otón et al. (2021b) FireCCILT11 product and assessment methodologies acting in combination: the heavy and exclusive reliance on interannual total BA as the basis for the assessment, and the 353 354 involvement of the FireCCI51 product in FireCCILT11 training, calibration, and assessment. In the 355 first case, per-region total annual BA as mapped by the various BA products was the sole metric 356 (Otón et al. (2021b). This included both visual comparison of interannual distribution of the 357 regional BA values, and correlation coefficients. Such a design is not sufficient to fully examine the 358 spatial distribution of burned pixels within a particular region in a given year, which is required for a 359 reliable BA product. In the second case, FireCCI51 was used not only as the training data for the 360 initial FireCCILT11 binary burned/unburned mapping algorithm, but also as a crucial input guiding 361 the final allocation of actual burned area to burned pixels within larger ~25-km patches. While the 362 use of FireCCI51 for training and calibration was a reasonable practice by itself, it substantially 363 weakens the reference power of FireCCI51 in accuracy assessments, particularly those involving only 364 total BA. This dual use suggests that the level of involvement of FireCCI51 in developing the 365 FireCCILT11 mapping algorithm was perhaps too heavy, which explains the great deterioration of 366 mapping accuracies in the pre-2001 era compared with the MODIS era when FireCCI51 was 367 available. And FireCCI51 should have been excluded in the accuracy assessment, as suggested by 368 Humber et al. (2018). We note that Otón et al. (2021a) later conducted an independent accuracy 369 assessment of FireCCILT11 using Landsat data. However, that assessment was limited to a single 370 Landsat path/row in southern Africa, which limits its validity for evaluating a global BA product. 371 5.3. FireCCILT11 pixelation effect

372	A notable feature of FireCCILT11 BA, which was reported by Giglio and Roy (2023) but
373	has not been discussed extensively, is that at its native resolution of 0.05°, the product appears to be
374	highly pixelated. Specifically, in many parts of the BA maps, the BA values of the 25 spatially
375	adjacent 0.05° grid cells (that form a 0.25° grid cell) are highly similar (Figure 9). Because of this
376	pixelation effect, FireCCILT11 is unable to resolve the spatial details of fire distribution at 0.05°,
377	which the 0.05° version of the FireCCI51 product is able to (as exemplified by the comparison
378	between Panels b) and c) in Figure 9). This means that the effective spatial resolution of
379	FireCCILT11 should be considered as 0.25° instead of 0.05°. This may be one of the reasons why
380	the per-pixel accuracies of FireCCILT11 at the 0.05° resolution was low (Tables 2 and 3).



Figure 9. a) BA in Sub-Saharan Africa in 2011 as mapped by FireCCILT11. b) A zoomed-in view of
an area in a). c) The same area as in b) but as mapped by FireCCI51 from the same year. Both
FireCCILT11 and FireCCI51 datasets visualized in these graphs have the same resolution of 0.05°.

Another noticeable feature associated with the pixelation effect is that the pixelation is not spatially consistent. As shown in Figure 9b, which is a zoomed-in view of FireCCILT11 for Sub-Saharan Africa in 2011, the pixelation effect is present in northern areas, whereas in the south its presence is much less prevalent. This inconsistency in spatial distribution is yet another factor that weakens the spatial coherence of FireCCILT11 as the users will essentially be dealing with two effective spatial resolutions (i.e., 0.05° and 0.25°) in any given image.

392 5.4. The need for a consistent, long-term AVHRRBA product

While a laudable step toward a long-term BA record, the FireCCILT11 product was released 393 394 with only a high-level, regional accuracy assessment conducted on an annual basis, and extremely 395 limited validation (Otón et al. (2021a). In hindsight, it is clear that those assessments were not 396 sufficiently comprehensive for a global BA product whose temporal coverage spans nearly four 397 decades. While Giglio and Roy (2022) and Giglio et al. (2022) have since documented pervasive 398 orbit-drift artifacts in the FireCCILT11 product, the evidence in those studies was primarily 399 circumstantial and similarly conducted at large spatial scales. Here, through a series of pixel-level 400 accuracy assessments utilizing remotely sensed global burned area data and independent regional 401 burned area data, we showed that the FireCCILT11 product suffers from significant quality issues at 402 much finer spatial scales and in additional locations, particularly in areas outside Canada during the 403 pre-2001 era, which weaken its usability as a reliable global BA product. While the performance of 404 FireCCILT11 is substantially better in Canada and the US during the post-2001 era, its performance 405 does not overshadow that of FireCCI51 or MCD64A1, two global BA products that have been

extensively assessed in the literature and proven to be high quality (Boschetti et al. 2019; Franquesa
et al. 2022; Huang et al. 2023; Katagis and Gitas 2022). This diminishes the need to use
FireCCILT11 if the study period is within the post-2001 era, due to the presence of better quality
alternatives. Consequently, it seems fair to say that the long-recognized need for a reliable, multidecadal global BA product necessarily derived from AVHRR data (Giglio and Roy 2020) remains
unsatisfied. Continued effort is required to address the many challenges of using data from this
sensor.

413 5.5. Best practice for assessing long-term BA product

414 Due to the limited operational lifespan of satellite-based remote sensing sensors and the 415 continual advancement of imaging technologies (e.g., MODIS being superseded by VIIRS, Landsat 416 TM by ETM+, and subsequently by OLI), generating and validating long-term BA products requires 417 integrating data from multiple sensor generations, usually involving space-for-time interpolation. 418 This introduces additional complexity beyond standard validation challenges for single-sensor 419 products. While substantial research exists on accuracy assessment methods for short-term BA 420 products (<20 years) through validation protocols, reference databases, and comparative analyses 421 against ground data, there remains a critical gap in established methodologies for evaluating long-422 term, multi-sensor BA datasets. Current validation frameworks primarily address temporal 423 consistency within individual sensor records rather than cross-mission harmonization, leaving 424 unresolved questions about error propagation and spectral compatibility across sensor lineages. 425 Here we argue that the evaluation of long-term BA products must adhere to several 426 fundamental protocols to ensure robust and meaningful accuracy assessments. First, the training 427 data used in algorithm development should ideally encompass the entire spatial and temporal range 428 of the BA product. This broad coverage helps capture the full variability of fire regimes, including 429 differences in fire size, intensity, and vegetation types. In cases where complete spatial coverage is

unattainable, it is essential that training data are sampled from all major ecosystems with distinct fire
characteristics, thereby reducing potential biases arising from underrepresented regions or fire types.
Additionally, the temporal distribution of training data must account for the interannual variability
of wildfire activity. Specifically, training datasets should include samples from years with both low
and high fire activity, as data from only small fire years may not adequately represent the conditions
present in large fire years, and vice versa.

436 Second, testing data-used for independent validation-must be both spatially and temporally 437 consistent throughout the product's spatio-temporal domain. This consistency is best achieved by 438 leveraging long-term, standardized datasets such as Landsat Analysis Ready Data (Dwyer et al. 439 2018), which provide harmonized surface reflectance records across decades. When such datasets 440 are unavailable, especially for older sensors like the AVHRR, explicit calibration and harmonization 441 methods (e.g., approaches developed by Berner et al. (2023) in conducting cross-sensor calibration 442 harmonalizing Landsat 5, 7, and 8 data) must be implemented to minimize inter-sensor 443 discrepancies. This requirement is particularly challenging for AVHRR-based BA products, where

sensor degradation and lack of standardization can introduce significant uncertainties.

445 Finally, reference data used for accuracy assessment must be strictly independent of the data 446 production process to avoid circular validation. These reference datasets should ideally be available 447 for all unique spatiotemporal domains, including periods of sensor transition and across ecosystems with different fire regimes, ensuring comprehensive coverage and representativeness. Furthermore, 448 449 performance assessment should not rely solely on aggregate BA statistics; it must also include per-450 pixel accuracy metrics, such as omission and commission errors, calculated over the entire spatial 451 and temporal extent of the BA product. This dual approach enables a more robust and nuanced 452 understanding of product performance, particularly in heterogeneous landscapes.

453 6. Conclusion

454 This study conducted a comprehensive assessment of the FireCCILT11 global BA product, 455 revealing significant limitations in its accuracy and consistency. The evaluation, based on national 456 fire history data and comparisons with other remotely sensed BA products like FireCCI51 and 457 MCD64A1, highlighted several critical issues with FireCCILT11. Key findings indicate that 458 FireCCILT11 generally exhibits low consistency with national fire records in terms of annual total 459 BA across most of the eight countries assessed, with Canada being the exception. Even when 460 compared to FireCCI51, which served as its training data, FireCCILT11 showed inconsistencies in 461 annual BA in several European countries. Per-pixel assessments in the U.S. and Canada revealed 462 particularly low performance for FireCCILT11, especially during the pre-2001 period, with low 463 correlations and high omission errors. In the U.S., FireCCILT11 also demonstrated high 464 commission errors. The product's performance was markedly different and generally worse in the pre-2001 era compared to the post-2001 era, undermining its suitability for robust long-term trend 465 analyses. Furthermore, a "pixelation effect" was observed, suggesting that the effective spatial 466 resolution of FireCCILT11 is closer to 0.25° rather than its native 0.05°, and this effect was not 467 468 spatially consistent.

469 These findings demonstrate that the spatial distribution of burned areas in FireCCILT11 can 470 in some instances diverge spectacularly from higher-quality independent reference data, particularly 471 before 2001, and the product is therefore unable to reliably represent BA in many regions. The 472 original FireCCILT11 accuracy assessment at the time the product was released likely did not 473 identify these issues due to its heavy reliance on interannual total BA and the triple-use of the 474 "parent" FireCCI51 BA product for FireCCILT11 training, calibration, and assessment. While FireCCILT11's performance improved in the post-2001 era in North America, it did not surpass 475 476 existing products like FireCCI51 and MCD64A1, diminishing the necessity for its use during this period. 477

- 478 In conclusion, this assessment underscores significant quality issues with the FireCCILT11
- 479 product, which weaken its utility as a reliable long-term global BA dataset. There remains a pressing
- 480 need for the development of a robust and consistent long-term global BA product, likely based on
- 481 AVHRR data, but this will require extensive work to address the inherent challenges of those data.
- 482 To ensure the reliability of future long-term BA products, adherence to stringent assessment
- 483 protocols is advisable. These ideally include training data that span the product's full spatiotemporal
- 484 range, employing temporally consistent testing data independent of the production process, and
- 485 conducting per-pixel accuracy assessments alongside aggregate statistics. Such rigorous evaluation is
- 486 crucial for providing the scientific community with dependable data for understanding long-term fire
- 487 regime dynamics and their impacts.
- 488 7. Acknowledgements
- 489 This work was funded in part by National Aeronautics and Space Administration grant
- 490 80NSSC24M0019.
- 491 8. References
- 492 Bastarrika, A., Rodriguez-Montellano, A., Roteta, E., Hantson, S., Franquesa, M., Torre, L.,
- 493 Gonzalez-Ibarzabal, J., Artano, K., Martinez-Blanco, P., Mesanza, A., Anaya, J.A., & Chuvieco, E.
- 494 (2024). An automatic procedure for mapping burned areas globally using Sentinel-2 and
- 495 VIIRS/MODIS active fires in Google Earth Engine. Isprs Journal of Photogrammetry and Remote Sensing,
- 496 218, 232-245 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.isprsjprs.2024.08.019</u>
- 497 Bastos, A., O'Sullivan, M., Ciais, P., Makowski, D., Sitch, S., Friedlingstein, P., Chevallier, F.,
- 498 Rödenbeck, C., Pongratz, J., Luijkx, I.T., Patra, P.K., Peylin, P., Canadell, J.G., Lauerwald, R., Li, W.,
- 499 Smith, N.E., Peters, W., Goll, D.S., Jain, A.K., Kato, E., Lienert, S., Lombardozzi, D.L., Haverd, V.,
- 500 Nabel, J.E.M.S., Poulter, B., Tian, H., Walker, A.P., & Zaehle, S. (2020). Sources of Uncertainty in
- 501 Regional and Global Terrestrial CO2 Exchange Estimates. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles, 34*,
- 502 e2019GB006393 <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/2019GB006393</u>
- 503 Berner, L.T., Assmann, J.J., Normand, S., & Goetz, S.J. (2023). 'LandsatTS': an R package to
- facilitate retrieval, cleaning, cross-calibration, and phenological modeling of Landsat time series data.
- 505 *Ecography, 2023*, e06768 <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/ecog.06768</u>
- Boer, M.M., Resco de Dios, V., & Bradstock, R.A. (2020). Unprecedented burn area of Australian
   mega forest fires. *Nature Climate Change*, 10, 171-172 <a href="https://doi.org/10.1038/s41558-020-0716-1">https://doi.org/10.1038/s41558-020-0716-1</a>

- 508 Bond-Lamberty, B., Peckham, S.D., Ahl, D.E., & Gower, S.T. (2007). Fire as the dominant driver of
- 509 central Canadian boreal forest carbon balance. *Nature, 450*, 89-92
- 510 <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/nature06272</u>
- 511 Boschetti, L., Roy, D.P., Giglio, L., Huang, H., Zubkova, M., & Humber, M.L. (2019). Global
- validation of the collection 6 MODIS burned area product. Remote Sensing of Environment, 235, 111490
   <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2019.111490</u>
- 514 Bowman, D.M., Balch, J.K., Artaxo, P., Bond, W.J., Carlson, J.M., Cochrane, M.A., d'Antonio, C.M.,
- 515 DeFries, R.S., Doyle, J.C., & Harrison, S.P. (2009). Fire in the Earth system. *Science*, *324*, 481-484 516 <u>https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1163886</u>
- 517 Canadell, J.G., Meyer, C.P., Cook, G.D., Dowdy, A., Briggs, P.R., Knauer, J., Pepler, A., & Haverd,
- 518 V. (2021). Multi-decadal increase of forest burned area in Australia is linked to climate change.
- 519 Nature Communications, 12, 6921 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-021-27225-4
- 520 Cardil, A., Rodrigues, M., Tapia, M., Barbero, R., Ramírez, J., Stoof, C.R., Silva, C.A., Mohan, M., &
- 521 de-Miguel, S. (2023). Climate teleconnections modulate global burned area. *Nature Communications*,
- 522 14, 427 <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-023-36052-8</u>
- 523 Chuvieco, E., Lizundia-Loiola, J., Pettinari, M.L., Ramo, R., Padilla, M., Tansey, K., Mouillot, F.,
- Laurent, P., Storm, T., Heil, A., & Plummer, S. (2018). Generation and analysis of a new global
- 525 burned area product based on MODIS 250 m reflectance bands and thermal anomalies. *Earth Syst.*
- 526 Sci. Data, 10, 2015-2031 https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-10-2015-2018
- 527 Chuvieco, E., Yue, C., Heil, A., Mouillot, F., Alonso-Canas, I., Padilla, M., Pereira, J.M., Oom, D., &
- 528 Tansey, K. (2016). A new global burned area product for climate assessment of fire impacts. *Global*
- 529 Ecology and Biogeography, 25, 619-629 https://doi.org/10.1111/geb.12440
- 530 Descals, A., Gaveau, D.L.A., Verger, A., Sheil, D., Naito, D., & Peñuelas, J. (2022). Unprecedented
- fire activity above the Arctic Circle linked to rising temperatures. *Science*, *378*, 532-537
   https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abn9768
- 533 Dwyer, J.L., Roy, D.P., Sauer, B., Jenkerson, C.B., Zhang, H.K., & Lymburner, L. (2018). Analysis
- Ready Data: Enabling Analysis of the Landsat Archive. *Remote Sensing*, 10, 1363
- 535 <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/rs10091363</u>
- 536 Franquesa, M., Stehman, S.V., & Chuvieco, E. (2022). Assessment and characterization of sources of
- 537 error impacting the accuracy of global burned area products. *Remote Sensing of Environment, 280*,
- 538 113214 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2022.113214
- 539 Gatti, L.V., Basso, L.S., Miller, J.B., Gloor, M., Gatti Domingues, L., Cassol, H.L.G., Tejada, G.,
- 540 Aragão, L.E.O.C., Nobre, C., Peters, W., Marani, L., Arai, E., Sanches, A.H., Corrêa, S.M.,
- 541 Anderson, L., Von Randow, C., Correia, C.S.C., Crispim, S.P., & Neves, R.A.L. (2021). Amazonia as
- 542 a carbon source linked to deforestation and climate change. *Nature*, 595, 388-393
- 543 <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-021-03629-6</u>

- 544 Gaveau, D.L.A., Descals, A., Salim, M.A., Sheil, D., & Sloan, S. (2021). Refined burned-area
- mapping protocol using Sentinel-2 data increases estimate of 2019 Indonesian burning. *Earth Syst. Sci. Data, 13*, 5353-5368 <u>https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-13-5353-2021</u>
- 547 Giglio, L., Boschetti, L., Roy, D., Hall, J.V., Zubkova, M., Humber, M., Hunag, H., & Oles, V. (in
- 548 review). The NASA Visible Infrared Imaging Radiometer Suite (VIIRS) burned area product, global
- validation, and inter-comparison with the NASA Moderate Resolution Imaging Spectroradiometer
- 550 (MODIS) burned area product
- 551 Giglio, L., Boschetti, L., Roy, D.P., Humber, M.L., & Justice, C.O. (2018). The Collection 6 MODIS
- burned area mapping algorithm and product. Remote Sensing of Environment, 217, 72-85
- 553 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2018.08.005</u>
- 554 Giglio, L., & Roy, D.P. (2020). On the outstanding need for a long-term, multi-decadal, validated
- and quality assessed record of global burned area: Caution in the use of Advanced Very High
- 556 Resolution Radiometer data. Science of Remote Sensing, 2, 100007
- 557 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.srs.2020.100007</u>
- 558 Giglio, L., & Roy, D.P. (2022). Assessment of satellite orbit-drift artifacts in the long-term AVHRR
- 559 FireCCILT11 global burned area data set. *Science of Remote Sensing, 5*, 100044 560 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.srs.2022.100044
- 561 Giglio, L., & Roy, D.P. (2023). FireCCILT11 artifacts may confound the link between biomass
- burning and infant mortality. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 120, e2317759120
   <u>https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.2317759120</u>
- Giglio, L., & Roy, D.P. (2024). Satellite artifacts modulate FireCCILT11 global burned area. *Nature Communications*, 15, 2079 <a href="https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-024-46168-0">https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-024-46168-0</a>
- 566 Giglio, L., Zubkova, M., & Roy, D.P. (2022). Comment on Otón et al. Analysis of Trends in the
- 567 FireCCI Global Long Term Burned Area Product (1982–2018). Fire 2021, 4, 74. *Fire, 5*, 52
   568 <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/fire5020052</u>
- 569 Gincheva, A., Pausas, J.G., Edwards, A., Provenzale, A., Cerdà, A., Hanes, C., Royé, D., Chuvieco,
- 570 E., Mouillot, F., Vissio, G., Rodrigo, J., Bedía, J., Abatzoglou, J.T., Senciales González, J.M., Short,
- 571 K.C., Baudena, M., Llasat, M.C., Magnani, M., Boer, M.M., González, M.E., Torres-Vázquez, M.Á.,
- 572 Fiorucci, P., Jacklyn, P., Libonati, R., Trigo, R.M., Herrera, S., Jerez, S., Wang, X., & Turco, M.
- 573 (2024). A monthly gridded burned area database of national wildland fire data. *Scientific Data, 11*, 352
- 574 <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41597-024-03141-2</u>
- 575 Hall, R.J., Skakun, R.S., Metsaranta, J.M., Landry, R., Fraser, R.H., Raymond, D., Gartrell, M.,
- 576 Decker, V., & Little, J. (2020). Generating annual estimates of forest fire disturbance in Canada: the 577 National Burned Area Composite. *International Journal of Wildland Fire, 29*, 878-891
- 578 <u>https://doi.org/10.1071/WF19201</u>
- 579 Harris, N.L., Gibbs, D.A., Baccini, A., Birdsey, R.A., de Bruin, S., Farina, M., Fatoyinbo, L., Hansen,
- 580 M.C., Herold, M., Houghton, R.A., Potapov, P.V., Suarez, D.R., Roman-Cuesta, R.M., Saatchi, S.S.,
- 581 Slay, C.M., Turubanova, S.A., & Tyukavina, A. (2021). Global maps of twenty-first century forest
- 582 carbon fluxes. Nature Climate Change, 11, 234-240 <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41558-020-00976-6</u>

- 583 Hawbaker, T.J., Vanderhoof, M.K., Beal, Y.-J., Takacs, J.D., Schmidt, G.L., Falgout, J.T., Williams,
- B., Fairaux, N.M., Caldwell, M.K., Picotte, J.J., Howard, S.M., Stitt, S., & Dwyer, J.L. (2017).
- 585 Mapping burned areas using dense time-series of Landsat data. Remote Sensing of Environment, 198,
- 586 504-522 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2017.06.027</u>
- 587 Hawbaker, T.J., Vanderhoof, M.K., Schmidt, G.L., Beal, Y.-J., Picotte, J.J., Takacs, J.D., Falgout,
- 588 J.T., & Dwyer, J.L. (2020). The Landsat Burned Area algorithm and products for the conterminous
- 589 United States. Remote Sensing of Environment, 244, 111801 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2020.111801
- Huang, Y., Yaozhong, P., Xingsheng, X., Qiang, Z., Qiong, C., & and Zhang, S. (2023). Validating
- 591 MCD64A1 and FireCCI51 burned area mapping in the Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau. *Geocarto*
- 592 International, 38, 2285345 https://doi.org/10.1080/10106049.2023.2285345
- 593 Humber, M.L., Boschetti, L., Giglio, L., & Justice, C.O. (2018). Spatial and temporal
- intercomparison of four global burned area products. *International Journal of Digital Earth*, 1-25
   https://doi.org/10.1080/17538947.2018.1433727
- 596 Katagis, T., & Gitas, I.Z. (2022). Assessing the Accuracy of MODIS MCD64A1 C6 and FireCCI51
- 597 Burned Area Products in Mediterranean Ecosystems. Remote Sensing, 14, 602
- 598 <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/rs14030602</u>
- 599 Lin, Z., Chen, A., Wang, X., Liu, Z., & Piao, S. (2024). Large language models reveal big disparities
- in current wildfire research. Communications Earth & Environment, 5, 168
  https://doi.org/10.1038/s43247-024-01341-7
- Lizundia-Loiola, J., Otón, G., Ramo, R., & Chuvieco, E. (2020). A spatio-temporal active-fire
- clustering approach for global burned area mapping at 250 m from MODIS data. Remote Sensing of
   *Environment, 236*, 111493 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2019.111493</u>
- 605 McClure, C.D., & Jaffe, D.A. (2018). US particulate matter air quality improves except in wildfire-
- 606 prone areas. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 201804353
- 607 https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1804353115
- Moritz, M.A., Batllori, E., Bradstock, R.A., Gill, A.M., Handmer, J., Hessburg, P.F., Leonard, J.,
- McCaffrey, S., Odion, D.C., Schoennagel, T., & Syphard, A.D. (2014). Learning to coexist with wildfire. *Nature*, *515*, 58 https://doi.org/10.1038/nature13946
- 611 National Interagency Fire Center (2024). Interagency Fire Perimeter History All Years. NIFC
- Open Data. <<u>https://data-nifc.opendata.arcgis.com/datasets/nifc::interagencyfireperimeterhistory-</u>
   all-years-view/about>
- O'Dell, K., Bilsback, K., Ford, B., Martenies, S.E., Magzamen, S., Fischer, E.V., & Pierce, J.R.
- 615 (2021). Estimated Mortality and Morbidity Attributable to Smoke Plumes in the United States: Not
- 616 Just a Western US Problem. *GeoHealth*, 5, e2021GH000457
- 617 https://doi.org/10.1029/2021GH000457
- Olofsson, P., Foody, G.M., Herold, M., Stehman, S.V., Woodcock, C.E., & Wulder, M.A. (2014).
- 619 Good practices for estimating area and assessing accuracy of land change. Remote Sensing of
- 620 Environment, 148, 42-57 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2014.02.015

- 621 Otón, G., Franquesa, M., Lizundia-Loiola, J., & Chuvieco, E. (2021a). Validation of low spatial resolution
- 622 and no-dichotomy global long-term burned area product by Pareto boundary. SPIE
- 623 <u>https://doi.org/10.1117/12.2599883</u>
- 624 Otón, G., Lizundia-Loiola, J., Pettinari, M.L., & Chuvieco, E. (2021b). Development of a consistent
- 625 global long-term burned area product (1982–2018) based on AVHRR-LTDR data. International
- 626 Journal of Applied Earth Observation and Geoinformation, 103, 102473
- 627 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jag.2021.102473
- 628 Pinto, M.M., Libonati, R., Trigo, R.M., Trigo, I.F., & DaCamara, C.C. (2020). A deep learning
- 629 approach for mapping and dating burned areas using temporal sequences of satellite images. *Isprs*
- 630 Journal of Photogrammetry and Remote Sensing, 160, 260-274
- 631 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.isprsjprs.2019.12.014</u>
- 632 Randerson, J.T., Liu, H., Flanner, M.G., Chambers, S.D., Jin, Y., Hess, P.G., Pfister, G., Mack, M.C.,
- 633 Treseder, K.K., Welp, L.R., Chapin, F.S., Harden, J.W., Goulden, M.L., Lyons, E., Neff, J.C.,
- 634 Schuur, E.A.G., & Zender, C.S. (2006). The impact of boreal forest fire on climate warming. Science,
- 635 *314*, 1130-1132 <u>https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1132075</u>
- Roy, D.P., Lewis, P.E., & Justice, C.O. (2002). Burned area mapping using multi-temporal moderate
- 637 spatial resolution data—a bi-directional reflectance model-based expectation approach. Remote
- 638 Sensing of Environment, 83, 263-286 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0034-4257(02)00077-9</u>
- 639 San-Miguel-Ayanz, J., Schulte, E., Schmuck, G., Camia, A., Strobl, P., Liberta, G., Giovando, C.,
- Boca, R., Sedano, F., Kempeners, P., McInerney, D., Whitmore, C., Santos De Oliveira, S.,
- 641 Rodrigues, M., Durrant, T., Corti, P., Oehler, F., Vilar, L., & Amatulli, G. (2012). Comprehensive
- 642 Monitoring of Wildfires in Europe: The European Forest Fire Information System (EFFIS). In J.P.
- 643 Tiefenbacher (Ed.), Approaches to Managing Disaster Assessing Hazards, Emergencies and Disaster Impacts.
- 644 Rijeka: IntechOpen https://doi.org/10.5772/28441
- van der Velde, I.R., van der Werf, G.R., Houweling, S., Maasakkers, J.D., Borsdorff, T., Landgraf, J.,
- 646 Tol, P., van Kempen, T.A., van Hees, R., Hoogeveen, R., Veefkind, J.P., & Aben, I. (2021). Vast
- 647 CO2 release from Australian fires in 2019–2020 constrained by satellite. *Nature, 597*, 366-369
- 648 <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-021-03712-y</u>
- 649 Walker, X.J., Baltzer, J.L., Cumming, S.G., Day, N.J., Ebert, C., Goetz, S., Johnstone, J.F., Potter, S.,
- 650 Rogers, B.M., Schuur, E.A.G., Turetsky, M.R., & Mack, M.C. (2019). Increasing wildfires threaten
- historic carbon sink of boreal forest soils. *Nature, 572*, 520-523 <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-</u>
- 652 <u>019-1474-y</u>
- 653 Whitman, E., Parisien, M.-A., Thompson, D.K., & Flannigan, M.D. (2018). Topoedaphic and Forest
- 654 Controls on Post-Fire Vegetation Assemblies Are Modified by Fire History and Burn Severity in the 655 Northwestern Canadian Boreal Forest. *Forests*, *9*, 151 https://doi.org/10.3390/f9030151
- World Meteorological Organization (2017). WMO guidelines on the calculation of climate normals.In. Geneva, Switzerland
- 658 Zheng, B., Ciais, P., Chevallier, F., Yang, H., Canadell, J.G., Chen, Y., van der Velde, I.R., Aben, I.,
- 659 Chuvieco, E., Davis, S.J., Deeter, M., Hong, C., Kong, Y., Li, H., Li, H., Lin, X., He, K., & Zhang,

- Q. (2023). Record-high CO2 emissions from boreal fires in 2021. Science, 379, 912-917 https://doi.org/10.1126/science.ade0805
- 662